

Management response to the observations made in the Mid-Term Review

GCP /CHI/034/GFF

“Strengthening and Development of Instruments for the Management, Prevention and Control of Beaver (*Castor Canadensis*), an Invasive Alien Species in the Chilean Patagonia”

Summary

The *Mid-Term Review* of the GEF Beaver Project was included in the project document as part of the Global Environment Facility requirements and carried out for the *purpose* of accountability, learning, and gathering recommendations. The recommendations stemming from this review are a determining factor to take corrective measures, as appropriate, during the overall project implementation and its intervention strategy for the second half of the project, to ensure that the expected outcomes are achieved within the timeframe as well as the dissemination of learning for similar projects.

Temporary and territorial scope: the Mid-Term Review ranges from 31 July 2017 to 31 December 2019. Information was collected through interviews with key stakeholders in Santiago and the Magallanes Region; visits to Karukinka Park and Marazzi River Basin pilot sites and a focus group in Karukinka Park, Tierra del Fuego. Since the project is a joint effort between Chile and Argentina, the implementers of the Invasive Alien Species project in Argentina were also contacted.

The evaluation encompasses the entire project and each component: Component 1. Management and governance framework, information, monitoring and early warning and sharing information about the beaver in the Magallanes and Chilean Antarctic region. Component 2. Demonstration activities of control, management and restoration in pilot areas. Component 3. Outcomes-based management, monitoring, evaluation and dissemination.

Management response to the observations made in the Mid-Term Review of GCP /CHI/034/GFF “Strengthening and Development of Instruments for the Management, Prevention and Control of Beaver (Castor Canadensis), an Invasive Alien Species in the Chilean Patagonia”					Date
Evaluation recommendation (a)	Management response (b) Accepted, partially accepted or rejected	Management Plan			
		Actions to be taken, and/or comments on partial acceptance or rejection (c)	Responsible Unit (d)	Period (e)	Additional funds requirement (Y or N) (f)
			FAO Representation Chile, LTO and Project Management		
Strategic relevance: A.1 Greater complementarity and synergies					
Recommendation A.1.1. To strive for increased complementarity and synergy with other initiatives developed by international organizations and research centres.	Accepted	<p>The development of Output 1.2.1 Information, monitoring and early warning system (SCIAT) considers training campaigns and the inclusion of international organizations and research centres, since it systematizes all the historical information on beaver found in the Magallanes region and produces new useful information to advance, in parallel, in research areas.</p> <p>Notwithstanding the possibility to generate complementarity and synergies with other organizations and/or research centres, contacts have been established to carry out activities in collaboration with the Universidad de Magallanes in Chile and the Centro Austral de Investigaciones Cientificas (Cadic) in Argentina.</p>	Project Management	Second semester 2020 and first semester 2021	No additional funds are required

<p>Recommendation A.1.2. Further alignment with Agenda 2030 goals (SDG 5, 6, 13, 15, 17) is recommended for better project positioning and increased management and lobbying capacity.</p>	<p>Accepted</p>	<p>All outputs related to the SDGs will be explicitly reinforced and highlighted for further alignment with Agenda 2030 goals. In particular:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Gender equality (SDG 5): Cross-cutting approach of all outputs. - Clean water and sanitation (SDG 6): Outputs 1.1.1 and 1.1.2, inclusion of sanitation companies into the governance of beaver issues, Output 1.3.2 Capacity strengthening of sanitation companies in the area of beaver control and monitoring - - Climate Action (ODS 13): Outputs 1.1.1 and 1.1.2 will link to this SDG by emphasizing the importance of ecosystems conservation such as forests and peatlands through beaver eradication and restoration of affected ecosystems. In this sense, the Pilot experiences of Component 2 that seek to recover environments affected by beaver, as well as the monitoring and early warning system that contributes to detect changes in the landscape as a result of beaver action, allow for rapid action to control the advance of beavers and recover affected ecosystems. - Life on land (SDG 15): The pilot actions of Component 2, aimed at the local eradication and recovery of ecosystems affected by beaver, as well as the information, monitoring and early warning system of Component 1 that monitors, stores and communicates all information on beaver advance in the territory 	<p>FAO Representation Chile, LTO and Project Management</p>	<p>Second semester 2020 and first semester 2021</p>	<p>No additional funds are required</p>
---	-----------------	---	---	---	---

		<p>enabling early control, thus contributing to the conservation of threatened land.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Partnerships for the goals (SDG 17): Outputs of Component 1: Management and governance framework, information, monitoring and early warning and sharing information about beaver in the Magallanes and Chilean Antarctic region which main objectives are the generation of management and governance frameworks, informing decision makers about beaver management in Magallanes to recognize the importance of controlling or eradicating invasive alien species, and keeping civil society informed about beaver monitoring and management actions in the territory. In particular, the development of the Plan for Coordination and Governance (1.1.2) for beaver management, whose objective is to configure the mechanisms by which the different public and private institutions and civil society organizations will articulate the beaver management strategy, as well as the Programme for Strengthening the Capacities of Key Stakeholders (1.3.2) and the Exchange Protocol at the regional, national and binational levels (1.1.4) create partnerships between governments, public institutions, the private sector and civil society 			
Strategic relevance: A.2. Integrated strategy with other Invasive Alien Species					
Recommendation A.2.1. Develop a comprehensive IAS strategy to address the beaver problem together	Partially accepted	This output can provide information for a comprehensive strategy, but it cannot take on a major task like this.	LTO and Project Management	First semester 2021	No additional funds are required

<p>with other harmful species in the region, with a view to understand the alien species problem as a whole and deal with it in a coordinated manner</p>		<p>On this basis, one of the main outputs considering the sustainability of the Project is Output 1.1.1 Strategic and financial plan for beaver management as an invasive species. This plan considers the systematization of beaver eradication, control and early warning actions in line with a budget to define a long-term financing strategy. While this strategic plan can be considered as the basis for a comprehensive invasive alien species strategy, it is not part of the Project's objectives. However, other invasive alien species can be incorporated into the post-GEF Project financial sustainability through regional, national or international funding.</p>			
<p>Efficacy: B.1. Involve more partners with more active participation</p>					
<p>Recommendation B.1.1. Involve more actors such as: Armed Forces and Army Regiment for field work, transportation and monitoring; private sector such as Aguas Magallanes, tour agents and more breeders, as well as rethink their role; universities and research centres; Instituto Nacional de la Juventud and national and international voluntary service.</p>	<p>Accepted</p>	<p>Both the Strategic Plan (Output 1.1.1) and the Coordination Plan (Output 1.1.2) include active participation of these actors. In addition, the key actors capacity strengthening programme for beaver management and eradication (Output 1.3.2) and the communication and awareness Programme (1.3.1), as well as Output 1.2.1 Information, monitoring and early warning system (SCIAT), considers training campaigns and involvement of the actors mentioned in this recommendation. Actions include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Introduction to invasive alien species (biology of the species and ecology), their impact and management options. - The beaver in Tierra del Fuego, history of the invasion and consequences - Tools for effective beaver eradication (techniques, safe use, maintenance, trapping designs, etc.) - Organization and operational monitoring for eradication (logistics in 	<p>FAO Representation Chile, LTO and Project Management</p>	<p>Second semester 2020 and first semester 2021</p>	<p>No additional funds are required</p>

		<p>extreme areas, monitoring techniques, data collection, restoration techniques)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Biosecurity. - Strategic communication of the beaver's problems. 			
<p>Recommendation B.1.2. Lobbying in municipalities for the inclusion of the beaver and other species' problems and their regulation within the Community Development Plan for the regulatory framework foreseen as Output 1.1.4</p>	Partially accepted	<p>The knowledge acquired in Component 2, as well as some outputs of Component 1 such as 1.1.1 Strategic and Financial Plan, 1.1.2 Governance and Coordination Plan, 1.2.1 Coordinated Information, Monitoring and Early Warning System, 1.2.4 Protocols for information exchange at the regional, national and binational levels between Chile and Argentina, 1.3.1 Communications and Awareness Programme and 1.3.2 Capacity Strengthening, guarantee the lobbying in municipalities to include beaver and other species' problem.</p> <p>In this case, the Project can extend an invitation to the Municipalities to sensitize and motivate them to include this topic about the beaver in their Community Development Plans (PLADECO). The recruitment of a consultant to work on the integration of the beaver problem in the municipalities will be considered.</p>	LTO, Project Management	Second semester 2020	No additional funds are required
<p>Recommendation B.1.3. Open spaces of decision and joint planning among the partners so that they can contribute to take strategic decisions.</p>	Accepted	<p>The implementation arrangement gives partners the space to review progress, build on lessons learned, and do joint planning. Technical Committee meetings have been revived to reorient new outputs or focus on those already under implementation. The frequency of meetings is determined by the number and urgency of issues to be addressed, but they are held fortnightly.</p>	LTO and Project Management		No additional funds are required
Efficacy: B.2. Definition of beaver eradication and/or control scenarios					
<p>Recommendation B.2.1. Define whether eradication and/or sustained control will be attempted, the</p>	Accepted	<p>Compliance with this recommendation is causally related to the fulfilment of the outputs detailed in the project. On the one hand, the strategic and financial plan for beaver management as an</p>	LTO and Project Management	Second semester 2020 and first semester 2021	No additional funds are required

territories involved and the methods of trapping, use of weapons or mixed technique.		invasive species (Output 1.1.1) as well as the coordination and governance plan for the management of beaver as an invasive species (Output 1.1.2) consider different scenarios and/or stages for a possible eradication of beaver in the long term. Each stage or scenario considers different actions (e.g., control, priority control, and local eradication). On the other hand, the systematization of pilot experiences will make it possible to orient or define territories and trapping methods.			
Efficacy: B.3 Promote studies on the beaver, its habits and other related species					
Recommendation B.3.1 Facilitate spaces of exchange, where universities and study centres that are working with the beaver can share experience and information. Do more research on beaver habits and other related species such as mink and muskrat together with universities and study centres.	Accepted	Output 1.2.1 Information, monitoring and early warning system (SCIAT) considers training campaigns and the inclusion of the actors mentioned in this recommendation, as well as joint work with research centres such as Universidad de Magallanes.	Project Management	Second semester 2020	No additional funds are required
Efficacy: C.1. Deadline extension					
Recommendation C.1.1. It is recommended to extend the deadline to one additional year, together with the prioritization of efforts and resources to conclude outputs and the definition of a roadmap for sustainability. Once the priority issues have been	Partially accepted	The 1-year extension is accepted , but it is suggested to extend the project for 6 months after the extension (18 months in total). The reason for this is the context of the COVID-19 pandemic and the impact on the implementation and accomplishment of some Project outputs. This is considering that the mid-term review was concluded at the beginning of the Chilean pandemic (March 2020) and was not considered in the review. At the time of drawing up this document, the pandemic situation in Chile has	LTO, Project Management		No additional funds are required

agreed and the positive balances defined, redirect resources to other key issues such as Monitoring, Evaluation and communication.		not been controlled and there is still no certainty about the time needed to conclude the project.			
Sustainability and extension/reproduction: D.1. Strategy and long-term financial plan					
Recommendation D.1.1. Develop a long-term strategy with and without a Biodiversity and Protected Areas Service (SBAP), provide for alternative resources such as regional funds or specific sources such as research funds from the Empresa Nacional Del Petróleo (ENAP).	Accepted	Both scenarios (with and without SBAP) are considered for the development of the Strategic and Financial Plan (Output 1.1.1) as well as the Coordination and Governance Plan (Output 1.1.2). Before the Pandemic, it was considered to apply for regional funds to implement the aforementioned plans; however, given the COVID-19 context, the possibility of available budget for this type of funding is uncertain in the short term	FAO Representation Chile, LTO and Project Management	Second semester 2020 and first semester 2021	No additional funds are required
Recommendation D.1.2. Develop a strategy linked to the limitation of compliance with the National Contributions NDC for the damage to the peatlands, important carbon sinks; to the safeguard of fresh water as strategic resource and to health problems as a result of beaver faeces in drinkable water and the presence of tapeworm in the species.	Partially accepted	The project does not commit to a strategy linked to the limitation of compliance with the National Contributions NDC. Developing a strategy linked to NDC for the damage to peatlands is not within the scope of the project; however, some findings during the implementation, make it possible to support or sustain peatland conservation strategies or plans by the Ministry of Environment or other institutions. The information generated will account for the beaver's impact on peatland ecosystems to be part of conservation plans and compliance with NDCs.	LTO, Project Management	First semester 2021	No additional funds are required

<p>Recommendation D.1.3. Develop a binational strategy with Argentina that extends beyond the end of the project and creates the protocols, communication and coordination spaces between governments and allows for the operationalization of a long-term binational strategy.</p>	Partially accepted	<p>The Output 1.2.4. Protocols for information exchange at regional, national and binational level between Chile and Argentina considers the design of information exchange protocols agreed upon between both countries, to spread information and data at binational level, using virtual mechanisms included in the SCIAT. These protocols can guide both countries towards the development of a binational strategy which is not within the scope of the project.</p> <p>However, the development of the Strategic Plan and the Coordination and Governance Plan, does include the importance of a binational work.</p>	FAO Representation in Chile, LTO and Project Management	Second semester 2020 and first semester 2021	No additional funds are required
Factors affecting performance: E.1. Strategic communication					
<p>Recommendation E.1.1. Reconsider the implementation arrangement with more partners' participation and quarterly meetings to enable adaptive project management: review progress, take advantage of lessons learned, and do joint planning.</p>	Partially accepted	<p>The implementation arrangement provides the partners with the necessary space to review progress, build on lessons learned, and do joint planning. Technical Committee meetings have been revived to reorient new outputs or focus on those already under implementation. The frequency of meetings is determined by the number and urgency of issues to be addressed, but they are held every two weeks</p>	LTO and Project Management	Second semester 2020 and first semester 2021	No additional funds are required
<p>Recommendation E.1.2. Develop a strategic communication plan for the community that, at the same time, raises awareness and positions the issue in the public agenda in a permanent and segmented way according to the target population (adults, youth</p>	Accepted	<p>The Project has a communication strategy focused on positioning the project in the public agenda. These are the actions to be considered for the next stage:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Strengthening communications in the public agenda regarding citizen's science for passive beaver denunciations. - Strengthening the partners as well as other institutions and/or organizations' communications team related to the beaver problem. 	LTO and Project Management	Second semester 2020 and first semester 2021	No additional funds are required

and children), and in a continuous way so that the trainings can generate impact beyond the change of officials. Recruit specific staff for the communications area if deemed appropriate.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Continuation of education and awareness programmes for different age groups of the population - Guide the communications strategy towards decision makers to position the beaver's problem. 			
Recommendation E.1.3. Work with young people of Universidad de Magallanes and the Municipality of Porvenir as a trainer of trainers in activities such as 'science afternoons in a remote place'.	Accepted	The communication strategy of Output 1.3.1 considers education and awareness of the target audience. In this case, partnering with higher education institutes as well as vocational institutes will facilitate training activities and involvement of young people.	Project Management	Second semester 2020	No additional funds are required
Factors affecting performance: E.2. Monitoring and Evaluation System					
Recommendation E.2.1. Agree on the purpose and objectives of Monitoring and Evaluation. Define the roles and responsibilities of the staff in charge of Monitoring and Evaluation. Consider recruiting specific staff. Get advice from FAO Monitoring and Evaluation Focal Point.	Partially accepted	Strengthen project monitoring and evaluation through reports and capacities for a better follow-up of project implementation, to take timely corrective decisions including environmental monitoring.	LTO, Project Management, FAO Chile		
Cross-sectional dimensions: F.1. Gender, indigenous peoples, workers and community policies					
Recommendation F.1.1. Leverage women's participation in work issues, training and information in the education area of to make	Accepted	The capacity strengthening programme (Output 1.3.2) will consider the participation of women for active denunciations about beavers. However, their participation cannot be ensured, considering that women are not interested in field activities. It must be considered that in the Magallanes region the population is rare, therefore, there are few staff for	Project Management	Second semester 2020 and first semester 2021	No additional funds are required

active denunciations about beavers. Get advice from FAO Gender Focal Point.		this type of work and, therefore, the target group is small. In this sense, 28 women have been trained in issues related to beaver management			
Recommendation F.1.2. Conduct a gender analysis to understand the role of women and their needs within the project and, in keeping with the same, make an inclusive proposal for the remainder of the project and the future; get advice from FAO Gender Focal Point.	Partially accepted	The project conducted a gender analysis during the design phase, and it was determined that the project is gender sensitive in terms of training and staff education and efforts have been made to achieve this. It must be considered that in the Magallanes region the population is rare, therefore, there is a few staff for this type of work and, therefore, the target group is small.	LTO and Project Management	Second semester 2020	No additional funds are required
Recommendation F.1.3. Consider and integrate indigenous communities as another actor in the territory to reclaim their rights in Tierra del Fuego. Get advice from FAO Indigenous Peoples' Focal Point.	Partially accepted	The indigenous peoples safeguard was not activated during the project design, given the absence of indigenous peoples in or around the project area. However, the project recognizes the national indigenous problem and hence, different actors such as indigenous peoples will be considered in the development of the strategy.	LTO and Project Management	Second semester 2020	No additional funds are required
Recommendation F.1.4. Ensure greater protection for field workers.	Partially accepted	FAO As long as each project consulting organization is responsible for worker protection, the Project team will ensure compliance and seek mechanisms (e.g., that everyone has access to the project leader's mail to report complaints/problems) to monitor the worker protection aspects set forth in FAO contracts.	LTO, Project Management	Second semester 2020 and first quarter 2021	No additional funds are required
Recommendation F.1.5. Community: determine mechanisms and responsibilities for	Accepted	Output 1.2.1 Information, Monitoring and Early Warning System (SCIAT) considers the design of the flows and responsibilities to manage the complaints received in the SCIAT, either through	Project Management	Second semester 2020	No additional funds are required

<p>handling complaints received from the early warning system with community participation</p>		<p>active records made by formal staff or through citizen's science.</p> <p>The main actions to be carried out are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Training different people responsible for the SCIAT Management (Administrator, managers, collaborators and analysts). - Training Information Technology staff of the Ministry of the Environment on the platform maintenance. - Training officials from partner institutions and other organizations related to the problem. - Training civil society on manuals or brochures format to make passive complaints. 			
--	--	---	--	--	--