

# TERMINAL EVALUATION

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b>I. OVERVIEW .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>A. Description .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>B. Key Dates .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>C. Disbursements .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>II. PROGRESS STATUS AND ISSUES .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>A. Main Terminal Evaluation Findings .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>B. Stakeholder Engagement .....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>C. Gender Equality .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>D. Knowledge Management .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>III. CORE INDICATORS .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>IV: CO FINANCING .....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>V: ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SAFEGUARDS .....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>VI. ANNEX .....</b>	<b>12</b>

## I. Overview

### A. Description

Project name

Combating Illegal and Unsustainable Trade in Endangered Species in Indonesia

Country

Indonesia

GEF ID

9150

Implementing Agency

UNDP

Executing Entity

Government

Trust Fund

GET

Project Type

FSP

Objective

### B. Key Dates

CEO Endorsement/Approval

5/17/2017

Agency Approval

11/17/2017

Implementation Start

11/17/2017

First Disbursement

12/6/2017

Expected MTR

11/17/2020

MTR Submission

3/6/2025

Actual MTR

7/26/2021

Expected Completion

11/17/2023

Actual Completion

10/23/2024

Actual TE

6/19/2024

TE Submission

3/6/2025

Final Disbursement

## C. Disbursements

Project Financing	Cumulative Disbursement
7617850	6759538.16

## II. PROGRESS STATUS AND ISSUES

### A. Main Terminal Evaluation Findings

The CIWT project has been successful in enhancing IWT enforcement at National and subnational levels among government agencies, including, Gakkum, BKSDA, National Parks, National Police, Port Authorities, Customs, and Quarantine. Evidence supporting these findings include:

Ministry of Environment and Forestry (Gakkum, BKSDA):

- Improved legal frameworks and policies have been established, particularly through revisions of existing wildlife protection laws and regulations, aiding Gakkum and BKSDA in better enforcement actions.
- Enhanced capacity building activities, including training sessions for law enforcement officers within these agencies, have been conducted to strengthen their capability in handling IWT cases effectively.

National Parks:

- National Parks personnel have received targeted training and resources to better monitor and respond to IWT activities within park boundaries. This includes the development of new monitoring technologies and methodologies for tracking wildlife movement and detecting poaching activities.

National Police: • Collaboration between the CIWT project and the National Police has been strengthened, leading to more effective joint operations against wildlife trafficking networks. Training programs specifically designed for police officers have enhanced their understanding and skills in tackling IWT.

Port Authorities, Customs, and Quarantine: • The project has implemented specific strategies to enhance the capabilities of Port Authorities, Customs, and Quarantine officials to detect and intercept wildlife trafficking at key ports of entry. This includes the use of advanced scanning technologies and dog squads trained to sniff out illegal wildlife products. • Workshops and training sessions have been provided to these entities to ensure that personnel are well-versed in identifying and handling IWT incidents, which is crucial for the enforcement chain at entry and exit points of the country

The CIWT project has also undertaken community work to begin to address some of the underlying issues driving the IWT. In particular, Human Wildlife Conflict (HWC), hunting practices and cultural traditions of eating meat from animals harvested from the wild.

While the community work undertaken by the CIWT project addressing underlying drivers of IWT has proven effective, this work needs to be scaled up significantly to reach the very large number of local communities living adjacent to protected areas.

The TE acknowledges the excellent work of the CIWT project which has twice received international recognition for its achievements, once for its development of Cyber Patrolling to investigate and prevent IWT

and a second time for the empowerment of women through Perempuan Inspiratif Mitra Polisi Kehutanan (PIMP) or Inspiring Women Partners of Forest Rangers.

## Conclusions

The CIWT project has made a substantial contribution to enhancing enforcement efforts to combat IWT in Indonesia through capacity development, the creation of new tools and improved collaboration and coordination among participating government partners, NGOs and community members.

Significant progress has been made in developing and strengthening the national framework for combatting IWT. This includes the enhancement of legal and policy frameworks, which has improved the overall enforcement capabilities against IWT. Ongoing efforts to refine and implement these frameworks as outlined in the National Strategy and Action Plan (NSAP) 2023-2027 for combatting IWT will play a crucial role.

The CIWT project also effectively built institutional capacity of national and sub-national stakeholders and enhanced Indonesia's participation in international actions, facilitating better implementation and enforcement of wildlife trade regulations at all levels. Training and capacity development focused on strengthening the capabilities of the key stakeholders participating in IWT enforcement, including Gakkum, National Police, BKSDA, National Parks, Port Authorities and Customs and Quarantine.

CIWT targeted key IWT trade ports and ecosystems connected to them, through improved surveillance, the deployment of new technologies, and enhanced inter-agency collaboration and more robust enforcement at these critical points.

The CIWT project also worked extensively at the sub-national and local level where IWT originates. This included four key identified issues that provide important conclusion findings for the CIWT project as discussed under the headings below.

**Local Law Enforcement Training:** The protection of wildlife occurs in areas close to their natural habitat where the CIWT project coordinated joint operations by local law enforcement agencies. Some of these agencies, particularly the national police, and customs and quarantine officers, require specialized wildlife training to enhance their ability to enforce wildlife protection laws and to conduct anti-poaching operations. To support the CIWT project's efforts at increasing cooperation and collaboration among enforcement agencies capacity development was undertaken to provide knowledge of the existing laws that protect wildlife, to provide training and develop tools to allow agencies without wildlife training, to identify relevant plants and animals and to learn the skills needed to handle wildlife, including collecting evidence where needed for prosecutions and for the protection of live animals, that have the potential to be returned to their natural habitat.

**Community Engagement and Empowerment:** Local rural communities possess indigenous ecological knowledge of native wildlife and of the habitats that support native biodiversity, and they may have local knowledge of or in some cases may contribute to the IWT. Local urban communities may contribute to IWT by purchasing "wild meat" or live birds to keep as pets at urban markets with little knowledge of source of the wildlife or the protection status of the species purchase. The CIWT project included activities that engaged local communities to increase their understanding of laws that protect native species and to provide opportunities for their participation in the monitoring and management of wildlife. The Inspiring Women for Forest Rangers program initiated by the CIWT project provided training of community members to collect data and report wildlife crimes, and to participate in conservation efforts, such as forest patrols, conducted by national parks. The TE has concluded the CIWT project has shown community engagement can make an important contribution towards a transformational shift in cultural attitudes regarding the consumption of "wild meat" and the value of protecting native biodiversity.

Work with Local NGOs: CIWT has fostered partnerships with local NGOs and government to work with communities to improve on-the-ground implementation of IWT control. The local Environmental NGOs (ENGOS) that were engaged in the CIWT project provided invaluable experience and in depth knowledge of plants and animals threatened by the IWT. ENGOS typically collect local data on species population statistics, habitat use, HWC, and IWT threats. In the CIWT project, ENGOS provided training to, and developed manuals for, government staff regarding the identification and handling of plants and animals encountered when enforcing IWT laws. ENGOS also conducted research to produce a Veterinary Forensics Guide to Wildlife for use in the enforcement of IWT laws. Local development NGOs equally important and were engaged by the CIWT project to provide their knowledge of local communities and to utilize their capacity to meaningfully engage local communities in transformative change regarding IWT. Local NGOs have the capacity to convey a knowledge of IWT issues and to engage local community members in participatory and collaborative efforts to combat IWT.

Infrastructure and Resource Support: The CIWT project has provided important tools and equipment and training in their use, needed for effective wildlife management at the local level to aid in the surveillance and tracking of wildlife movements and poaching activities. The tools include a mobile app to aid Customs and Quarantine officers who may be unfamiliar with native wildlife, to identify wildlife encountered at control points such as ports and border, where they operate. Providing these kinds of tools and training facilitate and empower officers to collaborate on efforts to combat IWT. CIWT infrastructure support to a national OpsRoom has been extended to two regional OpsRooms and with ongoing support from Gakkum this will be extended to a total of four regional OpsRooms. The CIWT project has demonstrated OpsRoom surveillance and communication among enforcement partners, particularly cyber patrol work, has identified thousands of digital sites involved in IWT that can be pursued through local IWT enforcement.

While there remain unmet needs to further enhance enforcement, such as the revision and approval of Law 5, full operationalizing Intelligence Operation sub-centres, creating mobile tools for species identification, there is an emerging recognition of the need to develop strategies that target efforts to reduce the demand side of IWT. Future efforts to combat IWT should build on the successful efforts of CIWT demand-side reduction, which included work with women rangers, scouts, youth, teachers, women's groups, religious leaders, market sellers and hunters.

## **B. Stakeholder Engagement**

The CIWT project has coordinated excellent cooperation among numerous project stakeholders. The roles and responsibilities of participating government ministries have demonstrated synergistic outcomes because of their collaboration. Some examples include:

- MoU established between Gakkum and the Custom Authority and an MoU between Gakkum and the Quarantine Authorities has enhanced the partnership between these agencies, and strengthened law enforcement measures through more efficient, integrated and systematic enforcement. For example, where Customs may have been unable to accurately identify potential articles of IWT (plant or animal), they have been supported through CIWT trainings in animal handling, zoonosis, protected species identification, quarantine, and illegal wildlife trafficking handling. Wildlife identification is being further enhanced through the creation of an easy-to-use mobile application. (Figure 3).
- Cooperation between the Ministry of Communication and Informatics (MoCI) and the MoEF Operations Room has reduced internet-based cybercrime, through the identification of IWT cyber targets by MoEF and their removal from the internet by MoCI;
- An MoU between the MoEF Operations Room and the Indonesian National Police has provided mutual benefits, including the Operations room identifying wanted persons for the police and the police providing

training to Operations Room staff and passing on information related to IWT to MoEF. In addition, the capacity of police to track mobile phones, supports MoEF field operations.

- An MoU between CIWT and BKSDA supporting their efforts to, for the first time, work collaboratively with a community to develop a Village Regulation to reduce HWC. The initiative included six FGD with participation from the local community, local government with university researchers facilitating.

### C. Gender Equality

The CIWT ProDoc is gender responsive in its design with a comprehensive approach to integrate gender considerations throughout project activities. A Gender Action Plan (GAP) was prepared that highlights several strategies to enhance gender equality and ensure that women are actively involved and benefit from the project.

The CIWT project's design is notably proactive in addressing gender disparities, ensuring women's participation, and promoting gender equality within the scope of combating illegal wildlife trade. This gender-responsive approach has enhanced the effectiveness of the project's conservation efforts by ensuring that they are inclusive and equitable

The CIWT project is a GEN2 Marker project, intended to make a “significant contribution” to gender equality. An excellent study on gender, titled “Toward Gender Equality in Combating Illegal Wildlife Trade. A document of Gender Action Plan for IWT Project in Indonesia & Monitoring Pan” (Nani Saptariani 2019) was prepared for the CIWT project in 2019. The report has noted that while consideration of gender in natural resource management has improved, little research has been done on the role of gender in natural resource law and enforcement (Figure 2).

As stated in the gender study: Hence the combating wildlife hunt and trade strategy need to consider gender roles and social relations to understand the needs, values and beliefs that drive hunting behavior. Thus beside it is urge to increase the capacity of forest ranger and investigator on gender equality perspective in CIWT strategy also increase the number of women forest ranger and investigator under DG GAKKUM should be consider. (Saptariani 2019, page 7).

=====

The TE team has used gender-responsive methodologies to measure the project’s contribution to advancing Gender Equality and Social Inclusion (GESI) results. The TE has considered the extent to which GESI, women’s empowerment and human rights have been considered in the delivery of the project and the extent to which it adheres to and further supports human rights principles. The Evaluation Question Matrix includes questions on cross-cutting issues, including specific questions related to gender equality and women's empowerment.

The TE team reviewed the ProDoc to assess how GESI was intentionally incorporated into project design, including activities directly engaging women, gender responsive development training for implementing partners, gender targets in the SRF and the collection gender disaggregated data. The TE also reviewed the Gender Action Plan and PIR to analyze the implementation, tracking and reporting on gender responsive project activities.

The TE approach used for FGD during the field mission requested equal representation of women where possible for all meetings. In mixed gender FGD the TE team made a concerted effort to engage the women present, to solicit their views and input for the TE. In two instances, women only meetings were held to discuss project activities. The TE data on persons interviewed is gender disaggregated.

In the field the TE team has assessed the ability of the CIWT project design and implementation to achieve social inclusion, including meaningful engagement of Persons with Disability, under-represented cultural groups, youth and elderly. The TE assessed how gender disaggregated data were collected and used by the CIWT project to achieve gender responsive project implementation. The TE has also assessed the CIWT project in the context of Indonesia’s National Policies and Strategies related to women and human rights.

During the field mission the TE team assessed the level of understanding of GESI amongst project staff, government stakeholders and other partners, including their knowledge of the relevance of GESI to project activities and what (if any) effective measures were taken to ensure GESI methods were implemented by the CIWT project.

Climate change is a cross-cutting issue assessed by the TE with consideration of predicted climate change impacts on project interventions, with consideration for how climate change may be a driver of illegal wildlife trade and the greater risks of survival wildlife face due to climate change.

#### D. Knowledge Management

- With CIWT assistance Gakkum has established a comprehensive Intelligence Operations centre (OpsRoom) in Jakarta and is establishing a network of four subcentres.
- The Intelligence Operations of Gakkum has established a Cyber-Patrol Unit that has identified thousands of IWT sites, and with assistance from MoCI, removed a large number of sites from the internet related to IWT.
- Enhanced collaboration among enforcement agencies has led to increased communication and knowledge sharing leading to more effective IWT control.
- The CIWT project has made a significant contribution to gender mainstreaming through the Inspiring Women Partners of Forest Rangers groups established at two national parks, in North Sulawesi and North Sumatra.

### III. Core Indicators

#### Indicator 4 Area of landscapes under improved practices (hectares; excluding protected areas)

Ha (Expected at PIF)	Ha (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Ha (Achieved at MTR)	Ha (Achieved at TE)
0	45000	0	45000

#### Indicator 4.1 Area of landscapes under improved management to benefit biodiversity (hectares, qualitative assessment, non-certified)

Ha (Expected at PIF)	Ha (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Ha (Achieved at MTR)	Ha (Achieved at TE)
	45,000.00		45,000.00

#### Indicator 4.2 Area of landscapes under third-party certification incorporating biodiversity considerations

Ha (Expected at PIF)	Ha (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Ha (Achieved at MTR)	Ha (Achieved at TE)

#### Type/Name of Third Party Certification

#### Indicator 4.3 Area of landscapes under sustainable land management in production systems

Ha (Expected at PIF)	Ha (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Ha (Achieved at MTR)	Ha (Achieved at TE)

**Indicator 4.4 Area of High Conservation Value or other forest loss avoided**

Disaggregation Type	Ha (Expected at PIF)	Ha (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Ha (Achieved at MTR)	Ha (Achieved at TE)
---------------------	----------------------	----------------------------------	----------------------	---------------------

**Indicator 4.5 Terrestrial OECMs supported**

Name of the OECMs	WDPA-ID	Total Ha (Expected at PIF)	Total Ha (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Total Ha (Achieved at MTR)	Total Ha (Achieved at TE)
-------------------	---------	----------------------------	--	----------------------------	---------------------------

**Documents (Document(s) that justifies the HCVF)**

Title
-------

**Indicator 11 People benefiting from GEF-financed investments**

	Number (Expected at PIF)	Number (Expected at CEO Endorsement)	Number (Achieved at MTR)	Number (Achieved at TE)
<b>Female</b>			265	978
<b>Male</b>			265	2,562
<b>Total</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>530</b>	<b>3,540</b>

#### IV: Co Financing

Sources of Co-financing	Name of Co-financier	Type of Co-financing	Investment Mobilized	Anticipated at CEO(\$)	Materialized at MTR(\$)	Materialized at TE(\$)
GEF Agency	UNDP	Grant	Investment mobilized	100000		100000
Recipient Country Government	Ministry of Env and Forestry	In-kind	Investment mobilized	42848742		54759029
Civil Society Organization	Wildlife conservation Society	Grant		2000000		777995
Recipient Country Government	Ministry of Env and Forest	Grant			25348905	
Civil Society Organization		In-kind	Investment mobilized			
<b>Total Co-financing</b>				<b>44,948,742.00</b>	<b>25,348,905.00</b>	<b>55,637,024.00</b>

Comments

The lead government agency, MoEF, committed a substantial amount of in-kind support for implementation of project activities (\$42,848,742). The actual amount reported at the time of the TE was US \$54,759,029 (Table 3), 28% greater than the original commitment. The TE observed significant engagement of a wide-range of national and sub-national government agencies in the participation of CIWT capacity development meetings, trainings, and workshops and their commitment to the implementation of a wide range of project activities.

V: ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL SAFEGUARDS

Overall Project/Program Risk Classification

PIF	CEO Endorsement/Approval	MTR	TE
		Medium/Moderate	Medium/Moderate

Measures to address identified risks and impacts

A Social and Environmental Screening Process (SESP) was undertaken during project design which is included as Annex 10 in the ProDoc. The SESP identified five risks, including four social risks. The SESP assessed the level of potential impact and probability of each risk, and assigned a level of significance of low to two risks and moderate to three risks, none were considered high risks (see Annex 11). The SESP also outlined how the project was designed to mitigate the risks identified.

The SESP social and environmental risks and TE analysis of each risk is provided below:

Risk 1: Adverse impacts on human rights of local communities, including marginalized groups.

- The TE found no evidence of adverse impacts on human rights, including marginalized groups
- There remain significant linkages between the IWT and distinct cultural groups that need to be understood and incorporated into efforts to combat IWT. For example, in North Sumatra recent migration and settlement of persons from Aceh Province within degraded (previously logged) portions of the Gunung Leuser National Park is leading to HWC which is linked to IWT. In North Sulawesi there is a strong cultural tradition of eating wild meat, which supports IWT

Risk 2: Restricted access to natural resources due to enhanced enforcement for local communities, including marginalized groups.

- The CIWT project has included awareness raising that has improved local understanding of hunting and trading restrictions on protected species inside and outside protected areas and hunting and trading restrictions on all species located within protected areas

Risk 3: Exclusion of potentially affected stakeholders, in particular marginalized groups, from participating in decisions that might affect them.

- The revision of Law 5 focuses on enhancing law enforcement for protected species, some of which may be traditional food sources

- Community awareness of the laws for protected species has been a core part of community engagement

Risk 4: Indonesian law enforcement agencies do not apply the law correctly.

- Capacity development of IWT laws has been a core component working with CIWT stakeholders, including, Gakkum, BKSDA, Police, Customs, Quarantine and Port Authorities

Risk 5: Project activities are within or adjacent to environmentally sensitive areas including PAs.

- CIWT has enhanced the protection of PAs, through snare patrols, establishment of women volunteer rangers, community awareness raising, and community engagement to address HWC

TE review of the risk register updates in the PIR noted the following new SESP risk and recommended management strategy:

The 2022 PIR documents a substantial risk related to overlapping claims for land and resources. To address SESP Standard 6 on Indigenous Peoples the recommended management approach was the development of three specific documents: an Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA), a Stakeholder Engagement Plan (SEP), and an Indigenous Peoples Plan (IPP). These documents were prepared to integrate recommendations into the remaining project activities through a multistakeholder validation workshop.

## VI. ANNEX

Uploaded Document

Document Category

M and E Document

Title

Tracking Tool

Document Category

M and E Document

Title

TE Indonesia (GEF 9150 / UNDP 5391)