

Management Response

**to the Final Evaluation of the Climate Smart Livestock project:
“Promotion of Climate-smart Livestock Management Integrating
Reversion of Land Degradation and Reduction of Desertification
Risks in Vulnerable Provinces”**

GCP/ECU/085/GFF and GCP/ECU/092/SCF

GEF ID 4775

Response for each recommendation

1. In this section, Management should address each recommendation, discussing them in the order in which they were presented in the executive summary of the evaluation report. This should be done using the Management Response Matrix format below (see Table 1) and include:
 - a. the recommendation number and text copied from the evaluation report;
 - b. indication of whether the recommendation is accepted, totally or partially, or if it is rejected;
 - c. a description of the actions to be implemented, with comments as required by the conditions necessary during implementation, or the reasons why the recommendation has been partially accepted or rejected;
 - d. the part or unit of FAO responsible for implementing the action (s);
 - e. the deadline for its implementation and / or the work plan, if required;
 - f. indication if the implementation of a recommendation requires additional funding from FAO or a resource partner.

| Management response to the evaluation of the Climate Smart Livestock project: Promotion of Climate-smart Livestock Management Integrating Reversion of Land Degradation and Reduction of Desertification Risks in Vulnerable Provinces GCP/ECU/085/GFF and GCP/ECU/092/SCF GEF ID 4775 | | | | | Date |
|---|---|---|-------------------------|------------------|--|
| Recommendation of the evaluation (a) | Management response (b) Accepted, partially accepted or rejected | Management plan | | | |
| | | Measures to be taken, and / or comments on partial acceptance or rejection (c) | Responsible Unit (d) | Period (e) | Additional financing necessary (Y or N) (f) |
| Recommendation 1. At the level of relevance: in order for the project to contribute to the country's commitments on climate change: - To the project team: It is recommended to finalize the proposed Strategy for sustainable livestock by 2030 and the proposed livestock NAMA as soon as possible. Work with the Government for the socialization and consultation of the Livestock NAMA for its adoption. - To the MAG and MAAE: It is suggested to review and evaluate if it can be adopted or work on it so that it can be sent to the UNFCCC. Consider whether the work carried out can contribute to the search for financing among international donors, including the IDB's NAMA Facility that has shown interest. The international financing for the livestock NAMA will make it possible to give sustainability to the GCI practices and meet the goal of reducing GHG emissions established in the NDC, in addition to generating environmental, social and economic benefits to the country. | Accepted | The livestock NAMA proposal is in place and negotiations are underway with the Government of Ecuador to present this NAMA to the NAMA Facility program in May 2021. | FAO Ecuador | Jan-June 2021 | Y |

| | | | | | |
|---|--------------------|---|-------------|--------------|---|
| <p>- To the MAG: It is suggested to evaluate the inclusion of the Sustainable Livestock Strategy by 2030 to have a political framework that facilitates the international financing of the actions proposed in the Livestock NAMA and other related initiatives.</p> | | | | | |
| <p>Recommendation 2. At the level of effectiveness: in order that Ecuador manages to consolidate the green credit line in the state development bank:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To BanEcuador: It is suggested to seek agreements with the international development bank to give sustainability to the green credit line, under the same credit conditions or even with rates interest rates lower than other development loans. - To FAO: It is recommended to promote the coordination and creation of synergies between BanEcuador and the National Corporation for Popular and Solidarity Finance (CONAFIPS), with a view to generating greater financial inclusion by adding the organizations of the popular and solidarity financial sector (savings cooperatives and credit, mutuals, savings banks and community banks) to offer the green credit line, expanding opportunities for producers who want to implement the GCI approach on their farms. It is also recommended that FAO in Ecuador accompany BanEcuador in the search for international financing to maintain a green credit line, linked to a GHG emission reduction scheme. | Partially accepted | <p>FAO Ecuador has contemplated supporting the development of green credit lines with BanEcuador and other financial institutions in new projects that are being designed and that are beginning their execution. In the projects on Land Degradation (GEF) and Andean Landscapes (European Union) activities are contemplated to consolidate this credit line and include new financial institutions interested in green credits. The continuity of the credit lines by BanEcuador will depend on the availability of resources to grant credits and on a continuity in its national credit policy.</p> | FAO Ecuador | Jan-Dec 2021 | N |
| <p>Recommendation 3. In order to maintain the GCI practices implemented by livestock producers, especially in the province of Loja:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To MAG, MAAE and FAO: It is suggested to support the provincial GAD Loja in the implementation of the GCI approach as part of the actions that it proposes in its PDOT and the Gonzanamá and Paltas cantonal GADs in their initiatives for the implementation of the GCI approach in their territories. Support the initiatives led by the partner universities of the project in the different provinces and the NGO Children of the Andes Humanitarian in the province of Imbabura that seek to ensure the sustainability and replication of the project's results. - To FAO: Based on the project evidence, it is recommended to promote approaches with private actors that can contribute to provide sustainability and replicate the GCI approach in other regions where interest may arise. | Partially accepted | <p>The FAO Ecuador office depends on external donor funding, therefore it cannot guarantee the continuity of interventions in places like Loja. However, thanks to the processes of the GCI project and the Sustainable Land Management project, some of the initiatives and practices have been consolidated and institutions at the local level continue to promote these practices at the local level. Regarding the approaches with the private sector, FAO in its new projects is including components of value chains and connection with markets in which an identified chain has been livestock. Therefore, future alliances can be found</p> | FAO Ecuador | Jan-Dec 2021 | N |

| | | | | | |
|--|--------------------|---|-------------|--------------|-------|
| | | in the new proposals based on the lessons learned from the GCI project. | | | |
| <p>Recommendation 4. It is recommended that the provincial GAD Loja and the provincial directorates of MAG and MAAE in Loja continue to implement the Gender Equality Strategy developed by the project, to promote equal opportunities and the generation of affirmative actions aimed especially at small owners, heads of households and women who lead livestock, in order to contribute to the elimination of obstacles that hinder their development at the provincial level. FAO is recommended to disseminate the existing lessons in Loja and to disseminate them in other provinces where there are similar works.</p> | Rejected | <p>FAO does not have permanent resources to guarantee the continuity of actions in a given territory. We have worked hand in hand with local institutions and we hope that these institutions are the ones that give continuity to the actions and allow the local sustainability of the actions.</p> | N / A | N / A | N / A |
| <p>Recommendation 5. In order to maintain the results (sustainability) achieved in the environmental, social, institutional and financial fields:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To FAO: It is recommended to promote the design and financing of new projects that allow to give continuity to the implementation of the ICM approach in the country and in the region, taking into consideration the lessons learned regarding the processes of capacity development, commitment and ownership of the interested parties, social equity, participation of the private sector and access to markets, among others, highlighting at all times the contribution of the GCI to food security. Integrate members of the project's technical team in these new initiatives, which could provide significant added value in the implementation of the GCI approach, its continuity and replication. - To the Institutions involved: It is suggested to evaluate the possibility of integrating the members of the project technical team in the new initiatives (Sustainable livestock strategy to 2030, livestock NAMA, NDC and others) that seek to provide sustainability and replicate the GCI approach. Since the technical team of the project was characterized by an excellent performance, in addition to the fact that all its members specialized in the implementation of GCI practices, they would undoubtedly contribute enormous added value to new projects and activities related to the subject. In this way, it would be ensuring that the human capital of the project can continue working on the GCI approach, ensuring its full adoption in the country. | Partially Accepted | <p>New projects in design and underway include the lessons learned from the GCI project and will foster proven practices in the GCI project in new initiatives.</p> <p>The approach with the government for the presentation of a NAMA on livestock has been initiated.</p> | FAO Ecuador | Jan-Dec 2021 | Y |

| | | | | | |
|--|-----------------|---|--|---------------------|----------|
| <p>Recommendation 6. It is recommended that the GEF Coordination Unit in Rome and FAO Ecuador clearly identify the components of a project whose execution presents benefits when carried out by FAO as an implementing agency and with a role of executing agency, based on a risk analysis, including technical and institutional capacities. For example, when it comes to projects that link two or more ministries or State portfolios with conflicting objectives and roles or where there are strong risks linked to political instability, FAO can play a key role as a high-level technical adviser, third party neutral and bridge between two or more ministries, facilitating fluid inter-institutional coordination, focused on achieving the results and goals of the project. In addition, it can facilitate input purchasing operations and personnel recruitment, maximizing efficiency in project management and implementation.</p> | <p>Accepted</p> | <p>New FAO proposals will maintain the required clarity of FAO as the implementing agency in future GEF projects. The risks associated with implementation through partners have been analyzed and the accompanying and technical assistance processes required will be adjusted to reduce the risks associated with implementation through local partners.</p> | | | |
| <p>Recommendation 7. In matters of monitoring and evaluation, it is recommended that FAO consider the Monitoring and Evaluation System developed in the project, as a model to follow in new projects, which can be reflected from the design phase of new initiatives. In this sense, it is recommended to systematize and disseminate the acquired learning among other GEF projects, inside and outside the country.</p> | <p>Accepted</p> | <p>The monitoring and follow-up system developed with the GCI project will be taken into account for the implementation of new projects.</p> | <p>FAO Ecuador and implementing partners</p> | <p>2021-2025</p> | <p>N</p> |
| <p>Recommendation 8. At the impact level, it is recommended to FAO that for future programs and projects that promote ICM and / or sustainable agricultural production, a component of value chains, access to markets, identification of special markets and alliances with the private sector, as elements that can contribute significantly to the adoption of sustainable production practices on a larger scale and in the long term. Likewise, FAO's linkage with private actors must be agile and efficient in order to respond to the demands of the sector and work together.</p> | <p>Accepted</p> | <p>The lessons learned from the GCI project have made it possible to include value chain components in the new initiatives of FAO Ecuador to reinforce field and productive activities. Therefore, future alliances with the private sector can be found in the new proposals based on the lessons learned from the GCI project.</p> | <p>FAO Ecuador</p> | <p>Jan-Dec 2021</p> | <p>N</p> |