

ADB GEF PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION REPORT (PIR 2024)

(This report covers implementation period from July 1, 2023 to June 30, 2024)

ADB Official Project Title: Secondary Green Cities Development Project
ADB Project Number: 47274-003

I. GEF PROJECT SUMMARY**Project Ratings:**

Development Objective Rating (DO): Satisfactory (S)

Implementation Progress Rating (IP): Moderately Satisfactory (MS)

Risk Rating: Modest Risk (M)

Information on Progress, challenges and outcomes on project implementation activities

The GEF grant is linked to the ADB financed Secondary Green Cities Development Project (SGCDP). There were changes to the project processing in terms of the lending modality, from a result-based lending (RBL) loan to a standard investment loan. In addition to this, the administration of the Technical Assistance (TA 9417) Output 1 (National Policy Framework for Environmental Planning and Green Development) and Output 4 (Replication of Green City Action Plan (GCAPs) to Provincial /City Level) was delegated to the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MONRE). The change of lending modality and delegation of administration caused some delays in the TA implementation. ADB also provides technical support to MONRE to prepare the project document for government approval, term of reference (TOR) development, training clinic on procurement and training on gender for implementation of delegated outputs and reviewing the procurement process and procedures. ADB is administering Output 3 (Disaster Risk Financing – by Urban Climate Change Resilience Trust Fund (UCCRTF) and Output 2 (Demonstration of GCAPs in Hue, Ha Giang, and Vinh Yen).

ADB-administered Outputs 2 and 3:

ADB appointed a consulting firm (ICEM and Nippon Koei Joint Venture) to implement a large consulting contract to deliver most of the TA outputs under Output 2. The contract is originally for 24 months, from July 1, 2021 to June 30, 2023, with an extension to January 31, 2025. This Technical Assistance (TA) Output 2 seeks to increase urban resilience in Ha Giang, Hue, and Vinh Yen based on a thorough understanding of the climate threats and vulnerabilities and an intelligent use of nature-based solutions (NbS) in integrated adaptation responses. The connection between GEF approach to generate GEBs is fundamental to planning sustainable cities in Vietnam. An integrated climate-sensitive planning approach where the synergies between urban development and environmental benefits are promoted is needed in all Vietnamese cities and towns to tackle climate change impacts and enhance urban sustainability.

Output 2 consultant shared the Climate Vulnerability Assessment (CVA) methodology with MONRE PMU and the three city PMUs. Output 2 Consultant also identified and developed a portfolio, one-page summary sheets of 7 demonstration projects. Due to issues related to master planning, loan savings and availability of public land, the scope of suitable NbS demonstration projects was changed to preparation of 2 Detailed Engineering Designs (DEDs) for Hue and Vinh Yen cities and 3 conceptual designs for Ha Giang, i.e., Green Park near the Vinh Phuc High School for the Gifted in Vinh Yen, NbS Embankment at Trinh Cong Son Park near Dong Ba Market in Hue, and NbS Embankment on Lo River. The DEDs (report and drawings) for Hue and Vinh Yen and the conceptual design (report and drawings) for Ha Giang was submitted in early 2024 and under review by ADB. In addition, the Output 2 Consultant has been partnering with Hanoi University of Civil Engineering (HUCE) for NBS Training Hub and innovation learning hub development. The green upgrade of the campus aims to validate Water Sensitive Urban Design (WSUD) tools by transforming an underutilized public space due to degradation, flood and urban heat into an educational and training center.

Output 2 TA Consultant submitted the Output 2.1 *Report on Strengthening and Greening City Planning Process in Hue, Ha Giang, and Vinh Yen* in August 2022 and was approved by ADB in November 2022 for completing the comprehensive review of 11 national technical standards TCNVs (Vietnam Standards) and proposing 10 New Nature-Based Solutions (NbS) and Water Sensitive Urban Design (WSUD) TCNVs. The greening process, materials, and dissemination of technical manual with its 25 NbS adaptation solutions prepared under the TA-9417 VIE is expected to deliver the knowledge and techniques to MONRE and the 3 project cities on how to integrate biodiversity and the landscape use into the urban planning system and public realm. The Consultant also prepared the unit cost database and new cost norm for Nature-based infrastructure materials and techniques.

Output 2 TA Consultant submitted Output 2.3 *Report on Demonstrating Low -Impact and Climate -Resilient Development in Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen* in November 2023 and the revised report was submitted in February 2024 and approved by ADB in April 2024. The Report included 6 separate volumes on City -Level Technical Sessions on Climate and Hazard Assessments in Ha Giang, Hue, Vinh Yen, Policy Brief on Barriers and Enablers to NbS in Vietnam, Cost -Benefit analysis: Report on Hue Baseline Survey, GEB Assessment for GEF Reporting, and Legal Framework of EIA and SEA for Climate Proofing. The draft report for Output 2.4 *Improved Capacity in Integrated and Resilient Development Approaches* on recommendations for capacity building activities for general protection regulation and for environmental and natural disaster response is finalized and will be submitted for ADB review in mid-August 2024.

The Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) evaluated the economic performance of green infrastructure when compared to conventional approaches. The CBA analysis is looking at the costs and benefits of one civil work package in Hue, i.e. HU-CW03: *Dredging, Drainage, Pavement of Lakes in 4 Inner City Wards, and Embankment of Dong Ba River*. The Output 2 consultant

solicited the service of Environment Institute of Vietnam (EEI-Vietnam) based in Hue to survey baseline data of socio-economic conditions of 400 selected households in Hue citadel. EEI-Vietnam submitted to Output 2 Consultant the final survey results. Output 2 Consultant submitted to ADB the final baseline survey. The CBA will be carried out when the construction of HU-CW03 is completed.

Up to now, Output 2 consultant has conducted 7 field missions, including Mission 3 in September 2022 to discuss the feedback of 3 cities on the technical summary sheet for demonstration projects; Mission 4 in December 2022 to discuss the revised scope of demonstration projects; Mission 5 in March 2023 to undertake participatory mapping and survey identified hazards, data quality, environmental modelling and GIS capacity need assessment; and Mission 6 in July and August 2023 to prepare the preliminary design, undertake technical design activities for 3 project cities, to prepare design concept option, training hub at Hanoi University of Civil Engineering (HUCE) campus, stakeholder interview for NbS policy brief, support to other activities (i.e. CVA). Mission 7 in April 2024 to assess the capacity to respond to environmental pollution and disasters and consult on necessary monitoring and capacity building projects and associated costs in the three cities.

Assessment of Global Environment Benefits (GEB) of TA Output 2: the contribution framework to the Global Environment Benefits (GEB) has been updated in July 2024. Meeting on Assessment of GEF Reporting Purpose was held on July 15, 2024. The GEB report included the matrix for the GEF implementation review with the TA output 2 to GEF outcomes. The contribution of TA Output 2 has been evaluated for two GEB focus areas: Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation (CCA and CCM) and Biodiversity. The contribution of the TA project has been evaluated for two GEB focal areas – Climate Change (CCM and CCA) and biodiversity with a focus on the GEB objectives that were relevant to the TA project. GEB indicators include, for example, number of direct beneficiaries affected by TA Output, land areas converted through demonstration project, reduction in vulnerability to climate threats, reduction in urban flooding. The association between the TA Output 2 and GEF Outcomes is presented below.

Table 1: GEB-Biodiversity

GEF Focal Areas		Climate Change	Role of TA – 9417
GEF Challenge		Urban Flooding, Heat Waves, Sea Level Rise, etc.	The TA provides climate adaptation solutions against urban flooding, landslide, and heat waves in urban area
GEF Response		The GEF outcomes help to contribute to reducing	The TA contributes to tackling climate change impacts in Hue, Ha Giang, and Vin Yen.

		climate change impacts.	
GEF Outcomes (Based on the table above)	GEF Outcome 1.1 -	Integrated, resilient planning in 3 cities	The TA recommends a comprehensive Climate Rapid Vulnerability Assessment (CRVA) tool for initial suggestions on the kinds of adaptation responses which can be considered given then threats pressing down on the hot spot area and its assets. The TA Output 2 Consultant is developing an automated CRVA tool which possibly will attract greater interest from Government officials with its simple usage (for example, the users input data then results will be provided with the tool)
	GEF Outcome 2.1 -	Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments	The TA increases the sustainable use of biodiversity and the production of landscape area into land use management. In details: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The greening process, materials, and dissemination of technical manual with its 25 NbS adaptation solutions prepared under the ADB TA-9417 VIE is expected to deliver the knowledge and techniques to MONRE and the 3 project cities on how to integrate biodiversity and the landscape use into the urban planning system and public realm. The drafting of new 11 TCVNs and QCVNs contain technical specification and regulatory measures to mainstream the sustainable land use and biodiversity conservation approach through the national regulatory framework. • Following consultation with the 3 project cities, the TA Output 2 Consultant prepared the Detailed Engineering Designs (DEDs) for Hue and Vinh Yen and concept designs for Ha Giang that suit the local context and possibly be considered for implementation in the future. • A training hub on water-sensitive urban design (WSUD) and nature-based solutions (NbS) at the Hanoi University of Civil Engineering (HUCE) is a small-scale exhibition that practically demonstrates how WSUD

			works and uses interactive elements for students and professionals to test out WSUD.
	GEF Outcome 2.2	- Demonstrating an integrated package of investments that lead to transition to low impact, low carbon development in Ha Giang city	BD4: No relevance to GEF TA 9417
	GEF Outcome 2.3	- Demonstrating community-based and insurance-based resilience	BD4: No relevance to GEF TA 9417
	GEF Outcome 3.1	- Strengthened enabling institutional environment	The TA 9417 will strengthen the institutional environment supporting the development of policies. Biodiversity considerations and ecosystem service values will be integrated into regulatory frameworks through the development of finance policy, land-use planning, and decision-making.

Table 2: GEB -Climate Change

GEF Focal Areas		Climate Change	Role of TA - 9417
GEF Challenge		Urban Flooding, Heat Waves, Sea Level Rise, etc.	
GEF Response		The GEF outcomes help to contribute to reducing climate change impacts.	
GEF Outcomes (Based on	GEF Outcome 1.1	- Integrated, resilient planning in 3 cities	CCA-1: The TA 9417, implements a new Climate Vulnerability Assessment (CVA) which supports the scale up of a new upgraded method to tackle climate change impacts. This strengthen the

the table above)			<p>technical capacity of local municipalities while reducing the vulnerability of inhabitants, livelihoods, buildings, and infrastructure assets, and natural system in the three cities Hue, Ha Giang, and Vinh Yen.</p> <p>CCA-2: The TA 9417, strengthens the technical capacity for effective climate change adaptation by delivering training, capacity building, and knowledge sharing through MONRE city PMUs, and local departments.</p>
	GEF - Outcome 2.1	Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments	<p>CCM-1: The drafting of 11 TCvNs and QCVNs on the WSUD approach and riverbank restoration, and the result of the CBA will demonstrate the validity, technical, and economic performance of adopting these green solutions.</p> <p>Together with the training hub on WSUD and NbS at HUCE will promote technology transfer and expectedly will support policies and strategies at the city level to use new green solutions in the built environment.</p>
	GEF - Outcome 2.2	Demonstrating an integrated package of investments that lead to transition to low impact, low carbon development in Ha Giang city	<p>CCM1, CCA-1 and CCA-2 Ha Giang PMU is coordinating with GOV agencies to extend the grant closing date. The package is scheduled to be procured in Q2-3/2025</p>
	GEF - Outcome 2.3	Demonstrating community-based and insurance-based resilience	<p>CCM1, CCA-1 and CCA-2 No relevance to GEF TA 9417</p>
	GEF - Outcome 3.1	Strengthened enabling institutional environment	<p>CCM1: The TA 9417 strengthens the institutional environment supporting the development of policies and technology transfer among construction organizations, MOC,</p>

			building materials producers, green certification organizations.
--	--	--	--

MONRE Delegated Outputs 1 and 4:

MONRE PMU was staffed with 5 officials assigned from PCD (formerly VEA) and ISPONRE, 6 and a newly added national individual consultants to support the project implementation. The packages progress as following:

01 MONRE Procurement package

TA9417-VEA Sh-01 “Office equipment and financial management software”: Completed in August 2021. Office equipment was installed and financial management software had been used.

04 MONRE management packages under implementation

1. TA9417-VEA ICS-01 “International consultant provides technical assistance and oversees VEA’s activities related to green city, circular economy, sustainable production, low carbon, eco-labelling, environmental monitoring, knowledge management”
2. TA9417-VEA ICS-07 “National consultant provides technical assistance and oversee VEA’s activities related to environmental protection and management policy”
3. TA9417-VEA FBS-14 “External Audit”: the implementation progress has reached approximately 69% completion as of June 2024. The original contract end date was June 30, 2024, extended to December 31, 2025.
4. TA9417-VEA CQS-15 “Mid-term and Final Assessment”: the implementation progress has reached approximately 60% completion as of June 2024. On-site professional training on M&E for PMU staff was conducted according to the instructions and requirements of GEF, ADB and the Government of Vietnam. The Midterm Review Report (MTR) for MONRE administered packages was prepared in March 2024. The original contract end date was December 31, 2023, extended to December 31, 2025.

10 MONRE technical QCBS/QCS packages under implementation

1. TA9417-VEA QCBS-01 “Develop legal documents guiding the implementation of the Environmental Protection Law 2020 related to environmental protection and climate change response for developing secondary green cities in Vietnam”; 24 -month contract signed on September 21, 2023.
2. TA9417-VEA QCBS-02 “ Review and revise national technical standards on environment quality”; 24 – month contract signed on September 20, 2023.
3. TA9417-VEA QCBS-03 “Review and revise/develop policies on sustainable consumption, environmentally friendly production and climate change adaptation for developing secondary green cities in Vietnam”; 24-moth contract signed on December 28, 2023.
4. TA9417-VEA QCBS-04 “Develop the eco-label criteria, pilot and finalize the certification process for 05 products, carrying out the solutions on circular economy, sustainable/environment friendly production and consumption in the secondary cities”; 30-month contract signed on October 12, 2023.

5. TA9417-VEA QCBS-07 "Update action plan (GCAP) for Hue, Vinh Yen and Ha Giang cities and Develop air quality management plan in several project cities and pilot in at least 02 project cities". 30-month contract signed on November 25, 2022 and extended until May 25, 2025.
6. TA9417-VEA QCBS-08 "Expand the planning with consideration to environmental quality improvement and management and climate change adaptation for the selected 03 secondary cities in the North and North Central regions "; 24-month contract signed on December 29, 2023.
7. TA9417-VEA QCBS-11 "Pilot at least 01 advanced technology to recycle wastes into environment-friendly products in 01 city ". 30 -month contract signed on April 28, 2023.
8. TA9417-VEA QCBS-12 " Investigate and assess the level of soil pollution at 01 polluted area due to industrial production, landfill... in service of land use conversion plan; Choose to support piloting treatment and restoration of environmental in service of land use conversion"; 30-month contract signed on July 16, 2022.
9. TA9417-ISP QCBS-02 " Review and develop greenhouse gas monitoring methods and MRV monitoring guidelines; Proposing a low carbon list and testing GHG inventory assessment for 03 cities (Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen)"; 16-month contract signed on March 16, 2023.
10. TA9417 ISP QCBS-03 "Conduct capacity need assessment, develop and conduct training program for GHG inventory, low carbon emission, CVA, green public procurement... for secondary cities"; 16-month contract signed on February 26, 2024.

01 technical package currently seeking approval for contractor selection results, the PMU discussed with ADB on taxation matter.

1. TA9417-VEA QCBS-13 ""International consulting firm provides technical assistance to VEAs' activities related to urban environmental management and ISPONRE's activities related to GHG inventory, climate vulnerability assessment, developing training and communication program"

07 MONRE QCBS/ CQS technical packages in different stages of bidding evaluation progress

1. TA9417-VEA QCBS-05 " Enhancing management capacity and experience sharing on environment, land-use and climate resilience for MONRE officials ": Currently S2¹. S2 was submitted to ADB on June 28, 2024.
2. TA9417-VEA QCBS-06 "Support to develop the environmental monitoring program, set up mechanisms for managing, information sharing environmental Database among Ministries, line agencies and local Government related project cities, pilot the environmental Program in at least 01 project city": ADB issued NOL to S2 on April 26,2024. S2 was submitted to PCD.
3. TA9417-VEA QCBS-09 "Expand the planning with consideration to environmental quality improvement and management and climate change adaptation for the selected 03 secondary cities in the South and South Central regions ": ADB issued NOL to S3 on June 11,2024; targeting contract signing.

¹ Submission 1: Cost estimate, Shortlist Firms, Request for Proposal, and Narrative Evaluation Criteria.

4. TA9417-VEA QCBS-10 “Review, evaluate the results of implementing pilot model of saving, reuse & applying new technology in wastewater treatment for a population/urban production, business and services entities in Component 1, to replicate this model in selected cities.”: ADB issued NOL to S3 on July 16,2024; targeting contract signing.
5. TA9417-ISP CQS-01 “ Review and develop the methodology for climate vulnerability assessment and pilot in 3 cities (Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen) ”: ADB issued NOL to S1 on June 10,2024.
6. TA9417-ISP QCBS-04 “Develop the eco-label criteria, pilot and finalize the certification process for 05 products, carrying out the solutions on circular economy, sustainable/environment friendly production and consumption in the secondary cities”: ADB issued NOL to S3 on May 10,2024. Contract signing is expected in Q3/2024
7. TA9417-VEA QCBS-13: “International consultant to support VEA on urban environment and ISPONRE on GHG inventory, climate vulnerability assessment, training, and communication” . S3 was submitted to PCD. Under discussion with ADB on taxation matter.

Assessment of Global Environment Benefits (GEB) of MONRE QCBS/CQS packages:

The contribution framework of MONRE packages has been discussed at the mid-term review meeting and GEB indicators were prepared to suit each package as presented in TA mid-term MOU. The mission looked at the likelihood that the TA would achieve GEF outcome and impact from the DMF and the development objectives, i.e., GEF/DMF outcomes. Meeting was held on July 11, 2024 with MONRE PMU on TA M&E. The contributions to GEB of MONRE packages have been evaluated mainly for three GEF focus areas: Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation (CCA and CCM), Biodiversity, and Chemicals and Waste. 20 indicators (as presented in the GEF core indicators section of the midterm MOU) were discussed at the midterm review meeting and agreed with MONRE PMU that those indicators will be calculated by the end of the TA MONRE QCBS/CQS packages.

Information on Progress, challenges and outcomes on Environment and Social Safeguards

GEF funds are used to provide associated technical support and capacity development to the baseline SGCDP project. There are no additional risks or concerns associated with the GEF funds over the baseline. Hence, the management of safeguards for GEF funds is through the management of safeguards of the baseline investment projects. The technical assistance is not anticipated to generate significant adverse environmental impacts during operation. The GEF administered funds will not be involved in the parts of the project related to involuntary resettlement, and will not fund activities related to involuntary resettlement.

Information on Progress, challenges and outcomes on stakeholder engagement

A comprehensive stakeholder analysis was undertaken in a participatory manner during the preparatory phase of the SGCDP. The objectives of the stakeholder analysis were to (i) Identify the key stakeholders and their support for the project or possible vested interests that may

be opposed to the project, and their means of doing so; and (ii) Develop measures to mitigate any identified resistance to and facilitate general agreement with the project. Further, following approval of the two PIFs for Special Climate Change Fund (SCCF) and Sustainable Cities Integrated Approach Pilot (SCIAP), a GEF-specific stakeholder consultation was undertaken to refine the components and outcomes. This included visits to each of the target cities for formal meetings with city officials and technical meetings with city and provincial staff and site visits to proposed demonstration projects and update the demonstration projects. Additional high level and technical level discussions have also been held with key national government agencies (MOF, MONRE, MPI) to further develop the national perspective and city-national integration and national upscaling.

The stakeholder analysis also included the mass unions, civil society, NGOs in Viet Nam and overseas, networks, professional associations, community-based organizations, affected communes and residents, vulnerable and other sectors of the society, and private sector. An inception workshop was held on April 9, 2021 with the steering committee members, representatives of the ADB loan project PMUs in Vinh Yen, Hue, Ha Giang, the MONRE team, the ADB project team (and Country Director), as well as representatives of researchers, professional associations, and private sector to update the project progress and further implementation of delegated outputs to MONRE, and strengthening the overall coordination of the TA. The Project Steering Committee was enhanced through MONRE Vice Minister's official decision no.1150/QD-BTNMT dated 8 June 2021 on official establishment of project steering committee (PSC) and the recently issued Decision no. 1411/QD-BTNMT dated 24 May 2024 on the Project Steering Committee consolidation.

Information on Progress on gender-responsive measures

The Secondary Green Cities Development Project (SGCDP) is classified as "Effective Gender Mainstreaming (EGM)". During the preparation of the SGCDP, a gender assessment was undertaken for each city, and a rapid assessment was undertaken for each priority sub-project. A gender action plan (GAP) was prepared to (i) ensure women participate in and benefit from the activities and (ii) monitor gender-specific aspects and benefits realization during the implementation phase.

MONRE PMU is recommended to inform the GAP target of at least 33% women participate in training courses to the service consultant (TA9417-ISP QCBS-03 package) and project provinces and monitor consultant performance to ensure this target is achieved by the end of project.

For three project participating provinces (Ha Giang, Vinh Phuc and Hue): 286 staff including 54 women in TT Hue and Vinh Phuc participated in the trainings on improving green design, integrating climate change prevention and environmental protection to develop grade II urban areas, enhancing green design (nature-based design), provincial and green city planning, etc. under TA9417. In which: Vinh Yen: 32 women among 95 participants (33.7%); Thua Thien Hue: 22 women among 191 participants (11.5%). The staff in Ha Giang province participated in the trainings under TA8671 (4 women among 19 staff [21%]).

Knowledge activities/ Products

Many lessons are being learned, both regarding engineering issues and policy issues. Hence, the lessons learned from the process will be disseminated, including by feeding into: (i) the preparation of new and/or updated green cities action plans (Output 1 and 4); (ii) the design of a new national policy framework and monitoring framework for sustainable cities (Output 1); and (iii) the design of a green financing mechanism for sustainable cities (Output 3). Information sharing on the process and the results will also be facilitated through the Viet Nam Sustainable Cities Cluster and Network.

As an SCIAP child project, the TA is supported by the Global Platform for Sustainable Cities (GPSC). GPSC supports knowledge capture and knowledge exchange, both amongst the SCIAP participating cities, and with external initiatives and cities. The proposed Project will be actively involved with the overall SCIAP, sharing knowledge on a regular basis through GPSC, and constantly learning from GPSC through its involvement in GPSC networks and learning events.

The Project also takes place within the broader ADB Green Cities Initiative. Through this network, the Project will share lessons and knowledge with cities across Asia. The ADB knowledge management resources support the urban development specialists and community practice members to collect data, learn lessons, and prepare documentation and publications. ADB has strong technical units responsible for collecting data, learning lessons and sharing knowledge notably through web events, conferences and publications. This includes close coordination with the Asia-Pacific Adaptation Network and Forum. For example, the study tour to Singapore further promoted the nature-based approach, which is incorporated in the green design, water sensitive features of the investments in the loan project as well as in the TA implementation in the development of scope of work and procurement for the demonstrated sustainable and resilient development in Hue, Ha Giang, and Vinh Yen (TA Output 2). ADB has also issued a knowledge product on water sensitive urban design, and published articles relating to the project (Development Asia, Viet Nam Investment Review). A knowledge management consultant has been appointed to help prepare knowledge products (video material) and started filming in Hue and Vinh Yen at the end of May 2022.

Under Output 1, knowledge management and sharing aim to assemble and share knowledge generated by this project as a whole, in which, knowledge products such as technical manuals, user manuals, toolkits, pilot studies to be developed to support the national framework of environmental analysis, planning and management tools and policies for cities in Viet Nam. The project knowledge products will be shared through the media, knowledge products, networks, seminars involving central agencies, provincial and city officials. This also supports international sharing of the project outputs with the GEF Sustainable Cities Program, ADB and other development partners, and other international stakeholders working on similar guidelines and toolkits. The MONRE PMU Leaders participated in several international

conferences to share technical knowledge and country experiences on climate change and global environmental issues, such as:

- At the COP28 Conference in Dubai in December 2023, the MONRE PMU Leader accompanied the Viet Nam delegation led by Prime Minister and Leaders of Ministries. At the technical level meeting, several contents were discussed including outcomes of the first global stock take (GST) and steps forward in operationalizing the Loss and Damage Fund, greenhouse gas emissions, evaluation and monitoring of climate change adaptation measures, sharing international experiences in implementing National Adaptation Plans, analyzing the impact of the EU Carbon Border Adjustment Mechanism on Vietnam's energy transition and its regional implications, etc.
- Through participating into a series of conferences for the Basel, Rotterdam, and Stockholm Conventions in Switzerland in May 2023, the MONRE PMU Leader established collaborative initiatives with priority partners to advance the implementation of the Stockholm and Basel Conventions in Vietnam. Several project-related contents were discussed such as Technical guidelines on Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs) wastes and other relevant matters, legal clarity on compliance and governance issues, and strategic topics such as improving the PIC procedure and guidelines for environmentally sound management.
- At the 18th Meeting of the POPs Review Committee of the Stockholm Convention in Italy in September 2022, the MONRE PMU Leaders had the chance to share insights and discourse concerning standards and technical regulations associated with POPs and PTS within articles/products; exchanged thoughts on national regulations for limiting POP substances in materials, products, and equipment.
- A series of conferences for the Basel, Rotterdam, and Stockholm Conventions in Switzerland in June 2022 brought to the MONRE PMU Leader international legal insights, enhanced pollution management strategies, and cross-border management principles on global environmental issues, especially POPs and PTS relevant matters.

Output 2 consultant presented CVA methodology to MONRE PMU, review and development of new technical standards (TCVNs) to 3 TA project cities with female participation. The TA will draw on MONRE's experience as Executing Agency to ensure lessons are captured and knowledge is shared. Notably, active involvement is planned for the Viet Nam Environment Agency (VEA) later on is Pollution Control Department (PCD) and ISPONRE. MONRE will ensure that knowledge is shared through the appropriate Vietnamese channels and this has been reflected in development of MONRE procurement plan.

The POP MONRE meetings will disseminate information on the international regulatory framework, updates on Best Available Techniques (BAT)/Best Environment Practices (BEP) show to deal with POPs and hazardous chemicals, content and process requirements procedures for the management of POPs and hazardous chemicals across borders and will facilitate international cooperation and coordination mechanisms to improve the effectiveness of the Conventions.

Three MONRE packages have been dedicated to knowledge sharing using different tools: ISP-QCBS-03: Conduct *Capacity Need Assessment, develop and conduct training program for GHG Inventory, low-carbon emission, climate risk vulnerability assessment, green public procurement...for secondary cities*; ISP-QCBS-04: *Develop and implement Communications Activities for GHG Inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, ecology assessment, circular economy, green public procurement... for targeted groups, incl. authorities, policy makers, enterprises, community*; and VEA-QCBS05: *MONRE Management Capacity and Experience Sharing*.

Grievances

Grant for Energy Efficiency for Street Lighting System in Ha Giang: Package HG -CW-08. ADB issued a no objection letter to the Ha Giang PMU on the recommendation of the proposed bidder and contract award on September 21, 2022. The PMU has issued an invitation to the first ranked contractor to attend contract negotiations. However, due to the receipt of a complaint regarding the evaluation process, the PMU was advised by the ADB team to investigate and report back. During mid-June 2023, Ha Giang PMU submitted the revised BER with recommendation to cancel the bid. On 12 July 2023, ADB issued no objection to the Ha Giang PMU’s request to cancel the current bidding process of the package following the determination that there are no qualified bids. On 31 July 2023, one bidder submitted request for a debriefing meeting to Ha Giang PMU (ADB project team was copied) on the bidding results. A response letter dated 3 August 2023 from Ha Giang PMU was issued to the requesting bidder providing an explanation why such bid was not selected. Ha Giang PMU is recommended to prepare to re-bid the package and submit the updated Bidding Document to ADB for review and approval.

The case was closed on 30 January 2024 and Ha Giang PMU is now coordinating with central government agencies to extend the grant closing date from 30 June 2024 to 30 June 2028. The re-bidding of this package is expected to be resumed in Q2-3 2025.

GEO LOCATION INFORMATION

Location Name	Latitude (WGS84 Format)	Longitude (WGS84 Format)	GEO Name ID	Location Description	Activity Description
Hue Imperial City, Thua Thien Hue, Viet Nam	N 16° 28' 31"	E 107° 34' 17"	N/A	Disaster Risk Financing (funded by UCCRTF)	Purchase pilot disaster risk insurance (funded by UCCRTF)
Ha Giang City, Ha Giang, Viet Nam	N 22° 49' 9"	E 104° 57' 24"	N/A	Energy Efficiency for Street	Provision of an estimated of the of 1,500 LED

				Lighting System	bulbs for Ha Giang city
Vinh Yen City, Vinh Phuc, Viet Nam	N 21° 18' 19"	E 105° 35' 40"	N/A	Industrial city in the Red River Delta	Dam Vac Lake in the city center

Project map and coordinates

PROJECT MINOR CHANGE IN SCOPE/MINOR AMMENDMENTS

- Results framework
- Components and cost
- Institutional and implementation arrangements
- Financial management
- Implementation schedule
- Executing Entity
- Executing Entity Category
- Minor project objective change
- Safeguards
- Risk analysis
- Increase of GEF project financing up to 5%
- Co-financing
- Location of project activity
- Other

(i) Implementation Schedule

- February 22, 2023: A minor change memo requesting for a 24-month extension of TA completion date to December 31, 2025 was approved by VRM Management. In the mid-term MOU a potential second extension of TA closing date to June 30, 2028 was discussed. This will allow the pending TA activities to be completed.

(ii) Institutional and Implementation Arrangements

- April 26, 2024: an approved minor change memo for a change in the governing procurement policy from the ADB's Procurement Guidelines (2015, as amended from time to time) and ADB Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time) to the 2017 Procurement Policy under TA 9417-VIE, which was supported by the implementing agency (i.e., MONRE's Project Management Unit). The 2017 Procurement Policy will be only applicable to future

packages under the TA (i.e., packages which have not yet been advertised). Packages already procured, or in the process of procurement, will be governed by ADB's Procurement Guidelines (2015, as amended from time to time) and ADB Guidelines on the Use of Consultants (2013, as amended from time to time) throughout the duration of their contracts.

- February 29, 2024: an approved minor change memo for the scope of Output 2 to be widened to include project preparation activities in other secondary cities, in line with the wider purpose of the project to "...demonstrate green and climate-resilient development approaches that will be scaled up for nationwide secondary green city development in Viet Nam." Output 2 of the TA paper would be modified to include a new component "(vii): develop and prepare green and climate urban investment projects in other cities".
- April 5, 2023: an approved minor change memo for the change in selection method of the consulting package TA9417-ISP QCBS-01: *Review, develop the climate vulnerability assessment methodology, and pilot in 03 cities (Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen)* from current the current Quality Cost Based Selection (QCBS) to Consultant Qualification Selection (CQS). The proposed CQS is therefore a suitable procurement method for this assignment.
- April 3, 2023: an approved minor change memo for the change of MONRE implementing agency from the Viet Nam Environmental Administration to Pollution Control Department. The new Project Management Unit (PMU) was established on January 18, 2023, under the Pollution Control Department. This change complies with the recent restructuring under MONRE, which takes effective from January 1, 2023. The Executing Agency (EA) confirmed that although the MONRE has been restructured, there are no changes in other management aspects such as organizational structure, segregation of duties, internal controls, internal audit, audit reporting line, disbursement arrangement, financial reporting, and auditing arrangements, etc.

Global Environmental Benefits (GEB) Objective/ Development Objective (DO)

GEB M&E INDICATORS OF TA OUTPUT 2

The Global Environmental Benefits (GEB) Assessment is conducted by the TA team to evaluate the benefits the project generates in response to the GEF mandate in its focal areas. This Technical Assistance (TA) Output 2 seeks to increase urban resilience in Ha Giang, Hue, and Vinh Yen based on a thorough understanding of the climate threats and vulnerabilities and an intelligent use of nature-based solutions (NbS) in integrated adaptation responses. An integrated climate-sensitive planning approach where the synergies between urban development and environmental benefits are promoted is needed in all Vietnamese cities and towns to tackle climate change impacts and enhance urban sustainability. The objective of this section is to demonstrate how the achievement of GEF outcomes has made contributions to GEB.

- The TA output 2 achieved all expected four TA ADB program outputs, which provided benefits to the GEF and GEB targets. In detail the TA output 2 project contributed to the achievement of the following GEF Outcomes:
 - ✓ Outcome 1.1: Integrated, resilient planning in 3 cities
 - ✓ Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of the resilience of urban investments
 - ✓ Outcome 3.1: Strengthened enabling institutional environment

And contributed to the achievement of the following GEB benefits:

- ✓ BD4. Mainstream Biodiversity Conservation and Sustainable Use into Production Landscapes/Seascapes and Sectors;
- ✓ CCM1. Promote Innovation, Technology Transfer, and Supportive Policies and Strategies;
- ✓ CCA-1. Reduce the Vulnerability of People, Livelihoods, Physical Assets and Natural Systems to the Adverse Effects of Climate Change;
- ✓ CCA-2. Strengthen Institutional and Technical Capacities for Effective Climate Change Adaptation.

At the outcome level, the project supported several national and local stakeholders in managing the mainstreaming of NbS measures through process and program implementation. The TA output 2 project, through the update of the CVA methodology, the implementation of greening techniques, the upgrading of eleven national standards (i.e., TCVN and QTCVN) benefitted 191 technical officials from PMUs, provincial and city levels, while 58 technical officials benefitted indirectly from relevant departments (e.g., DONRE, DARD, DoC, City offices).

- The TA output 2 indicates impact at an individual level (project beneficiaries) who gained new skills, equipment, also new technical capital through the dissemination of NbS practices so they could engage in new economic activities due to the new technologies and access to the NbS markets.

The TA output 2 identifies impacts at the physical level by reducing vulnerability to climate threats for people, buildings, and infrastructure in Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen. For instance, the population covered by the CVA include Hue: 276.160 pp, Vinh Yen 11.331 pp and Ha Giang: 4.240 pp. In addition, the TA output 2 project designed three demonstration projects in Hanoi, Hue and Vinh Yen.

Lastly, the TA output 2 improved efficiency at the process level by upgrading 11 technical standards and norms (i.e., TCVN and QCVN), facilitating the dissemination of good practices through the preparation of 25 Climate Adaptation Solutions based on NbS and WSUD approaches, and facilitating the dissemination of NbS by preparing a detailed cost analysis for NbS.

GEF Project Implementation Review as presented in Annex 1 of this report.

DELIVERABLES, M&E INDICATORS AND GEB INDICATORS OF MONRE ADMINISTERED 17 TA PACKAGES as presented in Annex 2 of this report.

II. Project Profile

1. General Information	1	GEF ID	: 6924 / 9484
	2	Focal Area(s)	: Climate Change (ID6924) / Multi Focal Area (ID9484)
	3	Region	: Southeast Asia
	4	Country	: Viet Nam
	5	GEF Project Title	: Promoting Climate Resilience in Viet Nam Cities (ID6924)/ Integrated Approaches for Sustainable Cities in Viet Nam (ID9484)
	6	Project Size (FSP; MSP)	: FSP
	7	Trust Fund (GEFTF; SCCF; LDCF)	: SCCF (ID6924) / GEFTF (ID9484)
2. Milestone Dates	8	GEF CEO Endorsement Date	: August 30, 2016 (ID6924)/ December 14, 2016 (ID9484)
	9	ADB Approval Date if the GEF Fund	: October 31, 2017
	10	GEF Grant Signing of the GEF Fund	: June 27, 2018
	11	Implementation Start Date of the Project and of the GEF Component	: April 14, 2019
	12	Date of 1st GEF Grant Disbursement	: November 08, 2019
	13	Final date of GEF Grant Disbursement	: N/A
	14	Proposed/Revised Implementation End	: December 31, 2027
	15	Actual Implementation End	: N/A
	16	Expected Financial Closure Date	: June 30, 2028
	17	Actual Financial Closure Date	: N/A
3. Funding	18	PPG/PDF Funding (USD)	
	19	GEF Grant (USD)	: \$4,566,210 (ID6924)/ \$8,256,881 (ID9484)
	20	Total GEF Fund Disbursement as of 30 June 2024(USD)	: \$2,926,608.44
	21	Confirmed Co-Finance at CEO Endorsement (USD)	: \$ 77,897,100 (ID6924) \$ 148,472,900 (ID9484)
	21	Materialized Co-Finance at project mid-term (USD)	:
22	Materialized Co-Finance at project completion (USD)	:	
	23	Proposed Mid-term date (mm/dd/yy)	: March 4 – 8, 2024
	24	Actual Mid-Term date - if applicable (mm/dd/yy)	: April 16, 2024

4. Evaluations	25	Proposed Terminal Evaluation date : June 30, 2028 (mm/dd/yy)
	26	Actual Terminal Evaluation Date (mm/dd/yy)

III. Project Implementation

A. Project Description:

The GEF Grant supports (i) TA 9417-VIE, a \$12.82 million Technical Assistance (\$ 10.82 million by GEF and \$2 million by UCCRTF) is attached to the Secondary Green Cities Development Project and (ii) Grant 0549-VIE, a \$2 million Grant Investment for Energy Efficiency for Street Lighting in Ha Giang is blended into the investment loan. The TA has 3 components and associated outcomes.

1. Component 1: Strengthen City Planning Processes

Outcome 1.1: Integrated, resilient planning in 3 cities. The Grant provides technical support to Ha Giang, Hue and Vinh Yen as they implement the existing GCAPs and then prepare updated, improved green city action plans (GCAP). Capacity will be built in the three cities through their involvement in these processes – i.e. on the job capacity development. This will result in a strengthened city planning process that mainstreams green planning/design approaches, resilience and the GCAP process into city master plans for spatial and socio-economic development.

Outcome 1.2: Replicating integrated, resilient planning in six cities: Six additional secondary cities will be selected based on (i) their readiness and commitment to take a GCAP approach, (ii) their potential for reducing GHG emissions, (iii) their vulnerability to climate and other risks; and (iv) assessments of infrastructure, services and capacity gaps. The alternative will support preparation of integrated urban development plans and build capacity in the six cities to prepare and implement plans.

2. Component 2: Demonstrating Low Impact and Climate Resilient Development

Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments. Outcome 2.1 will support a rigorous and cost-effective process that contributes to overall climate resilience at the city level. The process will involve (i) full definition of threats; (ii) selection of priority sub-projects and possibly some new investments for climate proofing; (iii) re-scoping or re-design of the priority sub-projects to ensure they are more resilient; (iv) supplying necessary goods/equipment as needed for the modified designs; and (v) capturing the knowledge. The whole process will be implemented through an approach that develops national and city capacity.

Outcome 2.2: Demonstrating an integrated package of investments that lead to transition to low impact, low carbon development in Ha Giang city. In Ha Giang, the alternative will demonstrate how to practically implement an integrated approach, how this can generate synergies, and how this can nudge a smaller secondary city onto a green, integrated, resilient pathway. The integrated package of technologies will contribute to reduced GHG emissions, improved urban livability, increased resilience of vulnerable populations, community development, and positive impacts on biodiversity.

Outcome 2.3: Demonstrating community-based and insurance-based resilience. This outcome is totally financed by UCCRTF co-financing and will be implemented within the

framework of GEF activities, and through the same management, monitoring and learning framework.

3. Component 3. Improved Enabling Environment for Upscaling Integrated, Resilient Approaches

Outcome 3.1: Strengthened enabling institutional environment. The GEF supported alternative will strengthen the national framework that provides the foundation and incentives for the adoption of integrated, low carbon, low impact, resilient planning by secondary cities across Viet Nam. This will facilitate replication, upscaling and institutionalization of the successes. The policy and technical support will focus mostly on MONRE and related institutes.

In terms of implementation activities of the TA in Viet Nam, the whole TA consists of 4 interrelated Outputs, 3 Outputs funded by GEF and one by UCCRTF as follows:

- **Output 1:** Formulated national regulatory framework for an enabling environment for sustainable and resilient cities.
- **Output 2:** Demonstrated sustainable and resilient development in Ha Giang, Hue, and Vinh Yen.
- **Output 3:** Prepared and tested innovative climate risk financing in Hue (funded by UCCRTF).
- **Output 4:** Enhanced and replicated integrated and resilient environmental planning at the city and provincial levels.

ADB administers Output 2 & 3. Administration of Outputs 1&4 was delegated to MONRE.

B. Implementation Progress (IP) Rating:

The GEF grant was endorsed by the GEF CEO on August 30, 2016 under the Special Climate Change Fund (SCCF) and October 31, 2017 under GEF Trust Fund and linked to the Sustainable Cities Integrated Approach Pilot (SCIAP).

The GEF grant was initially proposed to be linked to the ADB financed Secondary Green Cities Development Project, implemented through a result-based lending (RBL) modality. However, subsequent to the GEF grant endorsement, ADB proposed to change the lending modality to a standard investment loan. This was done due to the limited experience in Viet Nam with result-based lending and concern that this may complicate implementation.

Subsequently, the lending modality was revised based on agreement with the State Bank of Viet Nam (SBV) and the 3 participating cities, as well as consultation with MONRE. This caused a delay in the approval of the ADB loan of approximately 11 months from December 2016 to November 2017.

During this period ADB and MONRE entered further consultations, with ADB sending an official request in June 2017 for MONRE to request approval from the Prime Minister for domestic approval of the GEF grant funds. In July 2017, ADB and MONRE agreed for delegation of administration of Output 1 to MONRE. ADB also provides technical support to

MONRE to prepare the project document proposal for GOV approval. In May 2018, MONRE officially requested further discussion with ADB to further negotiate the implementation arrangements, including additional delegation and responsibility for additional project outputs. ADB issued the NOL to delegation of Output 4 to MONRE in October 2018. The delay occurred as ADB would like to ensure that MONRE has sufficient capacity and clear delegation of responsibilities to departments with an appropriate mandate and staff resources. The main reason for the unforeseeable delay is delegation of administration to MONRE and approval of GOV. In June 2022, due to the Covid-19 impacts and prolonged procurement process. TA was extended for 2 years from December 31, 2023 to December 31, 2025 and possibility of second extension of TA closing date of 30 June 2028.

A more detailed chronological timeline is provided below.

- February 24, 2016: ADB informed SBV a Loan Fact Finding Mission under Result-based lending (RBL) modality to 3 Cities from February 25 to March 18, 2016. The mission was attended by GEF team led by Xiaomei Tan (GEF) and accompanied by GEF consultant teams
- August 30, 2016: GEF CEO Endorsement using Special Climate Change Fund
- October 31, 2016: GEF CEO Endorsement of sub-project under a Program using GEF Trust Fund
- In Nov 2016, SERD management decided to change the modality to a standard investment loan.
- November and December 2016: ADB held various meetings to inform GOV (MPI, MOF, SBV) the change of the loan modality from RBL to a standard investment loan;
- March 17, 2017: MOU of loan re-appraisal mission signed with 3 Provinces;
- May 25, 2017: ADB Management Review Meeting approved the proposed investment project, including the TA Concept;
- June 9, 2017: ADB sent official letter to MONRE requesting for preparation of Project Outline to be submitted to the Prime Minister for approval by July 10, 2017, given ADB management's clearance to the TA Concept;
- July 28, 2017: ADB and MONRE agreed for delegation of administration of Output 1 to MONRE
- September 27, 2017: Loan negotiations held in VRM;
- October 6, 2018: ADB sent updated TA MOU to MONRE for delegation of administration of Output 1
- January 16, 2018: ADB sent official letter to MONRE requesting to prepare a Project Outline and submit to the Prime Minister at the earliest approval;
- May 28, 2018: MONRE sent ADB a written request for additional delegation of administration of TA Outputs 4 to MONRE
- June 29, 2018: GEF Grant agreement 0549-VIE (\$2 Million) grant for Ha Giang was signed by ADB and GOV
- October 1, 2018: ADB sent MONRE a NOL for delegation of administration of Output 4 to MONRE
- October 26, 2018: SBV sent ADB a written request for extension of ADB approval validity for 6 months from October 31, 2018 in order to complete the GOV approval

procedures.

- April 15, 2019: ADB and MONRE signed the MOU on the TA
- April 19, 2019: State Bank of Viet Nam sent ADB the No-objection letter of GOV to the TA
- MONRE circulated the PO submission and Project Documents and collected comments from all line ministries and submitted to the Office of Government for Prime Minister approval at the end of July 2019. Project Documents (PO) of the TA was approved by GOV on 18 September 2019.
- October 7-14, 2019: ADB Review Mission conducted meetings with MONRE and 3 Cities to review and update the project implementation schedule and discuss potential problems and viable solutions.
- December 5-6, 2019: a study tour was conducted in Singapore with the participation of 13 Government officials from relevant cities to learn about Singapore’s experience in implementing nature based-solutions for green and water sensitive city development (GEF – Output 2)
- January 30, 2020: The Project Document was approved by MONRE leader (Decision Ref. 245/QD-BTNMT)
- June 26, 2020: Formation of MONRE Project Management Unit (PMU) was approved by MONRE. MONRE prepared the detailed implementation plan and procurement plan for MONRE administered Outputs 1 & 4. ADB provided MONRE implementation plans for ADB administered Outputs 2 & 3. The establishment of the steering committee and project management regulation were approved by MONRE.
- July 24, 2020: Issuance of Decision Ref. 1633/QD-BTNMT on Establishment of Project Steering Committee for “Mainstreaming Climate Resilience and Environmental Protection for Secondary Green Cities Development”
- November 9-19, 2020: ADB Review Mission conducted meetings with MONRE and 3 Cities to review and update the project implementation schedule and discuss potential problems and viable solutions.
- November 24, 2020: ADB sent MONRE PMU no objection on the overall workplan
- February 2021: ADB and MONRE PMU agreed on the procurement plan for the delegated Output 1 and 4.
- April 2021: MONRE Procurement Plan for delegated Output 1&4 was approved by MONRE leadership
- April 9, 2021: TA Inception workshop in Hanoi with the participation of MONRE Minister, Steering Committee members, loan project PMUs, and ADB VRM Country Director.
- April 14 – May 5, 2021: ADB Review Mission conducted meetings with MONRE and 3 Cities to review and update the project implementation progress.
- May 21, 2021: Procurement training was provided to MONRE PMU by ADB VRM Procurement Consultant on ADB procurement guidelines.
- As for ADB administered Output 2, a large consulting contract (approximately \$2m) was signed on 15 June 2021 with the ICEM / Nippon Koei Joint venture. The Consultant’s main focus is on demonstrated sustainable and resilient development in Hue, Ha Giang, and Vinh Yen
- August 10, 2021: A meeting between Output 2 consultants with MONRE and ADB

team to brief the objectives and scope of TA Output 2 and to share the progress of TA Outputs 1 & 4

- December 8, 2021: A review mission to update the TA progress, update on work plan 2022 Contract award and Disbursement plan, procurement related issues, M&E and risk management (Covid impacts), and administration, communications and financial related issue
- March 23, 2022: A review mission to review TA implementation progress, update on the work plan, contract award and disbursement plan, procurement issues, M&E and risk management, administration/communication and financial issues, solid waste management discussion.
- June 3, 2022: MONRE PMU sent an official request to ADB for project extension until December 2025.
- November 7-16, 2022: A review mission (combined with mid-term review mission of Loan project) to review the procurement progress of Outputs 1 and 4, implementation status of output 2,3. Procedures for TA extension were also discussed.
- February 13, 2023: MONRE PMU sent an official letter informing the change (name) of implementing agency. Because of MONRE's organizational restructuring, Vietnam Environment Administration – VEA (IA at that time) was restructured and changed to Pollution Control Department (PCD). Personnel unchanged.
- February 23, 2023: ADB sent an official response letter to MONRE leader approving extension of the TA closing date to December 31, 2025 (following a minor change memo approved by Director General of ADB SERD on February 22, 2023).
- April 3, 2023: ADB approved an internal minor change memo requesting a change (in name) of the TA implementing agency, from VEA to PCD.
- April 30 – May 6, 2023: MONRE PMU leader and representatives of MONRE participated in the Conferences of the Parties to the Basel, Rotterdam, and Stockholm Conventions in Geneva, Switzerland. Post-mission report has been shared with ADB on July 24, 2023.
- May 31, 2023: MONRE PMU submitted the Audited Project Financial Report for 2022 fiscal year.
- July 12, 2023: ADB sent a fax to Ha Giang PMU to principally support extension of GEF component under Grant 0549-VIE to December 31, 2025, following a consultation within ADB. Once an official request to extend the grant completion date is received, ADB will proceed with an internal memo for official extension.
- July 21, 2023: ADB shared with the MONRE PMU the budget reallocation (per budget line and funding sources)
- July 24, 2023: ADB sent the MONRE PMU the no-objection fax to the updated overall workplan for whole project activities following the 2-year extension of completion date.
- Until now, MONRE PMU has been staffed with 6 officials assigned from PCD (previously known as VEA) and ISPONRE, 8 national individual consultants to support the project implementation. MONRE procurement plan consists of 9 individual consultant selections (including one recently proposed position due to the massive workload), 03 non-technical packages and 17 technical packages.

For ADB-administered output 2:

- December 15, 2022: Technical roundtable for scaling up nature-based solutions for resilient urban development was organized in Hanoi
- June 30, 2023: completion date of the consulting contract with ICEM/Nippon Koei joint venture was extended to December 31, 2023. Outputs 2.2 (scope of demonstration project) and 2.3 (scope of cost-benefit analysis) were also revised. The current revised contract closing date with ICEM is 31 January 2025.
- December 2023: submitted Output 2.3 Report on *Demonstrating Low -Impact and Climate -Resilient Development in Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen*
- 11 April 2024: Output 2.3 Revised Report on *Demonstrating Low -Impact and Climate -Resilient Development in Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen* was approved by ADB
- 16 April 2024: ADB Mid-term review mission was held

a. GEF Grant Disbursement

Up to now, the total grant disbursement amounted \$2.9 million under the TA9417. The first disbursement of the TA is on November 8, 2019 under TA Output 2 administered by ADB. ADB administered Output 2 contract was signed and the consulting firm was mobilized on July 8, 2021. TA Outputs 1&4 were delegated to MONRE and MONRE has developed Terms of References for 17 packages in accordance with their approved procurement plan. For payment arrangements, the MONRE PMU will receive GEF fund transfers from ADB based on a quarterly disbursement plan agreed upon between MONRE and ADB through an Advance Payment Facility (APF). The cumulative advance payment transferred to MONRE's advance account from the beginning of the project to 30 June 2024 is \$ 1.88 million.

This G.0549 mainly involved the procurement of goods package: Energy Efficiency for Street Lighting System in Ha Giang (HG-CW08): during mid-June 2023, Ha Giang PMU submitted the revised Bid Evaluation Report (BER) with recommendation to cancel the bid. On 12 July 2023, ADB issued no objection to the Ha Giang PMU's request to cancel the current bidding process of the package following the determination that there are no qualified bids. On 31 July 2023, one bidder submitted request for a debriefing meeting to Ha Giang PMU (ADB project team was copied) on the bidding results. A response letter dated 3 August 2023 from Ha Giang PMU was issued to the requesting bidder providing an explanation why such bid was not selected. Ha Giang PMU is recommended to prepare to re-bid the package and submit the updated Bidding Document to ADB for review and approval.

The Ha Giang PMU submitted ADB a letter in June 2023 requesting for extension of the grant closing date until December 31, 2025 to enable the PMU to revise the bidding documents and resume the new bidding process. July 12, 2023: ADB sent a fax to Ha Giang PMU to in-principal support extension of GEF component under Grant 0549-VIE to December 31, 2025, following a consultation within ADB. On 26 March 2024, ADB issued its letter indicated its support for extending the grant closing date from 30 June 2024 to 30 June 2028.

b. Stakeholders Engagement

During Mission 3, Output 2 consultant delivered the "National technical meeting of standardizing vulnerability assessment methodology" to 6 MONRE officials, 24 participants

in Hue including 4 from PMU, 2 from Steering Committee for Disaster Prevention and Rescue. The team also presented the Technical Sheet with the concept designs for “finalization of adaptation investment projects to 3 participants of PMU and 1 participant from Department of Planning and Investment in Hue; 7 participants from PMU and 02 participant from City People’s Committee in Vinh Yen and 02 participants from PMU in Ha Giang. During Mission 4, Output 2 team delivered the participatory mapping workshop and consultation in three cities “Consultations on hotspot zones for CVA” for 25 participants in Hue, 18 participants in Vinh Yen, and 25 participants in Ha Giang. During Mission 4, the team delivered the national technical meeting on “environmentally sustainable approach in national standards” to 26 participants from National institutions, City PMU and MONRE PMU; 17 participants from Hanoi Technical Organizations and Institutions, 3 participants from MONRE PMU, and 3 participants from PMU. In June 2023, the team interviewed 3 groups of stakeholders including 2 policymakers, 4 research institutions/university and 6 practitioners (PMUs, city developers in public and private sectors.

The Project Steering Committee was currently enhanced. Because of recent change in MONRE management leaders, MONRE PMU is processing internal protocol to update list of PSC members and get it approved within MONRE by the end of 2023. Capacity assessment will be carried out to MONRE officials as well as stakeholders in 3 project cities and in other secondary cities.

c. Gender Action Plan Implementation Status

SGCDP is classified as “Effective Gender Mainstreaming (EGM)”. During preparation of SGCDP, a gender assessment was undertaken for each city, and a rapid assessment was undertaken for each priority sub-project. Accordingly, a gender action plan (GAP) was prepared, which covers both baseline and GEF supported activities. The GAP proposes a systematic framework for ensuring that women participate in and benefit from the activities. The GAP also provides a framework for monitoring gender-specific aspects of the impact of the project and benefits realization during the implementation phase.

Under MONRE administration (Output 1 and Output 4): (i) The MONRE PMU conducted workshops on guiding the compliance with provisions of importing and using the persistent toxic substances (PTS) and articles, products, commodities and equipment containing PTS, technical meeting for revision of the national technical regulations on Surface water quality; and marine water quality, technical meeting for revision of National technical regulations on Ground water quality and the allowable limits of heavy metals in the soils, etc. for 779 participants including 373 female participants (47.8%); (ii) The package TA9417-ISP QCBS-03 “Conduct capacity need assessment, develop and conduct training program for GHG inventory, low-carbon emissions, climate risk vulnerability assessment, green public procurement... for secondary cities” contract awarded on 26 February 2024 and the training is scheduled to be started from Q1/2025; (iii) Under the package TA9417-VEA QCBS-07 “Update action plan (GCAP) for Hue, Vinh Yen and Ha Giang cities and Develop air quality management plan in several project cities and pilot in at least 02 project cities”, the updated draft GCAP for Hue, Vinh Yen and Ha Giang will be completed in Q4/2024; Under TA Output 2, the consulting firm ICEM conducted the training on natural edge treatment for Hue PMU,

construction contractors, and construction supervision consultants in Thua Thien Hue. In collaboration with HUCE and Monash University, ICEM organized a two-week training and design contest for 31 students (including 9 females) in July 2023. The competition enabled students to explore sustainable urban design and environmental engineering, crafting climate-sensitive solutions for a campus site. The aim is to transform the site into a green, resilient learning hub, reflecting HUCE FAP’s values of uniqueness, innovation, and leadership. The winning design will guide the upcoming site renovation.

For three project participating provinces (Ha Giang, Vinh Phuc and T.T.Hue): 286 staff including 54 women in TT Hue and Vinh Phuc participated in the trainings on improving green design, integrating climate change prevention and environmental protection to develop grade II urban areas, enhancing green design (nature-based design), provincial and green city planning, etc under TA9417. In which: Vinh Yen: 32 women among 95 participants (33.7%); T.T.Hue : 22 women among 191 participants (11.5%). The staff in Ha Giang province participated in the trainings under TA8671 (4 women among 19 staff [21%]).

MONRE PMU is recommended to inform the GAP target of at least 33% women participate in training courses to the service consultant (TA9417-ISP QCBS-03 package) and project provinces and monitor consultant performance to ensure this target is achieved by the end of project (target 18 of GAP);

Ha Giang CPRP, VPMO, Hue PMU are recommended to invite both men and women in trainings on green and resilient city concept, environmental protection, climate change adaptation to ensure the achievement of GAP target (at least 33% of participants are women).

d. Social and Environmental Safeguard Plan Implementation Status

Overall supervision of the GEF funds is subject to the ADB due diligence and safeguards system and all environmental and social safeguards will be ensured through this system. GEF funds are used to provide associated technical support and capacity development to the baseline SGCDP project. There are no additional risks or concerns associated with the GEF funds over the baseline. Hence, the management of safeguards for GEF funds is through the management of safeguards of the baseline investment project. The GEF administered funds will not be involved in the parts of the project related to involuntary resettlement and will not be involved with activities related to involuntary resettlement.

Impact level	Performance Indicators with Targets and Baselines	Status
Outcome	2023	
Integrated planning incorporating climate resilience and environmental protection mainstreamed into urban planning processes in secondary cities in Viet Nam	The GrEEEn ^a Cities approaches integrated into Viet Nam’s planning process	TA 9417 VEA QCBS 08 (under implementation) and 09 packages explicitly seek to incorporate the GrEEEn cities approach into planning for 6 target cities. However, this is not a national process because

		<p>urban planning laws are not a MONRE mandate.</p> <p>However, the TA is developing regulations around pollution generally which will be applicable to the national planning focus.</p> <p>The TA9417-VEA QCBS-02 (under implementation)/-07 (under implementation)/ -08/-09/-13 (under implementation) and TA9417-ISP QCBS-01 (changed to CQS), are related to environmental protection and/or climate resilience integration into urban planning in Viet Nam.</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-03 (under implementation) review and revise/develop policies on sustainable consumption, environmentally friendly production and climate change adaptation for developing secondary green cities in Viet Nam</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-04 (under implementation) develop a set of ecolabel criteria for transportation products, carrying out the solutions on circular economy, sustainable/environment friendly production and consumption in the secondary cities</p>
--	--	---

		<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-10 review, evaluate the results of implementing pilot model of saving, reuse & applying new technology in wastewater treatment for a population/ urban production, business and services entities and replicate this model in other selected cities</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-11 (under implementation) pilot at least 01 advanced technology to recycle wastes into environment-friendly products in 01 city</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-12 (under implementation) develops a list of hazardous chemical contaminated areas nationwide and restoration of the soil environment at polluted site, propose a plan to replicate it to urban areas with similar types of pollution to control land pollution for changing land use</p>
Outputs	By 31/12/2023:	
1. Strengthened city planning and implementation processes (Inclusive)	1a. 3 Updated GCAPs prepared for Hue, Vinh Yen and Ha Giang (2019) ^b	TA9417-VEA QCBS-07 (under implementation) update three GCAPs for Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen for 2020-2030 and prepares two air quality management plans for project cities Hue and Vinh Yen; drafts the

		<p>technical guidelines to develop GCAP for secondary cities in Viet Nam as the basis for expanding GCAP development to 6 other provinces</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-02 prepares criteria and green city assessment (under implementation).</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-02 (under implementation) develop technical guidelines for GHG inventory and MRV for urban areas in Viet Nam. Three GHG inventory reports and need assessment for low carbon technology for Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen Cities to be prepared as key inputs for the update of the relevant GCAPs.</p>
	<p>1b. GCAPs for 6 new secondary cities prepared²</p>	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-08 & 09 (under implementation) prepare GCAPs and replicate the green city approach for 6 new secondary cities</p>
	<p>1c. GCAPs mainstreamed into the Project Cities' Master Plans by 2023</p>	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-07 (under implementation) update three GCAPs for Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen for 2020-2030 and prepares two air quality management plans for project cities Hue and Vinh Yen; drafts the technical guidelines to develop GCAP for secondary cities in Viet Nam as the basis for expanding GCAP</p>

² Totally financed by GEF/SCIAP and associated co-financing

		<p>development to 6 other provinces</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-02 (under implementation) prepare criteria and green city assessment.</p>
	<p>1d. Strengthened capacity of at least 200 professionals from the central and local governments with at least 33% female to integrate green city principles into urban planning and budgeting processes.</p>	<p>The gender monitoring table was updated during the November 2022 ADB review mission.</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-13 (under discussion with ADB on tax and contract value): International consulting firm provide technical assistance to VEA's activities related to urban environmental management and ISPONRE's activities related to GHG inventory, climate vulnerability assessment, developing training and communication programs</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-05 (Currently Submission 2) enhance management capacity and experience sharing on environment, land-use and climate resilience for MONRE officials.</p> <p>TA9417-ISP QCBS/CQS-01 (under implementation) conduct capacity need assessment, develops and conducts training program for GHG inventory, low-carbon emission, climate risk vulnerability assessment, green public procurement for secondary cities</p>

		<p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-04 (ADB issued S3 NOL, contact signing in Q3/2024) develop and implement communications activities on GHG inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, ecology assessment, circular economy, green public procurement for targeted groups, including authorities and policy makers.</p>
	<p>1.d. Gender balanced and professionally staffed PMU with at least 33% female (2019)</p> <p>1e. Independent verification assistance (IVA) to assess performance of loan against Disbursement linked indicators (DLIs)</p>	<p>Gender Action Plan Monitoring Table was updated during ADB Review Mission in November 2022 and during the midterm review mission 16 April 2024.</p> <p>The gender training makes sure that MONRE needs to ensure the GAP indicators are included in the TOR of packages related to GCAPs and capacity building, such as: (i) All GCAPs that are approved and implemented include gender-responsive and pro-poor features; (ii) At least 200 government professionals (at least 33% women) gained new skills in green and resilient city concept and integrated planning; and (iii) Capacity development on gender mainstreaming for PMU staff and 40% of IA staff responsible for GCAP planning and implementation.</p>

		<p>Not applicable due to ADB’s change of loan modality from RBL to standard investment loan.</p>
<p>2. Enhanced low impact and climate resilient development</p>	<p>By 2022 2a. Recommendations for greening design and procurement for urban investments in project cities provided. (Baseline: N/A)</p>	<p>In Vinh Yen/Hue/Ha Giang, ADB appointed two international landscape architects consultants under the TA to assist in the inclusion of water sensitive design elements to the “green” packages under the loan,</p> <p>Workshop were held in May and June 2021 to discuss both Hue and Vinh Yen community led investments, and to explore opportunities to introduce water sensitive elements to improve environmental resilience and performance. The landscape architects appointed under Output 2 of the TA facilitated the workshops and reviewed the outline designs to introduce the water sensitive urban design concepts.</p> <p>As requested from the Hue PMU, ADB will send the national consultant landscape architect to Hue to support and provide instruction on “green” feature during the construction period.</p> <p>Output 2 consultant</p>

	<p>2d. Determination of optimal insurance products that provide incentives to Vietnamese cities for adaptation through integrated green city planning.</p> <p>2e. Replacement of at least 1000 streetlights to energy efficient lighting in Ha Giang city</p> <p>2f. At least [300,000] beneficiaries including [20,000] vulnerable beneficiaries have access to newly built infrastructure following low impact development and GrEEEn City approach</p>	<p>with Thua Thien Hue PPC and Insurance Administration (MOF) on the calculation method and pilot purchase of public property insurance. However, MOF have not submitted a list of specific assets that must be insured for disaster risks according to Public Property Insurance Decree 151/2017.</p> <p>Ha Giang submitted the request to cancel the bid in energy efficient lighting. The package will be rebid when the extension of the grant is completed</p>
<p>3. Improved enabling environment for upscaling green cities approaches</p>	<p>By 31/12/2025:</p> <p>3a. National regulation on green cities approved and issued.</p> <p>3b. Technical Guidelines on implementing the national regulation on green cities (indicator 3a) issued.</p>	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-01 (under implementation) develops legal documents guiding the implementation of the Environmental Protection Law 2020 related to environmental protection and climate change response for developing secondary green cities in Viet Nam.</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-02 (under implementation) prepares criteria and green city assessment.</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-04 (under implementation)</p>

		<p>develops technical guidance document for assessment and certification of Viet Nam's eco-label and develop sets of eco-label criteria; pilot application of technical guidance on assessment and certification of eco-labels; advanced technologies for recycling waste and apply waste recycling technology and replicate it in urban areas.</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-07 (under implementation) drafts the technical guidelines to develop GCAP for secondary cities in Viet Nam</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-13 (seeking approval): International consulting firm contributing to developing technical guidelines on green cities indicators & policy frameworks, treatment of urban contaminated sites: serious polluting factories, and treatment of urban contaminated sites: serious polluting landfills.</p> <p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-01 (changed from QCBS to CQS) review, develop the climate vulnerability assessment methodology and pilot in three cities: Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen.</p> <p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-02 (under implementation) review,</p>
--	--	---

		develop GHG inventory methodology and guidance for MRV monitoring; assess low-carbon technology need and emission reduction potential to propose low-carbon technology portfolio and pilot GHG inventory assessment and MRV in 3 cities (Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen).
	3c. Government decision to establish a green city financing mechanism.	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-03 (under implementation) review and revise/develop policies on sustainable consumption, environmentally friendly production and climate change adaptation for developing secondary green cities in Viet Nam.</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-13 (seeking approval): International consulting firm contributing to policy formulation, communication and training activities regarding circular economy, green public procurement.</p>
	3d. Endorsed policy document on Climate Induced Disaster Risk Financing (CDRF) issued.	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-10 (Submission 3): Pilot model on urban wastewater reuse and replication for selected cities</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-11 (under implementation): Assess current situations of plastic waste recycling in a selected secondary city Identify suitable technologies for increasing</p>

		plastic waste recycling rates in the selected city through piloting. Develop a roadmap for scaling up the piloted advanced recycling technologies in other urban areas.
	3e. At least eight cities join the Viet Nam sustainable cities cluster.	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-07 (under implementation) update three GCAPs for Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen for 2020-2030 and prepares two air quality management plans for project cities Hue and Vinh Yen; drafts the technical guidelines to develop GCAP for secondary cities in Viet Nam as the basis for expanding GCAP development to 6 other provinces</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-08 & 09 (under implementation) prepare GCAPs and replicate the green city approach for 6 new secondary cities</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-13 (Seeking approval): International consulting firm contributing to partnership development and coordination, including support for Viet Nam’s effective contribution to the international and regional forum on green cities</p>
	3f. Strengthened MONRE capacity to support integrated, resilient city plan	TA9417-VEA QCBS-05 (Submission 2) enhances management capacity and experience sharing on environment, land-use and

		<p>climate resilience for MONRE officials</p> <p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-06 (Submission 2) develop new technical guidelines on design criteria for the national and local environmental monitoring networks; technical guideline on processing and synthesizing environmental monitoring data for national monitoring stations located in ministries, sectors and provinces to send information to MONRE</p> <p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-03 (under implementation) conduct training needs assessment on GHG inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, circular economy, green public procurement, and low GHG emissions at central and secondary cities, focusing on 3 pilot cities (i.e. Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen) with at least 120 participants in each city will participate in the training programs.</p> <p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-04 (S3 NOL, contact signing in Q3/2024) prepare communication and knowledge dissemination plans</p>
--	--	---

C. Risk Rating:

Risk and Description	Impact & Probability ³	Update on Countermeasures/Management response
Overall project risks		
Delayed start of project implementation	I - 3 P- 5	Close consultation between GOV and ADB regarding project approvals is needed
Lack of coordination with other climate change adaptation projects and initiatives	I - 3 P- 1	Many climate change adaptation initiatives are already underway in Viet Nam. It is critical that these initiatives are coordinated to avoid duplication; to ensure that the various initiatives work together not in isolation; and to share knowledge. Consultation has already been undertaken with key Ministries (MONRE, MOC), development partners (World Bank, UNDP, GIZ) and NGOs (Association of Cities of Viet Nam) to mitigate this risk and will continue during the project preparation phase.
Lack of sustained commitment to reforms to promote climate resilience and integrated city approach	I - 2 P- 2	As described above, GOV has taken a proactive approach to addressing the climate change and urbanization challenges. Strong government commitment exists at all levels (national, provincial, city) to promote resilient, low carbon urban systems.
Lack of Coordination between and among relevant Agencies	I - 4 P- 2	Initial consultations indicate the benefits of establishing high-level Project Steering Committee comprising senior national and provincial/city government officials, and chaired by MONRE to effectively coordinate the project.
Low institutional capacity (technical, financial, environmental management)	I - 3 P- 2	Technical Assistance will be provided under the baseline project for specialist assistance to participating cities
Lack of qualified and available local staff for project implementation	I - 3 P- 2	Mitigated by development of a staff recruiting strategy during project preparation. With many climate change related projects underway in Viet Nam,

³ Range 1-5, where 5 is highest.

Risk and Description	Impact & Probability ³	Update on Countermeasures/Management response
		there is a growing pool of suitably-qualified local staff available.
Risks to All Project Outcomes		
<p>Lack of experience with the RBL modality leads to delays.</p> <p><i>The RBL modality is new to Viet Nam, leading to some uncertainty, and to the danger that unexpected problems will be encountered. Further, there are some specific requirements that may take time to meet.</i></p>	<p>I - 3 P- 2</p>	<p>The GEF grant was initially proposed to be linked to the ADB financed Secondary Green Cities Development Project, implemented through a result-based lending (RBL) modality. However, subsequent to the GEF grant endorsement, ADB proposed to change the lending modality to a standard investment loan. This was done due to the limited experience in Viet Nam with results-based lending and concern that this may complicate implementation. ADB communicated this proposed change with the GOV (MPI, MOF & SBV) and three project executing agencies/implementing agencies in November and December 2016.</p>
<p>The impacts of climate change at the scale relevant to these infrastructure projects are not adequately known or understood.</p> <p><i>The available data and available models make it very difficult to accurately predict climate change at the level of secondary cities, and the impacts it will have.</i></p>	<p>I - 2 P- 3</p>	<p>The impacts of climate change are known at a general level in the country level, and the best available models have been used in the preparation of this Project. Finally, there are many on-going activities to collect improved data and to improve measuring and modelling; this improved knowledge will be used as it becomes available.</p> <p>Also, the Project strategy focuses on ‘no regret’ and ‘low regret’ options, i.e. interventions that increase resilience to climate change and have other benefits.</p>
Risks specific to Outcomes not being achieved		
<p>Output 1: GCAPs are not integrated with other city level plans.</p>	<p>I – 2 P- 2</p>	<p>The existing GCAPs – for Ha Giang, Hue and Vinh Yen, were approved by the concerned Peoples Committees.</p>

Risk and Description	Impact & Probability ³	Update on Countermeasures/Management response
<p><i>The GCAPs are somewhat innovative, and as of yet are not formally included in the national planning framework. This may lead to the GCAP's being implemented, but not institutionalized thereafter.</i></p>		<p>Integration of GCAP into planning process has been made a target of the GEF support, so this risk will be addressed head on, with awareness raising, policy dialogue, national level advocacy, etc.</p> <p>Importantly, the broad participatory process should ensure that all concerned stakeholders are engaged, and so willing to support this integration process, when necessary.</p>
<p>Output 1: Cities are unable to meet gender targets.</p> <p><i>The baseline loan has set ambitious targets for gender, in particular in the women involved in project implementation. This can be challenging at secondary city level in Viet Nam.</i></p>	<p>I - 1 P- 3</p>	<p>Whereas one or two cities may be challenged to meet the targets, the others should be able to meet them comfortably. Hence this is likely to be a risk at only one, or two, cities.</p> <p>The GAPs address this issue, providing both incentives and support to meeting the targets. ADB will closely monitor this situation and provide support and guidance when necessary.</p>
<p>Output 1: Recommendations are not applied to loan sub-projects.</p> <p><i>Output 1.1.1 will lead to recommendations to improve the sub-projects, but the local authorities are not obliged to incorporate these.</i></p>	<p>I - 2 P- 3</p>	<p>The loan procurement process should ensure that the city level project implementation units have good 'ownership' over Output 1.1.1 and the related recommendations, and should treat the advice with due respect. Further, the ADB can ensure that the recommendations are based on <i>both</i> best international practices <i>and</i> sensitivity to Vietnamese circumstances – this should ensure that the recommendations are both pertinent and realistic.</p>
<p>Output 3: Insufficient impact into the national policies/ legislations to achieve sustainability.</p> <p><i>Ultimately, to be sustained, changes will be necessary in terms of policy and</i></p>	<p>I - 2 P- 3</p>	<p>This risk will be addressed head on with training, assessments, awareness raising, policy dialogue, national level advocacy, expert advisories, etc. Further, MONRE has committed to this project and its objectives and is committed to reaching this sustainability.</p>

Risk and Description	Impact & Probability ³	Update on Countermeasures/Management response
<i>legislation, this takes time in any country, and there is no guarantee it will be successful.</i>		ADB will work closely with MONRE to identify and implement the best pathways to achieving the policy and legislative requirements.

D. Overall Rating of the Project:

Overall Rating: Satisfactory (S)

E. Additional Comments – Good Practices and Lessons Learned:

Approval of project and institutional arrangements took considerable time, and this caused delays in project start up.

F. Knowledge activities / products:

The ADB is committed to ensure that all knowledge generated by the project and all lessons learnt will be disseminated in an appropriate manner, through the ADB networks and partner organizations. The Project is also linked into several knowledge management mechanisms and tools. First, as an SCIAP child project, it is supported by the Global Platform for Sustainable Cities (GPSC). GPSC supports knowledge capture and knowledge exchange, both amongst the SCIAP participating cities, and with external initiatives and cities. The proposed Project will be actively involved with the overall SCIAP, sharing knowledge on a regular basis through GPSC, and constantly learning from GPSC through its involvement in GPSC networks and learning events.

The Project also takes place within the broader ADB Green Cities Initiative. Through this network, the Project will share lessons and knowledge with cities across Asia. The ADB’s knowledge management resources support the urban development specialists and community practice members to collect data, learn lessons, and prepare documentation and publications.

The Project is also co-financed by the Urban Climate Change Resilience Trust Fund (UCCRTF), making UCCRTF a key partner. UCCRTF builds resilience to the effects of climate variability and climate change within medium-sized cities in Asia, particularly working with the urban vulnerable and poor. It promotes a systems-centered approach that supports making climate change a central element of city planning. This is linked to the implementation of infrastructure and policy or institutional interventions, as well as strong knowledge, capacity building, and networking components. Managed within the ADB, the UCCRTF has mechanisms for capturing and sharing knowledge.

The TA will benefit from MONRE as the Executing Agency to ensure lessons are captured and

knowledge is shared. Notably, an active involvement is planned for the National Environment Agency (NEA) and PCD and the Institute of Strategy and Policy on Natural Resources and Environment. MONRE will ensure that knowledge is shared through the appropriate Vietnamese channels.

Specifically, with regards to adaptation to climate change, ADB has been actively involved for nearly two decades in efforts to manage the risks associated with climate change on the region's development. In 2010, ADB launched its climate change strategy – Addressing Climate Change in Asia and the Pacific: Priorities for Action. This emphasized the integration of adaptation and disaster risk reduction into national development plans; the building of climate resilience of vulnerable sectors; the climate-proofing of projects; and prioritizing the adaptation needs of the most vulnerable, including women. Since 2012, ADB has been programming projects with adaptation elements amounting to approximately \$1 billion per year. As a result of all this groundwork, ADB has strong technical units responsible for collecting data, learning lessons and sharing knowledge notably through web events, conferences and publications. This includes close coordination with the Asia-Pacific Adaptation Network and Forum.

Three MONRE packages have been dedicated 3 packages to knowledge sharing: ISP-QCBS/CQS 01: *Capacity Need Assessment for GHG Inventory, CVA, Circular Economy, and Green Public Procurement*; ISP- QCBS -04: *Communication Activities for GHG Inventory , CVA, Circular Economy, Green Public Procurement*) and VEA-QCBS 05: *MONRE Management Capacity and Experience Sharing*

In June 2023, two videos titled “Building community resilience in Hue, Viet Nam”⁴ and “Better sanitation for poor families in Vinh Yen, Viet Nam”⁵ have been officially published on ADB’s website and ADB’s YouTube channel. The videos have been also shared with provincial PMUs, MONRE PMU, donors and within ADB for further dissemination to wide audience. The videos then have been shown in a various number of project meetings, workshops as well as published on the project provinces’ official websites in an aim that the videos can reach a wide audience and show benefits of the project to the people of Hue and Vinh Yen cities.

During September 24 to October 2, 2022, MONRE PMU management representatives attended Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs) Review Committee – the Eighteenth meeting in Rome, Italy. From this study tour, participants gained update important information on international legal framework, updated Best Available Techniques (BAT)/Best Environment Practices (BEP) for handling POPs and hazardous chemicals, and requirements on substantive and procedural norms on managing transboundary POPs and hazardous chemicals. The participation contributed to improved capacity of MONRE/PMU management in leading the TA and supervising quality of the relevant consulting packages.

Recently, MONRE PMU management and a representative of MONRE counterpart also joined the conferences of the Parties to the Basel, Rotterdam and Stockholm conventions in Geneva,

⁴ [Building Community Resilience in Hue, Viet Nam \(Teaser\) | Asian Development Bank \(adb.org\)](#) and full version on ADB’s YouTube channel [Building Community Resilience in Hue, Viet Nam - YouTube](#)

⁵ [Better Sanitation for Poor Families in Vinh Yen, Viet Nam | Asian Development Bank \(adb.org\)](#)

Switzerland from April 29 to May 6, 2023. The PMU delegation attended plenary sessions of COPs, participated in negotiation and contributed to the adoption of crucial decisions concerning the management of particularly hazardous chemicals, specifically Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs), throughout their entire life cycle, including chemical products, raw materials, fuels, articles, goods, and equipment containing POPs. This involvement encompasses areas such as the treatment of hot spots with residual chemical pollution, notification and management of international trade activities for dangerous chemicals, as well as hazardous waste management and treatment, including transboundary transport and disposal. Various topics relevant to the TA9417 (under four technical packages i.e. TA9417-VEA QCBS-01, TA9417-VEA QCBS-02, TA9417-VEA QCBS-05, and TA9417-VEA QCBS-11) were also integrated and discussed.

G. Location Data:

Name	Country	Feature Class	Latitude	Longitude
Hue Imperial City	Viet Nam, Thua Thien Hue	Monument	16.4755	107.57141
Ha Giang City	Viet Nam, Ha Giang	City	22.86	104.98
Vinh Yen City	Viet Nam, Vinh Phuc	City	21.31	105.5967

Source: www.geonames.org



Signature:

Name of Project Officer: Alexander David Nash

Position: Senior Urban Development Specialist
Water and Urban Development Sector Office, Sector Groups,
ADB

Date: 26 August 2024

Endorsed by:

Division Director:

For Projects that have conducted Midterm Review Mission (from 1 July 2023 to 30 June 2024)**IV. Midterm Review**

The MOU of the Midterm Review Mission is attached.

Midterm Project Ratings:

Development Objective Rating at MTR (IP): Satisfactory (S)

Implementation Progress Rating at MTR (DO): Moderately Satisfactory (MS),

Risk Rating at MTR: Modest Risk (M)

Information on Progress, challenges and outcomes on stakeholder engagement

Please refer to Stakeholder Engagement section above

Information on Progress on gender-responsive measures as documented at CEO Endorsement/Approval in the gender action plan or equivalent

Please refer to Gender Action Plan Implementation section (c) above

Knowledge activities/ products (based on the Knowledge management approach approved at CEO Endorsement / Approval) and lessons learned (if available)

Please refer to the Knowledge activities section above

Main Findings of the MTR

Among the four TA Outputs, Outputs 1 and 4 are dedicated to MONRE for implementation and management, while Outputs 2 and 3 are administered by ADB. The Project's Executing Agency is the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment of Viet Nam (MONRE) The TA was delegated to the GOV so this will improve the policy ownership

It is estimated that there will be around USD\$500,000 savings from the equipment procurement portion under Output 2 due to the potential cancellation of all demonstration projects (due to the lengthy approvals process). This amount will be allocated to support other activities such as developing a flood model (for a new flood mitigation project in Binh Duong, for example).

Change of scope to Output 2. The TA paper indicates that Output 2 "will provide direct technical support to the project implementing agencies and their project management units in Ha Giang, Hue, and Vinh Yen". ADB team has processed a Memo which was approved in March 2024 to expand the scope of Output 2 to include a new component "(vii): develop and prepare green and climate urban investment projects in other cities".

Core Indicators:

The tracking tools for GEF 6 Climate Change Adaptation and Mitigation Projects are used to determine the projects contribution in terms of GEB. The TA team recognizes the importance of these tools in justifying the project effort, providing a quantitative measure of the project's contribution to the Global Environmental Benefit (GEB). A limitation of this approach is that the project will not only have direct positive quantifiable benefits, through its catalytic role, the project will also have indirect benefits that are not quantifiable through the tools.

Under the GEF adaptation tracking tool, there are three adaptation objectives under GEF 6:

- Reducing the vulnerability of people, livelihoods, physical assets and natural systems to the adverse effects of climate change;
- Strengthening institutional and technical capacities for effective climate change adaptation; and
- Integrating climate change adaptation into relevant policies, plans and associated processes.

Output 2 and QCBS package indicators are applied across these objectives. While all the indicators are significant, the TA team is aware that the tracking tool was reconfigured somewhat under GEF7, with a streamlined set of indicators. Based on this knowledge, the GEB indicators for the adaptation tool are presented in Annex 1 for TA Output 2 and **Annex 2 for MONRE administered 17 packages.**

The overall objective of the TA project is to strengthen institutional capacity for environmental protection and climate resilience for green development of secondary cities in Vietnam so the likelihood that the TA would achieve GEF outcome and impact from DMF and the development objectives was accessed, i.e., GEF/ DMF outcome 1.1: integrated resilient planning in 3 cities; DMF outcome 2.1: demonstrating prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments; DMF outcome 3.1: strengthened enabling institutional environment and DMF outcome 1.2: replicating integrated and resilient planning in 6 cities. Under TA Output 2, the Global Environmental Benefits (GEB) focal areas include 2 areas, namely (i) biodiversity and (ii) climate change. The GEB assessment report was prepared by the consulting firm ICEM and submitted to ADB in February 2024. Under TA Output 2, 14 GEB indicators were developed.

Under TA Output 1 and 4, GEB focal areas include 3 areas, namely (i) biodiversity, (ii) climate change, and (iii) waste and chemical. 20 GEB indicators were developed to suit each package and contributions to GEF/DMF outcome. These 20 Indicators were discussed at the mid-term review meeting and likelihood to achieve GEB outcome and DMF impacts. Specifically, these following indicators were reviewed and will be assessed by MONRE administered technical packages.



Signature:

Name of Project Officer: Alexander David Nash

Position: Senior Urban Development Specialist

Water and Urban Development Sector Office, Sector Groups, ADB

Date: 26 August 2024

Endorsed by:

Division Director

VI. Materialized Cofinancing

Co-financing Table

(For projects which underwent a mid-term review/evaluation or terminal evaluation in FY)

Materialized Co-financing [Please refer to the CEO ENDORSEMENT DOCUMENT for the planned co-financing amounts]

Sources of Co-financing ⁶	Name of Co-financer	Type of Co-financing ⁷	Amount Confirmed at CEO endorsement / approval	Actual Amount Materialized at Midterm	Actual Amount Materialized at Closing
ID6924					
Recipient Government	GOV of Viet Nam	Grants	15,797,100		
GEF Agency	ADB (loan)	Loans	56,100,000		
	ADB (UCCRTF)	Loans	6,000,000		
		TOTAL	77.897.100		
ID9484					
Recipient Government	GOV of Viet Nam	Grants	32,072,900		
GEF Agency	ADB (loan)	Loans	113,900,000		
GEF Agency	ADB (CDTA)	Grants	32,072,900		
		TOTAL	148,472,900		

Explain "Other Sources of Co-financing":

Signature:



Name of Project Officer: Alexander David Nash

Position: Senior Urban Development Specialist

Water and Urban Development Sector Office, Sector Groups, ADB

Date: 26 August 2024

Endorsed by:

Division Director

⁶ Sources of Co-financing may include: Bilateral Aid Agency(ies), Foundation, GEF Agency, Local Government, National Government, Civil Society Organization, Other Multi-lateral Agency(ies), Private Sector, Other

⁷ Type of Co-financing may include: Grant, Soft Loan, Hard Loan, Guarantee, In-Kind, Other

ANNEX B. Project Contacts

ADB Project Officer : Alexander David Nash
Division and Department : Senior Urban Development Specialist
Water and Urban Development Sector Office, Sector Groups, ADB
Email : anash@adb.org

TA9417-VIE

EA Project Officer :Mr. Le Hoai Nam, National Deputy Director/Deputy Director
General
Name and Agency : Pollution Control Department, Ministry of Natural Resources and
Environment
Email : lenamnew@yahoo.com

Grant 0549-VIE

EA Project Officer : Mrs. Dao Thi Lan Anh
Name and Agency : Project Director, Program Coordination Office of Commodity -
Oriented Poverty Reduction Program, Ha Giang province
Email : lanahdppr@gmail.com

ANNEX C: DEFINITION OF RATINGS

Implementation Progress Ratings

Highly Satisfactory (HS): Implementation of **all** components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised implementation plan for the project. The project can be presented as “good practice”.

Satisfactory (S): Implementation of **most** components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan except for only a few that is subject to remedial action.

Moderately Satisfactory (MS): Implementation of **some** components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with **some** components requiring remedial action.

Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU): Implementation of **some** components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with **most** components requiring remedial action..

Unsatisfactory (U): Implementation of **most** components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan.

Highly Unsatisfactory (HU): Implementation of **none** of the components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan.

Global Environment Objective/Development Objective Ratings

Highly Satisfactory (HS): Project is expected to achieve or exceed **all** its major global environmental objectives, and yield substantial global environmental benefits, without major shortcomings. The project can be presented as “good practice”.

Satisfactory (S): Project is expected to achieve **most** of its major global environmental objectives, and yield satisfactory global environmental benefits, with only minor shortcomings.

Moderately Satisfactory (MS): Project is expected to achieve **most** of its major relevant objectives but with either significant shortcomings or modest overall relevance. Project is expected not to achieve **some** of its major global environmental objectives or yield some of the expected global environment benefits.

Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU): Project is expected to achieve of its major global environmental objectives with major shortcomings or is expected to achieve only **some** of its major global environmental objectives.

Unsatisfactory (U): Project is expected **not** to achieve **most** of its major global environment objectives or to yield any satisfactory global environmental benefits.

Highly Unsatisfactory (HU): The project has failed to achieve, and is not expected to achieve, **any** of its major global environment objectives with no worthwhile benefits.

Risk Rating

Risk ratings will assess the overall risk of factors internal or external to the project which may affect implementation or prospects for achieving project objectives. Risks of projects should be rated on the following scale:

High Risk (H): There is a probability of greater than 75% that assumptions may fail to hold or materialize, and/or the project may face high risks.

Substantial Risk (S): There is a probability of between 51% and 75% that assumptions may fail to hold and/or the project may face substantial risks.

Modest Risk (M): There is a probability of between 26% and 50% that assumptions may fail to hold or materialize, and/ or the project may face only modest risks.

Low Risk (L): There is a probability of up to 25% that assumptions may fail to hold or materialize, and/ or the project may face only modest risks.

Annex 1

GEF Project Implementation Review

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
1. Strengthened city planning processes.	Outcome 1.1: Integrated, resilient planning in 3 cities	Output 1 & 2	Update the CVA method and transfer to MONRE for reference	Completed the updated methodology and provided one introductory meeting to MONRE and the city PMUs. Draft reports were shared with MONRE PMU.	<p>MONRE will use the updated CVA method to inform the updates to the national guidelines for CVA.</p> <p>During Mission II⁸ the TA team presented in Hanoi the CVA methodology to MONRE 6pp (2 females).</p> <p>During Mission II the TA team presented the CVA methodology to three cities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hue to DONRE 2pp (1 female) and Steering Committee for Disaster Prevention and Rescue 4 pp (2 females) • Vin Yen to PMU 4 pp (1 female) and MONRE 1 pp. • Ha Giang not been presented as yet. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 10 officials from 3 PMUs will be trained. • 7 technical officials from MONRE • 30 technical officials that indirectly increased their knowledge of the project from relevant departments (DONRE, DARD, DoC, City offices) will increase their knowledge of climate change threats, the level of vulnerable to climate change in each city. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of direct beneficiaries (individuals, group of people, organization) affected by the TA Output.
					<p>During Mission III⁹ TA team delivered the event “E9: National technical meeting on standardizing vulnerability</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 32 officials from 2 PMUs from the 2 cities were trained. • 6 technical officials from 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of direct beneficiaries

⁸ Mission II held on April 2022.

⁹ Mission III held in September 2022

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
					<p>assessment methodologies related to CVA methodology to MONRE 6pp (4 females).</p> <p>During Mission III¹⁰ the TA team delivered the “E9: National technical meeting on standardizing vulnerability assessment methodologies“ to three cities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • At Hue to 24pp: MONRE 7pp (4 females), PMU 4pp (1 female), DONRE 2pp (1 female) and Steering Committee for Disaster Prevention and Rescue 4 pp (2 females) and other departments 7 pps (3 females) • At Vinh Yen to PMU 4 pp (1 female) and MONRE 1 pp and other department 3pp. <p>Ha Giang not presented as yet.</p>	<p>MONRE;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 28 technical officials that indirectly increased their knowledge of the project for climate change threats and vulnerability in each city from relevant departments (DONRE, DARD, DoC, City offices) . 	<p>(individuals, group of people, organization) affected by the TA Output.</p>
					<p>In July 2023, three Climate Vulnerability Assessments were delivered for Hue, Vinh Yen and Ha Giang.</p>	<p>Hue CVA Covered Area:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Population: 56% • Built-Up: 87.12% • Infrastructure: 34.14% <p>Ha Giang CVA Covered Area:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Population: 7.38% • Built-Up: 10.63% 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduction in vulnerability to climate threats for people, buildings

¹⁰ Mission III held on September 2022

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
						<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Infrastructure:34.92% Vinh Yen CVA Covered Area: • Population: 75.08% • Built-Up: 85.65% • Infrastructure: 11.93% 	and infrastructure (e.g., estimated percentage of population that will benefit from CVA, estimated land area in km2 that will be covered by CVA).
					<p>During Mission V¹¹ the TA team delivered participatory mapping workshops and consultations in the three cities (“E17: Consultations on hotspot zones for climate vulnerability assessments”).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In Hue: 25 participants • In Vinh Yen: 18 participants • In Ha Giang: 25 participants 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 18 technical officials from provincial and city level were trained on hazard hotspot mapping and climate threats assessments. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of direct beneficiaries (individuals, group of people, organization) affected by the TA Output.
2.Demonstrating low impact	Outcome 2.1: Demonstratin	Output 1,2,4	Review and suggest the	Greening process, materials, and	During Mission II the TA team presented the findings from the	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 32 technical staff of PMUs in 3 cities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of direct

¹¹ Mission V held March 2023

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
and climate resilient development.	g prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments		greening technics to current ADB's investment contract packages in 1 city.	dissemination of technical manual (Report on Output 2.1) prepared under the TA and later disseminated. Recommendations for greening and increasing the resilience of the design and procurement of Secondary City Development Program project investments for Ha Giang, developed.	technical manual (Report on Output 2.1) to three cities including technical sessions E4 and E5: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hue: presented the findings from the technical manual to PMU 2pp and technical session E4&E5¹² to 5pp from different departments, 1pp (female) from the Department of environment, 2pp from the contractors. • Vinh Yen: presented the findings from technical manual and technical session E4&E5¹³ to 10pp (3 females) people from PMU and representatives from department of construction. Ha Giang: the technical session was converted to share and disseminate the technical materials with PMU in Ha Giang, 5 departments and 12 pp (tentatively).	• 2 technical staff from 1 contractor.	beneficiaries (individuals, group of people and organization) affected by the TA Output.
			Review of national technical	Review, development of new ten TCVN	During Mission II the TA team presented the findings from the review of 11 TCVNs, and the	• Eleven TCVA reviewed and upgraded.	• Number of standards or

¹² Introduction to climate change adaptation solutions and greening of urban infrastructure. Swapped with exchange materials and documentation.

¹³ Introduction to climate change adaptation solutions and greening of urban infrastructure. Swapped with exchange materials and documentation.

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
			standards TCVNs and QTCVs and development of new green standards and cost database for WSUD and Bioengineering solutions to riverbank restoration	prepared in Report on Output 2.1. Development of a unit cost database, cost norms/unit price: new cost norms/unit price for applying green adaptation solutions prepared and disseminated.	draft of 10 New Green Upgraded TCVNs to 2pp (1 female) During Mission IV ¹⁴ the TA team delivered the event “E6: National technical meeting: environmentally sustainable approaches in national standards”.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 26 participants from National Institutions, PMU MONRE PMU were trained. • 17 participants from Hanoi Technical Organizations and Institutions; 3pp from MONRE PMU; and 3pp from PMUs. 	<p>regulations upgraded (number).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of direct beneficiaries (individuals, groups of people, organization) affected by the TA Output.

⁸ Mission IV delivered on December 2022.

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
			Identify, prepare, and design additional demonstration projects (risk reduction and climate change adaptation) and identify suitable technology demonstrate for three cities in Ha Giang, Hue and Vinh Yen.	A portfolio of seven demonstration projects at the concept stage was identified and developed.	<p>In Mission I, TA team discussed and conducted transect walks through the demonstration’s projects in three cities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hue: Transect walks with the PMU 2pp and City Government 1 pp. • Vinh Yen: Transect walks with the PMU 2pp. • Ha Giang: Transect walks with the PMU 1 pp. <p>During Mission II, the TA team discussed and conducted transect walks through the demonstration’s projects in three cities:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hue: The TA team provided transect walks with the PMU 1pp and presented the demonstration projects to City Government 4 pp. • Vinh Yen - The TA team provided transect walks with the PMU 4pp (1 female) and Ward 2pp. • Ha Giang: TA team presented demonstration projects to 6pp (3 females). The TA team provided transect walks to 3 pp from PMU (1 female). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 6 officials from 3 PMUs were trained. • 20 officials from 3 PMUs were trained. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of direct beneficiaries (individuals, group of people, organization) affected by the TA Output.

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
				<p>Presentation of concept designs to the stakeholders for their feedback</p>	<p>During Mission III the TA team delivered the event “E7: City level technical sessions: finalization of adaptation investment projects and commence procurement”. During the mission the Team presented the Technical Sheet with an initial concept design for the three sites:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hue: The TA team presented the Technical Sheet with the concept design to 3pp PMU and 1pp from Department of Planning; • Vinh Yen: The TA team presented the Technical Sheet with the concept design to 7pp PMU; 2 pp from City committee • Ha Giang: The TA team presented the Technical Sheet with the concept design to 2pp PMU; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 15 technical officials from relevant departments of 3 cities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of direct beneficiaries (individuals, group of people, organization) affected by the TA Output.
				<p>Detail Engineering Design for Hue and Vinh Yen</p>	<p>This SOW includes the detailed engineering design (DED) Center. The three demonstration projects include Hue (Park at Trinh Cong Son Park), and Vinh Yen (Green Park near the Vinh Phúc High School).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A population that is located in a flood-prone area and will indirectly benefit from our project. • Hue: 276.160 pp • Vinh Yen 11.331 pp 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of people benefitting from the NbS (estimated number of population)
						<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hue 2.0 ha 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Land area

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
						<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vinh Yen 4.1 ha 	converted through the three demonstration projects (ha)
						<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hue 2.0 ha • Vinh Yen 4.1 ha 	• Green space increase (% or m ²) by the three demonstration projects.
						<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hue: 687,100m³ • Vinh Yen: 1,408,550m³ 	• Reduction in urban flooding in areas around project sites (Amount of storm water runoff collected and treated) for 1-year return period
				Three concept designs with preliminary engineering and cost estimate for Ha	Three concept designs for Ha Giang at: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • HG1 – NbS Embankment on Lo River, near Yen Bien 2 Bridge • HG2 - Nbs Embankment & WSUD 	A population that is located in a landslide prone area will indirectly benefit from our project. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ha Giang: 4.240 pp 	• Number of people benefitting from the NbS (estimated number of

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
				Giang	near Me Bridge • HG3 – NbS Embankment along Me Stream West Bank	Ha Giang: 1.2ha	• Land area converted through the three demonstration projects (ha)
						Ha Giang: 1.2ha	• Green space increase (% or m ²) by the demonstration projects.
			Identify, prepare, and design additional demonstration projects (risk reduction and climate change adaptation) and identify suitable technology demonstrate for Hanoi University of Civil Engineering (HUCE)	Detailed Engineering Design, Procurement and Construction of an NbS training hub and resilient and innovation learning hub in HUCE C4.	The green upgrade of the campus aims to validate WSUD tools by transforming an underutilized public space due to degradation, flood and urban heat into an educational and training center.	• A population that is located in a flood-prone area and will directly benefit from our project • Number of students and lecturers in HUCE = 22,100	• Number of people benefitting from the NbS (estimated number of population)
						• HUCE C4 = 0.12ha	• Land area converted through the three demonstration projects (ha)
						• HUCE C4 green area = 460m ²	• Green space increase (%)

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
							or m ²)
						<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • HUCE C4 = 42,000m³ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reduction in urban flooding in areas around project sites (Amount of storm water runoff collected and treated) for 1-year return period
			Build the economic case for nature-based solutions.	Cost-benefit Analysis: Hue Baseline Report	During Mission II the TA team conducted the Hue baseline survey.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 5 people from Vietnam Environmental Economics Institute in Hue (VEEI in Hue) were trained to introduce the questionnaire and guide to conduct Hue HHs baseline survey. • 3 officers in wards were trained by VEEI to support the team of interviewers in conducting baseline surveys in 5 wards; • 400 Households living around 5 pond renovation projects including areas where NbS and grey pond upgrading are going to take 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Number of NbS projects evaluated using CBA • Number of direct beneficiaries (individuals, groups of people, organization) affected by the TA Output.

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
						place.	
				Policy brief on enablers and barriers to NbS in Vietnam's Cities.	In June 2023, the TA team conducted an interview to assess key barriers and opportunities to implement nature-based solutions in Vietnam's cities.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 10 people were interviewed and classified into three groups of stakeholders: • 2 Policymakers • 4 Research Institution/ University/ Designers • 4 Practitioners (PMUs, urban/cities developers in public and private sectors) 	• Number of direct beneficiaries (individuals, group of people, organization) affected by the TA Output.
	Outcome 2.2: Demonstrating an integrated package of investments that lead to transition to low impact, low carbon development in Ha Giang city	GEF Grant 0549 VIE Street Lighting Grant for Ha Giang	No relevance to TA Output 2 tasks				
	Outcome 2.3: Demonstrating community-based and insurance-based resilience	Output 3 - UCCRTF	No relevance to TA tasks				
3. Improved enabling	Outcome 3.1: Strengthened	Output 1,2,4	VEA CQS Consultant, 15	Update progress	The project will strengthen the institutional environment:	• 254 technical staff reached by training and capacity	• Number of staff reached

GEF Endorsement Project Components	GEF Outcome	TA Output	Role of TA	Progress (Until 30 June 2024)	Impact Narrative (To date)	Beneficiaries (End of the project)	Indicator
environment for upscaling integrated, resilient approaches.	enabling institutional environment		Output 2 Consultant, ADB M&E Consultant: Contribution from TA team to strengthened enabling institutional environment		supporting the development of policies by strengthening technical capacity to MOC, MONRE, Department of Planning, Department of Construction, DONRE; easing the use of NbS by contractors; and favoring the use of NbS by private owner.	development. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One policy review on NbS developed. • 3 NbS projects implemented 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • by training and capacity development (number) • Number of policies developed (number) • Number of NbS projects implemented (number)
				Student training and design competition for a green, resilient and innovative learning hub in Hanoi University of Civil Engineering (Jul 2023)	HUCE, a prestigious Vietnamese institute founded in 1966, has groomed urban planners, architects, and engineers for Ministries such as MOC and private sectors. This competition built a foundation of knowledge and experience on Nature-based Solutions and sustainable development for future practitioners and policymakers.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 31 students (9 females) participated in the training and design competition 	

Annex 2

DELIVERABLES, M&E INDICATORS AND GEB INDICATORS OF MONRE ADMINISTERED 17 TA PACKAGES

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
1	TA9417-VEA QCBS-01			
	Develop legal documents guiding the implementation of the Environmental Protection Law 2020 related to environmental protection and climate change response for developing secondary green cities in Vietnam	<i>I. Deliverables under Task 1</i>	1. The technical guidelines for assessing the quality and load capacity of the surface water environment for rivers and lakes is developed	Number of drafts on environmental protection policy documents for Outcome 1.1. Integrated, resilient planning in cities.
		1.1. Comprehensive report that synthesizes and analyzes both domestic and international experiences pertaining to the assessment of water quality, load-carrying capacity, and the strategic management of surface water in rivers and lakes.	2. The draft for environmental quality management plan of surface water of rivers and lakes in the selected secondary city is developed	
		1.2. Draft Guidelines for the evaluation of the quality and load-carrying capacity of aquatic environments in rivers and lakes	3. The draft National Plan for Air Quality Management of secondary cities to implement Articles 13 and 14 of the Law on Environmental Protection in 2020 to be developed	
		1.3. Draft Technical Guidelines for planning the management of environmental surface water quality in rivers and lakes.	4. The draft Technical guidelines for the implementation of Articles 15 to 19 of the Law on Environmental Protection in 2020 on land environmental quality	
		1.4. Minutes of meetings, workshops, and a summary table of feedback for the above draft guidelines.		
<i>II. Deliverables under Task 2</i>				
2.1. Report on the assessment of water quality and load carrying capacity for the aquatic environment of surface water in				

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>rivers and lakes in one urban area within the project scope.</p> <p>2.2. Draft plan for managing the environmental water quality in rivers and lakes in one urban area within the project scope.</p> <p>2.3. Draft amended Technical Guidelines for planning the management of environmental water quality for rivers and lakes after implementing the pilot in one urban area, along with the submission dossier to the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment.</p> <p>2.4. Minutes of meetings, workshops, and a summary table of feedback for the draft plan.</p> <p>III. Deliverables under Task 3</p> <p>3.1. Comprehensive report analyzing domestic and international experiences related to planning the management of air quality.</p> <p>3.2. Comprehensive report on the results of the investigation, survey, and assessment of the current air quality in Vietnam.</p> <p>3.3. Draft National Plan for air quality management along with the submission dossier to the Prime Minister.</p>	<p>management in secondary cities is developed</p> <p>5. The guidance for implementing Article 69 of the Law on Environmental Protection 2020 on environmental protection for persistent pollutants and raw materials, fuels, materials, products, goods and equipment containing persistent pollutants in secondary cities is developed.</p>	

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>3.4. Report on the results of meetings and workshops gathering expert opinions on the draft plan.</p> <p><i>IV. Deliverables under Task 4</i></p> <p>4.1. Comprehensive report analyzing domestic and international experiences related to assessing soil environmental quality in areas contaminated with hazardous chemicals that are difficult to degrade.</p> <p>4.2. Draft Technical Guidelines for investigating, assessing, and implementing the process of the treatment, enhancement, and restoration of soil environments for cases where the organizations or individuals causing pollution are identified, and for cases where pollution is historical or the responsible organizations or individuals cannot be identified, along with the submission dossier to the Minister of the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment.</p> <p>4.3. Revised report assessing the efficacy of implementing the nationwide Plan for managing and preventing environmental pollution caused by plant protection chemicals, in accordance with Decision</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>No. 1946/QD-TTg dated October 21, 2010. The report puts forth a comprehensive list of pollution hotspots requiring suitable management, treatment, and rehabilitation measures aligned with land use objectives, along with the submission dossier to the Prime Minister.</p> <p>4.4. Minutes of meetings, workshops, and a summary table of feedback for the above drafts.</p> <p><i>V. Deliverables under Task 5</i></p> <p>5.1. Report assessing the current situation of import, production, business, use, and sources of pollutants, along with raw materials, fuels, materials, products, goods, and equipment containing persistent organic pollutants (POPs), according to the requirements of the Stockholm Convention and the specific circumstances prevailing in Vietnam.</p> <p>5.2. Draft Technical Guidelines evaluating the appropriateness and verifying the presence of persistent organic pollutants in raw materials, fuels, materials, products, goods, and equipment, along with the submission dossier to the</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>Minister of the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment.</p> <p>5.3. Minutes of meetings, workshops, and a summary table of feedback for the above Technical Guidelines.</p> <p>VI. General deliverables</p> <p>6.1. Inception report, including a detailed plan for implementing the package.</p> <p>6.2. Comprehensive report summarizing the package, including all minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and summary tables of stakeholder opinions for each product.</p>		
2	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-02</p> <p>Review and revise national technical standards on environment quality.</p>	<p>I. Deliverables under Task 1</p> <p>1.1. Comprehensive report conducting a comprehensive review, scrutiny, analysis, and evaluation of gaps and deficiencies within national standards and regulations pertaining to environmental quality, and relevant international experiences.</p> <p>1.2. Report on the investigation and assessment of the current application of three Vietnamese standards on environmental quality (QCVN) and including the outcomes of sampling and</p>	<p>1. 03 QCVN on environmental quality to help protect human health and improve the quality of urban environment are developed</p> <p>2. 06 QCVN regulations on the limits of PTS in materials/products are developed</p> <p>3. The QCVN, TCVN system on environment for motor vehicle</p>	<p>Number of drafts on Vietnamese environmental standards/technical regulations (TCVN/QCVN) for Outcome 1.1. Integrated, resilient planning in cities.</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>analysis conducted on pertinent environmental parameters.</p> <p>1.3. Three draft QCVN on environmental quality: i) Noise, ii) Vibration, iii) Sediment quality.</p> <p>1.4. Draft submission documents for competent authority review for three QCVN on environmental quality.</p> <p>1.5. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of written opinions from relevant stakeholders for the three QCVN on environmental quality.</p> <p>II. Deliverables under Task 2</p> <p>2.1. Comprehensive report analyzing documents, national and international standards and technical regulations related to persistent organic pollutants in: i) Fast food packaging, ii) Kitchen utensils, iii) Plastic products, iv) Textile products, v) Fire-resistant materials, vi) Foam/fire extinguishing powder products</p>	<p>emissions on roadways and application roadmap are developed</p> <p>4. The set of criteria for assessment of green city is developed</p> <p>5. Guidelines on the application of new TCVN, QCVN on environment issued by MONRE in 2021 to be developed</p> <p>6. 75 officials, at least 33% females, in 03 project provinces are enhanced their capacity for application new TCVN, QCVN.</p>	

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>2.2. Report on the results of sampling and analyzing persistent organic pollutants and assessing the impact of six draft QCVN limiting these pollutants in:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) Fast food packaging, ii) Kitchen utensils, iii) Plastic products, iv) Textile products, v) Fire-resistant materials, vi) Foam/fire extinguishing powder products. <p>2.3. Six drafts of QCVN limiting persistent organic pollutants in:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) Fast food packaging, ii) Kitchen utensils, iii) Plastic products, iv) Textile products, v) Fire-resistant materials, vi) Foam/fire extinguishing powder products. <p>2.4. Draft submission documents for competent authority review for six QCVN limiting persistent organic pollutants.</p> <p>2.5. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of written opinions from relevant</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>stakeholders for the six QCVN limiting persistent organic pollutants.</p> <p>III. Deliverables under Task 3</p> <p>3.1. Report reviewing, analyzing, and evaluating the system of national and international standards on environmental aspects of road motor vehicle emissions in Vietnam.</p> <p>3.2. Draft report to the Prime Minister assessing the effectiveness of the roadmap for implementing national technical standards on road motor vehicle emissions, encompassing manufactured, assembled, imported cars, and motorcycles produced, assembled, or imported in Vietnam</p> <p>3.3. Report on the results of sampling and analyzing a draft of national environmental standards for road motor vehicle emissions and an associated application roadmap, specifically tailored for motorcycles currently in circulation in Vietnam</p> <p>3.4. Draft submission documents for competent authority review for national environmental standards on road motor vehicle emissions and the application roadmap.</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>3.5. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of written opinions from relevant stakeholders for the national standards on environmental quality for road motor vehicle emissions.</p> <p><i>IV. Deliverables under Task 4</i></p> <p>4.1. Comprehensive report analyzing domestic and international documents on criteria for the assessment of green cities.</p> <p>4.2. Draft criteria for assessing green cities: i) Criteria related to environmental protection/environmental quality, ii) Criteria related to climate change adaptation.</p> <p>4.3. Draft submission documents for competent authority review for the criteria for assessing green cities.</p> <p>4.4. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of written opinions from relevant stakeholders for the criteria for assessing green cities.</p> <p><i>V. Deliverables under Task 5</i></p> <p>5.1. Guidelines for applying the QCVN on environmental quality issued in 2021.</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>5.2. Report on the training results and guidelines for applying the QCVN in three project provinces.</p> <p>VI. General products</p> <p>6.1. Inception report, including a detailed plan, approach methods, and organizational procedures for implementing the package.</p> <p>6.2. Comprehensive report summarizing the package, including all minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, summary tables of stakeholder opinions for each product, and a complete survey questionnaire, collected information/documents from localities.</p>		
3	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-03</p> <p>Review and revise/develop policies on sustainable consumption, environmentally friendly production and climate change adaptation for</p>	<p>I. Deliverables under Task 1</p> <p>1.1. Report on the current status of preferential tax/fee/subsidy policies for environmentally friendly products and services certified with the Vietnam eco-label.</p> <p>1.2. Report proposing groups of mechanisms, for tax/fee/subsidy incentives policies for environmentally friendly products certified with the</p>	<p>1. Incentive policies to support environmentally friendly products via ecolabels is developed and pilot applied in transportation services and products.</p> <p>2. The draft technical guideline on ecolabels for transport services and products is developed and issued by MONRE</p>	<p>Number of draft on sustainable production and consumption policies for Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
	developing secondary green cities in Vietnam.	<p>Vietnam eco-label to be submitted to the Ministry of Finance.</p> <p>II. Deliverables under Task 2</p> <p>2.1. Draft criteria for the eco-label and certification procedures for environmentally friendly urban transportation products and services.</p> <p>2.2. Report on the results of the pilot with four selected transportation service and product providers.</p> <p>2.3. Report evaluating the effectiveness of the incentive policies for certified eco-labeled transportation products and services and proposing adjustments and improvements to these policies.</p> <p>III. Deliverables under Task 3</p> <p>3.1. Draft technical guidelines submitted to the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment for issuing the eco-label for transportation products and services.</p> <p>IV. Deliverables under Task 4</p> <p>4.1. Research report on the current situation of Vietnam's policies and laws on green procurement.</p> <p>4.2. Report proposing content on green procurement, and environmentally friendly procurement specified in the</p>	<p>3. Guidelines on content on green public procurement for the implementation of the Environmental Protection Law 2020 is developed</p> <p>4. Policy recommendations is prepared for the adjustment of related documents under auspices of Ministry of Finance and Ministry of Planning and Investment</p>	

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>guidance documents of the Environmental Protection Law.</p> <p>4.3. Report recommending content amendments in relevant legal documents (Asset Management Law, Bidding Law, etc.) to encourage green public procurement.</p> <p>V. General deliverables</p> <p>5.1. Inception report, including a detailed plan for implementing the package.</p> <p>5.2. Comprehensive report on the package, including all minutes of technical meetings and consultation workshops, summary tables of opinions from stakeholders for each product, and a complete survey questionnaire, collected information/documents from localities.</p>		
4	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-04</p> <p>Develop the eco-label criteria, pilot and finalize the certification process for 05 products, carrying out the solutions</p>	<p>I. Deliverables under Task 1</p> <p>1.1. Report reviewing legal documents on the process, procedures for evaluating, and certifying eco-labels for environmentally friendly products and services. Propose a process, procedures for evaluating and certifying eco-labels</p>	<p>1. Technical guideline for ecolabel certification processes and procedures for groups of environmentally friendly products and services in accordance with the LEP 2020 is developed</p>	<p>1. Number of draft eco-label criteria for Outcome 1.1. Integrated, resilient planning in cities.</p> <p>2. Number of beneficiaries/land</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
	<p>on circular economy, sustainable/environment friendly production and consumption in the secondary cities.</p>	<p>suitable for the 2020 Environmental Protection Law.</p> <p>1.2. Technical guidance documents for evaluating and certifying the Vietnam Eco-label for some environmentally friendly product and service groups, in accordance with the 2020 Environmental Protection Law and practical conditions.</p> <p>1.3. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of opinions from relevant stakeholders on the guidance documents for evaluating and certifying the Vietnam Eco-label.</p> <p>II. Deliverables under Task 2</p> <p>2.1. Report on the research status of the implementation process of evaluating, recognizing, and issuing eco-labels for products that meet the 17 criteria of the Vietnam Green Label.</p> <p>2.2. Draft amendments to the 17 criteria of the Vietnam Green Label.</p> <p>2.3. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of opinions from relevant stakeholders on the above 17 criteria.</p> <p>III. Deliverables under Task 3</p>	<p>2. The draft decision for the issuance of 17 revised sets of Vietnam green label criteria is submitted to MONRE</p> <p>3. The draft of at least 05 new sets of eco-label criteria for environmentally friendly products to submit to MONRE is developed and pilot applied for at least 05 new products, services.</p> <p>4. Technologies for recycling/circulating urban waste into more environmentally friendly products is proposed and pilot applied in 03 selected cities and recommendations is made for application for other cities.</p>	<p>area improved through the application of waste recycling technology for Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>3.1. Draft at least 05 sets of eco-label criteria for environmentally friendly products presented to the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment.</p> <p>3.2. Consultancy report on improving production technology, supporting waste treatment/recycling equipment to ensure product quality and environmental protection, in line with the eco-label criteria.</p> <p>3.3. Assessment files, proposals for eco-label certification for test products, and a report on the results of the new eco-label certification evaluation process suitable for the 2020 Environmental Protection Law.</p> <p>3.4. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of opinions from relevant stakeholders on the 05 draft criteria sets.</p> <p>IV. Deliverables under Task 4</p> <p>4.1. Comprehensive report reviewing and analyzing domestic documents on advanced technologies for recycling waste into environmentally friendly products.</p> <p>4.2. Report on the results of investigating the current situation of waste generation</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>and recycling capabilities in 3 selected project cities.</p> <p>4.3. Report proposing the application of waste recycling technologies for more environmentally friendly products and replication in other urban areas.</p> <p>4.4. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of opinions from relevant stakeholders on technology and products.</p> <p>V. Deliverables under Task 5</p> <p>5.1. Promotion program scenario supporting consumer consumption of eco-label certified recycled products in project cities.</p> <p>5.2. Report on the results of implementing the promotion program.</p> <p>5.3. Program, plan, and method of implementing the supply-demand connection channel for eco-label certified products.</p> <p>5.4. Report summarizing the experience of implementing the supply-demand connection channel for eco-label certified products.</p> <p>VI. General deliverables</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>6.1. Inception report, including a detailed plan, approach, and implementation of the package.</p> <p>6.2. Comprehensive report of the package, including all minutes of technical meetings and consultation workshops, a summary table of opinions from stakeholders for each product, and all survey sheets, surveys, and information/documents collected at the local level</p>		
5	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-05</p> <p>Enhancing management capacity and experience sharing on environment, land-use and climate resilience for MONRE officials.</p>		<p>1. 100 officials of MONRE, MOC, MPI, provincial DONREs, DOCs, DPIs, and 100 journalists from central and local media agencies of three project cities (Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen), with at least 33% females, are enhanced their capacity on environment, land-use and capacity on climate change resilience</p> <p>2. A website is developed for sharing communication materials and training purpose..</p>	<p>Number of beneficiaries and the proportion of women with enhanced capacity in environment, land use and climate resilience for Outcome 3.1 Strengthened enabling institutional environment.</p>
6	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-06</p>			

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
	<p>Support to develop the environmental monitoring program, set up mechanisms for managing, information sharing environmental Database among Ministries, line agencies and local Government related project cities, pilot the environmental Program in at least 01 project city</p> <p>Time: From the date of contract sign to 31/12/2023 (maximum 24 months base on the project extension).</p>	<p>I. Deliverables under Task 1</p> <p>1.1. Report assessing the current state of the environmental monitoring system and capacity at the central and local levels.</p> <p>1.2. Technical guidance documents on the criteria for designing a national and local environmental quality monitoring network (including water, air, and soil components).</p> <p>1.3. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of opinions from relevant stakeholders on the technical guidelines.</p> <p>II. Deliverables under Task 2</p> <p>2.1. General technical guidelines on processing and synthesizing environmental monitoring data for national stations (at ministries, sectors, and local levels).</p> <p>2.2. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of opinions from relevant stakeholders on the technical guidelines.</p> <p>III. Deliverables under Task 3</p> <p>3.1. Report assessing the current state of the water quality monitoring network in two selected river basins.</p>	<p>1. Technical guidelines on design criteria for the national and local environmental monitoring networks is developed</p> <p>2. Technical guidelines for processing and synthesizing environmental monitoring data is developed for the monitoring stations under the management of ministry and sectoral levels to support the implementation of Circular No. 10/2021/TT- BTNMT</p> <p>3. A water quality monitoring network in two main inter-provincial rivers is designed in line with the Decision 90/QD-TTg on the master plan for national environmental monitoring.</p>	<p>Number of draft environmental monitoring technical guidelines for Outcome 1.1: Integrated, resilient planning in cities</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>3.2. Report on the design of the water quality monitoring network in 02 inter-provincial river basins to serve the update and amendment of Decision No. 90/QD-TTg on the overall planning of the national resource and environmental monitoring network and water quality monitoring database.</p> <p>3.3. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of opinions from relevant stakeholders on the technical guidelines.</p> <p>IV. Deliverables under Task 4</p> <p>4.1. Report on the results of designing a procurement network and reviewing, evaluating the current situation of environmental monitoring equipment enhancement activities according to ADB procurement regulations for the selected locality and proposing a list of supporting equipment for the selected locality.</p> <p>4.2. Report on the results of designing the environmental monitoring program network, implementing procurement, and enhancing equipment according to ADB procurement regulations, and the results of implementing the environmental monitoring program and</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>synthesizing, processing information for one locality.</p> <p>4.3. Minutes of handover and testing, relevant records related to procurement activities, equipment enhancement, and handover to the locality.</p> <p>4.4. Minutes of technical meetings, consultation workshops, and a summary table of opinions from relevant stakeholders on the technical guidelines.</p> <p>V. General deliverables</p> <p>5.1. Inception report, including a detailed plan, approach, and implementation of the package.</p> <p>5.2. Comprehensive report of the package, including all minutes of technical meetings and consultation workshops, a summary table of opinions from stakeholders for each product, and all survey sheets, surveys, and information/documents collected at the local level</p>		
7	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-07</p> <p>Update action plan (GCAP) for Hue, Vinh Yen and Ha Giang cities and</p>	<p>I. Deliverables under Task 1</p> <p>1.1. Deliveable 1.1: Report on international experience in building GCAP integrating the requirements of</p>	<p>1. 03 draft GCAPs of Ha Giang, Vinh Yen and Hue are updated for the next period (2021 - 2030)</p>	<p>1. Number of beneficiaries from the GCAP action plan of the 3 project cities</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
	Develop air quality management plan in several project cities and pilot in at least 02 project cities.	<p>environmental sanitation and climate resilience, extracting lessons learned for Vietnam.</p> <p>II. Deliverables under Task 2</p> <p>2.1. Deliverable 2.1: Report reviewing the content and investigating, surveying, analyzing, and evaluating the results of implementing GCAP in 03 cities: Ha Giang, Vinh Yen, and Hue.</p> <p>III. Deliverables under Task 3</p> <p>3.1. Deliverable 3.1: 03 draft GCAPs for Ha Giang, Vinh Yen, and Hue, updated, integrating the requirements of environmental sanitation and climate resilience for the next phase (2021 - 2030).</p> <p>IV. Deliverables under Task 4</p> <p>4.1. Deliverable 4.1: Draft Guidelines for developing GCAP integrating environmental sanitation and climate resilience requirements for type II cities in Vietnam.</p> <p>V. Deliverables under Task 5</p> <p>5.1. Deliverable: Report on the current status and management of air quality and the results of air emissions inventory in Hue and Vinh Yen.</p>	<p>2. Draft guideline for developing GCAP plans with integrating environmental protection and climate change resilience requirements is developed for secondary cities in Vietnam</p> <p>3. The air quality management plans for Hue and Vinh Yen are developed</p>	<p>of Hue, Vinh Yen, Ha Giang for Outcome 1.1: Integrated, resilient planning in cities.</p> <p>2. Land area with reduced climate vulnerability for Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments.</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>5.2. Deliverable: 02 draft Air Quality Management Plans for Hue and Vinh Yen.</p> <p>VI. General deliverables</p> <p>6.1. Deliverable: Inception report, including a detailed plan for implementing the package.</p> <p>6.2 Deliverable: Comprehensive report of the package, including all minutes of technical meetings and consultation workshops, summary tables of opinions from stakeholders for each product, and all survey sheets, surveys, and information/documents collected at the local level.</p>		
8	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-08</p> <p>Expand the planning with consideration to environmental quality improvement and management and climate change adaptation for the selected 03 secondary cities in</p>	<p>I. Deliverables under Task 1</p> <p>1.1. Report analyzing, evaluating, and proposing the selection of 3 cities in the North and North Central regions for scaling up the development of climate-resilient and environmentally friendly urban action plans (including agreements from selected localities, such as the consent letter from the Provincial People's Committee).</p> <p>II. Deliverables under Task 2</p>	<p>1. Environmental protection plans/solutions to develop green secondary cities for 03 new cities in the North and North Central regions are developed</p> <p>2. The city plans for disaster risk management and climate resilience of 03 new cities in the North and North Central regions are developed</p>	<p>1. Number of beneficiaries from the GCAP action plan of 3 cities in the South, South Central and Central Highlands for Outcome 1.2: Replicating integrated, resilient planning in six cities.</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
	the North and North Central regions	<p>2.1. Report on the survey, analysis, and evaluation of the green urban development potential of 3 selected cities.</p> <p>III. Deliverables under Task 3</p> <p>3.1. Draft regulations on the Urban Management Mechanism (UMP) for the Environment.</p> <p>3.2. Proposed viewpoints and development goals for green urban development in the selected cities.</p> <p>3.3. Plans/solutions for environmental protection to develop type II green cities for the 3 selected cities.</p> <p>IV. Deliverables under Task 4</p> <p>4.1. Report assessing climate change risks and vulnerability in the selected cities.</p> <p>4.2. Draft regulations on the Urban Management Mechanism (UMP) for Natural Disaster Prevention and Climate Adaptation.</p> <p>4.3. Urban plans for disaster risk management and climate resilience.</p> <p>V. Deliverables under Task 5</p> <p>5.1. Integrated action plan for climate-resilient and environmentally friendly urban development for the 3 selected cities.</p>	<p>3. The draft Green city action plans integrating with climate change resilience and environmental protection for 03 new cities in the North and North Central regions are developed.</p>	<p>2. \$ increased green infrastructure investment over the next 10 years for Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		5.2. Feasibility report on priority investment programs/actions for developing climate-resilient and environmentally friendly urban areas for the 3 selected cities. VI. General deliverables 6.1. Inception report.		
9	TA9417-VEA QCBS-09 Expand the planning with consideration to environmental quality improvement and management and climate change adaptation for the selected 03 secondary cities in the South and South Central regions	I. Deliverables under Task 1 1.1. Report on analyzing, evaluating, and proposing the selection of 3 cities in the South and Central South regions for scaling up the development of climate-resilient and environmentally friendly urban action plans (including agreements from selected localities, such as the consent letter from the Provincial People's Committee). II. Deliverables under Task 2 2.1. Report on the survey, analysis, and evaluation of the green urban development potential of the 3 selected cities. III. Deliverables under Task 3 3.1. Draft regulations on the Urban Management Mechanism (UMP) for the Environment.	1. Environmental protection plans/solutions to develop green secondary cities for 03 new cities in the South and South Central regions are developed 2. The city plans for disaster risk management and climate resilience of 03 new cities in the South and South Central regions are developed 3. The GCAP of 03 new cities in the South and South Central regions are developed.	1. Number of beneficiaries from the GCAP action plan of 3 cities in the South, South Central and Central Highlands for Outcome 1.2: Replicating integrated, resilient planning in six cities. 2. \$ increased green infrastructure investment over the next 10 years for Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		3.2. Proposed viewpoints and development goals for green urban development in the selected cities.		resilience of urban investments
		3.3. Plans/solutions for environmental protection to develop type II green cities for the 3 selected cities.		
		IV. Deliverables under Task 4		
		4.1. Report on assessing climate change risks and vulnerability in the selected cities.		
		4.2. Draft regulations on the Urban Management Mechanism (UMP) for Natural Disaster Prevention and Climate Adaptation.		
		4.3. Urban plans for disaster risk management and climate resilience.		
		IV. Deliverables under Task 4		
		5.1. Integrated action plan for climate-resilient and environmentally friendly urban development for the 3 selected cities.		
		5.2. Feasibility report on priority investment programs/actions for developing climate-resilient and environmentally friendly urban areas for the 3 selected cities.		
		VI. General Deliverables		
6.1. Inception report				

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
10	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-10</p> <p>Review, evaluate the results of implementing pilot model of saving, reuse & applying new technology in wastewater treatment for a population/ urban production, business and services entities in Component 1, to replicate this model in selected cities.</p>	<p><i>I. Deliverables under Task 1</i></p> <p>1.1. Report on the assessment of the current situation, management, and treatment of domestic wastewater in the surveyed cities of Hanoi, Ha Giang, Hue, and Vinh Yen. Report on the criteria for selecting advanced technologies to enhance wastewater treatment efficiency in Vietnam, criteria, and proposed selection of pilot urban areas, locations, and centralized wastewater treatment systems.</p> <p><i>II. Deliverables under Task 2</i></p> <p>2.1. Report on the current situation survey, assessment, and technological solutions at the selected site/project and technical proposal for the pilot model.</p> <p>2.2. Documentation related to equipment procurement for the pilot model</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Technical design documentation for construction installation, including technological design drawings, construction and installation service technicalities, accompanying explanations; 	<p>1. The pilot model to improve the efficiency of domestic wastewater treatment using new technologies and/or reuse and recirculate urban domestic wastewater are developed and pilot implemented</p> <p>2. 30 officials, at least 33% females, in 01 selected secondary city are enhanced their capacity on domestic wastewater treatment using new technologies</p> <p>3. The proposed mechanisms and policies to facilitate the replication of pilot model on saving, reuse & applying new technology in wastewater treatment is developed..</p>	<p>1. Number of beneficiaries from the pilot model of domestic wastewater treatment with new technology for Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of resilience of urban investments.</p> <p>2. The number of policies to replicate pilot models on saving and reuse in urban wastewater treatment for Outcome 3.1 Strengthened enabling institutional environment</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Inventory and technical specifications of the necessary equipment to upgrade the system; and - Equipment procurement tender documents. 		
		<p>III. Deliverables under Task 3</p>		
		<p>3.1. Tender/procurement documents, including, but not limited to, the signed original contract, evaluation report including analysis of corresponding proposals, and recommendations for awarding contracts to equipment suppliers.</p>		
		<p>Report on operation/trial run.</p>		
		<p>IV. Deliverables under Task 4</p>		
<p>4.1. Report on data, evaluation model, construction of evaluation model and analysis, assessment of the actual effectiveness of the pilot model, challenges, difficulties.</p>				
<p>4.2. Report on the results of implementing the pilot model (including infrastructure construction activities, equipment investment, actual operation), cost-benefit assessment; challenges regarding mechanisms,</p>				

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>policies, finances that may affect sustainability and the ability to apply, replicate the model in the future. Propose recommendations for reusing treated wastewater.</p> <p>V. Deliverables under Task 5</p> <p>5.1. Report on finalizing the model and proposing policy mechanisms to create conditions for replicating the model.</p> <p>5.2. Minutes, reports on technical meeting contents, draft opinions.</p> <p>VI. General deliverables</p> <p>6.1. Inception report, including a detailed plan for implementing the package.</p> <p>6.2. Synthesis report of the Package</p>		
11	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-11</p> <p>Pilot at least 01 advanced technology to recycle wastes into environment-friendly products in 01 city.</p>	<p>I. Deliverables under Task 1</p> <p>1.1. Report on the current status of plastic waste management in the selected city, including types of plastic waste or recycled plastic pellets that can be recycled into environmentally friendly products.</p> <p>1.2. Report on the market potential for environmentally friendly products recycled from plastic waste or recycled plastic pellets in urban areas.</p>	<p>1. The suitable technologies for increasing plastic waste recycling rates in the selected city is identified and pilot implemented</p> <p>2. A pilot business model for supporting the use of the recycled products from the pilot activity is developed</p> <p>3. A roadmap for scaling up the piloted advanced recycling</p>	<p>1. The number of beneficiaries from the pilot model of recycling plastic waste with appropriate technology for Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating prioritized strengthening of</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>II. Deliverables under Task 2</p> <p>2.1. Report on suitable advanced recycling technologies.</p> <p>III. Deliverables under Task 3</p> <p>3.1. Report on pilot preparation.</p> <p>3.2. Report on the implementation process and results of the pilot.</p> <p>IV. Deliverables under Task 4</p> <p>4.1. Report on the business model pilot plan supporting the use of recycled products.</p> <p>4.2. Report on the implementation process and results of the business model pilot supporting the use of recycled products.</p> <p>V. Deliverables under Task 5</p> <p>5.1. Feasibility study on expanding technology and business models.</p> <p>5.2. Report on the roadmap for expanding the scale of technology and business models to other cities.</p> <p>VI. General deliverables</p> <p>6.1. Inception report, including a detailed plan for implementing the package.</p> <p>6.2. Synthesis report of the Package, including all technical meeting and consultation workshop minutes, a summary of stakeholders' opinions on</p>	<p>technologies in other urban areas is developed</p>	<p>resilience of urban investments.</p> <p>2. The number of policies to replicate pilot recycling models in other cities for Outcome 3.1 Strengthened enabling institutional environment.</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		each product, and all questionnaires, surveys, information/documents collected from localities (in both English and Vietnamese).		
12	<p>TA9417-VEA QCBS-12</p> <p>Investigate and assess the level of soil pollution at 01 polluted area due to industrial production, landfill... in service of land use conversion plan; Choose to support piloting treatment and restoration of environmental in service of land use conversion.</p>	<p><i>I. Deliverables under Task 1</i></p> <p>1.1. List of relocated or closed industrial zones, clusters, factories, landfills, and points of pesticide storage historically left across the entire country.</p> <p>1.2. Preliminary investigation report on polluted areas in selected provinces, including Type II urban areas.</p> <p><i>II. Deliverables under Task 2</i></p> <p>2.1. Detailed assessment report and proposal for the treatment, rehabilitation, and environmental restoration of 01 selected area/locality.</p> <p>2.2. Report on the results of pollution treatment and rehabilitation of the area (including monitoring plans and post-treatment care).</p> <p><i>III. Deliverables under Task 3</i></p> <p>3.1. Communication program, Communication materials.</p> <p>3.2. Communication result report.</p> <p><i>IV. General deliverables</i></p>	<p>1. 01 hazardous chemicals residue contaminated area is piloting environmental treated, improved and remediated for conversion of land use purpose and is handed over to the locality.</p> <p>2. The public awareness about the contaminated area is enhanced through communication program.</p>	<p>1. The area of contaminated land piloted for treatment and land use conversion for Outcome 2.1: Demonstrating strengthening of resilience of urban investments.</p> <p>2. Number of people benefiting from raising awareness about polluted areas through communication programs for Outcome 3.1 Strengthened enabling institutional environment</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		4.1. Inception report, including detailed implementation plan of the package. 4.2. Summary report of the package.		
13	TA9417-VEA QCBS-13 Int'l consulting firm provides technical assistance to VEAs' activities related to urban environmental management and ISPONRE's activities related to GHG inventory, climate vulnerability assessment, developing training and communication program. and project cities in Vietnam and country of the	1. Nine reports on international experiences and exemplary studies (from ASEAN member countries, Australia, China, and Japan) covering: 1.1. Indices for green cities and policy frameworks for green cities. 1.2. Treatment of urban pollution hotspots: factories causing severe pollution. 1.3. Treatment of polluted urban areas: landfills causing severe pollution. 1.4. Greenhouse Gas Inventory (KNK) and Measurement, Reporting, and Verification (MRV). 1.5. Assessment of low-carbon technologies focusing on urban areas. 1.6. Climate Risk and Vulnerability Assessment (CRVA), focusing on methods/guidelines for implementing CRVA in urban areas. 1.7. Circular economy, ecosystem labels, and green procurement.	1. Indicators for resilient, low carbon and low pollution cities (herein after referred to as 'green cities') are developed 2. Policy and legal frameworks for green cities are developed 3. Technical guidelines on suitable technology and policy solutions are identified for the treatment of urban contaminated sites 4. Partnership with development partners are enhanced in term of better information sharing on green cities. 5. 100 officers, at least 33% females, from government	1. Number of draft guidelines and policy frameworks on green urban areas for Outcome 1.1 Integrated, resilient planning in cities 2. Number of people trained and capacity improved by MONRE and relevant agencies on environmental management for Outcome 3.1 Strengthened enabling institutional environment

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
	international experts.	<p>1.8. Implementation of communication activities related to KNK, climate risk assessment, ecosystem assessment, circular economy, green procurement, etc., for target groups, including government, policy planners, businesses, and communities.</p> <p>1.9. Capacity building in KNK, climate risk assessment, circular economy, ecosystem labels, and green procurement, proposing feasible training programs suitable for the context in Vietnam.</p> <p>These reports will draw relevant lessons for Vietnam, provide policy recommendations on applying these lessons to Vietnam, and assist in developing new policies/plans. Reports will be prepared in both English and Vietnamese.</p> <p>2. Four technical guidelines to create conditions for green cities in Vietnam</p> <p>2.1. Indices for green cities.</p> <p>2.2. Policy tools for green cities.</p> <p>2.3. Treatment of urban pollution hotspots: factories causing severe pollution.</p>	<p>agencies, enterprises, communities, socio-political organizations, scientists, civil society organizations and international organization are enhanced their capacity on green cities</p> <p>6. 30 staff members of MONRE, at least 33% females, are enhanced their capacity on green cities indicators & policy frameworks, treatment of urban contaminated sites, GHG inventories, climate vulnerability assessment, ecosystem-based adaptation strategies, circular economy, green public procurement and eco-labelling.</p>	

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>2.4. Treatment of polluted urban areas: landfills causing severe pollution.</p> <p>These guidelines will be adjusted to fit the local context and will be prepared in both English and Vietnamese.</p> <p>3. Four presentations on project activities at regional and international forums</p> <p>4. Proposal program and organization of policy dialogue forums (one-day) to share knowledge and build partnerships on green cities with around 100 participants from government agencies, businesses, communities, political and social organizations, scientists, civil society organizations, and international organizations (including development partners and international research organizations). Additionally, at least four regional and international events to disseminate project activities and exchange experiences with partners in the region and internationally on green cities</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>5. Technical support for 11 project packages related to KNK, climate risk assessment, ecosystem-based adaptation strategies, soil pollution, circular economy, green procurement, and ecosystem labeling (TA9417-ISP QCBS-01, TA9417-ISP QCBS-02, TA9417-ISP QCBS-03, TA9417-ISP QCBS-04, TA9417-VEA QCBS-01, TA9417-VEA QCBS-03, TA9417-VEA QCBS-04, TA9417-VEA QCBS-05, TA9417-VEA QCBS-10, TA9417-VEA QCBS-11, and TA9417-VEA QCBS-12).</p> <p>Technical support includes (i) reviewing draft products of other packages managed by MOIT and IESD when requested by PMU; (ii) technical advice on communication strategies, training needs assessment; and (iii) on-site training/consultation.</p> <p>6. Training materials and nine one-day training workshops for 30 officers from MONRE.</p> <p>Training topics include: 1) indices and policy frameworks for green cities; 2) treatment of urban pollution hotspots: factories causing severe pollution; 3) treatment of polluted urban areas:</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>landfills causing severe pollution; 4) Greenhouse Gas Inventory (KNK); 5) assessment of climate vulnerability; 6) ecosystem-based adaptation strategies; 7) circular economy; 8) green procurement; and 9) ecosystem labels. The consultant must submit a training evaluation report after each training workshop.</p>		
14	<p>TA9417-ISP CQS-01</p> <p>Review, develop the climate vulnerability assessment methodology, and pilot in 03 cities (Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen).</p>	<p>1. Inception report.</p> <p>2. Overview report on documentation regarding (i) existing CRVA methods and studies and (ii) relevant policy frameworks and regulations.</p> <p>3. Outline for the implementation guidelines of CRVA in urban areas in Vietnam.</p> <p>4. First draft of the guidelines for implementing CRVA in urban areas in Vietnam.</p> <p>CRVA report for the cities of Vinh Yen, Hue, Ha Giang (Each city has a separate report).</p> <p>5. Second draft of the guidelines for implementing CRVA in urban areas in Vietnam.</p>	<p>1. The Guideline for conducting CRVA in urban areas in Viet Nam is developed</p> <p>2. CRVA is piloted in three secondary cities in Viet Nam, namely: Hue City, Ha Giang City and Vinh Yen City</p>	<p>Number of beneficiaries and land area included in the CVA in 3 cities: Hue, Ha Giang, and Vinh Yen (eg, % of population benefiting from the CVA, km2 area included in the CVA in each city) for Outcome 1.1 Integrated, resilient planning in cities.</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>6.Guidelines for the comprehensive implementation of CRVA in urban areas in Vietnam, including both document and digital formats, with requirements for both English and Vietnamese versions.</p> <p>7.Final comprehensive report on the results of the procurement package.</p>		
15	<p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-02</p> <p>Review, develop GHG inventory methodology and guidance for MRV monitoring; conduct low-carbon tech. emission reduction potential to propose low carbon tech. portfolio, and pilot GHG inventory assessment and MRV in 03 cities (Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Yen)</p>	<p>I. Deliverables for Task 0</p> <p>0.1. Inception report.</p> <p>II. Deliverables for Task 1</p> <p>1.1. Overview report on documents related to methods/guidelines for GHG inventory, and research related to GHG inventory</p> <p>1.2. Review report on policy documents, laws, standards/technical regulations related to GHG inventory in Vietnam and other countries.</p> <p>1.3. Report on methodology or technical guidelines for conducting GHG inventory for urban areas in Vietnam, focusing on 5 sectors: energy, agriculture, LULUCF, IP, and</p>	<p>1. Technical guidelines for GHG inventory and MRV for urban areas in Viet Nam are developed.</p> <p>2. 03 GHG inventory reports and need assessment for low carbon technology for Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen City to be prepared as key inputs for the update of the relevant GCAPs.</p> <p>3. MRV guidelines for the implementation of low-carbon development in 03 cities: Ha Giang, Vinh Yen and Hue are developed</p> <p>4. Need assessment of low-carbon technology is conducted and low-carbon technology portfolio is</p>	<p>Number of beneficiaries/land area subject to GHG inventory in the three cities of Hue, Ha Giang, and Vinh Yen for Outcome 1.1: Integrated, resilient planning in cities</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>waste (in both English and Vietnamese).</p> <p>1.4. GHG inventory database for 3 cities: Ha Giang, Vinh Yen and Hue.</p> <p>1.5. GHG inventory reports for 03 cities: Ha Giang, Vinh Yen and Hue (in both English and Vietnamese).</p> <p>III. Deliverables for Task 2</p> <p>2.1. Report on the methodology for evaluating low-carbon technologies.</p> <p>2.2. Report on the assessment of low-carbon technology needs and proposed list of low-carbon technologies for three cities: Ha Giang, Vinh Yen and Hue.</p> <p>IV. Deliverables for Task 3</p> <p>3.1. Overview report on documents related to the demand for the development of low-carbon and MRV methodology.</p> <p>3.2. Methodology report for MRV on the development of low-carbon for urban areas, focusing on 5 sectors: energy, agriculture, LULUCF, IP, and waste (in both English and Vietnamese).</p>	<p>proposed for three cities: Hue, Ha Giang and Vinh Yen.</p>	

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		3.3. Report on establishing MRV in 3 cities: Ha Giang, Vinh Yen and Hue V. Other Deliverables: 4.1. Completion report on activity outcomes. 4.2. Meeting minutes, seminars, summaries of recommendations for draft documents.		
16	TA9417-ISP QCBS-03 Conduct capacity need assessment, develop and conduct training program for GHG inventory, low-carbon emission, climate risk vulnerability assessment, green public procurement... for secondary cities.	1. Inception report. 2. Training needs assessment. 3. Develop training programs and enhance capacity. 4. Training materials, knowledge products. 5. Implementation of training courses and reporting on training and capacity-building activities. 6. Knowledge products.	1. 360 participants, at least 33% females, are improved their capacity on GHG inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, circular economy, green public procurement, and low GHG emissions... 2. 270 participants from officials, universities, and enterprises..., at least 33% females, are enhanced their capacity on GHG inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, circular economy, green public procurement, and low GHG emissions. 3. 360 officials, at least 33% females, of 3 pilot cities (i.e. Hue,	Number of trainee (including women) on GHG inventory, CVA assessment, circular economy, green procurement for Outcome 3.1 Strengthened enabling institutional environment.

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
			Ha Giang, Vinh Phuc) are enhanced their knowledge and capacity on GHG inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, circular economy, green public procurement, and low GHG emissions at central and secondary cities.	
17	<p>TA9417-ISP QCBS-04</p> <p>Develop and implement communications activities for GHG inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, ecology assessment, circular economy, green public procurement... for targeted groups, incl. authorities, policy makers, enterprises, community.</p>	<p><i>I. Task 1: Development and Implementation of Communication Plan and Event Content Program to Increase Awareness of Circular Economy, Green Procurement, Low Carbon Emissions, and Low Pollution for Stakeholders: Managers, Citizens, and Businesses.</i></p> <p>1.1. Synthesis report analyzing current communication activities on Circular Economy, Green Procurement, Low Carbon Emissions, and Low Pollution for stakeholders: Managers, Citizens, and Businesses. The report should include results from focused group discussions and survey findings.</p> <p>1.2. Draft communication plan framework to enhance awareness of</p>	<p>360 officials, at least 33% females, of 3 pilot cities (i.e. Hue, Ha Giang, Vinh Phuc) are enhanced their knowledge and capacity on GHG inventory, climate risk vulnerability assessment, circular economy, green public procurement, and low GHG emissions at central and secondary cities.</p>	<p>Number of participants/interactions in media events, raising awareness on GHG inventory, CVA assessment, circular economy, green public procurement for Outcome 3.1 Strengthened enabling institutional environment.</p>

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>Circular Economy, Green Procurement, Low Carbon Emissions, and Low Pollution for stakeholders: Managers, Citizens, and Businesses.</p> <p>1.3. Meeting minutes and compilation of feedback for the communication plan</p> <p>1.4. Organize 03 consultation workshops on the communication plan in Hà Giang, Vĩnh Phúc, and Huế to gather input on the draft communication plan. The communication plan should clearly define objectives, target audience, messages, content, and suitable communication methods for each province/city. This activity helps local authorities build appropriate communication activities and contribute to the policy-making process of the province/city (planned to conduct 3 workshops, in each selected province, with an expected 05 newsletters or TV features emerging).</p> <p>1.5. Report on the results of the workshops.</p> <p>1.6. Organize a photography contest and exhibition on Circular Economy, Green Procurement, Low Carbon Emissions, and Low Pollution (Participants: photographers nationwide submit photos</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>on various themes such as green cities, Circular Economy, etc. Photos are submitted online through the project's Facebook page and email. Prizes: cash prizes for the first, second, third, and fourth places, as detailed in the contest rules. The Project Management Board and consulting unit will select 20-30 photos for exhibition over 2 weeks. The exhibition venue will be determined later).</p> <p>1.4. Organize 03 consultation workshops on the communication plan in Hà Giang, Vĩnh Phúc, and Huế to gather input on the draft communication plan. The communication plan should clearly define objectives, target audience, messages, content, and suitable communication methods for each province/city. This activity helps local authorities build appropriate communication activities and contribute to the policy-making process of the province/city (planned to conduct 3 workshops, in each selected province, with an expected 05 newsletters or TV features emerging).</p> <p>1.7. Report on the results of organizing the contest and exhibition on Circular</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>Economy, Green Procurement, Low Carbon Emissions, and Low Pollution.</p> <p><i>II. Task 2: Design, Production, and Dissemination of Information Products on Sustainable Urban Development, Environmental Protection, and Climate Resilience through Various Media Channels (TV, Radio, Social Media, etc.).</i></p> <p>2.1. Branding, social media platforms, and online press conference organization to introduce the project. Weekly updates on project information, activities, photos, newsletters, and articles about the project on social media (planned for 12 popular pages, each with over 300,000 followers).</p> <p>2.2. Propaganda articles and publication/posting of articles, infographic communication about sustainable urban development, environmental protection, and climate resilience in newspapers, online newspapers (planned 8 articles and infographics), both in Vietnamese and English.</p> <p>2.3. Documentaries, discussions, and regular programs on sustainable urban development, environmental protection,</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>and climate resilience broadcast on Television (planned 2 news reports, 2 documentaries, 1 discussion, 1 regular program) (in Vietnamese with English subtitles).</p> <p>2.4. Communication messages on sustainable urban development, environmental protection, and climate resilience broadcast on Radio and Television (planned 1 TV message * 30 times/message and 1 radio message * 60 times/message).</p> <p>2.5. Short film (estimated 10-15 minutes) summarizing the activities of the Climate Change Adaptation and Environmental Protection Project for the development of green cities type II (Phase 2019 - 2023) (in Vietnamese with English subtitles).</p> <p>III. Task 3: Design, Build, and Disseminate Knowledge Products on Greenhouse Gas Inventory, Climate Impact Assessment, and Ecological Assessment.</p> <p>3.1. Analysis report of documents, output products, and research within the framework of the project, including technical guidance, usage instructions, toolkits, pilot studies to support the</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>national environmental analysis framework, tools, environmental management and protection policies, climate adaptation for cities in Vietnam, capturing requirements, ideas for designing knowledge products.</p> <p>3.2. Draft content of knowledge products (technical guidance, usage instructions, toolkits, pilot studies) supporting the national environmental analysis framework, tools, environmental management and protection policies, climate adaptation for cities in Vietnam.</p> <p>3.3. Design of knowledge product (planned for 03 product designs, each product with 40 pages, size: 21cm x 29cm; cover printed on 250gsm coated paper, inside pages printed on 150gsm coated paper, 2-sided printing, 4 colors, binding).</p> <p>3.4. Printing copies of communication materials, knowledge products as required by the Project Management Board in terms of quantity and material quality (Expected cover printed on 250gsm coated paper, inside pages printed on 150gsm coated paper, 2-sided printing, 4 colors, binding) (Publications in Vietnamese and English).</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		<p>3.5. Organize a multi-stakeholder dialogue forum on green urban development, environmental protection, and climate resilience between managers, businesses, communities, political-social organizations, scientists, and civil society organizations and international organizations.</p> <p>3.6. Share the project's knowledge products through the media, information networks, seminars with officials at central and provincial levels, share project products with GEF, ADB, and other development partners, relevant parties worldwide conducting similar guidelines, toolkits. Publish the project's knowledge products and communication products on the project's Fanpage, YouTube, and relevant information pages.</p> <p>IV. General deliverables</p> <p>4.1. Inception report, including a detailed implementation plan.</p> <p>4.2. Monthly report on communication activities and feedback measurement from public opinion, submitted to the Project Management Board.</p> <p>4.3. Annual work report.</p>		

No	Name of package	Deliverables	M&E indicators	GEB indicators
		4.4. Final report summarizing the implementation process of the consulting firm, approved by the Project Management Board at the end of the contract.		