

# FAO-GEF Project Implementation Review 2019 – Revised Template



Period covered: 1 July 2018 to 30 June 2019

#### 1. Basic Project Data

#### **General Information**

Region:	Asia Pacific
Country (ies):	China
Project Title:	Securing Biodiversity Conservation and Sustainable Use in China's Dongting Lake Protected Areas
FAO Project Symbol:	GCP/CPR/043/GFF
GEF ID:	4356
GEF Focal Area(s):	BD
Project Executing Partners:	Forestry Department of Hunan Province (FDHP)
Project Duration:	5 years

#### **Milestone Dates:**

GEF CEO Endorsement Date:	29 April, 2014
Project Implementation Start Date/EOD:	May 13, 2016
Proposed Project Implementation End Date/NTE:	May 12, 2021
Revised project implementation end date (if applicable)	May 12, 2021
Actual Implementation End Date:	

#### Funding

GEF Grant Amount (USD):	USD 2 950 000
Total Co-financing amount as included in GEF CEO Endorsement Request/ProDoc:	USD 7 600 000
Total GEF grant disbursement as of June 30, 2019 (USD m):	USD 872,450
Total estimated co-financing materialized as of June 30, 2019	USD 24,018,333

#### **Review and Evaluation**

Date of Most Recent Project Steering Committee:	December 22, 2018
Mid-term Review or Evaluation Date planned (if applicable):	N/A
Mid-term review/evaluation actual:	March 13-17, 2019
Mid-term review or evaluation due in coming fiscal year (July 2019 – June 2020).	N/A
Terminal evaluation due in coming fiscal year (July 2019 – June 2020).	No
Terminal Evaluation Date Actual:	N/A
Tracking tools/ Core indicators required	YES

#### Ratings<sup>1</sup>

Overall rating of progress	MS	
towards achieving objectives/		
outcomes:		
Overall implementation	NAC .	
Overall implementation	MS	
progress rating:		
Overall risk rating:	1	
Overall fisk facilig.	_	

#### Status

Implementation Status	3rd PIR
(1 <sup>st</sup> PIR, 2 <sup>nd</sup> PIR, etc. Final PIR):	Sidilik

#### **Project Contacts**

Contact	Name, Title, Division/Affiliation	E-mail
Project Manager / Coordinator	Yao Chunsheng, Project Manager, FAO China Office	Chunsheng.Yao@fao.org
Lead Technical Officer	Miao Weimin, LTO, the Aquaculture Officer of FAO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific	Weimin.Miao@fao.org
Budget Holder	Vincent Martin, BH, FAO Representative in China and DPRK	Vincent.Martin@fao.org
GEF Funding Liaison Officer, Investment Centre Division	Yurie Naito, Programme Officer	Yurie.Naito@fao.org

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)	Prog ress ratin g 4
Objective <sup>5</sup>						
Outcome 1.1: Provincial multi sectoral government meeting (PMSGM) is fulfilling its function coordinating the implementatio n of the DWEMP and at least two key biodiversity	1. PMSGM strengthened by the end of the project. 2. Updated detailed biodiversity baseline and threat analysis. 3. Integrated DWE management plan (MP) incorporating valuation of	A circular creating the Dongting Lake Conservation Committee (DLCC) and appointing the chairman and members was issued by the provincial government in 2007. However, the committee is still not operating, the sectors are not sharing existing	One key biodive rsity threat issue address ed	Most key biodiver sity threat issues addresse d	As the results of provincial government campaign and special actions, the following biodiversity threats within Dongting Lake were removed:  1. More than 10600 ha of poplar trees were cleaned up in the NRs, including 5300 ha in the core areas of NRs.  2. Sand mining in Dongting Lake NR has been stopped.  3. The illegal fishing/aquaculture activities such as enclosed fishing net, the fish cage were all cleaned up in the whole lake areas.  As of June 30, 2019, the Provincial Multi Sectorial Government Joint Meeting office received a total of 15,160 yuan of office expenses supported by the FDHP, staff salary of 40,000 yuan, equipment costs of 43,194 yuan.	S

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> This should describe indicators captured in the approved results framework of the project and in the tracking tools. Please add cells when required in order to use one cell for each indicator and one rating for each indicator.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Some indicators may not identify mid-term targets at the design stage therefore this column should only be filled when relevant.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup>Project team to insert reatings that will be confirmed by BH/LTO. Please Use GEF Secretariat required six-point scale system: **Highly Satisfactory** (HS), **Satisfactory** (S), **Marginally Satisfactory** (MS), **Marginally Unsatisfactory** (MU), **Unsatisfactory** (U), and **Highly Unsatisfactory** (HU).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>Applicable only for projects with objective level indicators.

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)	Prog ress ratin g 4
threats addressed (sand mining threatening porpoises, poplar plantations, and/or un- sustainable fisheries) by the end of project.	biodiversity approved by PMSGM.  4. DWE Integrated Information Management System (IIMS) on status of biodiversity, ecosystem services, and socio-economic indicators is operating	monitoring data and analysis weakening sound decision making, and a sector integrated planning and ecosystem conservation approach was lacking. No key biodiversity threats had been addressed.			Dongting Lake Integrated Information Management System was developed and put into test runs.	
Outcome 2.1a  Improvement in management effectiveness of NRs by the end of the project monitored through the BD management effectiveness tracking tool:	1. Three local decrees on Administrative Measures for NR (AMNR)  2. WDT NR and SDT NR are upgrated from provincial NRs to National NRs and  3. HLH NR to Ramsar	Management effectiveness assessment scores: East DL 61; West DL 54; South DL 56; and HLH 53 Threat score: East DL 56; West DL 63; South DL 57; and HLH 61	Manage ment effectiveness assessment scores: East DL 62; West DL 62; South DL 60; and	Manage ment effective ness assessme nt scores: East DL 70; West DL 70; South DL 68; and HLH 66	Management effectiveness score results:  East DT 78; West DT 66; South DT 68; HLH NR 57.  Threats Score:  East DT 36; West DT 25; South DT 29; HLH NR 12.  Progress of local decrees on Administrative Measures for NRs:  AMNRs for EDT NR and SDT NR have been promulgated and implemented, and the work of HLH NR needs to be speeded up.  Upgrade of NR and Designation of Ramsar Site:  WDT has been upgraded to national NR. Since the government of Hunan Province has confirmed the establishment of Dongting Lake National Park, the output of upgrading of SDT NR from	S

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)	Prog ress ratin g 4
	4. Four five- years NR management plans (NRMP) updated		HLH 60 Threat score: East DL 50; West DL 57; South DL 55; and HLH 40	Threat score: East DL 47; West DL 51; South DL 50; and HLH 40	Provincial NR to National NR is going to be redirected by the Dongting National Park Project instead.  Baseline data survey for HLH Ramsar Site designation was completed. Threats to ecosystem and biodiversity, hydrological process and ecosystem service function of the HLH wetland was analyzed. Management capacity assessment of and training for Hengling Lake NR as Wetlands of International Importance(Ramsar Site) have been completed. Paper work including application forms, scientific survey report, and verification reports, have been done by the sub-contract partner.  After the Ramsar Site designation of WDT in 2002, Changde City where the WDT located is confirmed as a World Wetland City in 2018.  NR management plan development:  Training courses on Management plan were conducted in the 4 NRs. The content of this training mainly includes the management plan overview, the basic content, the compiling procedures and method, the approval and implementation, the outline and framework of the management plan. The training resource person elaborated the definition, the purpose and significance, the compiling procedures and methods of NR management plans in a simple way.  The NRs organized symposiums of relevant stakeholders, who put forward issues such as to deal with reed and agricultural pollution, etc. Experts suggested baselines surveying with GIS to make clear the ecological red line, strengthen the law enforcement in NRs, etc.	

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)	Prog ress ratin g 4
					The first drafts of management plan for the 4 NRs have not been completed yet.	
Outcome 2.1b 50% increase in national and local governmental budget allocations to PA management	50% increase in national and local governmental budget	20 million/year  (USD 3.07 million)	25% increas e	50% increase	Investigation data shows an increase in both national fund and local fund for the conservation of the NRs management/Project budget (in USD) are as follows: EDT 312,295/1,656,334  WDT 101,541/4,173,371  SDT 281,118/312,354  HLH 23,461/969,674  Total budget is USD 7.1 million in 2018.  The total governmental budget baseline is USD 3.07 million in 2014.  The increment of national and local governmental budget is far more than 50%.	S
Outcome 2.2.a  Improved biodiversity and endangered species indicators in DWE by the	(i) increase in total bird visitation by 10% in the four DL NRs; (ii) finless porpoise population maintained; (iii) lesser white-fronted goose	Management effectiveness assessment scores: East DL 61; West DL 54; South DL 56; and HLH 53 Threat score: East DL 56; West DL		(i) Total migrator y bird visitatio n 114,400- 143,000; (ii) Finless porpoise	Key species conservation actions:  EDT NR together other NRs completed the synchronized monitoring of wintering birds from November 2017 to March 2018  Tracking Tool results of 2017-2018:  Management efficiency score results: EDT 78; WDT 66; SDT 68; HLH 57.	S

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)	Prog ress ratin g 4
end of the project	population maintained; (iv) black stork population maintained; (v) 5% increase in Pere Davis deer population; (vi) Whistling Swan population maintained; (vii) increase from 2 to 5% appearance of Silver Fish in monitoring caches (ecosystem health indicator)	63; South DL 57; and HLH 61		: 100- 150; (iii) Lesser white- fronted goose (Anser erythrop us): 18,000; (iv) Black stork (ciconia nigra): 23; (v) Pere David's Deer (Elaphur us Davidian us): 26- 27; (vi) Whistlin g Swan (Cygnus columbi anus): 800- 1,000;	Threats Score: EDT 36; WDT 25; SDT 29; HLH 12.  (i)total wintering birds 240,609; (ii) finless Porpoise: 100; (iii) lesser white-fronted goose population: 13,514; (iv) black stork: 70; (v) Pere Davis deer: 103 (vi) Whistling Swan: 5,155; (vii) Field investigation by GEF technical service provider showed more than 5% appearance of Silver Fish in monitoring caches.	

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)	Prog ress ratin g 4
				(vii) Silver fish: 5% appearan ce rate in monitori ng catches		
Outcome 2.2.b  Improved income indicators for households (of which 60% are represented by women as the main participant and beneficiary) involved in comanagement demonstration models	(i) 320 farming households have increased their income by at least 30% for EDT NR from bird-friendly rice production; (ii) 400 households involved in organic fish farming and 500 households involved in rights-based fisheries comanagement to support the restoration of fisheries resources have increased their income by at	Investigation on income baseline is ongoing	(i) 20 farming househ olds involve d with 30% increas e in income; (ii) 400 househ olds involve d (200 in organic fish farming and 200 in rights-based	(i) 320 farming househol ds involved with 30% increase in income; (ii) 900 househol ds involved (400 in organic fish farming and 500 in rights-based fisheries co-	The plan for the sustainable development of the Caisang lake has been completed, and the joint development agreement is being negotiated with the community.  Local community co-management in Caisang Lake and Matang village were developed. A preliminary agreement was reached among local town government, farmers and commercial company in bird friendly agriculture development. The agreement will be signed and technical support for the plan from Chinese Academy of Science was ready.  WDT NR:  Two Eco tourist company signed agreements with NR for a formalized management of tourism in the area.  In Qingshan polder in WDT NR, the organic fishery was developed, and the co-management administrative measures of Qingshan Polder were formulated. In Banbian Lake about USD 500,000 was invested in wetland restoration, which directly	MS

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	t Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)		
	least 100% from HLH NR experimental zone; (iii) 70 households have increased their income by at least 100% from WDT NR due to Eco-tourism operations and bird habitat conservation		fisherie s co-manage ment) with 100% increas e in income; (iii) 70 househ olds incorpo rated and their income increas ed with 100%	manage ment) with 100% increase in income; (iii) 70 househol ds incorpor ated and their income increase d with 100%	resulted in better water quality and an increasing of total number of wintering birds.  The development plan of Eco-tourism in the WDT Reserve has been completed. Bird's habitat in Banbian Lake has been restored.  30 households have signed on the agreements, covering an area of over 170 hectares.  An Eco-tourism association and publicity windows have been set up, and demonstration households were awarded. Plus, propaganda and educational materials and Eco-tourism manuals are printed and published.  The integration of the Eco-tourism Association and the Wetland Protection Association has become a successful practice in conservation and development cooperation.  HLH NR:  HLH NR together and Xiangyin county government had completed the preparatory work for fishermen relocation which was one of the fish resources protection project of Provincial Government.  GEF consultant group helped to develop and complete the fish culture project planning of Qingshan Island.  A social-economic feasibility analysis has been completed. Economic model for various development approaches including Eco-fisheries was defined in Qingshan Island. The environmental impact assessment of the development of ecological fisheries has been completed. It is confirmed that the contents of the project		

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)	Prog ress ratin g 4	
					development will play a good role in the protection and restoration of the aquatic ecosystem around Qingshan Island. The community co-management survey and the household survey have been completed, and the co-management model has been formulated.		
				Farmers will be encouraged to take part in protection, but incentive plan has not yet been formulated. The participatory protection methods that may be adopted are Eco-tourism and distinctive agricultural and sideline products.			
				Consultation meeting on the development of Eco-fisheries was held (10 participants, with an understanding of forming development intentions based on multi-partner communities, and reaching consensus through consultations with stakeholders on community co-management programs and agreements.			
					Since the co-management models were developed initially, income increment has not been achieved yet. Participatory households of organic fish farming and rights-based fisheries co-management are still in a process of confirmation.		
Outcome 3.1.a BD O2 tracking tool	increased from 17 to 23 (out of 36 possible) for the sectors	17	20	23	The tracking processes were carried out by PMO in July 5, 2018 through investigation on Governmental sector policies and documents. There are clearly progresses towards the outcomes as follows:	HS	
score on biodiversity conservation integration in	influencing on DWE				The overall score evaluated is 31 comparing with the results of 17 in 2011, which was validated by the MTE since the achieved indicator shows 100% and achievement rating "HS" on Appendix 2: Log Frame Review.		
policies and regulations					Amendment of Wetland Protection Regulation of Hunan Province:		

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)	Prog ress ratin g 4
					IN October 2017, Hunan Wetland Protection Regulation amendment plan was formally incorporated into the provincial people's Congress legislative plan	
					Sector policy aligned with WPRHP and promoting biodiversity in sector decision making:	
				Most of the provincial departments developed regulations and action plan towards the Dongting Lake wetland ecosystem and biodiversity as follows:		
				In 2018, the Department of Water Resource and Transportation of Hunan Province carried out the threeyear action for strengthening Dongting Lake ecological environment traffic, and regulating the illegal sand stone wharf.		
					Agricultural Committee of Hunan Province announced document in 2018 promoting healthy aquaculture through regulating overall aquaculture in rivers, lakes, reservoirs and other natural waters to protect water ecosystem. "The China fishery administration action 2018 "was launched in Changde City-WDT for a synchronized law enforcement action against over fishing in spring.	
					In February 2018, Forestry Department and Environmental Protection Department of the province developed 12 major projects in Hunan for joint action on water environment improvement of "one lake, four rivers", which means the Nine Dragons (the major Gov. Departments of Hunan Province) were jointly work together for ecological protection.	
					A new policy was announced by the Agricultural Committee of Hunan Province on caged fishery and other pollution related aquaculture control in 2018.	

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)	Prog ress ratin g 4
					Supported by co-financing, GEF project legal experts, together with the Provincial People's Congress, the Regulations Division and the Wetland Conservation Center of FDHP, carried out research on the revision of Wetland Protection Regulations.	
Outcome 3.1.b  Poplar plantation reduced by 20,000 ha by the end of the project	Poplar plantation reduced by 20,000 ha by the end of the project	400,000 ha	390,000 ha	380,000 ha	The management of Core zone of the NR in Dongting Lake was enforced:  Up to date, more than 14600 ha of poplar tree were removed from the 4 NRs of Dongting Lake, with a core zone of 5700 ha of all existing poplar trees eliminated, while more than 18800 ha of poplar trees remained in the buffer and experiment zones.	S
Outcome 4.1  Awareness among the local population on DWE biodiversity value, use and wetlands protection regulations increased	increased to 30%	Less than 10% of the local population knows about wetlands provincial regulation	20% awaren ess	30% awarene ss	The billboards were setup by Project Management Office and NRs. More than 10000 copies of NR brochures were distributed to the local people.  The visiting centre of EDT NR was updated.  The display of Visiting Center of WDT NR has been completed with an investment of more than 6 million yuan. The Visiting Center was officially opened in April 2019.  The 2018 Bird Watching Festival and the International Symposium on Dongting Lake were held simultaneously in EDT NR, Yueyang City with a huge social impact. The original bird-watching competition in EDT NR has become a bird-watching festival of Hunan Province and Yueyang City.  Summer camps of two universities to East and WDT NRs were organized by project communication specialist for environmental	S

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)	Prog ress ratin g 4
					education to local people and field investigation on NR development. At the same time, more than 7 universities participated the activity.  Preliminary Framework of Local Textbook "I Love Dongting Mother Lake" has been started in EDT NR. At the same time, the "Ecology Entering School" activity initiated by EDT NR, and developed local curricula on Dongting wetland for more than 10 schools such as Chaoyang Primary School and Hongyi Primary School.  According to project agreement and suggestion from FAO, the joint working group of EDT NR and WDT NR for the middle school curricula was formed for the unified Dongting text book.  A survey was done on ecological and environmental awareness among the local population on DWE biodiversity value, wetlands protection regulations and policies, local conservation efforts, and personal conservation behaviors on March 2, 2019. A total of 695 questionnaires were distributed and 510 were recalled, all of which are deemed effective. From the submitted report the surveyed data were analyzed and conclusions were made of more than 50% of the local population became aware of the biodiversity value and implemented protection regulations and policies on DWE.	
Outcome 5.1  Project implementatio n based on results based management and increased	Project "best- practices" and "lessons- learned" in relation to co- management models, integrated DWE	Project results framework with project output and outcome indicators, targets and baseline	30-40% progres s in achievi ng project	Project outcome s achieved and showing	MTE was completed.  The expert of knowledge management was recruit for gathering and observing best-practices and lessons-learned in the project.	S

Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>2</sup>	Baseline level	Mid- term target <sup>3</sup>	End-of- project target	Level at 30 June 2019 (since project start)	Prog ress ratin g 4
receptivity and	management		outcom	sustaina		
adoption of	experience,		es	bility		
DWE	mainstreaming					
approach to	of wetlands					
"mainstreamin	biodiversity					
g" biodiversity	conservation in					
conservation in	sectors					
sector planning	disseminated					
in both China	via publications,					
and elsewhere	project website					
	and others.					

#### Action plan to address MS, MU, U and HU rating <sup>6</sup>

Outcome	Action(s) to be taken	By whom?	By when?

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 6}\,{\rm To}$  be completed by Budget Holder and the Lead Technical Officer

#### 3. Progress in Generating Project Outputs

		Expected		Imple ment.				
	End of project Targets	completion date <sup>8</sup>	1 <sup>st</sup> PIR	2 <sup>nd</sup> PIR	J FIIN		status (cumu lative)	
Output 1.1.1: Provincial Multi Sectoral Government Meetings (PMSGM) strengthened by the end of the project with: i) a functioning secretariat in FDHP (two half-time staffs, office equipment and operations budget); ii) agreed operations procedures; iii) agreed five years' work plan; and iii) at least one meeting per year held	One PMSGM meeting held, progress in implementation of work plan monitored	Q3 Y4	Two provincial multi sectoral government meetings were held to combat threats in Dongting Lake area	Another provincial five administrative level video conference was held in November 1, 2017 participated by the officials from provincial level to village level to work on improve the ecological environment of Dongting Lake.	The office has a regular operation system and now is preparing its 5-year work plan.		60 %	DLCC was suspended by the government in 2016. Instead, Provincial Multi Sectorial Government Meetings chaired by the Vice Governor of Hunan Province has become the coordinating mechanism for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Outputs as described in the project logframe or in any updated project revision. In case of project revision resulted from a mid-term review please modify the output accordingly or leave the cells in blank and add the new outputs in the table explaining the variance in the comments section.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> As per latest work plan (latest project revision); for example: Quarter 1, Year 3 (Q1 y3)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Please use the same unity of measures of the project indicators, as much as possible

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Variance refers to the difference between the expected and actual progress at the time of reporting.

							comprehensive management for Dongting Lake conservation across departments.
Output 1.1.2: Updated detailed biodiversity baseline and threat analysis by the end of PY1 including three technical reports on: a) DWE biodiversity and ecosystem services value and status; b) impacts on biodiversity from different sectors and response options; and c) options and priorities for land and water use plans valuating biodiversity	Three draft reports prepared within 9 months of the project implementation and consulted with focus groups (at least three meetings per report) from relevant sectors before finalization by the end of PY1	Q4 Y3	consultant's recruitment is in progress	In March 2018, the biodiversity baseline survey was completed for the field work.	Biodiversity baseline was updated and threat analysis report was completed.  The three technical reports on: a) DWE biodiversity and ecosystem services value and status; b) impacts on biodiversity from different sectors and response options; and c) options and priorities for land and water use plans valuating biodiversity were under preparation.	30 %	
Output 1.1.3: Integrated DWE management plan (MP) incorporating valuation of biodiversity approved by DLCC PMSGM by PY3 and under initial implementation by the end of the project	Final plan approved by DLCC PMSGM and implementation initiated	Q 2 Y3	consultant's recruitment is in progress	December 29, 2017 The three-year plan for ecological restoration of Dongting Lake was launched by Hunan Provincial Gov.  In February 2018, 12 major projects in Hunan for joint action on water	Based on the new situation and the current management system and policy of Dongting Lake, a comprehensive monitoring of the present situation of Dongting Lake has been initiated to identify potential threats, and to develop strategies towards the policy,	30 %	

Output 1.1.4: DWE	1) IIMS is	Q 2 Y4	consultant's	environment improvement of "one lake, four rivers" were started which means the Nine Dragons (the major Gov. Departments of Hunan Province) were jointly for water environment protection. In May 2018, the initial	management system and legislation initiatives. Finally, a 5 to 10 year integrated management plan for Dongting Lake will be developed with scientific evidences,  By 2019, through the	40	
Integrated Information Management System (IIMS) on status of biodiversity, ecosystem services, and socio- economic indicators is operating providing data and analysis for DWE management and decision- making at municipal, province and NR levels by PY2.	updated with ongoing monitoring programs  2) Bi-annual status report on DWE services and biodiversity published		recruitment is in progress	form of Dongting Lake Integrated Information Management System platform was developed by GEF consultant.  The Leading unit of the IIMS will be Hunan Provincial People's Government Development Research Center (Hunan provincial E-government Center).  IIMS is developed fully utilize the resources, such as computing, storage, network and security of Hunan Forestry Data Center, and connect to the interface of Hunan Provincial Government network which including	internet, the general situation of protected areas, news, tourism services, laws and regulations and other information can be browsed and viewed through the portal website by the public users.  Through the integrated information management platform of protected areas, special data such as boundary, river system, road, social economy, meteorology, hydrology and functional zoning of protected areas are provided to public users based on spatial information.	%	

				Provincial Development and Reform committee, Environmental Protection Department, Meteorology Bureau, Water Resource Department, Emergency Bureau, Transportation Bureau, Social Development Bureau and other related data resource, finally will form governmental decision making system on Dongting wetland ecosystem development and provincial management system on NR in Dongting.	Bi-annual status report on DWE services and biodiversity has not been published yet.		
Output 2.1.1: Three local decrees on Administrative Measures for NR (AMNR), one for each of East, South and HLH Dongting Lake (DL) NRs, proclaimed by the end of PY2 (facilitating increased local government budget allocation)	1) Three final validation workshops AMNR, one for each NR; 2) Three AMNR proclaimed by local governments (county or Municipality)	Q3 Y3	The plans for developing AMNR for East and West DT NR were approved by the People's Congress of Yueyang City and Hanshou County in 2015	Legislative draft of Hunan EDT NR Regulation was reviewed and agreed by the Standing Committee of the Yueyang City People's Congress.  The first draft of the new regulations on the management of the WDT National NR was developed, and the Draft will be reported to	Administrative measures for EDT NR have been issued. HLH NR has initiated the drafting of Administrative Measures.	60 %	

				Changde City People's Congress for further discussion. The new NR Regulation will replace the existing Administrative Measure for WDT NR which was developed in 2011.			
				On April 26, 2018 Yiyang SDT Provincial NR Administrative Measure was approved by the Gov. of Yiyang Prefecture City			
				HLH NR is preparing the draft of local decrees on Administrative Measures through the assistance by GEF legal specialist which will be submitted to Yueyang City People's Congress at the end of the year.			
Output 2.1.2: WDT NR and SDT NR are upgraded from provincial NRs to National NRs and HLH NR to Ramsar site by the end of PY3 (facilitating increased national	1) Official approval of upgrading of South DL NR by State Council. 2) Designation on HLH NR as	Q4 Y4	WDT NR was upgraded from provincial NRs to National	The output of upgrading of SDT NR from Provincial NR to National NR is going to be redirected by the Dongting National Park Project.	Biodiversity baseline survey of SDT NR were completed. Biodiversity survey was updated for HLH NR and	35 %	

government budget allocation).	RAMSAR site by the State Council (to be approved by Ramsar Secretariat)		NRs in May 2013  The contract of Comprehensi ve Scientific Investigation and Master Plan Developing schedule for upgrading of SDT NR and the field investigation and report of HLH NR to Ramsar site were going into the Biding processes	Baseline data survey of HLH Ramsar site designation was completed	Ramsar information sheet was prepared.  Biodiversity baseline survey of SDT was completed.  The Dongting National Park framework was completed.		
Output 2.1.3: Four five- years NR management plans (NRMP) updated for 2013-2018 and at least 20 NR staff trained in NR planning and management strengthening the DWE NR network	Four five-years NRMPs approved by local government or Provincial Forestry Department respectively	Q2 Y2	Formulation team was formed with participation of over 50 NR staff and Local stakeholders in East, West and South TDNRs	The revision of EDT NR management plan for 2016-2020 was reported to the city gov. and waiting for approval.  The WDT NR worked specially on the revision of the NRMP of 2015 and insert special contents in the new	EDT has reported its management plan for 2016-2020, while WDT is revising its management plan for 2016-2020, adding new contents such as poplar tree clearance and restoration and Ecotourism management.  A working group has been set up in the SDT	60 %	

			Draft plans were developed Draft version was developed through consultants and was approved by local city government and will be sent to FDHP for final approval	NRMP of 2016-2020 on restoration of the wetland where the poplar trees were erased during the last 3 years in the NR core areas.  From Oct. 2017, a team was built in SDT NR work on drafting the NRMP.  HLH NR is now working closely with GEF project specialist on drafting the NRMP.	NR. Special team members have been arranged to prepare the management plan and the preliminary work plan had been worked out.  The draft of HLH NR Management Plan has been basically completed.  In the first half year of 2019, training programs, combined with consultant meeting with stakeholders, have been launched in NRs,  The draft of MPs has not been completed yet.		
Output 2.1.4: Capacities for NR management strengthened through: a) training of 100 NR staff in BD monitoring and conservation measures, eco-tourism in NRs, law enforcement and comanagement mechanism, and public communication and awareness raising; and b) up-grating of infrastructure, patrol and monitoring equipment in	1) 100 Staff trained  2) Animal rescue centre, bird watching corridor, and visitor centre constructed in East DL NR  3) Office building constructed in HLH NR  4) Office building and animal rescue	Q4 Y4	One Pick-up car, two unmanned aerial vehicles, binoculars and laptops were finished procurement processes  New Animal rescue centre, bird watching	More than 120 of the staffs trained on the skills of legislation, law enforcement and biodiversity monitoring that the NR needed during July 2017 to June 2018.  A Milu rescue centre, and the bird watching corridor in front the EDT NR field Station were constructed in East DL NR. The new Milu	More than 120 staff members of SDT have been trained on the skills of wetland conservation.  A Milu rescue center with 1 ha was built up in EDT NR.  A new wetland ecological monitoring station near Banbian Lake, local black stock conserving station and new field office have been built in WDT NR.	60 %	

three DL NRs (West, South and HLH).	centre constructed in South DL NR		corridor are built in East DTNR supported by co-funding A visitor centre is planned in HLH NR	rescue central takes 1.2 ha in area, and there are 7 wounded Milu in the centre recently.  One field station (field Office) of HLH was built in Qingshan Island, and a bird monitoring tower was built together.	Four communication billboard signs were set up on wetland conservation.  In the main street of the town where the WDT NR located, a new wetland education center was built up and officially opened.		
Output 2.2.1: Four demonstration models for NR co-management implemented:  a) agriculture integrated management model restoring paddy harvested fields as winter bird feeding ground on 700 ha involving 320 households in East DL NR;  b) reed and poplar management model in South DL NR;  c) organic fish farming (involving 400 households) and ecosystem and rights based fisheries comanagement (involving 500 households) models to support the restoration of fisheries resources and	a) Farmers trained, cultivation plans under implementation and outcomes monitored.  b) Solution options and incentives implemented. Assessment of solution options and incentives and co- management model with reed farmers documented	Q4 Y4	An investigation and feasibility study on sustainable agriculture development in East DTNR was carried out in 2015 and earlier 2016  An investigation on overall land use and Poplar tree planting situation in South DT	The plan for the sustainable development of the Caisang lake in East DT had been completed, and the joint development agreement was negotiated with the community.  South DT: N/A  HLH NR together and Xiangyin county government had completed the preparatory work for fishermen relocation which was one of the fish resources protection	The study tours for NR co-management were carried out as follows:  WDT NR:  18 staff members visited Tangjiahe and Wanglang National NR in Aug. 13-18, 2018  19 staff members visited Qixinghe National NR in Heilongjiang from Sept. 3 to 8, 2018 for co-management experiences learning.  EDT NR:  13 staff members visited Sanjiangyuan National Park during Aug. 6 to 11, 2018 for Eco-tourism development study.	20%	National Environmental Inspection on Dongting wetland since 2016 require a constrained policy of moving out all the pollution related cultivation activities, some of the planned alternative farming activities are in the Prohibit list, such as fish culture in the buffer zoon of the NR, specially, the

			1		
maintain the porpoises	c) Fish farmers	was	projects of Provincial	Local community co-	eco (or organic)
population in 1,800 ha in	trained and	conducted in	Government.	management in Caisang	fishery in HLH
HLH NR experimental	implementation	2015, and	GEF consultant group	Lake and Matang village	and Caisang
zone;	of business plan	land	helped to develop and	were developed.	Lake in EDT
d) Eco-tourism and bird	monitored;	ownership	complete the fish culture		will encounter a
habitat conservation model	fishermen,	for the	project planning of		policy risk when
conserving 60 ha of birds	County Bureau of	poplar tree	Qingshan Island.	There were two local	implement.
habitat and 70 additional	Fishery and NR	was		workshop organized in	The Red Swamp
households involved in	staff trained and	identified		Matang village during the	Crayfish (known
Eco-tourism operations in	outcome of the	through	Two Eco tourist	late year of 2018, a	as small lobster
West DL NR.	implementation	investigation	company signed	preliminary agreement	in China) were
	of fisheries co-	, which will	agreements with NR for	was reached among local	defined as one
	management plan	be the later	a formalised	town government, famers	of the alien
	monitored	evidence for the	management of tourism	and commercial company	species but with
		implementati	in the area.	in bird friendly	very good
		on of	in the area.	agriculture development.	commercial
	d) Documentation	payment for		Follow the bird friendly	values in Central
	of lessons learned	ecosystem	The WDT NR has	agriculture developing	and lower
	and Eco-tourism	services	implemented the wetland	plan the agreement will	Yangtze areas. It
	co-management	Scrvices	ecological benefits	be signed and technical	is one of the
	of birds		compensation project	support for the plan from	major freshwater
	biodiversity	A draft Eco-	since 2017 in 11 villages	Chinese Academy of	cultivating
	expanded to 1,000 additional	tourism plan	and towns within the 1	Science was ready to	products
	ha. and 300	for 60	km range of the NR. The	help.	recently in
	fishermen	hectares bird	project was divided into		Dongting area
	households	habitat was	four categories include:	Project consultant and	and is very
	nouscholus	developed in	Direct compensation on	scientists from Chinese	difficult to avoid
		West DTNR	crop damage; Awarding	Academy of Science	in the demo site.
		WESLDINK	on good practices;	carried out field	The planned
			Compensation on	investigation specially	wintering
			damaging of exiting	focus on the developing	feeding ground
			infrastructures and	issues and technique	in Jianxin Farm
			Compensation on	knowhow.	was turn over
			restoration habitats from		into vegetable
			12011		into vegetable

				poplar tree area and hydraulic recreations. The total investment was USD 4.9 million.	70 fishermen have been trained for eco-tourism in WDT.  The models are proposed as following:  EDT:  Agriculture integrated biodiversity conservation.  WDT:  Eco-tourism and bird habitat conservation  HLH:  Organic fish farming and gathering  SDT:  Dongtinghu Watcher program		grow area with new land owner ship shifting, and the original habitats for crane is no longer exited. The new wintering bird feeding ground development need to relocate to Caisang Lake area with replacement of model of ecofarming (or organic farming) and NR related wintering Birds economy.
Output 2.2.2: Conservation of 5 flagship biodiversity species (finless porpoise, lesser white-fronted goose, black stork, Pere David's Deer, Whistle Swan) in a common effort among all NRs through: a) development and implementation of conservation action plan; b) restoration of 6,000 ha of	1) Population and habitats systematically monitored 2) Priority actions from the five conservation action plans implemented	Q4 Y3	Follow the distribution and migratory routes, 38 migratory bird conservation stations were set up at provincial level	EDT NR together other NRs completed the synchronized monitoring of wintering birds from November 2017 to March 2018  The EDT and the HLH, the SDT and the WDT jointly carried out the investigation on the Milu	As supported by GEF specialists Hunan Dongting Flag Species conservation Action Plan was completed for FDHP, and will play as the main action plan during 2018-2019.  Synchronized monitoring initiated by EDT has become the annual	3 %	

proxy indic	of population or ators for size supported	A professional monitoring and research team has been set up in East DTNR since 2014 for key species study in the area. Up to now, 40 GPS based tracing	finless porpoise in March 2018.  After Milu wild releasing these years, a series of policies on protection and compensation of Milu	routine action of the four major protected areas.  Overall bird population was increased and habitat in Dongting Lake have been greatly improved.		
		devices have been in effective on monitoring the key species  Two field monitoring	were executed in the main habitats, the total population is increased to 187 in Dongting Lake wetland.  The black stork conservation association in WDT NR running			
		stations were set up in South DTNF core area for onsite monitoring the habitat health and living status of David's deer and	well, and more than 50 black storks were observed in the winter of			

				Whistling Swan  The first Non- Government Conservation Association for Black Stork was formed in West DTNR with participation of local communities and conservation area covers 11 villages and towns around the	both legislation and NR management approaches was developed by consultants of the key species.  Up to date, Restoration plan for the 5514-ha poplar tree removing areas in the core areas of four NRs was developed with billions of investments.			
-	Output 3.1.1: Amendment of Wetland Protection Regulation of Hunan Province (WPRHP) presented to the Provincial People's Congress by PY3 including in particular provisions for: a) integrated management of wetland biodiversity and	Amendment passed and proclaimed	Q4 Y4	No progress yet	On October 2017, Hunan Wetland Protection Regulation amendment plan was formally incorporated into the provincial people's Congress legislative plan.	The third draft Amendment of Wetland Protection Regulation of Hunan Province (WPRHP) was submitted to the Provincial People's Congress.	50 %	

ecosystems; and b) compensation mechanism for conservation of wetlands biodiversity and ecosystem services							
Output 3.1.2: At least two sector policies (fisheries, reed and/or poplar plantation) are aligned with WPRHP, the Integrated DWEMP and the four AMNR decrees and NRMPs at local and provincial level by the end of the project	Most sector policy aligned through two sector workshops	Q4 Y4	No progress yet	Most of the provincial departments developed regulations and action plan towards the Dongting Lake wetland ecosystem and biodiversity as follows:  A Workplan for cleaning up Dongting NR poplar tree was announced by Hunan Forest Department in Nov. 26, 2017. More than 5500 ha of poplar tree were removed from the core areas of NR in Dongting Lake.	Newly issued or drafted regulations or action plan related to conservation of Donting Lake wetland ecosystem as following:  1. The Department of Justice of Hunan Province: "Regulations on the Protection of Dongting Lake in Hunan Province" (draft);  2. The Science and Technology Department of Hunan Province: "Construction Plan of Public Technology Service Platform for Dongting Lake Ecological Protection";	70 %	
				In 2018, the Department of Water Resource and Transportation of Hunan Province carried out the three-year action for strengthening Dongting Lake ecological environment traffic, and	3.The Ecological Environment Department of Hunan Province: "Comprehensive Management and Implementation Plan on the Water Environment		

1 22 21 211 1	C-ut-1-f4h-D-u-tin-
sand stone wharf.	Lake";
regulating the illegal sand stone wharf.  Agricultural Committee of Hunan Province announced the document in 2018 promoting healthy aquaculture through regulating overall aquaculture in rivers, lakes, reservoirs and other natural waters to protect water ecosystem. "The China fishery administration action 2018 "was launched in Changde City WDT for a synchronized law enforcement action against over fishing in spring.  In February 2018, Forestry Department and Environmental Protection Department	Protection Plan for the Dongting Lake Ecological Economic Zone in Hunan Province (2018-2025);  5. The Ecological Environment Department and the Development and Reform Commission of Hunan Province: "Implementation Scheme for the Action Plan for the Reconstruction of the Yangtze River Economic Belt";  5. The Natural Resources Department of Hunan Province: "Implementation Guidance of the People's Government of Hunan
Protection Department of the province	Province on Promoting the Prior of
developed 12major	the Pilot Project of Ecological Protection and
projects in Hunan for	Restoration of the
joint action on water	Integrated System of
environment	landscape, forest, field,
improvement of "one	

				lake, four rivers", which means the Nine Dragons (the major Gov. Departments of Hunan Province) were jointly work together for ecological protection.  A new policy was announced by the Agricultural Committee of Hunan Province on caged fishery and other pollution related aquaculture control in 2018.	lake, grass in the Xiangjiang River Basin and Dongting Lake area"  6. The Natural Resources Department of Hunan Province: the Planning of the Land and Resources of the Yangtze River Economic Belt (2018- 2035)		
Output 3.1.3: Practical skills of 360 provincial and local government officers in enforcement of wetland conservation and sustainable use regulations enhanced	Practical skills of 360 provincial and local government officers are trained	Q4 Y4	No progress yet	A three days provincial experience sharing and training workshop on Dongting wetland conservation was organized on May 21-23, 2018 by Wang Mingxu, the director of the FAO-GEF Project. The 105 participants came from Changde, Yiyang cities governments, forestry bureaus of fifteen cities in Hunan, Office of Hunan Provincial Government, Financial Department of Hunan	Practical skills of 110 of provincial and local governmental officials were trained with support of co-fund. GEF project is preparing training plan of 2019 together with government on capacity of Dongting Wetland conservation and Green development.	50 %	

Province, Dongting Lake
Division of Hunan
Developing and
Reforming Committee,
Water Resource
Department of Hunan,
Nature Ecology Division
of Environmental
Protection Department
of Hunan, Hunan
Provincial Agriculture
Committee and some
NGOs such as China
Green Foundation etc
During the workshop,
the three major
demonstration sites on
wetland restoration in
Dongting Lake were
visited including
Caisang Lake in East
DT, Banbian Lake in
West DT, and the core
areas of EDT NR. After
field visit and experience
sharing, the wetland
protection policies,
major action towards
wetland, related
technical solutions and
wetland protection
system in Hunan
Province were
introduced and
elaborated by Gui

				Xiaojie, the Vice Director of GEF PSC. Finally the overall wetland conservation planning and tasks in Hunan Province were assigned to each of the city governments through the speech by Hu Changqing, the Director of GEF PSC.			
Output 3.1.4: Increased capacity of 40 provincial and local government officials and private sector representatives in development and implementation of biodiversity conservation measures and practices in fishery management, pollution control from paper mills, sand mining and land-use planning for reed and poplar plantations	40 provincial and local government officials and private sector representatives are trained for the threats reducing activities	Q4 Y4	No progress yet	N/A	Learning and training project at provincial level for 2019 is developing for government officials and private sector representatives.	20 %	
Output 4.1.1: 50,000 brochures distributed and system of 20 billboard signs set up on: a) flagship species conservation; b) rules and regulations for protection and use of wetlands biodiversity; c) success stories on organic	50,000 brochures distributed and system of 20 billboard signs set up	Q4 Y4	More than 2,000 copies of brochures and 500 copies of Chinese Calendars were prepared by	More than 5000 wetland conservation brochures were distributed to the local publics through West, East, South and HLH NRs.	10000 copies of ENR brochures were distributed to the local people.  PMO and the other NRs are preparing the brochures.	60 %	

aquaculture, eco-tourism,			East DTNR	All the billboard signs,	All billboards have been		
ecosystem and rights based			for wetland	the boundary makers and	set up in NRs.		
management of fisheries,			conservation	display were completed	set up in reres.		I
and bird-friendly			communicati	in East, West, and South			
cultivation plan; and d) NR			on uses. 20	DT NRs.			
demarcation			billboard	DI W.S.			
demarcation			signs				
			preparation				
			are under				
			bidding				
			processes for				
			better				
			communicati				
			on company.				
Output 4.1.2: Infrastructure	Infrastructure and	Q3 Y3	Both display	The online bird	The display of Visiting	60	
and display of visitors and	display of visitors		and facilities	monitoring system is	Center of WDT NR has	%	
other education centres	and other		in Visiting	open to public, all	been completed with an		
improved including: a)	education centres		Centre of	together 35 sites with	investment of more than 6		
construction of three	improved		East DTNR	control area of 90 square	million yuan.		
visitors and education			were updated	km core areas are	Visiting Center of WDT		
centers of West, South and			and	reachable through	was officially opened in		
HLH DL NRs; b)			renowned	internet connection	April 2019.		
improvement of displays in					April 2019.		
four centers; and c)							
upgrading of displays in			Group of	An education centre of			
Qingshan polder organic			new display	wetland was built in the			
aquaculture success story			boards were	main commercial street			
exhibition hall (West DL			built in	of the town where the			
NR)			nearby	WDT NR Bureau			
			communities	located with area of			
			in West	2478 square meters.			
			DTNR				
						1	,

Output 4.1.3: Special	Special campaign	Q4 Y4	Regular	The launching ceremony	The 2018 Bird Watching	60	1
campaign and events	and events		events, such	of "2018 Hunan bird	Festival and the	%	
organized and conducted	organized and		as Wetland	flying" was held in	International Symposium		
including: a) 20 summer	conducted		Day, Bird	March 11, 2018 at the	on Dongting Lake were		
holiday university			week, and	EDT National NR.	held simultaneously in		
volunteers camps in each			Bird		EDT NR, Yueyang City		
of the four NRs; and b) 40-			Watching		with a huge social impact.		
60 campaigns on special			Festival were	2017-2018 years	The original bird-		
days such as annual			organized in	wintering bird	watching competition in		
Wetlands day, annual Bird			the four NR	synchronized monitoring	EDT NR has become a		
week, bi-annual Bird				had been widely	bird-watching festival of		
watching race				reported through the	Hunan Province and		
				media.	Yueyang City. More than		
				media.	800 people participated in		
					the Bird Watching		
				D .: I 1 D: 1	Festival. The GEF team		
				Dongting Lake Bird-	also participated in the		
				Watching Festival with	Bird Watching		
				the theme of "Shared	Competition.		
				Clear Water and Blue			
				Sky" opened on 8 December 2017 in the	Following General		
					Secretary Xi Jinping's		
				"China Birdwatching	visit to the EDT NR, the		
				Capital" in Junshan	external influence of the		
				District, Yueyang City.	NR was expanding day		
					by day, in the second half		
					of 2018, more than 100		
				The WDT NR organized	delegations from central,		
				series of publicity	provincial and local		
				activities on the day of	governments have visited		
				"Wetland Day", "bird	Dongting Lake Reserve,		
				loving week" and	with more than 5000		
				"environmental day" in	receptionists.		
				2018, there are more			
				than 6000 people from			
				NR and Local			

				communities participated the evens.	On May 22, a chart exhibition was hold by PMO on the International Biodiversity Day.  the Chief of FDHP, Mr. Hu Changqing published a signed article entitled "Hunan: Strengthening Biodiversity Conservation to Make People's Life Healthier and Better" in Hunan Daily.  The 4 NRs carried out a series of activities at key time nodes such as the Earth Day, the International Environment Day, World		
Output 4.1.4: Curricula on DWE biodiversity conservation and sustainable use included in 20 middle schools in counties and townships around the lake reaching 30,000 students.	Curricula on DWE biodiversity conservation and sustainable use included in 20 middle schools in counties and townships around the lake reaching 30,000 students	Q4 Y4	No Progress yet	N/A	Wetlands Day, and Bird Loving Week.  EDT and WDT held a symposium on the preparation of middle school textbooks.  EDT signed an agreement on textbook promotion. The first draft was completed.	10 %	

Output 5.1.1: Project monitoring system providing six-monthly reports on progress in achieving project outputs and outcomes	six-monthly progress reports delivered on time	Q4 Y5	One six- month progress report is finished	Three Six-month reports were developed.	5 six-month reports were developed.	40 %	
Output 5.1.2: Midterm and final evaluation reports	Carried out on time	Q2 Y3	N/A	N/A	Midterm evaluation was completed	50 %	
Output 5.1.3: Project "best- practices" and "lessons- learned" in relation to co- management models, integrated DWE management experience, mainstreaming of wetlands biodiversity conservation in sectors disseminated via publications, project website and others.	Publication on "best practices" and lessons learned	Q4 Y4	N/A	N/A		0 %	

## Information on Progress, Outcomes and Challenges on project implementation.

Please briefly summarize main progress achieving the outcomes (cumulative) and outputs (during this fiscal year):

Max 200 words:

#### **Cumulative outcomes:**

- Multi sectoral and multi-level governmental Dongting Wetland Protection Joint Action Plan has been implemented
- Hunan provincial Dongting Lake protection system developed, A common Vision of Dongting Lake conservation was agreed.
- Major biodiversity threats have been effectively removed in Dongting Lake.
- Dongting Lake biodiversity data has been updated, and the integrated information system has been initiated.
- Management efficiency has been improved.
- Flagship species conservation has achieved remarkable results.

#### **During this fiscal year:**

- Dongting Wetland management and conservation system has been further developed.
- Dongting Lake integrated information management system was put into test runs.
- Co-management framework were further developed and three of four models were implemented.
- Regulations for Dongting Wetland conservation have been promulgated by provincial sectors.

What are the major challenges the project has experienced during this reporting period?

Max	200 words:
•	National Environmental Inspection on Dongting wetland since 2016 leads to a policy change for more stringent ecological environment protection. The result is many economic activities in Dongting Lake were restricted or banned, which has made the livelihood targets more difficult to achieve.
•	Difficulty in choosing proper livelihood options for local development, which match with the local wetland resources and inline with local environmental protection regulations.
•	Lack of good financial mechanisms to support effective co-management activities.
•	Significant personal changes in PMO and CTA may have impact on the management of project implementation in short term.

#### **Development Objective Ratings, Implementation Progress Ratings and Overall Assessment**

	FY2019  Development  Objective rating <sup>11</sup>	FY2019 Implementation Progress rating <sup>12</sup>	Comments/reasons justifying the ratings for FY2019 and any changes (positive or negative) in the ratings since the previous reporting period
Project Manager / Coordinator	MS	MS	The project is on the right track and made good progress to large extent. The project is rated as satisfactory in general by MTE in March 2019. The activities designed by the Project should be adjusted and implemented tailored to evolving external context to reflect adaptive management. However, the turnover of PMO staff is high, within 2 years, project managers have been changed three times; the CTA resigned in March 2019 and the new project manager has to act as CTA too; while the project coordinator also left recently, which is a big challenge for the project management and increased the risk.
Budget Holder	MS	MS	The project has received positive rating as satisfactory in general by MTE in Mach 2019. However, the project delivery should be accelerated, esp. in the area of capacity building, co-management and sustainable livelihood development. Besides, the high turnover of PMO staff is disturbing, which poses a serious risk to the future project implementation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> **Development/Global Environment Objectives Rating** – Assess how well the project is meeting its development objective/s or the global environment objective/s it set out to meet. Ratings can be Highly Satisfactory (HS), Satisfactory (S), Moderately Satisfactory (MS), Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU), Unsatisfactory (U) or Highly Unsatisfactory (HU). For more information on ratings, definitions please refer to Annex 1.

<sup>12</sup> **Implementation Progress Rating** – Assess the progress of project implementation. For more information on ratings definitions please refer to Annex 1.

Lead Technical Officer <sup>13</sup>	S	S	Although the activities funded by the project grant budget are not fully implemented according to the project workplan, most targeted project results have been delivered through the activities funded by the government cofinancing. So, the accumulated project progress towards Meeting Objectives is rated as satisfactory in general. The implementation and delivery of the project is imbalanced, implementation of project activities related to capacity building, co-management, alternative livelihood development, development and use of school textbook on Dongting Lake Ecosystem and biodiversity need to be speeded up. The PMO should focus more on monitoring and evaluation of project implementation and delivery by all the implementation partners and individual consultants while carefully plan and implement project activities against the ultimate project targets in the remaining project period.
GEF Funding Liaison Officer	MS	MS	The project has made positive progress despite continuing challenges from staff turn-over. We should work with the provincial government to agree on measurements to ensure stable PMO for seamless implementation of project activities.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> The LTO will consult the HQ technical officer and all other supporting technical Units.

### 3. Risks

**Environmental and Social Safeguards** (Under the responsibility of the LTO)

Overall Project Risk classification (at project submission)	Please indicate if the Environmental and Social Risk classification is still valid <sup>14</sup> .  If not, what is the new classification and explain.

Please make sure that the below risk table include also Environmental and Social Management Risks captured by the Environmental and social Management Risk Mitigations plans.

#### **Risk ratings**

#### **RISK TABLE**

The following table summarizes risks identified in the **Project Document** and reflects also **any new risks** identified in the course of project implementation. The <u>Notes</u> column should be used to provide additional details concerning manifestation of the risk in your specific project, **as relevant**.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> **Important:** please note that if the Environmental and Social Risk classification is changing, the ESM Unit should be contacted and an updated Social and Environmental Management Plan addressing new risks should be prepared.

	Risk	Risk rating <sup>15</sup>	Mitigation Action	Progress on mitigation actions <sup>16</sup>	Notes from the Project Task Force
1	limited power for coordinating and mobilizing the technical contribution from other governmental departments of Hunan Province	L	Making full use of Provincial Multi Sectoral Government Meeting (PMSGM) Mechanism to develop practical Policies.		Resulted from the recent national environmental policies and driving force on ecological restoration in the Central and Lower Yangtze from top government, the health statues of Dongting Wetland ecosystem became the top priorities in Hunan, and the FDHP turn into the leading Provincial department in wetland conservation.
2	lack of common understanding and coordination between production sectors and administration level to adopt biodiversity friendly practices in the utilization of DWE resources.	M	Developing more practical solutions for the production sectors within the scope of legal permit.		Ditto

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> GEF Risk ratings: Low, Medium, Substantial or High

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> If a risk mitigation plan had been presented as part of the Environmental and Social management Plan or in previous PIR please report here on progress or results of its implementation. For moderate and high risk projects, please Include a description of the ESMP monitoring activities undertaken in the relevant period".

	Risk	Risk rating <sup>15</sup>	Mitigation Action	Progress on mitigation actions <sup>16</sup>	Notes from the Project Task Force
3	The amendment of the WPRHP will be blocked by some sectors with conflicting economic interest	L	Promoting more participation of Provincial department, and collecting more suggestions from local Gov. and NRs.		Ditto
4	Some institutions important for the implementation of the IIMS may be reluctant to engaging in information sharing which could be a sensitive issue		1. Selecting Hunan Provincial People's Government Development Research Center as the Leading unit of the IIMS for better coordination;  2. Initiate the IIMS from involvement of local, regional and Neutral Academic institution monitoring network;  3. Helping to define the data systems of possible to publics.		This risk still exits since the sensitive data from related department will always the difficulties in defining the data publication.
5	Funds Flow	L	A more effective procedures for project fund approval need to be developed.		A more effective procedures for project fund approval need to be developed.
6	Reporting and Monitoring	L	A full-time project manager was in place this reporting year.		With the capacity building improved in the reporting year, the risk was lowered.
7	Project Information Systems	L	A full-time project manager was in place this reporting year.		Ditto

	Risk	Risk rating <sup>15</sup>	Mitigation Action	Progress on mitigation actions <sup>16</sup>	Notes from the Project Task Force
8	PMO capacity	M	PMO should reduce the turnover of staff and more capacity building should be provided for new staff		the turnover of PMO stuff is high, with 2 years, project managers have been changed three times; the CTA resigned in March 2019 and the new project manager has to act as CTA too; while the project coordinator also left recently

**Project overall risk rating** (Low, Medium, Substantial or High):

FY2018 rating	FY2019 rating	Comments/reason for the rating for FY2019 and any changes (positive or negative) in the rating since the previous reporting period
L	L	

## 4. Adjustments to Project Strategy

Please report any adjustments made to the project strategy, as reflected in the results matrix, in the past 12 months<sup>17</sup>

Change Made to	Yes/No	Describe the Change and Reason for Change
	yes	Outcome 1.1:
		Original:
Project Outcomes		DLCC is fulfilling its function coordinating the implementation of the DWEMP and at least two key biodiversity threats addressed (sand mining threatening porpoises, poplar plantations, and/or unsustainable fisheries) by the end of project.
		Changed:
		Hunan Provincial Joint Sector Conference on Wetland Protection and Restoration is fulfilling its function coordinating the implementation of the DWEMP and at least two key biodiversity threats addressed (sand mining threatening porpoises, poplar plantations, and/or unsustainable fisheries) by the end of project.
	yes	Output 1.1.1:
		Original:
Project Outputs		DLCC strengthened by the end of the project with: i) a functioning secretariat in FDHP (two half-time staffs, office equipment and operations budget); ii) agreed operations procedures; iii) agreed five years' work plan; and iii) at least one meeting per year held.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Minor adjustments to project outputs can be made during project inception. Significant adjustments can be made only after a mid-term review/evaluation or supervision missions. The changes need to be discussed with the FAO-GEF Coordination Unit, then approved by the whole Project Task Force and endorsed by the Project Steering Committee.

Changed:

Hunan Provincial Joint Sector Conference on Wetland Protection and Restoration strengthened by the end of the project with: i) a functioning secretariat in FDHP (two halftime staffs, office equipment and operations budget); ii) agreed operations procedures; iii) agreed five years' work plan; and iii) at least one meeting per year held.

Output 2.1.2:

Original:

WDT NR and SDT NR are upgrated from provincial NRs to National NRs and HLH NR to Ramsar site by the end of PY3 (facilitating increased national government budget allocation).

Changed:1) Upgrade WDT NR from provincial level to national level at the end of the 3rd year of project implementation; 2) Finalize a feasibility study on establishment of Dongting Lake National Park at the end of the 3rd year of project implementation, and facilitate the Forestry Bureau of Hunan Province to submit the study report to the provincial government and State Forestry and Grassland Administration (National Park Administration); 3) Finalize application forms for Ramsar sites for HLHhu NR and facilitate the Forestry Bureau of Hunan Province to submit the application form to State Forestry and Grassland Administration.

#### **Adjustments to Project Time Frame**

If the duration of the project, the project work schedule, or the timing of any key events such as project start up, evaluations or closing date, have been adjusted since project approval, please explain the changes and the reasons for these changes. The Budget Holder may decide, in consultation with the PTF, to request the adjustment of the EOD-NTE in FPMIS to the actual start of operations providing a sound justification.

Change	Describe the Change and Reason for Change

	Original NTE:	Revised NTE: May 12, 2021
Project extension		
	Justification:	

## 5. Gender Mainstreaming

Information on Progress on gender-responsive measures as documented at CEO Endorsement/Approval in the gender action plan or equivalent (when applicable)?

Within the project framework, many of the household and community-based livelihood development project were designed especially for woman's participation, e.g. the organic farming in the village and household ecotourism activities are largely carried by women at present time.

The project requires all the training and workshop, and outside visit learning activity should have least 20-30 percent of woman participation during the implementation.

2 of 3 personnel of PMO are women, and a female expert was recruited to the TWG.

# **6. Indigenous Peoples Involvement**

N/A
7. Stakeholders Engagement
Please report on progress, challenges and outcomes on stakeholder engagement (based on the description of the Stakeholder engagement plan included at CEO Endorsement/Approval (when
applicable)
applicable)  CAS institutes of Subtropical Agriculture participated and technically supported the 2017-2018 years wintering bird synchronized monitoring on Nov. 2017 to March 2018.
CAS institutes of Subtropical Agriculture participated and technically supported the 2017-2018 years wintering
CAS institutes of Subtropical Agriculture participated and technically supported the 2017-2018 years wintering bird synchronized monitoring on Nov. 2017 to March 2018.  CAS Institute of Hydrobiology provided technical support on Finless Porpoise investigation in the late year of
CAS institutes of Subtropical Agriculture participated and technically supported the 2017-2018 years wintering bird synchronized monitoring on Nov. 2017 to March 2018.  CAS Institute of Hydrobiology provided technical support on Finless Porpoise investigation in the late year of 2017.  Central South University of Forestry and Technology (CSUFT) supported the Milu investigation in Dongting
CAS institutes of Subtropical Agriculture participated and technically supported the 2017-2018 years wintering bird synchronized monitoring on Nov. 2017 to March 2018.  CAS Institute of Hydrobiology provided technical support on Finless Porpoise investigation in the late year of 2017.  Central South University of Forestry and Technology (CSUFT) supported the Milu investigation in Dongting areas.  Xiangyin County Government worked together with Hengling NR on the preparatory work for fishermen
CAS institutes of Subtropical Agriculture participated and technically supported the 2017-2018 years wintering bird synchronized monitoring on Nov. 2017 to March 2018.  CAS Institute of Hydrobiology provided technical support on Finless Porpoise investigation in the late year of 2017.  Central South University of Forestry and Technology (CSUFT) supported the Milu investigation in Dongting areas.  Xiangyin County Government worked together with Hengling NR on the preparatory work for fishermen relocation which was one of the fish resources protection project of Provincial Government.  Two Eco tourist company in West Dongting signed agreements with West Dongting NR in Nov. 2017 for a

## 8. Knowledge Management Activities

Knowledge activities / products (when applicable), as outlined in knowledge management approved at CEO Endorsement / Approval

- News from Chinese Internet portal *sina.com* entitled "The opening ceremony of the 10th Dongting Lake Bird Watching Festival was held" (In Chinese) http://k.sina.com.cn/article\_2721558170\_a237ae9a02000mbc2.html
- Video from Chinese Internet portal *sohu*. *com* entitled "Report from Hunan Satellite TV: The 10th Dongting Lake Bird Watching Festival opens: 21 teams compete for bird watching competition" (in Chinese) http://www.sohu.com/a/280181011\_100159986
- Video from Chinese Internet portal CCTV.com titled "Report from Hunan Satellite TV: The 10th Dongting Lake Bird Watching Festival closed today" <a href="http://news.cctv.com/2018/12/07/VIDEgEeTyZHQ6kiVfs7GGEmL181207.shtml">http://news.cctv.com/2018/12/07/VIDEgEeTyZHQ6kiVfs7GGEmL181207.shtml</a>
- 4. News from Chinese Internet portal *people.cn* titled "The 10th Dongting Lake Bird Watching Festival closed today in Yueyang City" (in Chinese)
  - http://hn.people.com.cn/n2/2018/1208/c195194-32384400.html
- 5. News from Chinese Internet portal *hunan.ifeng.com* titled "The 10th China Dongting Lake International Bird Watching Festival was held on December 5<sup>th</sup>" (in Chinese)
  - http://hunan.ifeng.com/a/20181203/7072556\_0.shtml

## 9. Co-Financing Table

Sources of Co- financing <sup>18</sup>	Name of Co- financer	Type of Co- financing	Amount Confirmed at CEO endorsement / approval	Actual Amount Materialized at 30 June 2019-	Actual Amount Materialized at Midterm or closure (confirmed by the review/evaluation team)	Expected total disbursement by the end of the project
Provincial Fund	FDHP, NR Management Bureaus, and local governments	Cash	2,900,000	383,333	N/A	2,900,000
National Fund	National Wetland Conservation Programme through FDHP	Cash	1,500,000	23,118,333	N/A	24,000,000
National Fund	Wetland Conservation Subsidy	Cash	1,000,000	516,667	N/A	1,000,000

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Sources of Co-financing may include: Bilateral Aid Agency(ies), Foundation, GEF Agency, Local Government, National Government, Civil Society Organization, Other Multi-lateral Agency(ies), Private Sector, Beneficiaries, Other.

	Programme through FDHP					
National Fund	National NR Development Programme though FDHP	Cash	2,000,000	N/A	N/A	2,000,000
		TOTAL	7,400,000	24,018,333		29,900,000

# Please explain any significant changes in project co-financing since Project Document signature, or differences between the anticipated and actual rates of disbursement

The Chinese government considers wetland protection a national priority, and is making progress on the ambitious goal of protecting more than 90% of its natural wetlands by 2030. As the second largest freshwater lake in China, Dongting Lake Protected Areas are receiving a growing budget on the investment on projects involving Wetland Conservation and Restoration. Among actual amount of USD 23.1 million dollars of co-financing funds materialized at 30 June 2019, about 49.41% came from Wetland Conservation and Restoration Program, with the amount of USD 11.42 million dollars allocated to the West Dongting Lake Nature Reserve. About 28.31% came from Three Gorges Follow-up Construction and Improvement Project for nature reserves involving East, South Dongting Lake, and Hengling Lake, with a total amount of USD 6.55 million. About 18.02% came from Ecological Compensation Program, with the amount of USD 4.17 million dollars allocated to the West and South Dongting Lake Nature Reserve. The rest 4.2% came from Returning Farmland to Wetlands Program and Capacity Building Program, with the amount of USD 0.98 million dollars allocated to the East and West Dongting Lake Nature Reserve.

## **Annex 1. – GEF Performance Ratings Definitions**

Development/Global Environment Objectives Rating — Assess how well the project is meeting its development objective/s or the global environment objective/s it set out to meet. DO Ratings definitions: Highly Satisfactory (HS - Project is expected to achieve or exceed all its major global environmental objectives, and yield substantial global environmental benefits, without major shortcomings. The project can be presented as "good practice"); Satisfactory (S - Project is expected to achieve most of its major global environmental objectives, and yield satisfactory global environmental benefits, with only minor shortcomings); Moderately Satisfactory (MS - Project is expected to achieve most of its major relevant objectives but with either significant shortcomings or modest overall relevance. Project is expected not to achieve some of its major global environmental objectives or yield some of the expected global environment benefits); Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU - Project is expected to achieve of its major global environmental objectives with major shortcomings or is expected to achieve only some of its major global environmental objectives); Unsatisfactory (U - Project is expected not to achieve most of its major global environment objectives or to yield any satisfactory global environmental benefits); Highly Unsatisfactory (HU - The project has failed to achieve, and is not expected to achieve, any of its major global environment objectives with no worthwhile benefits.)

Implementation Progress Rating — Assess the progress of project implementation. IP Ratings definitions: Highly Satisfactory (HS):
Implementation of all components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised implementation plan for the project. The project can be resented as "good practice". Satisfactory (S): Implementation of most components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan except for only a few that are subject to remedial action. Moderately Satisfactory (MS): Implementation of some components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with some components requiring remedial action. Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU): Implementation of some components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with most components requiring remedial action. Unsatisfactory (U): Implementation of most components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan. Highly Unsatisfactory (HU): Implementation of none of the components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan.