

UNDP/GEF 1996 Project Implementation Review (PIR) Report

1. Project Identifiers

Project Number : RAS/92/G33
Project Name : Asia Least-Cost GHG Abatement Strategy
(ALGAS) Project
Region : Asia & Pacific
Country : Regional
Focal Area : Climate Change
National : BCAS, INET, TERI/NPL, IPB/CES, ONU, IIBP, GPT, TEI,
Implementing : IMP
Agencies

Executing Agency : UNOPS/AsDB
Res. Representative : Mr. Kevin MCGRATH
Task Manager : Mr. Jorge Reyes

Entry into Work Program Date: December 1991

ProDoc Signature Date: 18 August 1994
amount (SUS M) 9.50

Cofinancing Amount: (SUS) 100,000

2. Project design and indicators

Development Objective:

The environmental objectives of this project are to limit the growth of GHG emissions from Asia, and to build a substantial pool of expertise in the region for addressing issues of global climate change. Expertise will be developed in areas such as the estimation and measurement of GHGs, identification of technologies and initiatives for reducing GHGs, and economic and social analyses for identifying cost-effective mitigation options. The activities of this project will contribute to the overall process of introducing sustainable development to the region.

The ALGAS Project embodies a strong emphasis on regional cooperation. It seeks to enhance regional capabilities in a number of critical environmental and natural resource disciplines which will ultimately allow the nations of the region to more effectively meet their commitments to the Framework Convention on Climate Change. Asian countries have demonstrated their concern for the global environment by having one of the highest participation rates in the global environmental conventions. This project intends to build on these concerns to develop the indigenous capabilities to ultimately actively address these concerns. The goals of this project are consistent with the development objectives of all the countries in the regions.

ACTIVITY	
National Workshops	<p>National Workshops on GHG inventory preparation were successfully conducted in Mongolia (29-31 January 1996), the Philippines (21-22 February 1996), China (6-21 June 1996), Indonesia (3-4 July 1996), and Vietnam (24-27 June 1996). India will conduct its inventory workshop on 6-10 November 1996.</p> <p>China conducted the Mitigation Workshop in June 24-26, 1996 and the Least Cost Strategy Workshop in July 1-3, 1996.</p> <p>The country will conduct the Mitigation Workshop on August 1996 in Cebu City.</p>
Technical Assessment Review	<p>The RPC conducted TA review missions in India, Thailand, PRC and Mongolia during the last quarter of 1995. The missions to Myanmar and Mongolia were undertaken to assist these countries with the formulation of their national work plans and institutional mechanisms including selection of the lead NTE.</p>
Linkaging with parallel multilateral and bilateral initiatives	<p>The project has supported the participation in the climate change training programs of the US Country Studies Program (UCSP) of participants from ALGAS countries not involved in UCSP.</p> <p>The project co-sponsored with UCSP, a Workshop on Climate Change Vulnerability and Adaptation in the Region held in Manila on 15-19 January 1996.</p> <p>The project co-sponsored a workshop with SASCOM and the National Physical Laboratory in New Delhi.</p>
Proposal for Supplemental Funding	<p>Supplemental funding is now being processed by the ADB in the amount of US\$295,000 for (sub)regional activities, including, but not limited to: (1) empirical measurements of methane emissions from rice paddies; (2) regional database on climate change; (3) country parameterization of a particular model; (4) regional thematic support group; and (5) project development.</p>
Setting up of a Communications Policy	<p>A Communications Policy was set-up, among others, to establish a clear flow of information to all project partners. This policy will also facilitate coordination, enhance cooperation and transparency in project implementation.</p>

Immediate Objectives:

1. Develop and improve the regional and national capacity to undertake, prepare, and present baseline and historical inventories of GHG emissions and sinks to meet the standards and requirements of the FCCC.
2. Improve the reliability of GHG emission and sink inventories for the region.
3. Develop national and regional capacities to identify, formulate, and analyze GHG mitigation initiatives.
4. Develop and recommend national and regional least-cost GHG abatement strategies.

3. Financial Data

Disbursements (US \$ Millions)

FY 1995 0.05

FY 1996 2.40

Cumulative expenditure upto 30 June 1996

2.60

Cumulative expenditure as a percentage of the total project budget

27%

4. Implementation Progress Ratings:

IMMEDIATE OBJECTIVE	Highly Satisfactory 75%-100%	Satisfactory 50%-75%	Unsatisfactory 25%-50%	Highly Unsatisfactory 0%-25%
1	ü			
2	ü			
3	ü			
4		ü*		

* This being the last activity in the project, it is too early to comment. Most participating countries are preparing for the national workshop on mitigation strategy.

satisfactorily perform the ALGAS country workplan. Key activities are to (i) develop a national inventory of GHG sources/sinks; (ii) identify options for mitigation/abatement of GHG's; and (iii) develop a least-cost strategy for mitigation of GHGs.

DPRK country project is being executed by UN-ESCAP.

Appendix 3

II. Matrix of Accomplishments

ACTIVITY	ACCOMPLISHMENT/STATUS
1.0 Project Initiation	ALGAS was launched in an Inception meeting held in 6-7 February 1995 in Manila and participated by UNDP, ADB, ESCAP, UNEP, National Counterpart Agencies, and international consultants. The output of the meeting was the finalization of the TORs for project partners.
2.0 Development of Methodology	<p>Conduct of ALGAS Project Approach and Methodology Workshop on 6-9 June 1995 in Manila to enable country, regional and international experts to discuss appropriate approaches and methodologies. The outputs of the workshop are: (1) a set of methods and issues papers that will form the basis of GHG emissions inventory and abatement planning under the ALGAS project; and (2) draft national workplans that establish countries' needs, priorities, and detailed activities to be undertaken. Subregional activities were likewise identified during the workshop: (1) empirical measurements for methane emissions from rice paddies; and (2) creation of a regional database.</p> <p>Conduct of a Methodology Meeting on 4-5 November 1995 in New Delhi with ITE to prepare a detailed methodology for the country studies. Two new regional activities were identified: (1) conduct of training of analytical models for mitigation options and drawing CERI curves; and (2) preparation of pre-feasibility project documents for various donors.</p>
Regional Training Workshops	<p>Conduct of First Regional Training Workshop on GHG Inventory Preparation on 6-1- November 1995 in New Delhi. The workshop provided detailed training and information to assist ALGAS participating countries in preparing their national GHG inventories.</p> <p>Conduct of Second Regional Training Workshop on GHG Mitigation Least-Cost Plans and Projects on 18-28 March 1996 in Bangkok. The workshop provided detailed training and serve as a forum for exchange of knowledge and experiences among participating countries.</p> <p>The ALGAS Project has also participated/supported a number of regional workshops.</p> <p>ACCOMPLISHMENT/STATUS</p>

Summary: Regional capability initiatives (training workshops) on GHG Inventory Preparation and Assessment of GHG Mitigation Options have been conducted. Most participating countries (except DPRK, Myanmar and ROK) have conducted their national workshop on GHG Inventory Preparation and are planning their National Workshop on Assessment of GHG Mitigation Options. Other (sub)/regional training activities to be held within the year will beef up the capability of the countries in implementing the project.

NGO Participation

(NGOs/Research Institutes consulted in all countries & expected to be members of national Steering Committee during project implementation).

For each participating country, NTEs are drawn from private consulting groups and research institutions with expertise on climate-related matters. Research arms of national universities are likewise involved in the project, either as members of the advisory board or the NTE. For example, in Pakistan, The Pakistan Science Foundation and the Quaid-e-Azam University are members of the NTEs. Similarly, in Korea, the Korea Chamber of Commerce and Industry and Yonsei University are NTE members, while the Seoul National University is a member of the National Implementing Committee. Please See Appendix 2.

5. Overall Performance Rating

(Verbal assessment of project performance in achieving all Objectives outlined in section 2)

The implementation of the project is progressing satisfactorily in achieving all objectives, and is expected to be completed by the scheduled completion date in August 1997.

Overall, a number of project activities have been significantly completed. The project has conducted two regional training workshops (1. GHG Inventory Preparation, 6-10 November 1995; 2. GHG Mitigation Least Cost Plans and Projects, 18-28 March 1996). Institutional arrangements for project implementation, including budget, major contract variation with ITE, subcontracts with NTE and procurement guidelines are in place. Except for DPRK and Myanmar, the other twelve countries have already commenced country studies. The mitigation DPRK study is cofunded by ESCAP and is not directly under ADB's responsibility.

National inventory workshops in the following countries: Bangladesh, China, India, Indonesia, Mongolia, Philippines, and Vietnam. ROK, DPRK and Myanmar have yet to start work programme. Thailand and Pakistan do not have plans to conduct the inventory workshop.

RAS/92/G33 ALGAS PROJECT APPENDIX 2 NGO/GEF

Country	Project Cost	National Counterpart Agency (NCA)	National Technical Experts (NTE) organization*	Type of NTE Organization
Bangladesh	\$412,000	Department of Environment/Ministry of Env't and Forests	Bangladesh Centre for Advance Studies (BCAS) Bangladesh Univ. of Eng'g. & Tech. (BUET) Bangladesh Inst. of Dev't Studies (BIDS)	Consulting Firm/NGO Consulting Firm/NGO Consulting Firm/NGO
PRC	703,000	State Science & Technology Commission of China	INET, Tsinghua University Chinese Academy of Sciences (CAS)	Consulting Firm/NGO
India	850,000	Ministry of Forests and Environment	Tata Energy Research Institute (TERI) A.P. Mitra and National Physical Laboratory (NPL)	Consulting Firm/NGO Govt. Institute
Indonesia	528,000	State Ministry of Environment	Institut Pertanian Bogor/Center for Environmental Studies (IPB/CES) Indonesian Agrometeorology Association (PERHIMPI) Institut Teknologi Bandung/Center for Research on Energy (ITE/CRE) PELANGI	Consulting Firm/NGO NGO Consulting Firm/NGO NGO
Mongolia	319,000	Ministry of Nature and Environment	Orchiun (ONU) Co. Ltd.	Consulting Firm/NGO
Myanmar		National Commission for Environmental Affairs		
Pakistan	272,667	Ministry of Environment, Urban Affairs, Forestry & Wildlife	Hagler Bailly Pakistan (Pvt) Limited Enterprise and Dev't Consulting (Pvt) Ltd. Asianics Argo Dev't International (Pvt) Ltd.	Consulting Firm/NGO Consulting Firm/NGO Consulting Firm/NGO
Philippines	423,000	Environmental Mgt. Bureau/Department of Environment & Natural Resources	Geosphere Technologies, Inc. (GTI)	Consulting Firm/NGO
Thailand	423,000	Office of Environmental Policy & Planning	Thailand Environment Institute (TEI)	Consulting Firm/NGO
Viet Nam	321,000	Institute of Meteorology & Hydrology	Institute of Meteorology & Hydrology	Gov't. Institute
Democratic People's Rep. of Korea (DPRK)	385,000	Gen. Bureau for Cooperation with Int'l. Organizations		
Republic of Korea	100,000	Energy & Resources Policy Division, Ministry of Trade, Industry & Energy	Korea Energy Economics Institute (KEEI) Korea Institute for Economic Research (KIER)	NGO NGO

* The NTE organization provides technical assistance, project management backstopping by home office office staff, administration of services, communications, local transportation translation and interpreting, preparation and delivery of reports to all other related activities, called for to

Participating countries have initiated the establishment of national inventories of GHG emissions and sinks.

The following (sub) regional activities were approved for further persual to ensure dissemination and sustainability of the project ideas even after the GEF phase is completed.

1. Empirical Measurements of Methane Emissions from Rice Paddies
2. Set up Regional Database on Climate Change
3. Country Parameterization of a Particular Model
4. Set up Regional Thematic Support Group

Linkages with ALGAS related activities of bilateral and multilateral development organizations have likewise been established.

Please see Appendix 3 - Matrix of Accomplishments.

6. Focal Area Questions:

Inclusion of vulnerability and adaptation activities within current project recommended by UNDP.

7. Verbal summary of current project status, problems and issues of importance for further implementation

- The contract for the Myanmar Work programme has been signed recently and DPRK Work Programme has not been started yet. For DPRK, the UN ESCAP is sub-contracting the ALGAS Country Study. ESCAP is still in the process of reviewing the sub-contract arrangements. For Myanmar, the National Commission for Environmental Affairs has been selected as the NTE Team and the national workplan is being finalized with the international consultants.
- The supplemental funding for sub-regional activities amounting to US\$ 592,000 under a co-financing arrangement has not been approved by the ADB. This amount is needed to bolster small amount initially provided by ADB.
- The RPC contract was terminated by the ADB effective 01 September 1996. The RPC is supposed to coordinate, manage and supervise the day to day activities of the ALGAS project. In place of the RPC, ADB assigned a senior bank staff, but who will be working on a part-time basis on ALGAS as he also attends to his regular Bank functions.
- On the performance of the ITEs team, there is a lack of technical outputs from AED, such as workshop proceedings, inventory manuals, and semi-annual reports inspite of repeated reminders. A detailed work plan for in-country technical assistance and project implementation is also lacking.

32.03	Regional Workshops					136,060	88,759	-	224,819	9,181
33.01	In-Country Training - ESCAP	234,000	-	-	-	-	-	71,200	71,200	588,800
39	COMPONENT TOTAL	1,544,000	30,184	-	-	301,430	113,554	71,200	486,184	1,057,816
40	EQUIPMENT & SUPPLIES									
46	Int. Procurement Over \$70,000	120,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	120,000
46.01	Expendable Equipment	1,020,000	-	-	-	-	39,674	-	39,674	980,326
46.02	Non-Expendable Equipment	1,140,000	-	-	-	-	39,674	-	39,674	1,100,326
49	COMPONENT TOTAL									
50	MISCELLANEOUS									
52.01	Reporting Costs	30,000	-	-	-	-	275	-	275	29,725
53.01	Sundry	95,389	5,620	-	-	54,127	1,398	-	61,145	34,244
59	COMPONENT TOTAL	125,389	5,620	-	-	54,127	1,673	-	61,420	63,969
99	PROJECT TOTAL	8,137,389	35,804	-	-	1,541,751	378,660	198,355	2,154,570	5,982,819

1/ Latest UNDP Allocation as Per Revision "A" dated 29/03/93

- The NTE team for Myanmar has been selected and the national workplan is being finalized in consultation with the international consultants.
- Supplementary funding support for ROK may soon be approved.

8. Follow up Recommendations

II. ADB to facilitate approval of co-financing and increase the amount to be co-financed with UNDP-GEF.

III. Follow-up to the ROK workplan

IV. For Myanmar, some experts from within the region will be involved to get the country study started and to catch up with the schedule of the other regions.

V. TA review missions to be undertaken by the international consultants and/or Bank staff from August 1996 onwards as required by countries.

VI. Additional (sub)/regional activities to commence before the end of the year, as follows:

a) Markal Model training for countries like India, Bangladesh, Philippines and; and EFOM model training for countries like Vietnam, Pakistan, Thailand, Myanmar and DPRK .

b) Regional Thematic Support Group which will not only serve ALGAS but also pilot in place an institutional mechanism that could continue after the project.

VII. A regional training workshop on project profile preparation is being planned for December 1996 or early 1997. Interim results will be presented in another regional workshop.

VIII. Need for full time replacement of RPC will be assessed on the basis of the success of the present arrangement to ensure adequate coordination and monitoring of project activities particularly in the participating countries.

III. Increased monitoring responsibility of UNDP Country Offices.

BL CODE	BUDGET LINE	TOTAL ALLOC. I/	1994	1995	As of 30/06 Actual	19 96 Unl. Obl.	Cumulative Expenditure as of 30/06/96	Balance UNDP Alloc.
10	PROJECT PERSONNEL							
11	International Experts							
11.01	Programme Coordinator - S Mukherjee	340,000	28,937	42,753	51,274	27,155	150,119	189,881
11.49	Sub-total: Experts	340,000	28,937	42,753	51,274	27,155	150,119	189,881
11.50	Consultants							
11.51	International Consultants - AEDI	1,296,000	-	431,983	160,788	100,000	692,771	603,229
11.59	Sub-total: Consultants	1,296,000	-	431,983	160,788	100,000	692,771	603,229
11.99	Sub-total: Experts & Cons.	1,636,000	-	474,736	212,062	127,155	842,890	793,110
15	Duty Travel							
15.01	D.T. for Int'l. Consultants	540,000	-	147,228	-	-	147,228	392,772
15.99	Sub-total: Duty Travel	540,000	-	147,228	-	-	147,228	392,772
16	Mission Costs							
16.01	Mission Costs	45,000	-	-	1,000	-	1,000	44,000
16.02	Monitoring & Evaluation	180,000	-	-	-	-	-	180,000
16.99	Sub-total: Mission Costs	225,000	-	-	1,000	-	1,000	224,000
17	NPPP							
17.01	National Consultants - AEDI - A. Idanan	2,862,200	-	547,550	-	-	547,550	2,314,650
17.02	Information & Clearinghouse	64,800	1,247	16,680	10,697	-	28,624	(28,624)
17.99	Sub-total: NPPP	2,927,000	1,247	564,230	10,697	-	576,174	2,350,826
19	COMPONENT TOTAL	5,328,000	-	1,186,194	223,759	127,155	1,567,292	3,760,708
30	TRAINING							
32.01	Group Training Workshops	350,000	-	128,300	4,795	-	133,095	216,905
32.02	Study Tours	300,000	-	37,070	20,000	-	57,050	242,930

**9. Appendix (Appendix 1 - Utilization Status as of 30 June 1996; Appendix 2 - NGO-GEF Participation; Appendix 3 - Matrix of Accomplishments) TA 5592:
RAS/92/G33 Asia Least-Cost Greenhouse Gas Abatement Strategy**

Project APPENDIX 1 Utilization Status as of 30 June 1996