

TERMINAL EVALUATION

Project ID:	9682
Project Name:	Achieving Efficient and Green Freight Transport Development
Countr(ies):	China
Implementing Agency:	World Bank

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. OVERVIEW	3
A. Description	3
B. Key Dates	3
C. Disbursements	3
II. PROGRESS STATUS AND ISSUES	4
A. Main Terminal Evaluation Findings	4
B. Stakeholder Engagement	4
C. Gender Equality	4
D. Knowledge Management	4
III. CORE INDICATORS	4
IV: CO FINANCING	6
V: ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SAFEGUARDS	6
VI. ANNEX	7

I. Overview

A. Description

Project name

Achieving Efficient and Green Freight Transport Development

Country

China

GEF ID

9682

Implementing Agency

World Bank

Executing Entity

Ministry of Transport

Trust Fund

GET

Project Type

FSP

Objective

The development objective is to inform green freight transport, enhance institutional capacity for planning and policy development, and pilot innovations for carbon emission reduction in selected provinces.

B. Key Dates

CEO Endorsement/Approval

10/29/2018

Agency Approval

12/18/2018

Implementation Start

12/18/2018

First Disbursement

5/18/2020

Expected MTR

MTR Submission

8/22/2025

Actual MTR

11/22/2021

Expected Completion

12/31/2023

Actual Completion

12/31/2023

Actual TE

12/31/2023

TE Submission

8/22/2025

Final Disbursement

C. Disbursements

Project Financing

9,029,474.00

Cumulative Disbursement

7,720,828.00

II. PROGRESS STATUS AND ISSUES

A. Main Terminal Evaluation Findings

By project closing, all revised end targets for PDO-level and intermediate-level indicators were met. The national technical assistance (TA) outputs supported the preparation of several key plans and guidelines for freight transport development in China. All local pilot projects (Weifang, Yantai, Hubei, and Guangdong) successfully completed their planned activities. The project achieved 112% of the targeted CO2 emission reduction, demonstrating significant environmental impact. Capacity-building efforts substantially exceeded expectations, with the most notable achievement being the number of truck drivers trained—21 times the original target. Through the National Road Continuing Education Network Platform for Freight Drivers, the NPMO delivered green driving-related training to 6,458 truck drivers over four years: 4,201 in 2020, 977 in 2021, 500 in 2021, and 780 in 2022.

B. Stakeholder Engagement

Stakeholder participation and public information disclosure were also conducted throughout the TA process. Meaningful consultation and participation mechanism was conducted throughout the TA studies. Key stakeholders were identified, mainly including logistics enterprises, relevant government agencies, experts, drivers, farmers, and women. Their options and suggestions were taken into consideration during the TA studies.

C. Gender Equality

The project incorporated and evolved gender-responsive measures, particularly since the mid-term review (MTR), to address specific needs and improve outcomes for women in the transport and logistics sectors. In the Bohai Bay Highway-Waterway Multimodal Transport Project in Yantai, feedback from female practitioners highlighted the inconvenience of shared male-female transport lounges. In response, Shenbo Logistics Technology, a demonstration enterprise, implemented separate male and female lounges. This adjustment enhanced the comfort and employment experience of female drivers, reflecting the project's commitment to creating gender-sensitive working environments. The Guangdong Integrated Urban-Rural Distribution Pilot significantly boosted employment opportunities for rural women. For example, the 'Yue cheng pei' APP enabled the blueberry farm 'Foshan Lishui' to distribute its produce efficiently, leading to increased wages and job stability for workers. Between February and May 2023, 95% of the 525 blueberry pickers employed were women, earning an average monthly wage of 8,000 yuan. This initiative resulted in a total income increase of 15.94 million yuan (US\$2.24 million) for rural women during this period.

D. Knowledge Management

The project's success in promoting green freight practices was significantly influenced by its capacity building activities, which included training programs, seminars, and knowledge sharing platforms. This lesson highlights the importance of investing in long-term capacity building initiatives to ensure that project outcomes are sustained beyond the project's completion. In particular, by equipping companies with the knowledge and tools to measure their carbon footprints, set low-carbon goals, and develop sustainable roadmaps, the project has fostered a culture of environmental responsibility within the industry. The project's use of professional media platforms to publicize project results and promote the concept of green freight further amplified its impact and contributed to the long-term sustainability of its outcomes.

III. Core Indicators

Indicator 6 Greenhouse Gas Emissions Mitigated

Total Target Benefit	(At PIF)	(At CEO Endorsement)	(Achieved at MTR)	(Achieved at TE)
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (direct)		1330000	1760000	2882612
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (indirect)		14270000	7600000	6931675

Indicator 6.1 Carbon Sequestered or Emissions Avoided in the AFOLU (Agriculture, Forestry and Other Land Use) sector

Total Target Benefit	(At PIF)	(At CEO Endorsement)	(Achieved at MTR)	(Achieved at TE)
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (direct)				
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (indirect)				
Anticipated start year of accounting				
Duration of accounting				

Indicator 6.2 Emissions Avoided Outside AFOLU (Agriculture, Forestry and Other Land Use) Sector

Total Target Benefit	(At PIF)	(At CEO Endorsement)	(Achieved at MTR)	(Achieved at TE)
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (direct)		1330000	1,760,000	2,882,612
Expected metric tons of CO₂e (indirect)		14270000	7,600,000	6,931,675
Anticipated start year of accounting		2018	2020	2020
Duration of accounting		20	20	20

Indicator 6.3 Energy Saved (Use this sub-indicator in addition to the sub-indicator 6.2 if applicable)

Total Target Benefit	Energy (MJ) (At PIF)	Energy (MJ) (At CEO Endorsement)	Energy (MJ) (Achieved at MTR)	Energy (MJ) (Achieved at TE)
Target Energy Saved (MJ)				

Indicator 6.4 Increase in Installed Renewable Energy Capacity per Technology (Use this sub-indicator in addition to the sub-indicator 6.2 if applicable)

Technology	Capacity (MW) (Expected at PIF)	Capacity (MW) (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Capacity (MW) (Achieved at MTR)	Capacity (MW) (Achieved at TE)
------------	---------------------------------	---	---------------------------------	--------------------------------

Indicator 10 Persistent organic pollutants to air reduced

Grams of toxic equivalent gTEQ (Expected at PIF)	Grams of toxic equivalent gTEQ (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Grams of toxic equivalent gTEQ (Achieved at MTR)	Grams of toxic equivalent gTEQ (Achieved at TE)

Indicator 10.1 Number of countries with legislation and policy implemented to control emissions of POPs to air (Use this sub-indicator in addition to Core Indicator 10 if applicable)

Number (Expected at PIF)	Number (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Number (Achieved at MTR)	Number (Achieved at TE)
	0	0	0

Indicator 10.2 Number of emission control technologies/practices implemented (Use this sub-indicator in addition to Core Indicator 10 if applicable)

Number (Expected at PIF)	Number (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Number (Achieved at MTR)	Number (Achieved at TE)

IV: Co Financing

Sources of Co-financing	Name of Co-financier	Type of Co-financing	Investment Mobilized	Anticipated at CEO(\$)	Materialized at MTR(\$)	Materialized at TE(\$)
Recipient Country Government	Ministry of Transport and Provincial Dept of Transport	Grant	Investment mobilized	5,420,000.00	2,500,000.00	13,629,309.00
GEF Agency	World Bank	Loan	Investment mobilized	150,000,000.00	150,000,000.00	150,000,000.00
Recipient Country Government	Hubei, Guangdong, Weifang, Yantai	In-kind	Recurrent expenditures		1,200,000.00	1,200,000.00
Total Co-financing				155,420,000.00	153,700,000.00	164,829,309.00

Comments

V: ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SAFEGUARDS

Overall Project/Program Risk Classification

PIF	CEO Endorsement/Approval	MTR	TE
		Low	Low

Measures to address identified risks and impacts

National PMO assigned an environmental and social focal point to manage the project environmental and social performance, and an Environmental and a Social consultant was contracted separately to assist the approved ESMF implementation. The environmental and social capacity building and training workshops to PMOs or contractors were conducted at least once a year. An effective working mechanism/ procedure for environmental and social assessment was established between PMOs and contractors. Since the outcomes of TA support may have some environmental and social implications going forward, entailing risks, and potentially inducing adverse impacts, TORs on environmental and social assessment were prepared and incorporated into the proposed scope of TA studies or platform development; and environment and social risks were identified, and the corresponding measures were put forward. The ESMF performance was monitored and reviewed by both national PMO and the World Bank through the regular missions and progress reports. Existing Grievance Redress Service (GRS) were used to collect suggestions or complains related to the proposed TA studies and any downstream investments. The Involuntary Resettlement (OP4.12), Natural Habitats (OP4.04), and Indigenous Peoples (OP4.10) were triggered during the appraisal due to precautionary considerations. These policies were not applicable during the implementation of the project since the environment and social impacts screening concluded that no TA contract was to support the preparation of feasibility studies of infrastructure investment, technical designs or other activities directly linked to future investment project (whether or not funded by the World Bank). Overall, the ESMF was well implemented, the project environmental and social performance is satisfactory.

VI. ANNEX

Uploaded Document

Document Category	Title
M and E Document	9682-P159883-2024-ICR-TE-WB-China