

ADB GEF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION REPORT (PIR)

(This report covers implementation period from July 1, 2022 to June 30, 2023)

ADB Official Project Title: Secondary Green Cities Development Project
ADB Project Number: 47274-003

I. GEF PROJECT SUMMARY

Development Objective Rating (DO): Satisfactory (S)

Implementation Progress Rating (IP): Moderately Satisfactory (MS)

Risk Rating: Modest Risk (M)

Information on Progress, challenges and outcomes on project implementation activities

The GEF grant is linked to the ADB financed Secondary Green Cities Development Project (SGCDP). There were changes to the project processing in terms of the lending modality, from a result-based lending (RBL) loan to a standard investment loan. In addition to this, the administration of the Technical Assistance (TA 9417) Output 1 (National Policy Framework for Environmental Planning and Green Development) and Output 4 (Replication of Green City Action Plan (GCAPs) to Provincial /City Level) was delegated to the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MONRE). The change of lending modality and delegation of administration caused some delays in the TA implementation. ADB also provides technical support to MONRE to prepare the project document for government approval, term of reference (TOR) development, training clinic on procurement and training on gender for implementation of delegated outputs and reviewing the procurement process and procedures. ADB is administering Output 3 (Disaster Risk Financing – by Urban Climate Change Resilience Trust Fund (UCCRTF)) and Output 2 (Demonstration of GCAPs in Hue, Ha Giang, and Vinh Yen).

ADB-administered Outputs 2 and 3:

ADB appointed a consulting firm (ICEM and Nippon Koei Joint Venture) to implement a large consulting contract to deliver most of the TA outputs under Output 2. The contract is for 24 months, from July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2023, with an extension to December 31, 2023. It is likely that this will be extended again, and the scope of the current contract increased (see below).

Output 2 consultant presented the final Climate Vulnerability Assessment (CVA) methodology to MONRE PMU in September 2022 and to the three city PMU in June 2023 for developing a standard vulnerability assessment methodology.

Output 2 Consultant developed a portfolio, one-page summary sheet of 7 demonstration projects at concept stage and submitted to ADB in July 2022 and the updated version in August 2022. The original scope for the output 2 consultant included the “Detailed design of the climate proofing demonstration projects. Procure equipment required for implementation, using green materials and procurement principles.” For up to \$700,000 of goods and equipment. This formed part of the overall TA target of \$1.5m expenditure on goods and equipment for demonstrating the climate proofing projects. Due to issues related to master planning, loan savings, and availability of public land, the scope of suitable Nature-based Solutions (NbS) demonstration projects has been changed to preparation of 3 Detailed Engineering

Designs (DEDs) for 3 cities, i.e., Road Bridge Transition over Me Stream in Ha Giang Park near the Vinh Phuc High School for the Gifted in Vinh Yen, and Embankment of Trinh Cong Son Park near Dong Ba Market in Hue . The three DEDs will be completed by Q4/ 2023.

It is proposed to re-allocate \$500,000 of the \$700,000 provision sum available for the purchase of climate proofing goods and equipment to consulting services to prepare a large climate adaptation project in Thua Thien Hue Province. The re-allocation memo is currently being prepared by the project team, and the scope of work for the consultants would be increased to include surveying, bathymetry of the Hue Lagoon, flood modelling and coastal sediment transport modelling to prepare a new drainage and coastal protection project for Hue, which would be the subject of a future ADB loan.

The remaining \$200,000 provisional sum would be spent on the implementation of a Nature Based Solutions training hub at Hanoi University of Civil Engineering, and in training the first cohort of engineers from around the country in the design and construction of Nature Based Solution infrastructure.

Output 2 Consultant submitted the Output 2.1 Report *on Strengthening and Greening City Planning Process* in August 2022 and was approved by ADB in November 2022 for completing the comprehensive review of 11 national technical standards TCVNs (Vietnam Standards) and proposing 10 New Nature-Based Solutions (NbS) and Water Sensitive Urban Design (WSUD) TCVNs as well as completing the unit cost database and new cost norm for applying Nature-based Solutions. The report recommended 24 climate change adaptation solutions.

The Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) evaluates the economic performance of green infrastructure when compared to conventional approaches. The CBA analysis is looking at the costs and benefits of one civil work package in Hue, i.e. HU-CW03: *Dredging, Drainage, Pavement of Lakes in 4 Inner City Wards, and Embankment of Dong Ba River*. The Output 2 consultant solicited the service of Environment Institute of Vietnam (EEI-Vietnam) based in Hue to survey baseline data of socio-economic conditions of 400 selected households in Hue citadel. EEI- Vietnam submitted to Output 2 Consultant the final survey results in November 2022. Output 2 Consultant will submit the final results of DEDs anytime soon.

Up to now, Output 2 consultant has conducted 6 field missions, including Mission 3 from September 5-24, 2022 to discuss the feedback of 3 cities on the technical summary sheet for demonstration projects; Mission 4 from December 11-17, 2022 to discuss the revised scope of demonstration projects; Mission 5 from March 13-22, 2023 to undertake participatory mapping and survey identified hazards, data quality, environmental modelling and GIS capacity need assessment; and Mission 6 from June 26, to July 28, 2023 to prepare the preliminary design, undertake technical design activities for DEDs in 3 project cities, to prepare design concept option, training hub at Hanoi University of Civil Engineering (HUCE) campus, stakeholder interview for NbS policy brief, support to other activities (i.e. CVA).

Assessment of Global Environment Benefits (GEB) of TA Output 2: the contribution framework to the Global Environment Benefits (GEB) has been prepared in August 2022 and updated in July 2023. Meetings have been held on August 12, 2022 and July 27, 2023 and Output 2 consultant will calculate GEB indicators. The GEB indicator report will be available by the end of October 2023. The GEB report will include the matrix for the GEF implementation review with the TA output 2 to GEF outcomes. The contribution of TA Output 2 has been evaluated for two GEB focus areas: Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation (CCA and CCM) and Biodiversity. GEB indicators include, for example, number of direct beneficiaries affected by TA Output, land areas converted through demonstration project, reduction in vulnerability to climate

threats, reduction in urban flooding, number of standards or regulation updated, increase in NPV and EIRR of the demonstration. The indicator calculations will be included in the mid-term review (MTR).

The implementation of UCCRTF-funded TA Output 3 (Disaster Risk Financing in Hue) reached the final stage of piloting public asset disaster risk insurance, which required the Prime Minister's approval since this is the first in Viet Nam. The proposed insurance pilot scheme was welcomed and supported by Thua Thien Hue provincial government as well as the Ministry of Finance. A long process has been followed and valuable insight into the required legal process has been completed. However, the Government has not approved the insurance and during a series of meetings, have informed ADB that approval for the Hue project is not possible prior to the publication of general guidelines for provinces on disaster risk insurance. Therefore, ADB will recommend that the UCCRTF funding allocation for the insurance purchase be returned to the donor.

MONRE Delegated Outputs 1 and 4:

MONRE PMU's procurement progress accelerated significantly during Q2, 2023. Until now, MONRE PMU has been staffed with 5 officials assigned from Pollution Control Department (PCD, restructured from VEA because of MONRE's organizational restructure – details of this organization restructure are mentioned in project minor change) and Institute for Strategy and Policy on Natural Resources and Environment (ISPONRE), 6 national individual consultants to support the project implementation. MONRE procurement plan consists of 8 individual consultant selection (addition of one proposed technical support position due to the massive workload is being processed), 03 non-technical packages and 17 technical packages. Among 17 technical packages, 05 QCBS packages have been in the implementation as follow:

- TA9417-VEA-QCBS-02: *Review and Revise National Technical Standards on Environment Quality*; contract will be signed and first payment expects in Q4/2023
- TA9417-VEA-QCBS-07: *Update action plan (GCAP) for Hue, Vinh Yen, and Ha Giang and Develop Air Quality Management Plans in several project cities and pilot in at least 2 Project Cities*: The project is working currently on GCAP International Experience and 3 GCAPs Review for project cities Hue, Vinh Yen, and Ha Giang Report, targeting 2nd milestone payment in the Q4/2023
- TA9417-VEA-QCBS-11: *Pilot at least 01 Advanced Technology to Recycle Waste into Environment Friendly Products in 01 City*: The project currently working on reviewing and assessment of waste recycling in 4 cities, targeting 2nd milestone payment at the end of Q3/2023 or beginning Q 4/2023
- TA9417-VEA-QCBS-12: *Investigate and Assess the Level of Soil Pollution at 01 Polluted Area. Choose to Support Piloting Treatment and Restoration of Environment in Service of Land Use Conversion*. The project is currently surveying the soil pollution in Hung Yen. The final findings for soil sampling and analysis are available and report is being finalized, targeting the 3rd milestone payment in Q3/2023.
- TA9417-ISP-QCBS-02: *Review and Develop GHG inventory methodology and guidance for MRV Monitoring, Conduct Low Carbon Technology Emission Reduction potential to propose low carbon tech. portfolio, and pilot GHG inventory assessment and MRV in 03 Cities (Ha Giang, Vinh Yen and Hue)*/ The project is currently working on (i) the Report on GHG Inventory; (ii) Review of GHG Policy, Technical Standards in Vietnam and other Countries; (iii) GHG Methodology for Cities in Vietnam, targeting 2nd milestone payment in Q4/2023

13 other MONRE QCBS packages have been in different stages of procurement process:

- 03 packages completed Submission 3 (Financial Evaluation and Contract Negotiation) and ready for contract awards:
 - TA9417-VEA-QCBS-01: *Develop Legal Documents Guiding the Implementation of Environmental Protection Law 2020 related to environmental protection and climate change response for developing secondary green cities in Vietnam;*
 - TA9417-VEA-QCBS-02: *Review and Revise National Technical Standards on Environmental Quality;*
 - TA9417-VEA-QCBS-04: *Develop the eco-label criteria, pilot and finalize the certification process for 05 products, carrying out the solutions on circular economy, sustainable/environment-friendly production and consumption in the secondary cities.*
- 05 packages in the process of Submission 2 (Technical Evaluation):
 - TA9417-VEA-QCBS-03: *Review and revise/develop policies on sustainable consumption, environmentally friendly production and climate change adaptation for developing secondary green cities in Vietnam;*
 - TA9417-VEA-QCBS-08: *Expand the planning with consideration to environmental quality improvement and management and climate change adaptation for the selected 03 secondary cities;*
 - TA9417-VEA-QCBS-09: *Expand the planning with consideration to environmental quality improvement and management and climate change adaptation for the selected 03 secondary cities;*
 - TA9417-VEA-QCBS-13: *International Consulting Firm provides Technical Assistance to VEA's activities related to urban environmental management and ISPONRE's activities related to GHG inventory, climate vulnerability assessment, developing training and communication program;*
 - TA9417-ISP-QCBS-03: *Conduct Capacity Need Assessment, develop and conduct training program for GHG Inventory, low-carbon emission, climate risk vulnerability assessment, green public procurement...for secondary cities.*
- 03 packages in the process of Submission 1 (Shortlisting):
 - TA9417-VEA-QCBS-06: *Support to develop the env monitoring program, set up mechanism for managing, information sharing envi. Database among Ministries, line agencies and local gov related project cities, pilot the env. Program in at least 01 project city;*
 - TA9417-VEA-QCBS-10: *Review, evaluate the results of implementing pilot model of saving, reuse and applying new technology in wastewater treatment for a population, business and serves entities in Component 1, to replicate this model in selected cities*
 - TA9417-ISP-QCBS-04: *Develop and implement Communications Activities for GHG Inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, ecology assessment, circular economy, green public procurement... for targeted groups, incl. authorities, policy makers, enterprises, community.*
- 01 package (TA9417-VEA-QCBS-05: *Enhancing management capacity and experience sharing on environment, land-use and climate resilience for MONRE officials*): TOR was approved by ADB and has been submitted to PCD.
- and 01 package (TA9417-ISP-QCBS-01: *Review, develop the Climate Vulnerability Assessment methodology and pilot in 03 cities (Hue, Ha Giang, and Vinh Yen)* in the process of revising TOR for changing the procurement method from QCBS to CQS.

Assessment of Global Environment Benefits (GEB) of MONRE QCBS packages:

The contribution framework of MONRE packages to the Mid-Term Report (MTR) has been discussed and GEB indicators prepared to suit each package. A meeting was held on July 28, 2023 with MONRE PMU and Consultants of VEA-QCBS-07 (*Update GCAPs of 3 Project Cities*) and VEA-QCBS12 (*Treatment of Soil Pollution*) as well as VEA-CQS-15 (*Mid-term and Final Assessment*). MONRE consultants will calculate GEB indicators and GEB indicator report will be available by the end of January 2024. The report will be consolidated in the MTR report. The contributions to GEB of MONRE packages have been evaluated mainly for three GEB focus areas: Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation (CCA and CCM), Biodiversity, and Chemicals and Waste.

Information on Progress, challenges and outcomes on Environment and Social Safeguards

GEF funds are used to provide associated technical support and capacity development to the baseline SGCDP project. There are no additional risks or concerns associated with the GEF funds over the baseline. Hence, the management of safeguards for GEF funds is through the management of safeguards of the baseline investment projects. The technical assistance is not anticipated to generate significant adverse environmental impacts during operation. The GEF administered funds will not be involved in the parts of the project related to involuntary resettlement and will not fund activities related to involuntary resettlement.

Information on Progress, challenges and outcomes on stakeholder engagement

A comprehensive stakeholder analysis was undertaken in a participatory manner during the preparatory phase of the SGCDP. The objectives of the stakeholder analysis were to (i) Identify the key stakeholders and their support for the project or possible vested interests that may be opposed to the project, and their means of doing so; and (ii) Develop measures to mitigate any identified resistance to and facilitate general agreement with the project. Further, following approval of the two PIFs for Special Climate Change Fund (SCCF) and Sustainable Cities Integrated Approach Pilot (SCIAP), a GEF-specific stakeholder consultation was undertaken to refine the components and outcomes. This included visits to each of the target cities for formal meetings with city officials and technical meetings with city and provincial staff and site visits to proposed demonstration projects and update the demonstration projects. Additional high level and technical level discussions have also been held with key national government agencies (MOF, MONRE, MPI) to further develop the national perspective and city-national integration and national upscaling. The stakeholder analysis also included the mass unions, civil society, NGOs in Viet Nam and overseas, networks, professional associations, community-based organizations, affected communes and residents, vulnerable and other sectors of the society, and private sector. An inception workshop was held on April 9, 2021 with the steering committee members, representatives of the ADB loan project PMUs in Vinh Yen, Hue, Ha Giang, the MONRE team, the ADB project team (and Country Director), as well as representatives of researchers, professional associations, and private sector to update the project progress and further implementation of delegated outputs to MONRE, and strengthening the overall coordination of the TA. The Project Steering Committee was currently enhanced through MONRE Vice Minister's official decision no.1150/QD-BTNMT dated 8 June 2021 on official establishment of project steering committee (PSC). Because of recent key change in MONRE management leaders (change of MONRE Minister as well as Country Director/Deputy Country Director of ADB Viet Nam Resident Mission), MONRE PMU is processing internal protocol to update list of PSC members and get it approved within MONRE by the end of 2023. Capacity assessment will be carried out to MONRE officials as well as

stakeholders in 3 project cities and in other secondary cities. Hue PMU mobilized the culture heritage consultant as part of CSC to support additional consultation/disclosure.

Information on Progress on gender-responsive measures

The Secondary Green Cities Development Project (SGCDP) is classified as “Effective Gender Mainstreaming (EGM)”. During the preparation of the SGCDP, a gender assessment was undertaken for each city, and a rapid assessment was undertaken for each priority sub-project. A gender action plan (GAP) was prepared to (i) ensure women participate in and benefit from the activities; and (ii) monitor gender-specific aspects and benefits realization during the implementation phase. Gender Action Plan Monitoring Table was updated during ADB Review Mission in November 2022. Gender training was provided to MONRE PMU on June 1, 2021 by the ADB Gender Consultant with the participation of 6 members from the MONRE PMU including 3 female staff (50%). The gender training focused on the Gender Action Plan (GAP), gender mainstreaming, gender indicators, and other gender related requirements for the TA. Three PMUs (Ha Giang, Vinh Yen and Hue) conducted gender mainstreaming and (GAP) orientation for 34 PMUs staff including 9 female staff (26.5%). Hue PMU conducted gender mainstreaming training for 45 EA/IA staffs including 28 (62.2%) female staff responsible for GCAP planning and implementation. The gender indicator for PMU has been revised to ensure at least 35% of staff being hired in 3 PMUs are women.

Knowledge activities/ Products

Many lessons will be learnt, both regarding engineering issues and policy issues. Hence, the lessons learned from the process will be disseminated, including by feeding into: (i) the preparation of new and/or updated green cities action plans (Output 1 and 4); (ii) the design of a new national policy framework and monitoring framework for sustainable cities (Output 1); and (iii) the design of a green financing mechanism for sustainable cities (Output 3). Information sharing on the process and the results will also be facilitated through the Viet Nam Sustainable Cities Cluster and Network.

As an SCIAP child project, the TA is supported by the Global Platform for Sustainable Cities (GPSC). GPSC supports knowledge capture and knowledge exchange, both amongst the SCIAP participating cities, and with external initiatives and cities. The proposed Project will be actively involved with the overall SCIAP, sharing knowledge on a regular basis through GPSC, and constantly learning from GPSC through its involvement in GPSC networks and learning events.

The Project also takes place within the broader ADB Green Cities Initiative. Through this network, the Project will share lessons and knowledge with cities across Asia. The ADB knowledge management resources support the urban development specialists and community practice members to collect data, learn lessons, and prepare documentation and publications. ADB has strong technical units responsible for collecting data, learning lessons and sharing knowledge notably through web events, conferences and publications. This includes close coordination with the Asia-Pacific Adaptation Network and Forum. For example, the study tour to Singapore further promoted the nature-based approach, which is incorporated in the green design, water sensitive features of the investments in the loan project as well as in the TA implementation in the development of scope of work and procurement for the demonstrated sustainable and resilient development in Hue, Ha Giang, and Vinh Yen (TA Output 2). ADB has also issued a knowledge product on water sensitive urban design, and published articles relating to the project (Dev Asia, Viet Nam

Investment Review). A knowledge management consultant has been appointed to help prepare knowledge products (video material) and started filming in Hue and Vinh Yen at the end of May 2022.

Under Output 1, knowledge management and sharing aim to assemble and share knowledge generated by this project as a whole, in which, knowledge products such as technical manuals, user manuals, toolkits, pilot studies to be developed to support the national framework of environmental analysis, planning and management tools and policies for cities in Viet Nam. The project knowledge products will be shared through the media, knowledge products, networks, seminars involving central agencies, provincial and city officials. This also supports international sharing of the project outputs with the GEF Sustainable Cities Program, ADB and other development partners, and other international stakeholders working on similar guidelines and toolkits.

Output 2 consultant presented CVA methodology to MONRE PMU, review and development of new technical standards (TCVNs) to 3 project cities with female participation. The TA will draw on MONRE's experience as Executing Agency to ensure lessons are captured and knowledge is shared. Notably, active involvement is planned for the Viet Nam Environment Agency (VEA) later on is Pollution Control Department (PCD) and ISPONRE. MONRE will ensure that knowledge is shared through the appropriate Vietnamese channels and this has been reflected in development of MONRE procurement plan.

The POP MONRE meetings will disseminate information on the international regulatory framework, updates on Best Available Techniques (BAT)/Best Environment Practices (BEP) show to deal with POPs and hazardous chemicals, content and process requirements procedures for the management of POPs and hazardous chemicals across borders and will facilitate international cooperation and coordination mechanisms to improve the effectiveness of the Conventions.

Three MONRE packages have been dedicated to knowledge sharing using different tools: ISP-QCBS-03: *Conduct Capacity Need Assessment, develop and conduct training program for GHG Inventory, low-carbon emission, climate risk vulnerability assessment, green public procurement...for secondary cities*; ISP-QCBS-04: *Develop and implement Communications Activities for GHG Inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, ecology assessment, circular economy, green public procurement... for targeted groups, incl. authorities, policy makers, enterprises, community*; and VEA-QCBS05: *MONRE Management Capacity and Experience Sharing*

Grievances

Grant for Energy Efficiency for Street Lighting System in Ha Giang: Package HG -CW-08

ADB issued a no objection letter to the Ha Giang PMU on the recommendation of the proposed bidder and contract award on September 21, 2022. The PMU has issued an invitation to the first ranked contractor to attend contract negotiations. However, due to the receipt of a complaint regarding the evaluation process, the PMU was advised by the ADB team to clarify the matters raised in the complaint with the bidders and report back. The PMU requested additional information regarding the reference contracts, and by mid-June 2023, Ha Giang PMU submitted the revised BER with recommendation to cancel the bid, finding that both bidders failed to meet the qualification criteria. On 12 July 2023, ADB issued no objection to the Ha Giang PMU's request to conclude the current bidding process of the package following the determination that there are no qualified bids. On July 31, 2023 one bidder submitted request for a debriefing meeting to Ha Giang PMU (ADB project team was copied) on the bidding results.

A response letter dated August 3, 2023 from Ha Giang PMU was issued to the requesting bidder providing an explanation why such bid was not selected. Ha Giang PMU is recommended to prepare to re-bid the package and submit the updated Bidding Document to ADB for review and approval.

GEO LOCATION INFORMATION

Location Name	Latitude (WGS84 Format)	Longitude (WGS84 Format)	GEO Name ID	Location Description	Activity Description
Hue Imperial City, Thua Thien Hue, Viet Nam	N 16° 28' 31"	E 107° 34' 17"	N/A	Disaster Risk Financing (funded by UCCRTF)	Purchase pilot disaster risk insurance (funded by UCCRTF)
Ha Giang City, Ha Giang, Viet Nam	N 22° 49' 9"	E 104° 57' 24"	N/A	Energy Efficiency for Street Lighting System	Provision of an estimated of the of 1,500 LED bulbs for Ha Giang city
Vinh Yen City, Vinh Phuc, Viet Nam	N 21° 18' 19"	E 105° 35' 40"	N/A	Industrial city in the Red River Delta	Dam Vac Lake in the city center

PROJECT MINOR CHANGE IN SCOPE/MINOR AMMENDMENTS

- ☐ Results framework
- ☐ Components and cost
- ☒ Institutional and implementation arrangements
- ☐ Financial management
- ☒ Implementation schedule
- ☐ Executing Entity
- ☐ Executing Entity Category
- ☐ Minor project objective change
- ☐ Safeguards
- ☐ Risk analysis
- ☐ Increase of GEF project financing up to 5%
- ☐ Co-financing
- ☐ Location of project activity
- ☐ Other

(i) Implementation Schedule

- February 22, 2023: A minor change memo (see attachment xx) requesting for a 24-month extension of TA completion date to December 31, 2025 was approved by VRM Management. This extension compensates for 2.5-year delays in MONRE's components and will allow the pending TA activities to be completed. For ADB-administered components, the extension will allow to implement the pilot activities under Output 3.

(ii) Institutional and Implementation Arrangements

- April 18, 2023: MONRE PMU Deputy Director and staff of International Cooperation Department) to attend series of meetings under scope of the Conference of the Parties (COP) to the Basel, Rotterdam and Stockholm conventions in Geneva, Switzerland, from May 1-12, 2023. This proposed minor change is under Output 1 and 4 funded by GEF. The PMU management's participation in the convention meetings relates to several TA activities under MONRE's delegated output, especially developing national regulatory instruments for the management of Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs).

- April 5, 2023: An approved minor change requested to change in selection method of the consulting package TA9417-ISP QCBS-01: *Review, develop the climate vulnerability assessment methodology, and pilot in 03 cities (Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen)* from current the current Quality Cost Based Selection (QCBS) to Consultant Qualification Selection (CQS). The proposed CQS is therefore a suitable procurement method for this assignment.
- April 3, 2023: An approved minor change memo requested a change of MONRE implementing agency from the Viet Nam Environmental Administration to Pollution Control Department. The new Project Management Unit (PMU) was established on January 18, 2023, under the Pollution Control Department. This change complies with the recent restructuring under MONRE, which takes effective from January 1, 2023. The Executing Agency (EA) confirmed that although the MONRE has been restructured, there are no changes in other management aspects such as organizational structure, segregation of duties, internal controls, internal audit, audit reporting line, disbursement arrangement, financial reporting, and auditing arrangements, etc.

FOR SCCF/LDCF INDICATORS:

Total Number of Beneficiaries	Male: Female: Will be consolidated in the mid-term report
Area of land managed for climate resilience (ha)	Will be consolidated in the mid-term report
Total no. of policies/plans that will mainstream climate resilience	Will be consolidated in the mid-term report
No. of risk and vulnerability assessments, and other relevant scientific and technical assessments carried out and updated	
Total number of people trained	Male: Female: Will be consolidated in the mid-term report
No. of people trained to identify, prioritize, implement, monitor and/or evaluate adaptation strategies and measures	Will be consolidated in the mid-term report
No. of regional, national and sub-national institutions with strengthened capacities to identify, prioritize, implement, monitor and/or evaluate adaptation strategies and measures	Will be consolidated in the mid-term report
Contribute towards public awareness of climate change impacts, vulnerability and adaption (Tick if relevant)	Will be consolidated in the mid-term report
Expand access to improved climate information services (Tick if relevant)	Will be consolidated in the mid-term report
Expand access to improved climate related early-warning information (Tick if relevant)	Will be consolidated in the mid-term report
No. of regional, national and sector-wide policies, plans and processes developed or strengthened to identify, prioritize and integrate adaptation strategies and measures	Will be in consolidated in the mid-term report
No. of sub-national plans and processes developed or strengthened to identify, prioritize and integrate adaptation strategies and measures	Will be consolidated in the mid-term report

II. Project Profile

1. General Information	1	GEF ID	: 6924 / 9484
	2	Focal Area(s)	: Climate Change (ID6924) / Multi Focal Area (ID9484)
	3	Region	: Southeast Asia
	4	Country	: Viet Nam
	5	GEF Project Title	: Promoting Climate Resilience in Viet Nam Cities (ID6924)/ Integrated Approaches for Sustainable Cities in Viet Nam (ID9484)
	6	Project Size (FSP; MSP)	: FSP
	7	Trust Fund (GEFTF; SCCF; LDCF)	: SCCF (ID6924) / GEFTF (ID9484)
2. Milestone Dates	8	GEF CEO Endorsement Date	: August 30, 2016 (ID6924)/ December 14, 2016 (ID9484)
	9	ADB Approval Date if the GEF Fund	: October 31, 2017
	10	GEF Grant Signing of the GEF Fund	: June 27, 2018
	11	Implementation Start Date of the Project and of the GEF Component	: April 14, 2019
	12	Date of 1st GEF Grant Disbursement	: November 08, 2019
	13	Final date of GEF Grant Disbursement	: N/A
	14	Proposed/Revised Implementation End	: December 31, 2025
	15	Actual Implementation End	: N/A
	16	Expected Financial Closure Date	: June 30, 2026
	17	Actual Financial Closure Date	: N/A
3. Funding	18	PPG/PDF Funding (USD)	
	19	GEF Grant (USD)	: \$4,566,210 (ID6924)/ \$ 8,256,881 (ID9484)
	20	Total GEF Fund Disbursement as of 30 June 2023(USD)	: \$1,789,927
	21	Confirmed Co-Finance at CEO Endorsement (USD)	: \$ 77,897,100 (ID6924) \$ 148,472,900 (ID9484)
	21	Materialized Co-Finance at project mid-term (USD)	:
	22	Materialized Co-Finance at project completion (USD)	:
4. Evaluations	23	Proposed Mid-term date (mm/dd/yy)	: March 4 – 8, 2024
	24	Actual Mid-Term date - if applicable (mm/dd/yy)	
	25	Proposed Terminal Evaluation date (mm/dd/yy)	: November 30, 2025

26	Actual Terminal Evaluation Date (mm/dd/yy)
27	Tracking Tools Required (Yes/No/ Focal Area TT)
28	Tracking Tools Date - if applicable (mm/dd/yy) Midterm Tracking Tool Terminal Evaluation Tracking Tool

III. Project Implementation

A. Project Description:

The GEF Grant supports (i) TA 9417-VIE, a \$12.82 million Technical Assistance (\$ 10.82 million by GEF and \$2 million by UCCRTF) is attached to the Secondary Green Cities Development Project and (ii) Grant 0549-VIE, a \$2 million Grant Investment for Energy Efficiency for Street Lighting in Ha Giang is blended into the investment loan. The TA has 3 components and associated outcomes.

1. Component 1: Strengthen City Planning Processes

Outcome 1.1: Integrated, resilient planning in 3 cities. The Grant provides technical support to Ha Giang, Hue and Vinh Yen as they implement the existing GCAPs and then prepare updated, improved green city action plans (GCAP). Capacity will be built in the three cities through their involvement in these processes – i.e. on the job capacity development. This will result in a strengthened city planning process that mainstreams green planning/design approaches, resilience and the GCAP process into city master plans for spatial and socio-economic development.

Outcome 1.2: Replicating integrated, resilient planning in six cities: Six additional secondary cities will be selected based on (i) their readiness and commitment to take a GCAP approach, (ii) their potential for reducing GHG emissions, (iii) their vulnerability to climate and other risks; and (iv) assessments of infrastructure, services and capacity gaps. The alternative will support preparation of integrated urban development plans and build capacity in the six cities to prepare and implement plans.

2. Component 2: Demonstrating Low Impact and Climate Resilient Development

Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments. Outcome 2.1 will support a rigorous and cost-effective process that contributes to overall climate resilience at the city level. The process will involve (i) full definition of threats; (ii) selection of priority sub-projects and possibly some new investments for climate proofing; (iii) re-scoping or re-design of the priority sub-projects to ensure they are more resilient; (iv) supplying necessary goods/equipment as needed for the modified designs; and (v) capturing the knowledge. The whole process will be implemented through an approach that develops national and city capacity.

Outcome 2.2: Demonstrating an integrated package of investments that lead to transition to low impact, low carbon development in Ha Giang city. In Ha Giang, the alternative will demonstrate how to practically implement an integrated approach, how this can generate synergies, and how this can nudge a smaller secondary city onto a green, integrated, resilient pathway. The integrated package of technologies will contribute to reduced GHG emissions, improved urban livability, increased resilience of vulnerable populations, community development, and positive impacts on biodiversity.

Outcome 2.3: Demonstrating community-based and insurance-based resilience. This outcome is totally financed by UCCRTF co-financing and will be implemented within the framework of GEF activities, and through the same management, monitoring and learning framework.

3. Component 3: Improved Enabling Environment for Upscaling Integrated, Resilient Approaches

Outcome 3.1: Strengthened enabling institutional environment. The GEF supported alternative will strengthen the national framework that provides the foundation and incentives for the adoption of integrated, low carbon, low impact, resilient planning by secondary cities across Viet Nam. This will facilitate replication, upscaling and institutionalization of the successes. The policy and technical support will focus mostly on MONRE and related institutes.

In terms of implementation activities of the TA in Viet Nam, the whole TA consists of 4 interrelated Outputs, 3 Outputs funded by GEF and one by UCCRTF as follows:

- **Output 1:** Formulated national regulatory framework for an enabling environment for sustainable and resilient cities.
- **Output 2:** Demonstrated sustainable and resilient development in Ha Giang, Hue, and Vinh Yen.
- **Output 3:** Prepared and tested innovative climate risk financing in Hue (funded by UCCRTF).
- **Output 4:** Enhanced and replicated integrated and resilient environmental planning at the city and provincial levels.

ADB administers Output 2 & 3. Administration of Outputs 1&4 was delegated to MONRE.

B. Implementation Progress (IP) Rating:

The GEF grant was endorsed by the GEF CEO on August 30, 2016 under the Special Climate Change Fund (SCCF) and October 31, 2017 under GEF Trust Fund and linked to the Sustainable Cities Integrated Approach Pilot (SCIAP).

The GEF grant was initially proposed to be linked to the ADB financed Secondary Green Cities Development Project, implemented through a result-based lending (RBL) modality. However, subsequent to the GEF grant endorsement, ADB proposed to change the lending modality to a standard investment loan. This was done due to the limited experience in Viet Nam with result-based lending and concern that this may complicate implementation.

Subsequently, the lending modality was revised based on agreement with the State Bank of Viet Nam (SBV) and the 3 participating cities, as well as consultation with MONRE. This caused a delay in the approval of the ADB loan of approximately 11 months from December 2016 to November 2017.

During this period ADB and MONRE entered further consultations, with ADB sending an official request in June 2017 for MONRE to request approval from the Prime Minister for domestic approval of the GEF grant funds. In July 2017, ADB and MONRE agreed for delegation of administration of Output 1 to MONRE. ADB also provides technical support to MONRE to prepare the project document proposal for GOV approval. In May 2018, MONRE officially requested further discussion with ADB to further negotiate the implementation arrangements, including additional delegation and responsibility for additional project outputs. ADB issued the NOL to delegation of Output 4 to MONRE in October 2018. The delay occurred as ADB would like to ensure that MONRE has sufficient capacity and clear delegation of responsibilities to departments with an appropriate mandate and staff resources. The main reason for the unforeseeable delay is delegation of administration to MONRE and approval of GOV. In June 2022, due to the Covid-19 impacts and prolonged procurement process. TA was extended for 2 years from December 31, 2023 to December 31, 2025.

A more detailed chronological timeline is provided below.

- February 24, 2016: ADB informed SBV a Loan Fact Finding Mission under Result-based lending (RBL) modality to 3 Cities from February 25 to March 18, 2016. The mission was attended by GEF team led by Xiaomei Tan (GEF) and accompanied by GEF consultant teams
- August 30, 2016: GEF CEO Endorsement using Special Climate Change Fund
- October 31, 2016: GEF CEO Endorsement of sub-project under a Program using GEF Trust Fund
- In Nov 2016, SERD management decided to change the modality to a standard investment loan.
- November and December 2016: ADB held various meetings to inform GOV (MPI, MOF, SBV) the change of the loan modality from RBL to a standard investment loan;
- March 17, 2017: MOU of loan re-appraisal mission signed with 3 Provinces;
- May 25, 2017: ADB Management Review Meeting approved the proposed investment project, including the TA Concept;
- June 9, 2017: ADB sent official letter to MONRE requesting for preparation of Project Outline to be submitted to the Prime Minister for approval by July 10, 2017, given ADB management's clearance to the TA Concept;
- July 28, 2017: ADB and MONRE agreed for delegation of administration of Output 1 to MONRE
- September 27, 2017: Loan negotiations held in VRM;
- October 6, 2018: ADB sent updated TA MOU to MONRE for delegation of administration of Output 1
- January 16, 2018: ADB sent official letter to MONRE requesting to prepare a Project Outline and submit to the Prime Minister at the earliest approval;
- May 28, 2018: MONRE sent ADB a written request for additional delegation of administration of TA Outputs 4 to MONRE
- June 29, 2018: GEF Grant agreement 0549-VIE (\$2 Million) grant for Ha Giang was signed by ADB and GOV
- October 1, 2018: ADB sent MONRE a NOL for delegation of administration of Output 4 to MONRE
- October 26, 2018: SBV sent ADB a written request for extension of ADB approval validity for 6 months from October 31, 2018 in order to complete the GOV approval procedures.
- April 15, 2019: ADB and MONRE signed the MOU on the TA
- April 19, 2019: State Bank of Viet Nam sent ADB the No-objection letter of GOV to the TA
- MONRE circulated the PO submission and Project Documents and collected comments from all line ministries and submitted to the Office of Government for Prime Minister approval at the end of July 2019. Project Documents (PO) of the TA was approved by GOV on 18 September 2019.
- October 7-14, 2019: ADB Review Mission conducted meetings with MONRE and 3 Cities to review and update the project implementation schedule and discuss potential problems and viable solutions.
- December 5-6, 2019: a study tour was conducted in Singapore with the participation of 13 Government officials from relevant cities to learn about Singapore's experience in implementing nature-based solutions for green and water sensitive city development (GEF – Output 2)
- January 30, 2020: The Project Document was approved by MONRE leader (Decision Ref. 245/QD-BTNMT)
- June 26, 2020: Formation of MONRE Project Management Unit (PMU) was approved by MONRE. MONRE prepared the detailed implementation plan and procurement plan for MONRE administered Outputs 1 & 4. ADB provided MONRE implementation plans for ADB administered Outputs 2 & 3. The establishment of the steering committee and project management regulation were approved by MONRE.

- July 24, 2020: Issuance of Decision Ref. 1633/QD-BTNMT on Establishment of Project Steering Committee for “Mainstreaming Climate Resilience and Environmental Protection for Secondary Green Cities Development”
- November 9-19, 2020: ADB Review Mission conducted meetings with MONRE and 3 Cities to review and update the project implementation schedule and discuss potential problems and viable solutions.
- November 24, 2020: ADB sent MONRE PMU no objection on the overall workplan
- February 2021: ADB and MONRE PMU agreed on the procurement plan for the delegated Output 1 and 4.
- April 2021: MONRE Procurement Plan for delegated Output 1&4 was approved by MONRE leadership
- April 9, 2021: TA Inception workshop in Hanoi with the participation of MONRE Minister, Steering Committee members, loan project PMUs, and ADB VRM Country Director.
- April 14 – May 5, 2021: ADB Review Mission conducted meetings with MONRE and 3 Cities to review and update the project implementation progress.
- May 21, 2021: Procurement training was provided to MONRE PMU by ADB VRM Procurement Consultant on ADB procurement guidelines.
- As for ADB administered Output 2, a large consulting contract (approximately \$2m) was signed on 15 June 2021 with the ICEM / Nippon Koei Joint venture. The Consultant’s main focus is on demonstrated sustainable and resilient development in Hue, Ha Giang, and Vinh Yen
- August 10, 2021: A meeting between Output 2 consultants with MONRE and ADB team to brief the objectives and scope of TA Output 2 and to share the progress of TA Outputs 1 & 4
- December 8, 2021: A review mission to update the TA progress, update on work plan 2022 Contract award and Disbursement plan, procurement related issues, M&E and risk management (Covid impacts), and administration, communications and financial related issue
- March 23, 2022: A review mission to review TA implementation progress, update on the work plan, contract award and disbursement plan, procurement issues, M&E and risk management, administration/communication and financial issues, solid waste management discussion.
- June 3, 2022: MONRE PMU sent an official request to ADB for project extension until December 2025.
- November 7-16, 2022: A review mission (combined with mid-term review mission of Loan project) to review the procurement progress of Outputs 1 and 4, implementation status of output 2,3. Procedures for TA extension were also discussed.
- February 13, 2023: MONRE PMU sent an official letter informing the change (name) of implementing agency. Because of MONRE’s organizational restructuring, Vietnam Environment Administration – VEA (IA at that time) was restructured and changed to Pollution Control Department (PCD). Personnel unchanged.
- February 23, 2023: ADB sent an official response letter to MONRE leader approving extension of the TA closing date to December 31, 2025 (following a minor change memo approved by Director General of ADB SERD on February 22, 2023).
- April 3, 2023: ADB approved an internal minor change memo requesting a change (in name) of the TA implementing agency, from VEA to PCD.
- April 30 – May 6, 2023: MONRE PMU leader and representatives of MONRE participated in the Conferences of the Parties to the Basel, Rotterdam, and Stockholm Conventions in Geneva, Switzerland. Post-mission report has been shared with ADB on July 24, 2023.
- May 31, 2023: MONRE PMU submitted the Audited Project Financial Report for 2022 fiscal year.

- June 30, 2023: completion date of the consulting contract with ICEM/Nippon Koei joint venture under output 2 was extended to December 31, 2023. Outputs 2.2 (scope of demonstration project) and 2.3 (scope of cost-benefit analysis) were also revised.
- July 12, 2023: ADB sent a fax to Ha Giang PMU to principally support extension of GEF component under Grant 0549-VIE to December 31, 2025, following a consultation within ADB. Once an official request to extend the grant completion date is received, ADB will proceed with an internal memo for official extension.
- July 21, 2023: ADB shared with the MONRE PMU the budget reallocation (per budget line and funding sources)
- July 24, 2023: ADB sent the MONRE PMU the no-objection fax to the updated overall workplan for whole project activities following the 2-year extension of completion date.
- Until now, MONRE PMU has been staffed with 6 officials assigned from PCD (previously known as VEA) and ISPONRE, 8 national individual consultants to support the project implementation. MONRE procurement plan consists of 9 individual consultant selections (including one recently proposed position due to the massive workload), 03 non-technical packages and 17 technical packages.

a. GEF Grant Disbursement

Up to now, the total grant disbursement amounted to \$1,789,927. The first disbursement of the TA is on November 8, 2019 under TA Output 2 administered by ADB. ADB administered Output 2 contract was signed and the consulting firm was mobilized on July 8, 2021. TA Outputs 1&4 were delegated to MONRE and MONRE has developed Terms of References for 17 packages in accordance with their approved procurement plan. For payment arrangements, the MONRE PMU will receive GEF fund transfers from ADB based on a quarterly disbursement plan agreed upon between MONRE and ADB through an Advance Payment Facility (APF). The cumulative advance payment transferred to MONRE's advance account from the beginning of the project to June 2023 is \$753,913.90.

This grant mainly involved the procurement of goods package: Energy Efficiency for Street Lighting System in Ha Giang (HG-CW08): provision of an estimated of the of 1,500 LED bulbs for Ha Giang city. The preparation of the package started in 2019 and ADB, therefore, included additional resources necessary for a detailed design of the proposed system in the TA so the bidding documents allow the PMU to immediately procure the lighting system. The international lighting system specialist was on board on October 10, 2019. Ha Giang PPC has sought MOC's endorsement/guidance on the expert's recommendations on the standard issues and the appraisal and approval of the technical specifications of this package took nearly 2 years.

The draft Bidding Document (BD) was approved by ADB on July 28, 2021 and was issued on September 2, 2021. In April 2022, there is a minor change in the PMU arrangements with the new PMU on board as one of several efforts from Ha Giang Provincial People's Committee to improve the project implementation progress. ADB issued a no objection letter to the Ha Giang PMU on the recommendation of the proposed bidder and contract award on September 21, 2022. The PMU has issued an invitation to the first ranked contractor to attend contract negotiations. However, due to the receipt of a complaint regarding the evaluation process, the PMU was advised by the ADB team to investigate and report back. During mid-June 2023, Ha Giang PMU submitted the revised Bid Evaluation Report (BER) with recommendation to cancel the bid. On 12 July 2023, ADB issued no objection to the Ha Giang PMU's request to cancel the current bidding process of the package following the determination that there are no qualified bids. On

31 July, one bidder submitted a request for a debriefing meeting to Ha Giang PMU (ADB project team was copied) on the bidding results. A response letter dated 3rd August from Ha Giang PMU was issued to the requesting bidder providing an explanation why such bid was not selected. Ha Giang PMU is recommended to prepare to re-bid the package and submit the updated Bidding Document to ADB for review and approval.

The Ha Giang PMU submitted ADB a letter in June 2023 requesting for extension of the grant closing date until December 31, 2025 to enable the PMU to revise the bidding documents and resume the new bidding process. July 12, 2023: ADB sent a fax to Ha Giang PMU to in-principal support extension of GEF component under Grant 0549-VIE to December 31, 2025, following a consultation within ADB. Once an official request to extend the grant completion date is received, ADB will proceed with an internal memo for official extension.

b. Stakeholders Engagement

During Mission 3, Output 2 consultant delivered the “National technical meeting of standardizing vulnerability assessment methodology” to 6 MONRE officials, 24 participants in Hue including 4 from PMU, 2 from Steering Committee for Disaster Prevention and Rescue. The team also presented the Technical Sheet with the concept designs for “finalization of adaptation investment projects to 3 participants of PMU and 1 participant from Department of Planning and Investment in Hue; 7 participants from PMU and 02 participant from City People’s Committee in Vinh Yen and 02 participants from PMU in Ha Giang. During Mission 4, Output 2 team delivered the participatory mapping workshop and consultation in three cities “Consultations on hotspot zones for CVA” for 25 participants in Hue, 18 participants in Vinh Yen, and 25 participants in Ha Giang. During Mission 4, the team delivered the national technical meeting on “environmentally sustainable approach in national standards” to 26 participants from National institutions, City PMU and MONRE PMU; 17 participants from Hanoi Technical Organizations and Institutions, 3 participants from MONRE PMU, and 3 participants from PMU. In June 2023, the team interviewed 3 groups of stakeholders including 2 policymakers, 4 research institutions/university and 6 practitioners (PMUs, city developers in public and private sectors.

The Project Steering Committee was currently enhanced. Because of recent change in MONRE management leaders (change of MONRE Minister as well as Country Director/Deputy Country Director of ADB Viet Nam Resident Mission), MONRE PMU is processing internal protocol to update list of PSC members and get it approved within MONRE by the end of 2023. Capacity assessment will be carried out to MONRE officials as well as stakeholders in 3 project cities and in other secondary cities.

c. Gender Action Plan Implementation Status

SGCDP is classified as “Effective Gender Mainstreaming (EGM)”. During preparation of SGCDP, a gender assessment was undertaken for each city, and a rapid assessment was undertaken for each priority sub-project. Accordingly, a gender action plan (GAP) was prepared, which covers both baseline and GEF supported activities. The GAP proposes a systematic framework for ensuring that women participate in and benefit from the activities. The GAP also provides a framework for monitoring gender-specific aspects of the impact of the project and benefits realization during the implementation phase.

The Gender Action Plan Monitoring Table was updated during ADB Review Mission in November 2022 and attached to the Aide Memoire circulated to relevant agencies: (i) There are 779 participants including 373

female participants (47.9%) from local governments of project provinces and other provinces participated in the workshops related to environmental protection and green and resilient city; (ii) Hue PMU conducted trainings on gender mainstreaming for 45 EA and IA staff responsible for GCAP planning and implementation including 28 female staff (62.2%) ; (iii) Green City Action Plan (GCAP)s of Hue city, Vinh Yen and Ha Giang were developed and approved in 2015. These GCAPs set the framework for the preparation of a results-based loan project (ADB-VIE 47274-003). The subprojects under Loan 3590 were developed from initiatives of GCAPs. The detailed designs of subprojects included gender-responsive and pro-poor features.

A gender training was provided to MONRE PMU on June 1, 2021 by ADB Gender consultant with the participation of 6 members including 3 female staff (50%) from the PMU. MONRE PMU was advised to pay close attention and monitors the GAP indicators including: (i) at least 33% of participants in project management and green and resilient city planning capacity trainings should be women; (ii) capacity development on gender mainstreaming for PMU staff and 40% of EA and IA staff responsible for GCAP planning and implementation ; and (iii) all GCAPs that are approved and implemented include gender-responsive and pro-poor features. The detailed number of female participants from which project city/province in which training should be clearly mentioned in project progress report.

MONRE PMU's package TA9417-ISP QCBS-03 committed that at least 30% of participants in the training will be women. They will evaluate the training courses to assess the effectiveness of the capacity building program, ensure at least 33% of participants as female in each training class.

d. Social and Environmental Safeguard Plan Implementation Status

Overall supervision of the GEF funds is subject to the ADB due diligence and safeguards system and all environmental and social safeguards will be ensured through this system. GEF funds are used to provide associated technical support and capacity development to the baseline SGCDP project. There are no additional risks or concerns associated with the GEF funds over the baseline. Hence, the management of safeguards for GEF funds is through the management of safeguards of the baseline investment project. The GEF administered funds will not be involved in the parts of the project related to involuntary resettlement and will not be involved with activities related to involuntary resettlement.

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
Outcome	2023	
Integrated planning incorporating climate resilience and environmental protection mainstreamed into urban planning processes in secondary cities in Viet Nam	The GrEEEn ^a Cities approaches integrated into Viet Nam's planning process	Two of the MONRE TA packages explicitly seek to incorporate the GrEEEn cities approach into planning for 6 target cities. However, this is not a national process because urban planning laws are not a MONRE mandate. However, the TA is developing regulations around pollution

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
		<p>generally which will be applicable to the national planning focus.</p> <p>The TA9417-VEA QCBS-02 (ready for contract award)/-07 (contract awarded, under implementation)/ -08/-09/-13 (Submission 2) and TA9417-ISP QCBS-01 (changed to CQS, now rebidding) are related to environmental protection and/or climate resilience integration into urban planning in Viet Nam.</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-03 (Submission 2) review and revise/develop policies on sustainable consumption, environmentally friendly production and climate change adaptation for developing secondary green cities in Viet Nam</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-04 (Submission 3) develop a set of ecolabel criteria for transportation products, carrying out the solutions on circular economy, sustainable/environment friendly production and consumption in the secondary cities</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-10 (Submission 1) review, evaluate the results of implementing pilot model of saving, reuse & applying new technology in wastewater treatment for a</p>

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
		<p>population/ urban production, business and services entities and replicate this model in other selected cities</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-11 (contract awarded, under implementation) pilot at least 01 advanced technology to recycle wastes into environment-friendly products in 01 city</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-12 (contract awarded, under implementation) develops a list of hazardous chemical contaminated areas nationwide and restoration of the soil environment at polluted site, propose a plan to replicate it to urban areas with similar types of pollution to control land pollution for changing land use</p>
Outputs	By 31/12/2023:	
1. Strengthened city and implementation processes (Inclusive)	1a. 3 Updated GCAPs prepared for Hue, Vinh Yen and Ha Giang (2019) ^b	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-07 (contract awarded, under implementation) update three GCAPs for Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen for 2020-2030 and prepares two air quality management plans for project cities Hue and Vinh Yen; drafts the technical guidelines to develop GCAP for secondary cities in Viet Nam as the basis for expanding GCAP development to 6 other provinces</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-02 prepares criteria and green city</p>

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
		assessment (contract award is ready). TA9417-VEA QCBS-02 (contract award is ready) develop technical guidelines for GHG inventory and MRV for urban areas in Viet Nam. Three GHG inventory reports and need assessment for low carbon technology for Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen Cities to be prepared as key inputs for the update of the relevant GCAPs.
	1b. GCAPs for 6 new secondary cities prepared ¹	TA9417-VEA QCBS-08 & 09 (Submission 2) prepare GCAPs and replicate the green city approach for 6 new secondary cities
	1c. GCAPs mainstreamed into the Project Cities' Master Plans by 2023	TA9417-VEA QCBS-07 (contract awarded, under implementation) update three GCAPs for Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen for 2020-2030 and prepares two air quality management plans for project cities Hue and Vinh Yen; drafts the technical guidelines to develop GCAP for secondary cities in Viet Nam as the basis for expanding GCAP development to 6 other provinces TA9417-VEA QCBS-02 (contract award is ready) prepare criteria and green city assessment.
	1d. Strengthened capacity of at least 200 professionals from the central and local governments with at least 33% female to integrate green city	The gender monitoring table was updated during the November 2022 ADB review mission.

¹ Totally financed by GEF/SCIAP and associated co-financing

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
	principles into urban planning and budgeting processes.	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-13 (Submission 2): International consulting firm provide technical assistance to VEA's activities related to urban environmental management and ISPONRE's activities related to GHG inventory, climate vulnerability assessment, developing training and communication programs</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-05 (TOR approval by ADB) enhance management capacity and experience sharing on environment, land-use and climate resilience for MONRE officials.</p> <p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-03 (Submission 2) conduct capacity need assessment, develops and conducts training program for GHG inventory, low-carbon emission, climate risk vulnerability assessment, green public procurement for secondary cities</p> <p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-04 (RFP issuance) develop and implement communications activities on GHG inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, ecology assessment, circular economy, green public procurement for targeted groups, including authorities and policy makers.</p>
	1.d. Gender balanced and professionally staffed PMU with at least 33% female (2019)	Gender Action Plan Monitoring Table was updated during ADB Review Mission in November 2022.

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
		<p>The gender training makes sure that MONRE needs to ensure the GAP indicators are included in the TOR of packages related to GCAPs and capacity building, such as: (i) All GCAPs that are approved and implemented include gender-responsive and pro-poor features; (ii) At least 200 government professionals (at least 33% women) gained new skills in green and resilient city concept and integrated planning; and (iii) Capacity development on gender mainstreaming for PMU staff and 40% of IA staff responsible for GCAP planning and implementation.</p>
	1e. Independent verification assistance (IVA) to assess performance of loan against Disbursement linked indicators (DLIs)	Not applicable due to ADB's change of loan modality from RBL to standard investment loan.
2. Enhanced low impact and climate resilient development	<p>By 2022</p> <p>2a. Recommendations for greening design and procurement for urban investments in project cities provided. (Baseline: N/A)</p>	<p>In Vinh Yen, ADB appointed two consultant landscape architects under the TA to assist in the inclusion of water sensitive design elements to the "green" packages under the loan, including VY CW01 (Dredging and Landscape Protection of Dam Vac Lake). This package is planned for advertising in June 2021, and as such the DED is now being finalized. The project team requested that the PMU facilitate the inclusion of water sensitive features into the design, in collaboration with the</p>

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
		<p>consultant landscape architects.</p> <p>Workshop were held in May and June 2021 to discuss both Hue and Vinh Yen community led investments, and to explore opportunities to introduce water sensitive elements to improve environmental resilience and performance. The landscape architects appointed under Output 2 of the TA facilitated the workshops and reviewed the outline designs to introduce the water sensitive urban design concepts.</p> <p>As requested from the Hue PMU, ADB will send the national consultant landscape architect to Hue to support and provide instruction on “green” feature during the construction period.</p> <p>Output 2 consultant demonstrated the Nature Based Solutions (NbS) Technical Manual to city PMUs for scaling up the NbS at city level.</p>
	2b. 27 km of drainage improved (loan financed)	<p>HG-CW05: Embankment of Me Stream. Ha Giang PMU has requested the national consultant to revise the DED following Ramboll’s recommendation on green features. Ha Giang PMU will develop additional design plan on the basis of the proposal of Ramboll. Then, the final design</p>

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
	<p>2c. Disaster risk financing piloted in one secondary city (funded by UCCRTF)</p> <p>2d. Determination of optimal insurance products that provide incentives to Vietnamese cities for adaptation through integrated green city planning.</p>	<p>plan will be sent to ADB for consideration and concurrence/endorsement. An official letter on adjustment contents was sent to Ha Giang PPC on 5 February 2021 requesting for incorporation of ADB recommended water sensitive urban design elements and river embankment protection. The updated DED will be sent to the Ha Giang Department of Construction for appraisal and Ha Giang PPC for approval. This contract is scheduled to be procured in Q1/2-2024.</p> <p>ADB sent a letter to Thua Thien Hue PPC in August and October 2021 to request agreement on a list of public asset and proposed DRI; advise on policy beneficiary of an insurance policy. ADB held a meeting in November 2021 with Thua Thien Hue PPC and Insurance Administration (MOF) on the calculation method and pilot purchase of public property insurance. However, MOF have not submitted a list of specific assets that must be insured for disaster risks according to Public Property Insurance Decree 151/2017. Discussions with Government indicate that approval for the insurance purchase will not be granted, due to the lack of published national guidelines, and therefore, the grant component available for this component will be returned to the donor.</p>

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
	<p>2e. Replacement of at least 1000 streetlights to energy efficient lighting in Ha Giang city</p> <p>2f. At least [300,000] beneficiaries including [20,000] vulnerable beneficiaries have access to newly built infrastructure following low impact development and GrEEEn City approach</p>	<p>Ha Giang submitted the revised BER to conclude the current bid (no qualified bidders) and will re-issue revised tender documents to re-bid.</p>
3. Improved enabling environment for upscaling green cities approaches	<p>By 31/12/2023:</p> <p>3a. National regulation on green cities approved and issued.</p> <p>3b. Technical Guidelines on implementing the national regulation on green cities (indicator 3a) issued.</p>	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-01 (contract award is ready) develops legal documents guiding the implementation of the Environmental Protection Law 2020 related to environmental protection and climate change response for developing secondary green cities in Viet Nam.</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-02 (contract award is ready) prepares criteria and green city assessment.</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-04 (Submission 3) develops technical guidance document for assessment and certification of Viet Nam's eco-label and develop sets of eco-label criteria; pilot application of technical guidance on assessment and certification of eco-labels; advanced technologies for recycling waste and apply waste recycling technology and replicate it in urban areas.</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-07 (contract awarded, under implementation) drafts the</p>

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
		<p>technical guidelines to develop GCAP for secondary cities in Viet Nam</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-13 (Submission 2): International consulting firm contributing to developing technical guidelines on green cities indicators & policy frameworks, treatment of urban contaminated sites: serious polluting factories, and treatment of urban contaminated sites: serious polluting landfills.</p> <p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-01 (changed form QCBS to CQS) review, develop the climate vulnerability assessment methodology and pilot in three cities: Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen.</p> <p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-02 (S2) review, develop GHG inventory methodology and guidance for MRV monitoring; assess low-carbon technology need and emission reduction potential to propose low-carbon technology portfolio and pilot GHG inventory assessment and MRV in 3 cities (Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen).</p>
	3c. Government decision to establish a green city financing mechanism.	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-03 (Submission 2) review and revise/develop policies on sustainable consumption, environmentally friendly production and climate change adaptation for developing secondary green cities in Viet Nam.</p>

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
		TA9417-VEA QCBS-13 (Submission 2): International consulting firm contributing to policy formulation, communication and training activities regarding circular economy, green public procurement.
	3d. Endorsed policy document on Climate Induced Disaster Risk Financing (CDRF) issued.	TA9417-VEA QCBS-10 (Submission 1): Pilot model on urban wastewater reuse and replication for selected cities TA9417-VEA QCBS-11 (contract awarded, under implementation): Assess current situations of plastic waste recycling in a selected secondary city Identify suitable technologies for increasing plastic waste recycling rates in the selected city through piloting. Develop a roadmap for scaling up the piloted advanced recycling technologies in other urban areas.
	3e. At least eight cities join the Viet Nam sustainable cities cluster.	TA9417-VEA QCBS-07 (contract awarded, under implementation) update three GCAPs for Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen for 2020-2030 and prepares two air quality management plans for project cities Hue and Vinh Yen; drafts the technical guidelines to develop GCAP for secondary cities in Viet Nam as the basis for expanding GCAP development to 6 other provinces TA9417-VEA QCBS-08 & 09 (Submission 2) prepare GCAPs and replicate the green city

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
		<p>approach for 6 new secondary cities</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-13 (Submission 2): International consulting firm contributing to partnership development and coordination, including support for Viet Nam's effective contribution to the international and regional forum on green cities</p>
	3f. Strengthened MONRE capacity to support integrated, resilient city plan	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-05 (TOR approval) enhances management capacity and experience sharing on environment, land-use and climate resilience for MONRE officials</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-06 (Submission 1) develop new technical guidelines on design criteria for the national and local environmental monitoring networks; technical guideline on processing and synthesizing environmental monitoring data for national monitoring stations located in ministries, sectors and provinces to send information to MONRE</p> <p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-03 (Submission 2) conduct training needs assessment on GHG inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, circular economy, green public procurement, and low GHG emissions at central and secondary cities, focusing on 3 pilot cities (i.e. Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen) with at least 120</p>

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
		<p>participants in each cities will participate in the training programs.</p> <p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-04 (RFP issuance) prepare communication and knowledge dissemination plans</p>

C. Global Environmental Benefits (GEB) Objective/ Development Objective (DO) Rating:

Following indicators could be applied for Global Environmental Benefits (GEB)

Corporate Results	Replenishment Targets	Project Targets
1. Maintain globally significant biodiversity and the ecosystem goods and services that it provides to society	Improved management of landscapes and seascapes covering 300 million hectares	
2. Sustainable land management in production systems (agriculture, rangelands, and forest landscapes)	120 million hectares under sustainable land management	<i>Hectares</i>
3. Promotion of collective management of trans boundary water systems and implementation of the full range of policy, legal, and institutional reforms and investments contributing to sustainable use and maintenance of ecosystem services	Water-food-ecosystems security and conjunctive management of surface and groundwater in at least 10 freshwater basins;	<i>Number of freshwater basins</i>
	20% of globally over-exploited fisheries (by volume) moved to more sustainable levels	<i>Percent of fisheries, by volume</i>
4. Support to transformational shifts towards a low-emission and resilient development path	750 million tons of CO ₂ e mitigated (include both direct and indirect)	
5. Increase in phase-out, disposal and reduction of releases of POPs, ODS, mercury and other chemicals of global	Disposal of 80,000 tons of POPs (PCB, obsolete pesticides)	<i>metric tons</i>
	Reduction of 1000 tons of Mercury	

concern		<i>metric tons</i>
	Phase-out of 303.44 tons of ODP (HCFC)	<i>ODP tons</i>
6. Enhance capacity of countries to implement MEAs (multilateral environmental agreements) and mainstream into national and sub-national policy, planning financial and legal frameworks	Development and sectoral planning frameworks integrate measurable targets drawn from the MEAs in at least 10 countries	<i>Number of Countries:</i>
	Functional environmental information systems are established to support decision-making in at least 10 countries	<i>Number of Countries:</i>

D. Risk Rating:

Risk and Description	Impact & Probability ²	Update on Countermeasures/Management response
Overall project risks		
Delayed start of project implementation	I - 3 P - 5	Close consultation between GOV and ADB regarding project approvals is needed
Lack of coordination with other climate change adaptation projects and initiatives	I - 3 P - 1	Many climate change adaptation initiatives are already underway in Viet Nam. It is critical that these initiatives are coordinated to avoid duplication; to ensure that the various initiatives work together not in isolation; and to share knowledge. Consultation has already been undertaken with key Ministries (MONRE, MOC), development partners (World Bank, UNDP, GIZ) and NGOs (Association of Cities of Viet Nam) to mitigate this risk and will continue during the project preparation phase.
Lack of sustained commitment to reforms to promote climate resilience and integrated city approach	I - 2 P - 2	As described above, GOV has taken a proactive approach to addressing the climate change and urbanization challenges. Strong government commitment exists at all levels (national, provincial, city) to promote resilient, low carbon urban systems.
Lack of Coordination between and among relevant Agencies	I - 4 P - 2	Initial consultations indicate the benefits of establishing high-level Project Steering Committee comprising senior national and provincial/city

² Range 1-5, where 5 is highest.

Risk and Description	Impact & Probability ²	Update on Countermeasures/Management response
		government officials, and chaired by MONRE to effectively coordinate the project.
Low institutional capacity (technical, financial, environmental management)	I - 3 P- 2	Technical Assistance will be provided under the baseline project for specialist assistance to participating cities
Lack of qualified and available local staff for project implementation	I - 3 P- 2	Mitigated by development of a staff recruiting strategy during project preparation. With many climate change related projects underway in Viet Nam, there is a growing pool of suitably-qualified local staff available.
Risks to All Project Outcomes		
<p>Lack of experience with the RBL modality leads to delays.</p> <p><i>The RBL modality is new to Viet Nam, leading to some uncertainty, and to the danger that unexpected problems will be encountered. Further, there are some specific requirements that may take time to meet.</i></p>	I - 3 P- 2	The GEF grant was initially proposed to be linked to the ADB financed Secondary Green Cities Development Project, implemented through a result-based lending (RBL) modality. However, subsequent to the GEF grant endorsement, ADB proposed to change the lending modality to a standard investment loan. This was done due to the limited experience in Viet Nam with results-based lending and concern that this may complicate implementation. ADB communicated this proposed change with the GOV (MPI, MOF & SBV) and three project executing agencies/implementing agencies in November and December 2016.
<p>The impacts of climate change at the scale relevant to these infrastructure projects are not adequately known or understood.</p> <p><i>The available data and available models make it very difficult to accurately predict climate change at the level of secondary cities, and the impacts it will have.</i></p>	I - 2 P- 3	<p>The impacts of climate change are known at a general level in the country level, and the best available models have been used in the preparation of this Project. Finally, there are many on-going activities to collect improved data and to improve measuring and modelling; this improved knowledge will be used as it becomes available.</p> <p>Also, the Project strategy focuses on ‘no regret’ and ‘low regret’ options, i.e. interventions that increase resilience to climate change and have other benefits.</p>
Risks specific to Outcomes not being achieved		

Risk and Description	Impact & Probability ²	Update on Countermeasures/Management response
<p>Output 1: GCAPs are not integrated with other city level plans.</p> <p><i>The GCAPs are somewhat innovative, and as of yet are not formally included in the national planning framework. This may lead to the GCAP's being implemented, but not institutionalized thereafter.</i></p>	<p>I – 2 P- 2</p>	<p>The existing GCAPs – for Ha Giang, Hue and Vinh Yen, were approved by the concerned Peoples Committees.</p> <p>Integration of GCAP into planning process has been made a target of the GEF support, so this risk will be addressed head on, with awareness raising, policy dialogue, national level advocacy, etc.</p> <p>Importantly, the broad participatory process should ensure that all concerned stakeholders are engaged, and so willing to support this integration process, when necessary.</p>
<p>Output 1: Cities are unable to meet gender targets.</p> <p><i>The baseline loan has set ambitious targets for gender, in particular in the women involved in project implementation. This can be challenging at secondary city level in Viet Nam.</i></p>	<p>I - 1 P- 3</p>	<p>Whereas one or two cities may be challenged to meet the targets, the others should be able to meet them comfortably. Hence this is likely to be a risk at only one, or two, cities.</p> <p>The GAPs address this issue, providing both incentives and support to meeting the targets. ADB will closely monitor this situation and provide support and guidance when necessary.</p>
<p>Output 1: Recommendations are not applied to loan sub-projects.</p> <p><i>Output 1.1.1 will lead to recommendations to improve the sub-projects, but the local authorities are not obliged to incorporate these.</i></p>	<p>I - 2 P- 3</p>	<p>The loan procurement process should ensure that the city level project implementation units have good 'ownership' over Output 1.1.1 and the related recommendations, and should treat the advice with due respect. Further, the ADB can ensure that the recommendations are based on <i>both</i> best international practices <i>and</i> sensitivity to Vietnamese circumstances – this should ensure that the recommendations are both pertinent and realistic.</p>
<p>Output 3: Insufficient impact into the national policies/ legislations to achieve sustainability.</p> <p><i>Ultimately, to be sustained, changes will be necessary in terms of policy and legislation, this takes time in any country, and there is no guarantee it will be successful.</i></p>	<p>I - 2 P- 3</p>	<p>This risk will be addressed head on with training, assessments, awareness raising, policy dialogue, national level advocacy, expert advisories, etc. Further, MONRE has committed to this project and its objectives and is committed to reaching this sustainability.</p>

Risk and Description	Impact & Probability ²	Update on Countermeasures/Management response
		ADB will work closely with MONRE to identify and implement the best pathways to achieving the policy and legislative requirements.

E. Overall Rating of the Project:

Overall Rating: Satisfactory (S)

F. Additional Comments – Good Practices And Lessons Learned:

Approval of project and institutional arrangements took considerable time, and this caused delays in project start up.

G. Knowledge activities / products:

The ADB is committed to ensure that all knowledge generated by the project and all lessons learnt will be disseminated in an appropriate manner, through the ADB networks and partner organizations. The Project is also linked into several knowledge management mechanisms and tools. First, as an SCIAP child project, it is supported by the Global Platform for Sustainable Cities (GPSC). GPSC supports knowledge capture and knowledge exchange, both amongst the SCIAP participating cities, and with external initiatives and cities. The proposed Project will be actively involved with the overall SCIAP, sharing knowledge on a regular basis through GPSC, and constantly learning from GPSC through its involvement in GPSC networks and learning events.

The Project also takes place within the broader ADB Green Cities Initiative. Through this network, the Project will share lessons and knowledge with cities across Asia. The ADB's knowledge management resources support the urban development specialists and community practice members to collect data, learn lessons, and prepare documentation and publications.

The Project is also co-financed by the Urban Climate Change Resilience Trust Fund (UCCRTF), making UCCRTF a key partner. UCCRTF builds resilience to the effects of climate variability and climate change within medium-sized cities in Asia, particularly working with the urban vulnerable and poor. It promotes a systems-centered approach that supports making climate change a central element of city planning. This is linked to the implementation of infrastructure and policy or institutional interventions, as well as strong knowledge, capacity building, and networking components. Managed within the ADB, the UCCRTF has mechanisms for capturing and sharing knowledge.

The TA will benefit from MONRE as the Executing Agency to ensure lessons are captured and knowledge is shared. Notably, an active involvement is planned for the National Environment Agency (NEA) and PCD and the Institute of Strategy and Policy on Natural Resources and Environment. MONRE will ensure that knowledge is shared through the appropriate Vietnamese channels.

Specifically, with regards to adaptation to climate change, ADB has been actively involved for nearly two decades in efforts to manage the risks associated with climate change on the region's development. In

2010, ADB launched its climate change strategy – Addressing Climate Change in Asia and the Pacific: Priorities for Action. This emphasized the integration of adaptation and disaster risk reduction into national development plans; the building of climate resilience of vulnerable sectors; the climate-proofing of projects; and prioritizing the adaptation needs of the most vulnerable, including women. Since 2012, ADB has been programming projects with adaptation elements amounting to approximately \$1 billion per year. As a result of all this groundwork, ADB has strong technical units responsible for collecting data, learning lessons and sharing knowledge notably through web events, conferences and publications. This includes close coordination with the Asia-Pacific Adaptation Network and Forum.

Three MONRE packages have been dedicated to knowledge sharing: ISP-QCBS 03: *Capacity Need Assessment for GHG Inventory, CVA, Circular Economy, and Green Public Procurement*; ISP- QCBS -04: *Communication Activities for GHG Inventory , CVA, Circular Economy, Green Public Procurement*) and VEA-QCBS 05: *MONRE Management Capacity and Experience Sharing*

In June 2023, two videos titled “Building community resilience in Hue, Viet Nam”³ and “Better sanitation for poor families in Vinh Yen, Viet Nam”⁴ have been officially published on ADB’s website and ADB’s YouTube channel. The videos have been also shared with provincial PMUs, MONRE PMU, donors and within ADB for further dissemination to wide audience. The videos then have been shown in a various number of project meetings, workshops as well as published on the project provinces’ official websites in an aim that the videos can reach a wide audience and show benefits of the project to the people of Hue and Vinh Yen cities.

During September 24 to October 2, 2022, MONRE PMU management representatives attended Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs) Review Committee – the Eighteenth meeting in Rome, Italy. From this study tour, participants gained update important information on international legal framework, updated Best Available Techniques (BAT)/Best Environment Practices (BEP) for handling POPs and hazardous chemicals, and requirements on substantive and procedural norms on managing transboundary POPs and hazardous chemicals. The participation contributed to improved capacity of MONRE/PMU management in leading the TA and supervising quality of the relevant consulting packages.

Recently, MONRE PMU management and a representative of MONRE counterpart also joined the conferences of the Parties to the Basel, Rotterdam and Stockholm conventions in Geneva, Switzerland from April 29 to May 6, 2023. The PMU delegation attended plenary sessions of COPs, participated in negotiation and contributed to the adoption of crucial decisions concerning the management of particularly hazardous chemicals, specifically Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs), throughout their entire life cycle, including chemical products, raw materials, fuels, articles, goods, and equipment containing POPs. This involvement encompasses areas such as the treatment of hot spots with residual chemical pollution, notification and management of international trade activities for dangerous chemicals, as well as hazardous waste management and treatment, including transboundary transport and disposal. Various topics relevant to the TA9417 (under several technical packages i.e. TA9417-VEA QCBS-01, TA9417-VEA QCBS-02, TA9417-VEA QCBS-05, and TA9417-VEA QCBS-11) were also integrated and discussed. The PMU also shared with ADB the post-mission report for reference in July 2023.

H. Location Data:

³ [Building Community Resilience in Hue, Viet Nam \(Teaser\) | Asian Development Bank \(adb.org\)](#) and full version on ADB’s YouTube channel [Building Community Resilience in Hue, Viet Nam - YouTube](#)

⁴ [Better Sanitation for Poor Families in Vinh Yen, Viet Nam | Asian Development Bank \(adb.org\)](#)

Name	Country	Feature Class	Latitude	Longitude
Hue Imperial City	Viet Nam, Thua Thien Hue	Monument	16.4755	107.57141
Ha Giang City	Viet Nam, Ha Giang	City	22.86	104.98
Vinh Yen City	Viet Nam, Vinh Phuc	City	21.31	105.5967

Source: www.geonames.org

Signature:



Name of Project Officer:

Alexander David Nash

Position:

Senior Urban Development Specialist

Water and Urban Development Sector Office, Sector Groups, ADB

Date:

14 August 2023

Endorsed by:

Division Director:

Grant 0549-VIE
EA Project Officer
Name and Agency

: Mrs. Dao Thi Lan Anh
: Project Director, Program Coordination Office of Commodity -
Oriented Poverty Reduction Program, Ha Giang province
: lananhdppr@gmail.com

Email

ANNEX C: DEFINITION OF RATINGS

Implementation Progress Ratings

Highly Satisfactory (HS): Implementation of **all** components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised implementation plan for the project. The project can be presented as “good practice”.

Satisfactory (S): Implementation of **most** components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan except for only a few that is subject to remedial action.

Moderately Satisfactory (MS): Implementation of **some** components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with **some** components requiring remedial action.

Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU): Implementation of **some** components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with **most** components requiring remedial action..

Unsatisfactory (U): Implementation of **most** components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan.

Highly Unsatisfactory (HU): Implementation of **none** of the components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan.

Global Environment Objective/Development Objective Ratings

Highly Satisfactory (HS): Project is expected to achieve or exceed **all** its major global environmental objectives, and yield substantial global environmental benefits, without major shortcomings. The project can be presented as “good practice”.

Satisfactory (S): Project is expected to achieve **most** of its major global environmental objectives, and yield satisfactory global environmental benefits, with only minor shortcomings.

Moderately Satisfactory (MS): Project is expected to achieve **most** of its major relevant objectives but with either significant shortcomings or modest overall relevance. Project is expected not to achieve **some** of its major global environmental objectives or yield some of the expected global environment benefits.

Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU): Project is expected to achieve of its major global environmental objectives with major shortcomings or is expected to achieve only **some** of its major global environmental objectives.

Unsatisfactory (U): Project is expected **not** to achieve **most** of its major global environment objectives or to yield any satisfactory global environmental benefits.

Highly Unsatisfactory (HU): The project has failed to achieve, and is not expected to achieve, **any** of its major global environment objectives with no worthwhile benefits.

Risk Rating

Risk ratings will assess the overall risk of factors internal or external to the project which may affect implementation or prospects for achieving project objectives. Risks of projects should be rated on the following scale:

High Risk (H): There is a probability of greater than 75% that assumptions may fail to hold or materialize, and/or the project may face high risks.

Substantial Risk (S): There is a probability of between 51% and 75% that assumptions may fail to hold and/or the project may face substantial risks.

Modest Risk (M): There is a probability of between 26% and 50% that assumptions may fail to hold or materialize, and/ or the project may face only modest risks.

Low Risk (L): There is a probability of up to 25% that assumptions may fail to hold or materialize, and/ or the project may face only modest risks.