

TERMINAL EVALUATION

Project ID:	9223
Project Name:	GEF China Sustainable Cities Integrated Approach Pilot
Countr(ies):	China
Implementing Agency:	World Bank

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. OVERVIEW	3
A. Description	3
B. Key Dates	3
C. Disbursements	3
II. PROGRESS STATUS AND ISSUES	4
A. Main Terminal Evaluation Findings	4
B. Stakeholder Engagement	4
C. Gender Equality	5
D. Knowledge Management	5
III. CORE INDICATORS	6
IV: CO FINANCING	7
V: ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SAFEGUARDS	7
VI. ANNEX	8

I. Overview

A. Description

Project name

GEF China Sustainable Cities Integrated Approach Pilot

Country

China

GEF ID

9223

Implementing Agency

World Bank

Executing Entity

MOF, MOHRUD, city governments of Tianjin, Beijing, Shijiazhuang, Nanchang, Shenzhen, Nignbo, Guiyang

Trust Fund

GET

Project Type

FSP

Objective

The objective is for participating cities to incorporate transit-oriented development principles into their polices and into future urban and transit plans.

B. Key Dates

CEO Endorsement/Approval

2/17/2017

Agency Approval

7/27/2017

Implementation Start

7/27/2017

First Disbursement

11/9/2018

Expected MTR

MTR Submission

6/6/2025

Actual MTR

8/17/2020

Expected Completion

3/31/2023

Actual Completion

3/31/2023

Actual TE

3/31/2023

TE Submission

6/6/2025

Final Disbursement

12/31/2023

C. Disbursements

Project Financing

35,673,000.00

Cumulative Disbursement

30,978,506.00

II. PROGRESS STATUS AND ISSUES

A. Main Terminal Evaluation Findings

The ICR presents a clear context of urbanization in China, emphasizing the need for a different approach to cope with agglomeration problems in cities. The government supported the transit-oriented development (TOD) approach, with a few advanced cities taking early initiatives, and the project came timely to strengthen such efforts. It is worth noting that the project's impacts on the ministry and the participating cities are significant, along with impacts that were outside the original project scope.

The project PDO, aiming for participating cities to incorporate transit-oriented development principles into their policies and future urban and transit plans, was successful. All PDO indicator targets were exceeded, and all intermediate results indicator targets were either exceeded or achieved. The project is rated highly satisfactory in relevance, efficacy, and efficiency. This is justified by the project's high relevance to China's national strategies and the World Bank Group's current CPF for China. It also demonstrated high efficacy, with all three PDO indicators over-achieved, and high efficiency in terms of expanding activities while staying within the original budget. These achievements were realized without delays, even amidst stringent local Covid-19 restrictions.

Additionally, the project has achieved unintended impacts. It played a pivotal role in strengthening institutional capacity at both national and city levels, fostering exchanges and knowledge sharing among government departments, and expanding its influence through various initiatives. The National TOD Platform, the output under Component 1, made valuable contributions to the National City Assessment Platform by enhancing its indicators and enriching its rail transit and land use data. This improvement enhanced the platform's capacity to identify and address existing issues within Chinese cities.

More importantly, the project, through its array of knowledge-sharing and capacity-building initiatives, successfully achieved cross-border exchanges, establishing a network across cities for peer-to-peer communication among local government entities. This laid the groundwork for a comprehensive environmental and social strategic framework for TOD in Chinese cities by incorporating social and environmental considerations into city-corridor-station levels of TOD research. Coupled with the spill-over results that the project garnered in achieving indirect GHG reduction at national and city levels (the projected reduction of GHG emissions from the seven project cities during 2017–36 is 43.7 million tonnes of CO₂. An additional reduction of approximately 44 million tonnes of CO₂ is anticipated across the 40 cities involved in the established National TOD platform from 2023 to 2042), attributable to the mainstreaming of the TOD concept supported by the project, the project achievements could be concluded as undoubtedly considerable.

About bank performance, it is also rated highly Satisfactory. It is justified that the implementation had a timely MTR, no extension even with China's major COVID lockdown period, high ratio of disbursement. The budget management was also good, having the flexibility to adjust activities and over-achieve targets.

B. Stakeholder Engagement

Significant progress was made in stakeholder engagement since the time of MTR. Active efforts were made to engage stakeholders at various levels. The project leading groups (PLGs) established in each of the seven participating cities were actively involved during the project implementation. Senior city leadership of TOD-related key stakeholders were in the PLGs including the Bureau of Urban Planning, the Bureau of Transportation, the Bureau of Housing and Urban-Rural Development, the Bureau of Ecology and

Environment Protection, the Bureau of Business, rail transit companies, and relevant district government representatives. PLG members actively attended the implementation supporting missions and technical missions of the World Bank to discuss the project implementation status. They also participated peer learning and capacity building activities organized by the PMOs and the World Bank. The takeaways of these activities improved their capacities on TOD. In turn, their insights gained from practicing TOD enhanced the project outputs. Given their pivotal role in shaping key urban planning and policies, PLG members were instrumental in achieving the PDO, particularly in relation to PDO Indicators 1- Cities incorporating TOD strategies in urban and transit plans and PDO Indicators 2- Cities formally adopting TOD principles into city-level strategies or policies. The final achievements of PDO indicators (see Efficacy section in ICR) underscore the critical contributions of the PLGs. The integration of TOD into economic and social development five-year plan, territorial and spatial master plans, and rail transit network plans couldn't be achieved without the PLGs' support.

The project also actively involved citizen and residents. This collaborative approach, including public consultations and technology platforms, ensures contextually relevant interventions by leveraging local knowledge and promoting a two-way communication channel. More than one hundred public consultations, involving local communities, local experts and normal citizens are critical in providing essential information for formulating the TOD strategy at multiple scales in this project.

C. Gender Equality

Although there's no direct indicator related to gender, the project made great progress on gender-responsive measures after MTR through actively involving women in public engagement and capacity-building activities. To integrate gender considerations into TOD planning at the city level and station level, the seven participating cities held multiple citizen engagement sessions in which 40–50 percent of the participants were female. Similarly, the training sessions provided under this project had around 50 percent female participation (See more details in table4 in ICR). Moreover, the underlying assumption in the project was that gender mainstreaming benefits would accrue slightly more to women than to men. This rationale was supported by research indicating that women and men had different transportation needs, travel behaviors, and levels of access to services and infrastructure. Since women tend to make more trips for a wider variety of purposes, they could benefit more from mixed land uses around transit facilities.

D. Knowledge Management

1) The task team organized an annual conference for the project cities in July 2022, with 60 representatives attending in person and over 100 participating online. The conference featured international speakers from six countries who were paired with the seven Chinese project cities to address the key TOD challenges faced by each city. Additionally, the conference facilitated three-day field visits in Beijing to explore local TOD practices.

2) The World Bank's knowledge sharing included issuing 18 quarterly newsletters during project implementation which are available on the World Bank Global Platform for Sustainable Cities (GPSC) website (link: <https://www.thegpsc.org/tod/blogs>).

3) At the conclusion of the project, 10 technical summary reports were produced in both English and Chinese which captured the main achievements of the eight PMOs. These publications are also readily accessible to the public through the GPSC website (link: <https://www.thegpsc.org/tod/knowledge/sustainable-cities-integrated-approach-pilot-technical-summary-series>). This accessibility to such valuable information in the public domain has effectively served the purpose of keeping stakeholders and the general public well-informed about the project's latest findings and insights.

Lessons learned: In projects featuring multiple TA activities, indicators that measure the frequency and quality of capacity-building and peer-learning events should be included in the results framework. Capacity building equips PMOs with essential skills to handle challenges; peer learning fosters a culture of knowledge exchange, and the collective wisdom enhances PMOs overall understanding and problem-solving capabilities. Both types of activities indirectly promote the achievements of outcomes by improving the quality of project implementation. Incorporating measurable indicators on capacity building and peer learning will help pave the way for continued proactive engagement in such activities.

III. Core Indicators

Indicator 6 Greenhouse Gas Emissions Mitigated

Total Target Benefit	(At PIF)	(At CEO Endorsement)	(Achieved at MTR)	(Achieved at TE)
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (direct)				
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (indirect)		62000000	44545753	87829807

Indicator 6.1 Carbon Sequestered or Emissions Avoided in the AFOLU (Agriculture, Forestry and Other Land Use) sector

Total Target Benefit	(At PIF)	(At CEO Endorsement)	(Achieved at MTR)	(Achieved at TE)
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (direct)				
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (indirect)				
Anticipated start year of accounting				
Duration of accounting				

Indicator 6.2 Emissions Avoided Outside AFOLU (Agriculture, Forestry and Other Land Use) Sector

Total Target Benefit	(At PIF)	(At CEO Endorsement)	(Achieved at MTR)	(Achieved at TE)
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (direct)				
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (indirect)		62,000,000	44,545,753	87,829,807
Anticipated start year of accounting				
Duration of accounting				

Indicator 6.3 Energy Saved (Use this sub-indicator in addition to the sub-indicator 6.2 if applicable)

Total Target Benefit	Energy (MJ) (At PIF)	Energy (MJ) (At CEO Endorsement)	Energy (MJ) (Achieved at MTR)	Energy (MJ) (Achieved at TE)
Target Energy Saved (MJ)				

Indicator 6.4 Increase in Installed Renewable Energy Capacity per Technology (Use this sub-indicator in addition to the sub-indicator 6.2 if applicable)

Technology	Capacity (MW) (Expected at PIF)	Capacity (MW) (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Capacity (MW) (Achieved at MTR)	Capacity (MW) (Achieved at TE)
------------	------------------------------------	--	------------------------------------	-----------------------------------

IV: Co Financing

Sources of Co-financing	Name of Co-financier	Type of Co-financing	Investment Mobilized	Anticipated at CEO(\$)	Materialized at MTR(\$)	Materialized at TE(\$)
Donor Agency	World Bank Loan: Nanchang Urban Rail Project (P132154)	Loan	Investment mobilized	180,000,000.00		189,492,846.00
Donor Agency	WB loan Tianjin Urban	Loan	Investment mobilized	100,000,000.00		100,000,000.00
Recipient Country Government	Nanchang Municipal Government and Metro Company	Equity Investment	Investment mobilized	680,000,000.00		2,000,469,000.00
Recipient Country Government	Tianjin Municipal Government	Equity Investment	Investment mobilized	124,000,000.00		44,770,000.00
Total Co-financing				1,084,000,000.00	0.00	2,334,731,846.00

Comments

Co-financing from Tianjin Municipal Government was not fully realized due to competitive bidding, there has been a lot of savings with World Bank Loan during project implementation. The project then revised the disbursement percentage during project restructuring to 100% utilizing World Bank Loan, ended with smaller counterpart funds needed from the local government.

V: ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SAFEGUARDS

Overall Project/Program Risk Classification

PIF	CEO Endorsement/Approval	MTR	TE
		Medium/Moderate	Low

Measures to address identified risks and impacts

The re-assessing of the project environmental and social risks was completed in fall 2021. The Bank's task team identified deficiencies in considering ESS in different levels of TOD research in cities. In response, the task team has mandated the inclusion of ESS strategy research within the scope of each technical assistance contract, emphasizing that public consultations and a comprehensive review of ESS issues should form a substantial component of the overall work. For city-level research, the task team has requested that the ESS strategy should be presented as an independent report, subject to review and approval by environmental and social specialists. A chapter was essential in the corridor and station levels of TOD research, and it was asked to be reviewed by local experts.

VI. ANNEX

Uploaded Document

Document Category	Title
M and E Document	9223-P156507-2023-TE-WB-China