

Management response to the Evaluation of the project  
“Piloting Provincial-level Wetland PA System in Jiangxi Province”

GCP/CPR/052/GFF

GEF ID: 4662

*Overall response to the evaluation*

*Response by recommendation*

In this section, Management should address each recommendation, discussing them in the order presented in the executive summary of the evaluation report. This should be done in the format of the Management Response matrix below (see Box 1) and include:

- a. The recommendation number and text copied from the evaluation report;
- b. Indication of whether the recommendation is accepted fully, partially, or rejected;
- c. Description of the actions to be taken, with comments as required on the conditions to be met during implementation, or on reasons leading to a partial acceptance or rejection of a recommendation;
- d. The responsible party or FAO unit for implementing the action/s;
- e. The time-frame for implementation and/or an implementation schedule, if required;
- f. Indication if further funding from FAO or a resource partner is required for implementing the recommendation.

**Box 1. Management response matrix<sup>1</sup>**

Evaluation Recommendation (a)	Management response (b)	Management plan			
	Accepted, partially accepted or rejected	Actions to be taken, and/or comments about partial acceptance or rejection (c)	Responsible unit (d)	Timeframe (e)	Further funding required (Y or N) (f)
<b>Insert title of section, if any</b>					
<b>Recommendation 1</b>					
1. it is highly recommended to establish regular dialogue and participatory decision-making that enhances intra and inter-institutional coordination and cooperation on planning and monitoring. It is, therefore, proposed the following Provincial Departments that are closely associated with/have a major impact on the PWEPA, assign a focal point/delegated representative with decision-making powers to participate in the PSC. To convoke meetings with these representatives, the MTR recommends the vice governor of Jiangxi Province nominates a suitable person to chair the PSC	<b>partially accepted</b>	This is a good recommendation. The leaders of the JxFoD pay high attention to this issue. The 3 <sup>rd</sup> PSC meeting held on 9 December 2020 has agreed to include following 7 Provincial Departments as new PSC members: a) Department of Natural Resources; b) the Department of Water Resources; c) the Department of Ecology and Environment; d) the Department of Agriculture and Rural Affairs; e) the Department of Culture and Tourism; f) Jiangxi Development and Reform Commission; g) Jiangxi Administration of Market Supervision.	PMO	April of 2021	No
2. In addition, in order the staff of the PMO have access to these line agencies, it is recommended the PSC assesses	<b>partially accepted</b>	Though the leaders of the JxFoD attach great importance to this project, the move of PMO to the department level of the JxFoD still faces great challenges and difficulties. The project has been			No

<sup>1</sup> Each column is cross-referenced to the bullet letters above.

<p>whether it is necessary to relocate the PMO from the PLNNR to the Department level of JxFoD.</p>		<p>implemented more than half, the relocation of the PMO will make it very difficult to proceed the job handover, which is very unfavorable to the later implementation of the project. However, for ensuring smooth implementation of the project, the deputy director of the JxFoD who is responsible for administration of nature reserves will head as director of PMO</p>			
<p>3. Moreover, a focal point should be identified in the NFGA to maintain regular communication with the project on national wetland policy developments, coordination with strategic initiatives such as the 6+1 programme and building support for the upscaling of the project with the support of MNR.</p>	<p><b>partially accepted</b></p>	<p>We think there is no need to establish the focal point as the other projects under 6+1 programme already completed. However, PMO will proactively strengthen the communication with NFGA and provincial 6+1 project forestry departments and relevant wetland natural reserves for sharing policy development and best practices. For example, PMO will invite them to attend PSC meetings and result dissemination meeting, send newsletters, sharing information on the JWRIMS, JPWPAMS, Standards &amp; Guidelines, policy recommendations on wetland conservation, etc.</p>	<p>PMO</p>	<p>End of 2022</p>	<p>No</p>
<p>4. At the same time, focal points/delegated representatives should be established in the PLNNR, NWNRR, DPMBNR and the County Governments responsible for the three county-level NRs (Yugan, Wannian and Lushan) to enhance internal communication on the application and monitoring of results of the project, including contributions to provincial and national targets (including those relating to wetland habitats and biodiversity conservation as in the NBCSAP).</p>	<p><b>accepted</b></p>	<p>Coordination and communication with NWNRR and Duchang is working well. The communication with the County Governments responsible for the three county-level NRs (Yugan, Wannian and Lushan) will be further strengthened.</p>	<p>PMO</p>	<p>End of 2022</p>	<p>No</p>
<p><b>Recommendation2</b></p>					

<p>1. a budget reallocation should be considered to cover the employment of short-term national and (where deemed necessary) international consultants.</p>	<p><b>accepted</b></p>	<p>The budget has been reallocated to employ Monitoring &amp; Evaluation consultant and additional project management expense due to project extension.</p>	<p>PMO</p>	<p>Upon completion of budget revision</p>	
<p>2. The employment of a qualified national consultant in spatial governance mechanisms of China, especially at the provincial level (socio-economic development plans under NRDC/JRDC, national spatial plans under MNR and urban/rural plans under the department for Housing and Urban-Rural Development). It is recommended the proposed consultant works closely with the PMO, the CTA and the expert for the JPWPAMS on determining how the protection of wetland PA habitats and biodiversity can be fully integrated into the 14th Five-Year Plans for Provincial/Prefecture Economic and Social Development (coordinated with the JRDC), the Jiangxi Provincial/Prefecture/Township Spatial and Land Use Plans in the PWEPA (coordinated with the Department for Natural Resources) and Provincial/Prefecture/Township/County Urban/Rural Plans in the PWEPA (coordinated with the Department for Housing and Urban-Rural Development). To support the full integration of wetland management in the above-mentioned plans, it is recommended risk maps are identified by JxFoD in coordination with the Department for Housing and Urban-Rural Development to identify high, medium and low risk areas (to flooding, erosion/sedimentation, pollution, etc.) where the protection/restoration of wetland habitats and its biodiversity should be prioritised.</p>	<p><b>partially accepted</b></p>	<p>The issues described in this recommendation are also problems that need to be addressed mentioned in the Jiangxi Province Wetland Management Strategy. The Strategy consultant recruited by 052 project used to be the leader of the expert team to formulate the national biodiversity strategies and action plan. His background and qualification satisfied all requirements of this consultant position. When formulating the Strategy, the Strategy consultant reviewed and collected information on the ecological “red line” strategy planning of Jiangxi Province, and developed gap analysis on wetland eco-service function valuation and wetland protection. A cross-sectoral consultation workshop was held to review the Strategy document and all relevant departments provided suggestions through workshop and via mail correspondence. Now PMO are calling for related national consultants to prepare conservation recommendations for integration into the 14th Five-year Plan for provincial departments. In other words, the tasks mentioned in the recommendation have already been done by our</p>			

		national consultants, no need to recruit a new short term consultant.			
3. it is recommended a 3-D model of the PWEPA (including upland areas) is constructed under the supervision of CAS with funding determined by the PSC	<b>rejected</b>	<p>After consulting several units, the CAS has no plan or additional funding for making a 3-D model of the PWEPA, other relevant departments cannot provide corresponding co-financing, either.</p> <p>PMO also consulted Department of Natural Resources of Jiangxi Province and other related departments, they have no 3D model targeting PWEPA . After market enquiry, the cost is about 300,000USD, we have no excessive budget to cover it. What's more, we can only use old data which will be outdated soon to make such a 3-D model as there is no access to the latest survey data (not published yet).</p>			No
4. Liaise with the Department of Industry and Information Technologies on the options available to provide access to training, resources and marketing information to promote the alternative livelihoods initiative in participating local communities (prioritising women and youths)	<b>Partially accepted</b>	We already contacted with the Department of Industry and Information Technologies. They indeed provided some training to enterprises. But the training mainly focuses on energy-saving policies and energy-saving information collection. The training targets at key energy-using enterprises. At present, there is no available training, resources or market information that can promote the alternative livelihoods initiative in participating local communities But PMO will continue to consult with other departments to see if there are training			No

		courses to promote their alternative livelihoods activities			
5. The development of a communication strategy on wetland management and conservation tailored to the needs and priorities of different audiences, in particular stakeholders at the county level. It is recommended a gender strategy is integrated into the communication strategy in order vulnerable groups have full access to training, information, resources, etc. relating to alternative livelihoods' development, co-management techniques, etc.	<b>accepted</b>	PMO and FAO already finished the communication strategy in November 2020.	FAO, CTA, PMO	November of 2020	No
6. Establishment of a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU), or similar with project GCP/CPR/057/GFF to facilitate information exchange and visits between the project and the Departments for Water Resources in Jiangxi and Yunnan Provinces/Chongqing Municipality concerning the application of R/LHA to monitor e-flow and biodiversity in the PWEPA, the application of the River Chief system in Yunnan Province and Chongqing Municipality, etc.	<b>partially accepted</b>	No need to sign a MOU, FAO will organize study tours for PMO to 057 project sites for experience & good practices learning	FAO, PMO	End of 2022	No
7. Explore, the potential benefit of visiting project GCP/CPR/056/GFF to exchange information on the carbon trading schemes applied in Fujian Province, to determine if such a scheme is applicable in the PWEPA, taking into account wetlands store considerable amounts of carbon.	<b>accepted</b>	FAO will organize study tour to 056 project sites next year	FAO, PMO	End of 2021	No
8. Establish a coordination agreement, or MoU, with the provincial authorities that continue to operate the projects in Anhui and Hubei provinces under the 6+1 programme	<b>partially accepted</b>	PMO has included study tours to these project sites into the work plan. FAO will provide support and coordination for these study tours. But there	FAO, CTA, PMO	End of 2022	No

<p>that ended in 2019. It is highly recommended Jiangxi Province shares its JPWPAMS with Anhui Province (which has not established its own wetland PA strategy) and Hubei Province (which mainly focused on an Action Plan for wetland protection in the four lakes basin around Jingzhou City), in the interests of harmonising the wetland PA management strategies and information systems with those of project 052. To aid this process it is recommended the CTA, LTO and FAO-CN establish contact with the UNDP office in China to aid this process and explore the establishment of synergies as and where relevant.</p>		<p>is no need for signing agreement or MoU. Anhui and Hubei have already completed their projects we can share information with them via newsletters, study tours, inviting them to participate in the 052 consultation workshops</p>			
<p><b>Recommendation 3</b></p>					
<p>1. A no-cost extension of 18 months is recommended to 06 October 2023 to recover the current and projected delays due to the COVID-19 pandemic and record floods in June-July 2020, which is estimated to amount to 18 months.</p>	<p><b>accepted</b></p>	<p>The budget, work plan and request for project extension have been prepared and were cleared in principle in the 3rd PSC meeting.</p>	<p>PMO</p>	<p>January of 2021</p>	<p>No</p>
<p>2. Adopt the theory of change proposed in Appendix 9 to clarify the vision and mission of the project, role in the 6+1 programme and promote ecological civilisation all of which are designed to also support the NFGA/MEE report on targets under the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda, in particular relevant Aichi Targets;</p>	<p><b>partially accepted</b></p>	<p>6+1 Programme has been completed in 2019 except Jiangxi. We can add “promotion of China’s ecological civilization and contribution to achieve China’s targets under SDG 2030” as development goal into the revised Result Matrix</p>	<p>PMO</p>	<p>End of 2022</p>	<p>No</p>
<p>3. Agree to an exchange of letters (or amendment to the Prodoc if necessary) allowing for a revision of the project’s outputs, including their assignment to different components where it is agreed they are misplaced. Alternatively, an agreement should be explored and</p>	<p><b>partially accepted</b></p>	<p>We have already improved some result indicator in Result Matrix based on recommendation and Change of Theory. The original structure of the Result Matrix remains the same.</p>	<p>FAO, PMO, CTA</p>	<p>January of 2021</p>	<p>No</p>

<p>consensus reached that allows for a complete revision of the Results Matrix to be accepted in lieu of the exchange of letters mentioned above. The revision process should take into account the contents of recommendation 1 and 2 above (includes coordination between the project and Anhui and Hubei provinces) and alignment with the ToC provided in Appendix 9 of this report.</p>					
<p>4. Proposed outcome for component 1: Provincial and sector development plans are designed and implemented in compliance with spatial/land use plans, in which the conservation and sustainable use of wetland ecosystems, together with risk management, are fully integrated and coordinated with Anhui and Hubei Provinces. In addition, define what constitutes “effective” management and consider including community participation in spatial/land-use planning, risk mapping and mitigation in the definition;</p>	<p><b>partially accepted</b></p>	<p>Provincial and sector development plans will be designed and implemented in compliance with spatial/land use plans. But “the conservation and sustainable use of wetland ecosystems, together with risk management, are fully integrated and coordinated with Anhui and Hubei Provinces” are beyond the design of Prodoc and exceeded the authority of Jiangxi Province.</p> <p>PMO will incorporate “the effective definition” into Wetland Management Guidelines.</p>	<p>PMO</p>	<p>2023</p>	<p>No</p>
<p>5. Proposed outcome for component 2: Wetland PA management guides the implementation of provincial and sector development plans, based on co-management, inter-county and ecosystem approaches, that leads to the establishment of sustainable local communities in and around the wetland PA system;</p>	<p><b>accepted</b></p>	<p>PMO has formulated these outcomes into the indicator column of Result Matrix;</p>	<p>PMO</p>	<p>End of 2022</p>	<p>No</p>
<p>6. Proposed outcome for component 3: The JWRIMS – supported by an effective communication strategy - establishes itself as the IMS to be upscaled for the benefit of the middle reaches of the Yangtze River basin to support all sectors take informed and coordinated decisions on socio-economic and spatial/land-use planning (and disaster risk management) in all wetland</p>	<p><b>rejected</b></p>	<p>The recommendation goes beyond the design of Prodoc and exceeded the authority of Jiangxi Province. PMO already prepared the communication strategy to strengthen the coordination and communication with Hubei, Anhui and Hunan, they will be invited to the result share and policy consultation events of</p>			



<p>PAs systems (including buffer zones) in Jiangxi, Anhui and Hubei provinces.</p>		<p>052 project, actual upscale is under the responsibility of these provinces, not of 052 project.</p>			
<p>7. Output 1.2: reassign the specific parts of this output that relate to component 2 (establishment and operation of Wetland Field Stations and establish three operational demonstration county wetland nature reserves) and ensure the expansion of geographic coverage is quantified with baseline data, so that it can be used as an indicator for JxDoF to monitor the expansion of its management services;</p>	<p><b>accepted</b></p>	<p>The expansion of geographic coverage will be quantified with baseline data as recommended.</p>	<p>PMO</p>	<p>End of 2022</p>	
<p>8. Output 1.4: reassign relevant parts of this output (community outreach education and economic valuation) to component 3. It is recommended the main elements of the valuation are updated at the end of the Five-Year Plan, when the JWRIMS is in full operation to support efforts to incorporate wetland values into provincial accounting systems (as foreseen in the Aichi Target 2) and designed to support informed and effective cross-sector coordination on sector planning and budgeting.</p>	<p><b>rejected</b></p>	<p>GEF have strict rules and procedures in revising the Prodoc and Result Matrix. We had better keep community outreach education and economic valuation in Component 1. As we explain before, the valuation results are used in JPWPAMS and “community outreach education for implementing Jiangxi Province Wetland Protection Ordinance” contribute to strengthened legal, regulatory frameworks for wetland PAs in Jiangxi, so it makes sense to keep them in output1.4</p> <p>“the main elements of the valuation are updated at the end of the Five-Year Plan, when the JWRIMS is in full operation to support efforts to incorporate wetland values into provincial accounting systems (as foreseen in the Aichi</p>	<p>PMO</p>	<p>End of 2022</p>	

		Target 2) and designed to support informed and effective cross-sector coordination on sector planning and budgeting” is hard to achieve			
9. Meanwhile, the remaining elements of output 1.4 (review legal/regulatory framework and integration of wetland conservation recommendations in the governmental development planning process) should be modified to secure the integration of wetland conservation and its sustainable use in the socio-economic and spatial/land-use planning process (managed by the Jiangxi Development and Reform Commission and Department for Natural Resources respectively) in urban/rural plans (managed by the Department or Housing) and in the provincial sector development planning and reform process in order the legal and regulatory framework fully protects wetland PA systems from change of use (especially where ecological compensation reverts farmland to wetlands, but which could be susceptible to conversion into farmland at a later date).	accepted	The policy consultant has forwarded relevant policy recommendations to the JxFoD. However, the modification of the laws and regulations has its specific procedures and requirements. This is out of project’s ability.			
10. In addition, it is recommended to assess possible policy and legal reforms in consultation with the Environmental Investment Committee of the Provincial People’s Congress that aim at reducing dependency on direct provincial funding allocations to wetland PA systems to cross-sector cost sharing approaches, on applying international good practices concerning the wetland PA system management and funding (including opportunities to raise income through partnerships with private and non-governmental entities, provincial/local fiscal measures, voluntary contributions, application of PES and carbon trading initiatives at the provincial level, etc.	accepted	The policy consultant will forward relevant policy recommendations to the JxFoD through which the recommendations will be submitted to the Environmental Investment Committee of the Provincial People’s Congress. However, the modification of the laws and regulations has its specific procedures and requirements. We cannot assure policy and legal reforms can happen, this is out of project’s ability.			

(taking into account Nature Reserve administrations cannot generate income by law);					
11. Output 3.2: reassign to component 1. It is recommended the text is modified to include training on the integration of wetland PA management within the context of coordinated spatial/land-use planning and risk management to support and guide sector development planning in wetland ecosystems (emphasising the importance of spatial/land-use planning in the upper and middle watersheds of wetland PAs;	<b>partially accepted</b>	1. The change of the result matrix may lead to the difficulty to compare among PPRs and PIRs in terms of outputs and outcomes. we suggest keeping it in component 3.  2. PMO already included training on the integration of wetland PA management within the context of coordinated spatial/land-use planning and risk management into training plan	PMO	End of 2022	
12. Output 3.3: refocus the public awareness and outreach activities under a communication strategy that includes information on how spatial/land-use planning can support component 2 achieve effective wetland management, conserve biodiversity and, with the inclusion of risk management/risk mapping/restoration techniques, increase the resilience of local communities and their wetlands.	<b>accepted</b>	PMO will translate and develop the relevant education materials based on the available technical outputs	PMO	August of 2021	
13. Assess and modify the project budget and reassign funds where there are funding gaps, or determine alternative sources.	<b>accepted</b>	The budget has been revised and was reviewed and cleared in the 3rd PSC meeting.	FAO, PMO, CTA	January of 2021	
14. Opportunities to increase the visibility of the project and GEF's commitment to save globally important biodiversity and habitats. To support this initiative, it is highly recommended the project consults local communities and schools on the adoption of a suitable logo to promote the public's association in Jiangxi Province as well as throughout China and internationally,	<b>accepted</b>	We will use the logo specifically designed for Poyang Lake International Bird Watching Week to promote the public's association in Jiangxi Province as well as throughout China and internationally, that the PWEPA is dedicated to conserving globally important biodiversity.	PMO	December of 2021	

<p>that the PWEPA is dedicated to conserving globally important biodiversity.</p>					
<p>15.Risk management: METT and KAP should include questions that track awareness of the role of risk management in enhancing resilience of wetland PAs and the local communities that live in and around them (within the PWEPA);</p>	<p><b>partially accepted</b></p>	<p>The PMO will consult with the Capacity building consultant and the KAP survey consultant to see how to deal with this issue</p>		<p>MID-2021</p>	
<p>16.Monitoring: there is a need to improve outcome (results) monitoring. This should include baseline data and targets to support the establishment of measurable indicators that are timebound as well as numerical. Baseline data should ensure there is ongoing monitoring of the wetland habitats (in terms of land area) that are brought under management to show progress in relation to “expansion of geographic coverage of operationally effective wetland PAs” (output 1.2 in the Prodoc) relating to the PWEPA and ultimately for the rest of PAs in Jiangxi Province. In this way this data can be fully integrated into the JWRIMS and support the identification of management gaps and/or scale-up good practices that support effective land-use and sector planning, ecological restoration, communications, etc. An example of how to track this data is provided in Table 5 below. To support the project’s strategic relevance and sustainability monitoring should also include the project’s contribution to meeting the NBCSAP and, in particular, relevant Aichi Targets. In this way the above-mentioned communication strategy can also enhance outreach the importance of addressing the causes of biodiversity loss; namely the loss of wetland habitats that are fundamental to the wetland species protection plans promoted by the project,</p>	<p><b>partially accepted</b></p>	<p>The PMO will contact relevant consultants to develop a monitoring &amp; evaluation framework to track the data of wetland d under effective management.</p>		<p>MID-2021</p>	

<p>but also its contribution to reducing the effects of climate variability and change;</p>					
<p>17.PSC: An exit strategy should be produced taking into consideration all the recommendations in this report, paying particular attention to ensuring the proposed coordination mechanism above, has a suitable secretariat that has the authority to supervise spatial/land-use compliance in the field with the support of the local communities, which implies an expansion of co-management agreements including monitoring of land-use changes.</p>	<p><b>accepted</b></p>	<p>We are formulating the Existing Strategy and it will be reviewed and cleared in the 4th PSC meeting.</p>	<p>FAO, CTA, PMO</p>	<p>End of 2021</p>	