



## FAO-GEF Project Implementation Report

### 2021 – Revised Template



Period covered: 1 July 2020 to 30 June 2021

### 1. Basic Project Data

#### General Information

<b>Region:</b>	Asia Pacific
<b>Country (ies):</b>	Pakistan
<b>Project Title:</b>	Reversing deforestation and degradation in high conservation value Chilgoza Pine Forests in Pakistan
<b>FAO Project Symbol:</b>	GCP /PAK/091/GFF
<b>GEF ID:</b>	9516
<b>GEF Focal Area(s):</b>	Climate Change, Biodiversity, Sustainable Forest Management
<b>Project Executing Partners:</b>	Ministry of Climate Change
<b>Project Duration:</b>	48 months
<b>Project coordinates:</b> <a href="#">(Ctrl+Click here)</a>	<i>This section should be completed by:</i> -Projects with 1st PIR -Projects could re-submit the coordinates if they have changed, or if the PMU now has more updated coordinates

#### Milestone Dates:

<b>GEF CEO Endorsement Date:</b>	25 April 2018
<b>Project Implementation Start Date/EOD :</b>	25 April 2018
<b>Proposed Project Implementation End Date/NTE<sup>1</sup>:</b>	24 April 2022
<b>Revised project implementation end date (if applicable) <sup>2</sup></b>	n/a
<b>Actual Implementation End Date<sup>3</sup>:</b>	n/a

#### Funding

<b>GEF Grant Amount (USD):</b>	3,978,440
<b>Total Co-financing amount as included in GEF CEO Endorsement Request/ProDoc<sup>4</sup>:</b>	24,000,000

<sup>1</sup> As per FPMIS

<sup>2</sup> In case of a project extension.

<sup>3</sup> Actual date at which project implementation ends - only for projects that have ended.

<sup>4</sup> This is the total amount of co-financing as included in the CEO document/Project Document.

<b>Total GEF grant disbursement as of June 30, 2021 (USD m):</b>	1,525,000
<b>Total estimated co-financing materialized as of June 30, 2021<sup>5</sup></b>	The total co-finance in the reporting period is 1,894,188 213,333. The detail is in Table on Page 41. The grant component is mainly the amount spent on the restoration projects in the project target districts under the one Billion and 10 Billion tree Projects

### Review and Evaluation

<b>Date of Most Recent Project Steering Committee Meeting:</b>	10 <sup>th</sup> November 2020
<b>Expected Mid-term Review date<sup>6</sup>:</b>	First Quarter 2021
<b>Actual Mid-term review date:</b>	24 May - 30 September 2021
<b>Mid-term review or evaluation due in coming fiscal year (July 2021 – June 2022)<sup>7</sup>:</b>	Yes
<b>Expected Terminal Evaluation Date:</b>	Last quarter 2022
<b>Terminal evaluation due in coming fiscal year (July 2021 – June 2022):</b>	No
<b>Tracking tools/ Core indicators required<sup>8</sup></b>	Yes

### Ratings

<b>Overall rating of progress towards achieving objectives/ outcomes (cumulative):</b>	S
<b>Overall implementation progress rating:</b>	S
<b>Overall risk rating:</b>	Low

<sup>5</sup> Please see last section of this report where you are asked to provide updated co-financing estimates. Use the total from this Section and insert here.

<sup>6</sup> The MTR should take place about halfpoint between EOD and NTE – this is the expected date

<sup>7</sup> Please note that the FAO GEF Coordination Unit should be contacted six months prior to the expected MTR date

<sup>8</sup> Please note that the Tracking Tools are required at mid-term and closure for all GEF-4 and GEF-5 projects. Tracking tools are not mandatory for Medium Sized projects = < 2M USD at mid-term, but only at project completion. The new GEF-7 results indicators (core and sub-indicators) will be applied to all projects and programs approved on or after July 1, 2018. Also projects and programs approved from July 1, 2014 to June 30, 2018 (GEF-6) must apply core indicators and sub-indicators at mid-term and/or completion

**Status**

<b>Implementation Status</b> <i>(1<sup>st</sup> PIR, 2<sup>nd</sup> PIR, etc. Final PIR):</i>	<b>3<sup>rd</sup> PIR</b>
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	---------------------------

**Project Contacts**

<b>Contact</b>	<b>Name, Title, Division/Institution</b>	<b>E-mail</b>
<b>Project Manager</b>	Faizul Bari	faizul.bari@fao.org
<b>Lead Technical Officer</b>	Christophe Besacier	christophe.besacier@fao.org
<b>Budget Holder</b>	Rebekah Bell	rebekah.bell@fao.org
<b>GEF Funding Liaison Officer</b>	Paola Palestini	paola.palestini@fao.org

## 2. Progress Towards Achieving Project Objectives and Outcome (DO)

*(All inputs in this section should be cumulative from project start, not annual)*

Level at 30 June 2021						
Project objective and Outcomes	Description of indicator(s) <sup>7</sup>	Baseline level	Mid-term target <sup>8</sup>	End-of-project target	Level at 30 June 2021	Progress rating <sup>9</sup>
Development objective: Local livelihoods improved through the increased productivity and enhanced services and functions of the Chilgoza ecosystem in Pakistan						
<b>Outcome 1:</b> National and provincial FLR policies and legal frameworks are strengthened and implemented with efforts aiming at maximizing the provision of the multiple goods and services provided by the Chilgoza forest ecosystems	(i) number of participatory FLR supportive policies/legislations/plans identified/developed/strengthened;	0	(i) two participatory FLR supportive policies/legislations/plans identified/developed/strengthened;	(i) five participatory FLR supportive policies/legislations/plans identified/developed/strengthened;	Planned for the third year. Physical activities in the initial years were prioritised to create project impact, regarding policy work the PSC opinion was that there are already good policies in place, which support the FLR. For the third year the project will work to identify any potential gaps to be addressed.	Planned for the third year
	(ii) number of FLR assessments conducted;	0	(ii) two FLR assessment conducted;	(ii) four FLR assessments conducted;	Four Restoration Opportunity Assessment Methodology (ROAM) Assessments have been completed and the final report prepared. Training conducted for forty-four persons (36 men and 8 women) professionals and key stakeholders from all the project districts.	HS
	(iii) number of women and men providing input to participatory policy planning;	0	(iii) At least two-hundred people providing input to policy planning with 40 percent women;	(iii) At least four-hundred per year (with 40 percent women);	Since its inception, the project has been generating several multi-stakeholders (including women and youth) discussions around FLR, which is a good starting point to discuss policy engagement.	Planned for the third year

Outcome 2: Forest and Landscape Restoration and Sustainable Forest Management options. Increasing livelihood based on goods and services provided by Chilgoza ecosystems, are demonstrated at district level in the four targeted provinces/regions	(iv) number of policy/regulatory frameworks/strategies reviewed/strengthened with regards to the use of innovative and sustainable financial mechanisms (e.g. Payments for Ecosystem Services-PES);	0	(iv) two policy/regulatory frameworks/strategies reviewed/strengthened with regards to the use of innovative and sustainable financial mechanisms (e.g. PES);	(iv) four policy/regulatory frameworks/strategies reviewed/strengthened with regards to the use of innovative and sustainable financial mechanisms (e.g. PES);	Initial scoping mission to assess the feasibility of PES incentives conducted. An economic valuation study of the Chilgoza forests ecosystem services has been conducted, a workshop to discuss the final report is planned for the end of June 2021. Based on this workshop the project will start working on the selected PES options.	S
	(v) number of local stakeholders skilled in design and implementation schemes of PES;	0	(v) forty local stakeholders skilled in design and implementation schemes of PES;	(v) eighty local stakeholders skilled in design and implementation schemes of PES;	Twenty-six participants (22 men and 4 women) received training in Ecosystem Services valuation, incentives, and payments for Ecosystem Services (PES).	MS
	(i) number of sustainable management plans developed;	0	(i) two sustainable management plans developed covering 32,200: (30,000 ha initiated under sustainable forest management plans by mid-term involving communities and private enterprises);	(i) four sustainable management plans developed covering 34,400: (30,000 ha under sustainable forest management plans involving communities and private enterprises);	One plan (Sherani district) covering 26000 ha has been finalized and shared with Balochistan Forest department for endorsement. The plan formulation for Chitral and SW has been included in the LoAs and the formulation work will start soon by the Forest Department KP.	S
	(ii) number of ha of land under restoration practices Assisted Natural Regeneration (ANR) in degraded Chilgoza ecosystems;	0	(ii) 1,800 ha under restoration (ANR);	(ii) 3,600 ha under restoration (ANR);	Forty-eight ANR sites covering 2,153 Ha have been demarcated. The project team has conducted a survey to assess the status of Assisted Natural Regeneration.	HS
(iii) number of ha of land restored under agroforestry in degraded Chilgoza ecosystems;	0	(iii) 400 ha restored (agroforestry);	(iii) 800 ha restored (agroforestry);	652.87 ha under agroforestry completed.	HS	

	(iv) tCO <sub>2</sub> eq emissions avoided/sequestered in TRI target landscapes as a direct result of TRI interventions;	0	(iv) mid-term milestone after two/three years are not relevant for CO <sub>2</sub> . Milestone after 5 years at the end of the project implementation could be considered as one mid-term milestone and the tons of CO <sub>2</sub> after 20 years should be the targets;	(iv) 1,928,168 tCO <sub>2</sub> eq will be sequestered within the 30,000 ha under SFM plans + 854,252 tCO <sub>2</sub> eq will be sequestered within the 4,400 ha under restoration practices;	(iv) n/a at June 30, 2021.	
	(v) number of households engaged in restoration programs at different levels;	0	(v) At least 10,000 households engaged in restoration practices (50 percent women);	(v) At 50,000 households engaged in restoration practices (50 percent women);	17,500+ Households engaged in restoration activities.	HS
	(vi) number of households directly benefitting from the project activities;	0	(vi) 5,000 households directly benefitting from the project activities;	(vi) At least 25,000 households directly benefitting from the project activities;	8443 farmers (6679 Men and 1764 Women) directly benefitted from project activities.	HS
	(vii) number of small grants at district and provincial levels given out to support alternative livelihoods;	0	(vii) 20 small grants;	(vii) 60 (15 small grants in each of 4 target districts given out);	Call for small grants planned in each district for the second semester 2021. Procurement is in process to provide 400 small grants (beneficiaries) in four areas NTFPs, fodder, honeybee, homebased nurseries.	Call for small grants planned in each district for the second semester 2021. S
	(viii) number of bankable projects developed on PES;	0	(vii) Feasibility study for the establishment of PES schemes is launched in at least two landscapes;	(vii) At least two bankable projects developed;	The formulation of bankable project will start in the second semester of 2021.	Planned for the second semester 2021. MS

	(ix) number of value chain units strengthened/established;	0	(ix) two value chain units strengthened/developed;	(ix) four value chain units strengthened/developed;	Four Chilgoza nut processing units procured and installed in two of the project target areas (Diامر Chitral, and Zhob). 300 sets of cone collection tools have been distributed among CFPCC members to promote safe and sustainable Chilgoza cones collection. 24 chilgoza cone crushers provided. 1000 Fuel efficient stoves and 200 gasifiers provided to the farming communities	HS
<b>Outcome 3: Chilgoza Forest Protection and Conservation Committees (FPCCs) operational, with strengthened capacities of provincial, district and local stakeholders to implement participatory Sustainable Forest Management</b>	(i) number of cross-sectoral mechanisms and other relevant frameworks established/strengthened;	0	(i) At least one cross-sectoral mechanism is initiated in each of the 4 target areas;	(i) At least one cross-sectoral mechanism is operational in each of the 4 target areas;	Planned for the first second semester 2021. At least 8 cross-sectoral discussions took place during the formulation of the ROAM as well as during the preparation of the sustainable management plan and survey for non-NTFPs. TRI child project team on national level as a consortium partner, is monitoring the FLR implementation of the 10 billion tree programme.	Planned for the second semester 2021.
	(ii) number of capacity building events at local/ district/provincial levels organized;	0	(ii) At least five capacity building events involving both men and women are organized;	(ii) At least ten capacity building events involving both men and women are organized;	Seven capacity development events on Collect Earth, ROAM, PES, safe use of sustainable Chilgoza toolkits, tree planting and "Bridge for Billions" organised.	HS
	(iii) number of operational FPCCs;	0	(iii) FPCCs needs are assessed and a capacity building plan is implemented with the support of TRI;	(iii) eight operational FPCCs (at least two in each of the four selected districts);	Fourteen CFPCCs established and operationalized, and are engaged in protecting and management of their Chilgoza forests.	HS

	(iv) number of provincial, district and local stakeholders trained in the four selected provinces;	0	(iv) Capacity assessment needs are assessed and a capacity building plan is under implementation with the support of TRI;	(iv) 2700 stakeholders (200 staff + 2500 local community members and Chilgoza traders);	391 (360 men and 31 women) stakeholders received training and participated in capacity development workshops in Collect Earth, ROAM and PES; 165 (162 men and 3 women) farmers from 4 project districts (Sherani, South Waziristan, Chitral, and Diamer) received quality training on Chilgoza harvesting toolkits for sustainable and safe Chilgoza cones collection.	HS
<b>Outcome 4:</b> Stakeholders equipped with new knowledge related to forest and landscape restoration of Chilgoza forest ecosystems with strengthened private and public engagement through sharing of best practices, lessons, and exchanges with both the other TRI national and the global projects	(i) number of attended TRI Annual Knowledge Sharing events, Restoration Finance events, and relevant TRI-sponsored South-South exchanges;	0	(i) two TRI events attended;	(i) four TRI events attended;	Three events attended (Inception workshop in Kenya in February 2019, TRI regional workshop on PES in Beijing in September 2019 and TRI Global event in Rome in October 2019). The COVID epidemic prevent the 2020 event to happen.	HS
	(ii) number of monitoring systems established: providing relevant information to managers both at national, provincial and district levels;	0	(ii) Four monitoring systems (one for each pilot district) feeding to one comprehensive system;	(ii) Four monitoring systems (one for each pilot district) feeding to one comprehensive system;	Land degradation baseline established using Collect Earth Open Foris (CEOF GIS-based tools. One national-level M&E system established to facilitate data flow; M&E plan has been prepared. Beneficiary data collection tools developed to capture the required data for reporting against the project indicators. The Collect Earth Open Foris tool has received a lot of positive attention and the Federal Ministry of Climate Change will adopt the Collect Earth tools for setting up baseline and monitoring the Ten Billion Tree Tsunami	HS



					Programme, which is a flagship programme of Government of Pakistan.	
	(iii) number of TRI knowledge products (ecosystem assessment reports, guidelines for PES, guidelines for Gender, leaflets, newsletters, case studies, etc.) developed and disseminated through relevant knowledge platforms both at provincial, national and global levels;	0	(iii) At least five knowledge products developed and disseminated on relevant issues for SFM/FLR of Chilgoza forest ecosystems;	(iii) At least ten knowledge products developed and disseminated on relevant issues for SFM/FLR of Chilgoza forest ecosystems;	Seven communication products developed and disseminated online and during project events. Events such as toolkits plant distribution covered by 15+ provincial communication products. One pager related to the project background and activities developed and disseminated in all the events conducted.	HS
	(iv) number of knowledge sharing events/tools on forest landscape information between districts at the provincial level. and between provinces in Pakistan;	0	(iv) One (project website and information system operational);	(iv) 11 (1 website + 10) information-sharing events involving more than 400 four-hundred stakeholder representatives at local and national levels (technical days on Chilgoza forest ecosystems);	TRI global information sharing platform established and operationalized. Project team regularly contributes to TRI global newsletter.	S

Action plan to address MS, MU, U and HU ratings

Outcome	Action(s) to be taken	By whom?	By when?

### 3. Progress in Generating Project Outputs (Implementation Progress, IP)

*(Please indicate progress achieved during this FY as planned in the Annual Work Plan)*

Outputs <sup>11</sup>	Expected completion date <sup>12</sup>	Achievements at each PIR <sup>13</sup>					Implement. status (cumulative)	Comments. Describe any variance <sup>14</sup> or any challenge in delivering outputs
		1 <sup>st</sup> PIR	2 <sup>nd</sup> PIR	3 <sup>rd</sup> PIR	4 <sup>th</sup> PIR	5 <sup>th</sup> PIR		
Output 1.1 A replicable Sustainable Forest Management and Forest and Landscape Restoration framework is developed for Chilgoza forest ecosystems in the four selected districts using participatory inventory and mapping approaches (e.g. ROAM) addressing both forest economic issues, biodiversity conservation concerns and key current drivers of forest degradation.	Q2 Y2	n/a	ROAM assessment conducted. Training on ROAM methodology conducted for 44 (36 men and 8 women) professionals and key stakeholders from all the project districts. ROAM draft Report is ready and is under review to prepare the final report.	The ROAM report finalized and shared with stakeholders.			% 100	
Output 1.2 Policies and legal frameworks are strengthened to support integrated landscape approaches for the management of Chilgoza Pine ecosystems including biodiversity	Q4 Y4	n/a	n/a	n/a			% n/a	Planned for the third year as it is not a priority as physical activities in the initial years were prioritised to create project impact as per the PSC opinion. For the third year the project will work to identify any

conservation priorities, management of multiple NTFPs and innovative financing mechanisms								<i>potential gaps to be addressed.</i>
Output 1.3 Policy and regulatory frameworks reviewed in order to promote/facilitate the use of innovative and sustainable financial mechanisms (e.g. Payment for Ecosystems Services and/or targeted funds at district level providing Incentives for Ecosystems Services) in Chilgoza forest landscapes	Q4 Y4	n/a	<i>Initial scoping mission to assess the feasibility of PES incentives conducted. 26 participants (22 men and 4 women) received training on Ecosystem Services Valuation, Incentives, and Payments for Ecosystem Services (PES). The scheme is being piloted in Chitral, and a consultant has been engaged to study the various options for generating resources for the conservation and management of the forests and the draft feasibility report is ready.</i>	<i>An economic valuation study of the Chilgoza forests ecosystem services has been conducted, a workshop was organized on June, 30, 2021 to discuss the final report and the way forward.</i>			% 25	<i>Planned for the third year.</i>
Output 2.1: Chilgoza Forest multifunctional Management Plans based on cross-sectoral approaches including restoration, biodiversity conservation, and sustainable production / livelihood options are prepared and implemented in one	Q4 Y4	n/a	<i>Initial consultations with communities, forest and wildlife departments, and other development organizations working in project districts were conducted. Currently awaiting for the Letter of Agreement</i>	<i>Chilgoza Forest Multi-functional Management Plan covering 26000 ha has been finalized and shared with Balochistan Forest department</i>			% 25	<i>Development of plans for other districts planned for the third year.</i>

management unit (villages or watersheds depending on the provincial regulation) of each selected district of the four provinces			(LoA) signature with KP Forest Department to kick-start the development of plans. For district Sherani LoA with Balochistan Forest Department was signed and preparation of the plan has been completed. For district Diamer – LoA was signed with the GB Forest Department, initial consultation meetings have been carried out with the stakeholders. Sustainable chilgoza forest management plan for Sherani district covering 26000 ha has been prepared and the draft plan is under review for finalization.	for endorsement.				
Output 2.2: Good practices for sustainable management of Chilgoza pine forests are promoted in the targeted districts of the four provinces with at least ten different forest communities	Q4 Y2	n/a	3 sets of guidelines for sustainable management of chilgoza pine forests (Chitral, Diamer, and Sherani districts) developed.	n/a			% 40	Planned for the third year.
Output 2.3: Assisted Natural Regeneration actions are	Q4 Y4	Work has been initiated, target areas have been identified and	48 ANR sites covering 2420 ha were selected with the communities based on the drivers of	48 ANR sites covering 2,153 Ha have been			% 60	Per PIR 2020, 2,420 ha of ANR were identified based on estimation. 2,153 ha were

<p>implemented in Chilgoza forest ecosystems</p>		<p><i>consultation with local stakeholders carried out for implementation.</i></p>	<p><i>degradation in Chilgoza forest, excessive grazing, cutting of trees, and erosion. Sites were identified in the core areas/ sub valleys after several meetings with the communities and signing formal Terms of Partnerships (TOPs) with the relevant communities and discussion with FPCCs and endorsed by provincial Forest and Wildlife Departments.</i></p>	<p><i>demarcated. The project team has conducted a survey to assess the status of Assisted Natural Regeneration. An ANR report is now developed.</i></p>				<p><i>demarcated after physical visits and surveys in 2021, therefore slight revision of achieved result.</i></p>
<p>Output 2.4: NTFPs are sustainably managed and producing increased incomes for local stakeholders through the promotion of value chain development in the targeted Chilgoza forest landscapes</p>	<p>Q4 Y2</p>	<p><i>Major NTFPs are Chilgoza nuts for which four production studies conducted.</i></p>	<p><i>Major NTFPs are Chilgoza nuts for which four production studies conducted.</i></p>	<p><i>Major NTFPs are Chilgoza nuts for which four annual production studies were conducted. The project also support the development of sustainable value chain on honey and olive oil through entrepreneurship development and coaching.</i></p>			<p>% 20</p>	<p><i>On the basis of annual production studies the project team will develop a paper to show the total production and its value so that the government policy makers put more resources for its conservation.</i></p>

Output 2.5: Alternative livelihoods opportunities are increased for local residents	Q4 Y4	n/a	CFPCC were provided with 150 (150 more procured to be distributed in July 2020) sets of chilgoza harvesting tools kits in order to promote sustainable and safe chilgoza pine nuts collection among farmers. 2 chilgoza processing units have also been procured and will become functional before the harvesting of chilgoza cones in September 2020.	CFPCC were provided with an additional 150 sets of chilgoza harvesting tools kits in order to promote sustainable and safe chilgoza pine nuts collection among farmers. 2 Chilgoza processing units have been set up in Diامر and Zhob districts. 12 cone crushers provided. The Livelihood fund will be operationalized in 2021 after consultations with communities in 2020.		% 60	
Output 2.6. An enabling environment is created for future implementation of PES	Q4 Y4	n/a	Scoping mission undertaken by FAO HQ Specialist in Financing mechanisms and	An economic valuation study of the Chilgoza		% 50	

schemes in Chilgoza ecosystems (Payment for Ecosystem Services)			<i>incentives to assess the feasibility of PES in three communities of Chitral district; consultant has been engaged to study the various options for generating resources for the conservation and management of the forests.</i>	<i>forests ecosystem services has been conducted, the final report is being finalized.</i>				
Output 2.7: Carbon sequestration is enhanced in targeted Chilgoza forest ecosystems	Q4 Y4	<i>n/a</i>	<i>14,547 of fruit and 340,750 of forest plants distributed, benefitting 2249 (1801 Men, 448 Women) farmers and 332 ha land under restoration.</i>	<i>20,800 of fruit plants and 326,950 of forest plants were distributed in all four project areas, benefitting 5440 small holder farmers (4173 men and 1267 women), and bringing 320.87 ha of land under restoration, including 24.165 ha of block plantation.</i>			<i>% 40</i>	
Output 3.1: Chilgoza Forest Protection and Conservation Committees (FPCCs) are	Q4 Y1	<i>FPCCs have been identified and will be notified soon</i>	<i>14 FPCCs were established in project core areas. Terms of partnerships signed</i>	<i>Project team continued to work closely with local</i>			<i>% 100</i>	



established and operational in the four selected sites to ensure local participation and long term ownership in forest protection, management and restoration activities proposed in the context of Component 2			<i>and all the communities motivated to participate in forest conservation, ANR sites protection, Agroforestry planting activities, and sustainable collection and trade of the Chilgoza nuts and other NTFPs.</i>	<i>CFPCC to promote forest conservation, ANR sites protection, land restoration under agroforestry, safe and sustainable chilgoza nut collection.</i>				
Output 3.2: Capacity is built for national and provincial forest managers in the strategic development of inter-sectoral forest policies and programs	Q4 Y4	<i>n/a</i>	<i>n/a</i>	<i>n/a</i>			<i>% n/a</i>	<i>Planned for the first semester 2021. Activities were scattered according to the implementation capacity.</i>
Output 3.3: Capacity is built/strengthened at provincial, district and local stakeholders on sustainable forest management practices	Q4 Y4	<i>n/a</i>	<i>83 (71 men and 12 women) officials from provincial (Balochistan, KP, and Gilgit Baltistan) Forest and Wildlife departments, Pakistan Forest Institute, WWF, Forest Management Centre received training and participated in capacity development workshops in Collect Earth, ROAM and PES.</i>	<i>308 (289 men and 19 women) farmers received training in chilgoza harvesting toolkits utilization, tree planting and participated in "Bridge for Billions" training.</i>			<i>% 40</i>	

Output 4.1: Monitoring and evaluation framework is developed for the TRI child project in Pakistan	Q4 Y4	Pakistan also has developed an internal M&E framework that will be used to continuously monitor project implementation and reporting.	Collect Earth Open Foris (CEOF) training and data collection exercise conducted for 13 (13 men) participants from provincial Forest Departments, Pakistan Forest Institute, IUCN, and FAO. CE enables land use data collection through Google Earth to establish the reference levels and to monitor the dynamics of land-use change. Data collected during the workshop is currently being analyzed and baseline for restoration activities being prepared. Internally, the M&E system has been established to facilitate data flow; M&E plan has been prepared; beneficiary data collection tools have been used during the reporting period to capture the required data for mandatory indicator reporting. National Chilgoza project team	The results of the Land Use data collection exercise using Collect Earth have been analyzed and the final report has been finalized. The Collect Earth Open Foris tool has received a lot of positive attention and the Federal Ministry of Climate Change will adopt the Collect Earth tools for setting up baseline and monitoring the Ten Billion Tree Tsunami Programme, which is a flagship programme of Government of Pakistan. Internally, national chilgoza team		% 40	
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--	------	--

			<p>participated in M&amp;E related trainings, webinars organized both in Pakistan and internationally during the TRI annual meetings.</p>	<p>participated in M&amp;E related trainings, webinars organized on TRI MEL framework.</p>				
<p>Output 4.2: Communication, awareness-raising and knowledge management at the local, provincial, national and global levels on Chilgoza forest ecosystems</p>	<p>Q4 Y4</p>	<p>The video highlighting the major work under the Chilgoza project has been prepared and shared globally to raise awareness of the significance of Chilgoza forest to communities in Pakistan and at large. Five inception workshops conducted with participation from various stakeholders including government, private sector, and community. This brought awareness regarding FLR in general public and policy makers. Project</p>	<p>Five communication products developed and disseminated online and during project events. Events such as toolkits plant distribution covered by provincial media channels. One pager related to the project background and activities developed and disseminated in all the events conducted.</p>	<p>Two communication products developed and disseminated online. Events such as toolkits plant distribution covered by provincial media channels.</p>			<p>% 35</p>	

		<i>flyer has been prepared and distributed widely at district, province, national and global levels.</i>						
Output 4.3: Lessons sharing and aggregation of progress and experiences at local, regional (district/provincial), national and global levels	Q4 Y4	n/a	n/a	n/a			% n/a	<i>Planned for the second semester of 2021. As the project time frame is four years, the project team scattered activities according to the implementation capacity.</i>
Output 4.4. Knowledge generation via targeted applied research actions on Sustainable Management of Chilgoza forest ecosystems	Q4 Y4	<i>Chilgoza pine nut cones production survey conducted in four project areas.</i>	<i>Chilgoza pine nut cones production survey conducted in four project areas.</i>	<i>Chilgoza pine nut cones production survey conducted in four project areas.</i>			% 40	

#### 4. Information on Progress, Outcomes and Challenges on Project Implementation

**Please briefly summarize main progress achieving the outcomes (cumulative) and outputs (during this fiscal year):**

The 2nd Project Steering Committee (PSC) meeting of GEF Chilgoza project was held on November 11, 2020 virtually, chaired by Federal Secretary of the Ministry of Climate Change (MoCC). Main objective of the meeting was to discuss the project progress of year 1 (May 2019 to June 2020); discuss the year 2nd work plan and budget covering the period from July 2020 to June 2021 as per approved project document. Overall, Chilgoza project received positive remarks and appreciation from the Federal Secretary of the MoCC and the Provincial Forestry and Wildlife Secretaries. It was appreciated that the project is working very closely with all the provincial Forest departments and local communities, which is a sustainable approach for chilgoza conservation, protection and management. All three provincial Forestry Secretaries displayed high level of satisfaction, and appreciated the efforts of the project for conservation of natural resources. The PSC re-stated their desire to see most of the project resources going on Component 2 and 3 directly benefiting concrete restoration and livelihood activities.

During the reporting period, project implementation continued under all four outcomes, however the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic and subsequent lockdowns have affected the implementation of the project in the field.

Under Outcome 1, the Restoration Opportunity Assessment Methodology (ROAM)-IUCN report has been finalized and shared with the stakeholders. An economic valuation study of the Chilgoza forests ecosystem services has been conducted, the final report is the basis of an upcoming workshop to decide next steps for Payment for Ecosystem Services development in Chitral.

Under outcome 2, the IUCN facilitated Chilgoza Forest Multi-functional Management Plan covering 26000 ha has been finalized and shared with Balochistan Forest department for endorsement. The project team has conducted a survey to assess the status of Assisted Natural Regeneration (ANR) in the 48 identified ANR sites (2153 ha) in the target districts. During the survey various parameters associated with ANR were assessed, such as, count and estimation of regeneration, vegetation composition, mother trees and total number of chilgoza trees. Beside these the anthropogenic disturbance and scope for forest landscape restoration option were also considered. The baseline data on the status of ANR from the sites was collected through an extensive field visits, meetings with local communities, the draft report of consolidated results of the survey has been completed and is under review. In total 48 ANR sites covering 2153 ha have been demarcated, GPS coordinates taken, 48 guards (negehban) identified by the communities.

In total, 326 950 of forest and 20 800 of fruit plants were distributed in all four project areas this year, benefitting an additional 5440 small holder farmers (4173 men and 1267 women), and bringing 320.87 ha of land under restoration, including 24.165 ha of block plantation. 5800 fruit and 96750 forest plants provided by Balochistan and KP Forest and Wildlife departments as in-kind contribution to the project.

During the reporting period the project has set up two Chilgoza processing units one in each Diamer and Zhob districts with the aim to empower chilgoza forest communities, enhance their income by increasing shelf life of commodity, create alternate job opportunities specially women, and involve local communities in chilgoza business, trade and local entrepreneurship. For the first time in Diamer and Zhob districts, the local people were able to process their harvest under one roof from grading to packaging and labeling, s and hence obtain a higher price in the market as compared to selling cones or unroasted nuts. Currently two units have been established but due to the high demand, four more units will be established at various locations in the project areas. To date, chilgoza processing unit established in Diamer has processed 44,132 kg of chilgoza nut, chilgoza processing unit in Zhob processed 15,000 kg of chilgoza, directly benefitting 421 people. Furthermore, 24 chilgoza cone crushers have been distributed in Diamer and Sherani districts.

During the reporting period the project procured 1000 fuel efficient stoves and 200 gasifiers to selected beneficiaries and the distribution is in progress. This is to lower the pressure on wood resources for cooking and household needs purposes. In total the CFPCCs were provided with 300 sets of chilgoza harvesting toolkits to promote sustainable and safe collection of chilgoza pine nut.

The structure of a fund to support livelihood opportunities development in the target district has been developed with the communities picking the 4 key activities linked to restored land that communities want to lead. This fund will be implemented in Year 3 with a strong sustainability angle.

Under Outcome 3, the project team continued to work closely with local CFPCC to promote forest conservation, ANR sites protection, land restoration under agroforestry, safe and sustainable chilgoza nut collection. The CFPCCs were provided with 150 more chilgoza harvesting toolkits and community members participated in various events organized by the project, such distribution and training.

During the reporting period:

1. 195 community members from CFPCCS have been trained in tree plantation techniques.
2. 6 stakeholders from Chitral and Sherani districts have been trained in TRI global finance workshop “Bridge for Billions” and one entrepreneur from each of this area is currently following the full coaching program to enhance its activities.

Under Outcome 4, the results of the Land Use data collection exercise using Collect Earth have been analyzed and the final report has been finalized. It is a great baseline to follow the progress of restoration activities. The Collect Earth Open Foris tool has received a lot

of positive attention and the Federal Ministry of Climate Change will adopt the Collect Earth tools for setting up baseline and monitoring the Ten Billion Tree Tsunami Programme, which is a flagship programme of Government of Pakistan. Internally, the national chilgoza team participated in M&E related trainings, webinars organized on TRI MEL framework. Two additional communication products were developed and disseminated online and during events. Events such as chilgoza nut harvesting toolkits and plant distribution were covered by federal and provincial level media channels. The project team has conducted the Chilgoza cone production survey for the year 2020. The Chilgoza project has been highlighted as part of the official launch of the Decade on Ecosystem Restoration on June 5<sup>th</sup> 2021 from Pakistan.

**What are the major challenges the project has experienced during this reporting period?**

During the reporting period:

1. FAO Pakistan offices continued with teleworking modality due to COVID-19 pandemic, slowing down implementation of project activities. At the time of the report writing FAO Pakistan office staff is still teleworking, with only critical staff members working from the representation and provincial offices.
2. Fragile security situation in one of the project target areas – South Waziristan, KP.
3. Due to gender sensitivity and lack of NOC, law enforcing agencies and district administration does not allow female movement in one the project area.
4. Delays in obtaining necessary administrative clearances from provincial government and signing of LoAs.
5. Remote locations of target districts, isolated beneficiary communities and without telephone network coverage.

### Development Objective (DO) Ratings, Implementation Progress (IP) Ratings and Overall Assessment

Please note that the overall DO and IP ratings should be substantiated by evidence and progress reported in the Section 2 and Section 3 of the PIR.

For DO, the ratings and comments should reflect the overall progress of project results.

	<b>F Y2021 Development Objective rating<sup>9</sup></b>	<b>FY2021 Implementation Progress rating<sup>10</sup></b>	<b>Comments/reasons<sup>11</sup> justifying the ratings for FY2021 and any changes (positive or negative) in the ratings since the previous reporting period</b>
<b>Project Manager / Coordinator</b>	<b>Highly satisfactory</b>	<b>Highly satisfactory</b>	<i>Mandatory Ratings/Comments The project is being implemented very closely with the provincial forest department and the Ministry of Climate Change. The positive impact of the project is increasing with the passage of time, and the forests are conserved more properly by the local communities and forest departments. The income level of the local people has increased by enhancing the value chain development.</i>
<b>Budget Holder</b>	<b>Highly satisfactory</b>	<b>Highly satisfactory</b>	<i>Mandatory Ratings/comments The project is running smoothly and the key outputs achieved so far are showing the impact on the climate change and local livelihoods. There is great appreciation by the provincial forest departments and MOCC, and they are aiming for upscaling the project interventions. The project is also greatly contributing to the government mega flagship 10 billion tree project.</i>
<b>GEF Operational Focal Point</b>			<i>Optional Ratings/comments</i>

<sup>9</sup> **Development/Global Environment Objectives Rating** – Assess how well the project is meeting its development objective/s or the global environment objective/s it set out to meet.

For more information on ratings, definitions please refer to Annex 1.

<sup>10</sup> **Implementation Progress Rating** – Assess the progress of project implementation. For more information on ratings definitions please refer to Annex 1.

<sup>11</sup> Please ensure that the ratings are based on evidence



<b>Lead Technical Officer<sup>12</sup></b>	<b>Satisfactory</b>	<b>Satisfactory</b>	<p><i>The project has been able to move forward most of the key actions planned for the period July 2020 to June 2021 including restoration investments in the field (Assisted Natural Regeneration and Agroforestry). Unfortunately, due to COVID-19 constraints other actions (in particular the provision of small grants) have been delayed or postponed to the second half of the year 2021. Nevertheless, in this difficult context, the PMU has managed to advance well the related interventions thanks to a strong ownership both at national and at district levels.</i></p> <p><i>The provision of small grants during the next period (July 2021-June 2022) should be considered as a top priority of the next Annual Work Plan and Budget. The Mid-Term Review, currently ongoing with a report expected at the end of the third quarter of the year 2021, will be an excellent opportunity to better analyse the COVID-19 impact on this project GCP/PAK/091/GFF, to revise/adjust eventually the project targets (including proposing a one year no-cost extension) and to provide recommendations to the Project Management Unit (PMU).</i></p>
<b>FAO-GEF Funding Liaison Officer</b>	<b>Satisfactory</b>	<b>Moderately Satisfactory</b>	<p><i>The project is progressing well towards its ambitious development and environmental objectives – and is gaining momentum also in light of the launch of the Restoration Decade held in Pakistan. It is indeed seen as a champion to inspire national and regional FLR actions.</i></p> <p><i>In terms of implementation progress, despite delays due to COVID-19 disruptions, the project is on track with most of its outputs. The mid-term review will provide an opportunity to take note of the strength of the project and its achievements thus far and discuss challenges and identify corrective measures to address them. This process may allow prioritization on completing fewer outputs - Including consolidating the work with the CFPPCs and their sustainability and sustainable livelihoods to benefit communities, as a basis for the project exit strategy.</i></p>

<sup>12</sup> The LTO will consult the HQ technical officer and all other supporting technical Units.

### 5. Environmental and Social Safeguards (ESS)

**Under the responsibility of the LTO (PMU to draft)**

This section of the PIR describes the progress made towards complying with the approved ESM plan, when appropriate. Note that only projects with **moderate** or **high** Environmental and Social Risk, approved from June 2015 should have submitted an ESM plan/table at CEO endorsement. This does not apply to **low** risk projects. Please add recommendations to improve the implementation of the ESM plan, when needed.

Social & Environmental Risk Impacts identified at CEO Endorsement	Expected mitigation measures	Actions taken during this FY	Remaining measures to be taken	Responsibility
<b>ESS 1: Natural Resource Management</b>				
<b>ESS 2: Biodiversity, Ecosystems and Natural Habitats</b>				
<b>ESS 3: Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture</b>				
<b>ESS 4: Animal - Livestock and Aquatic - Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture</b>				
<b>ESS 5: Pest and Pesticide Management</b>				
<b>ESS 6: Involuntary Resettlement and Displacement</b>				
<b>ESS 7: Decent Work</b>				
<b>ESS 8: Gender Equality</b>				
<b>ESS 9: Indigenous Peoples and Cultural Heritage</b>				
<b>New ESS risks that have emerged during this FY</b>				

In case the project did not include an ESM Plan at CEO endorsement stage, please indicate if the initial Environmental and Social Risk classification is still valid; if not, what is the new classification and explain.

Overall Project Risk classification (at project submission)	Please indicate if the Environmental and Social Risk classification is still valid <sup>13</sup> . If not, what is the new classification and explain.
Low	This classification is still valid.

<b><i>Please report if any grievance was received as per FAO and GEF ESS policies. If yes, please indicate how it is being/has been addressed.</i></b>

## 6. Risks

### Risk ratings

RISK TABLE
<i>The following table summarizes risks identified in the <b>Project Document</b> and reflects also <b>any new risks</b> identified in the course of project implementation. Please make sure that the table also includes the Environmental and Social Management Risks captured by the Environmental and social Management Risk Mitigations plans. The <u>Notes</u> column should be used to provide additional details concerning manifestation of the risk in your specific project, <b>as relevant</b>.</i>

---

<sup>13</sup> **Important:** please note that if the Environmental and Social Risk classification is changing, the ESM Unit should be contacted and an updated Social and Environmental Management Plan addressing new risks should be prepared.

	Risk	Risk rating <sup>14</sup>	Mitigation Actions	Progress on mitigation actions <sup>15</sup>	Notes from the Project Task Force
1	Accessibility to remote project sites (e.g. as well as security in places like South- Waziristan).	Medium	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The project is to be implemented by the Forest Department, which has an extensive and ongoing outreach programme in tribal districts of KP (formerly known as FATA).</li> <li>• FAO has successfully implemented a number of projects in FATA-- including North and South- Waziristan (e.g. in relief and early recovery)—and will build upon those respected networks and programmes.</li> <li>• Local NGOs also have access to the area, and will contribute to the smooth implementation of the project.</li> <li>• Forestry and Agriculture activities are much sought after by remote local communities, they are largely viewed as non-controversial and continue to be well received even in the active conflict zones.</li> </ul>	The project has been successfully undertaken a number of missions, including two international missions, to the project sites in all four targeted districts. This was made possible due to close working with the forest department and local communities.	

<sup>14</sup> GEF Risk ratings: Low, Moderate, Substantial or High

<sup>15</sup> If a risk mitigation plan had been presented as part of the Environmental and Social management Plan or in previous PIR please report here on progress or results of its implementation. For moderate and high risk projects, please Include a description of the ESMP monitoring activities undertaken in the relevant period".

	Risk	Risk rating <sup>14</sup>	Mitigation Actions	Progress on mitigation actions <sup>15</sup>	Notes from the Project Task Force
2	Limited technical implementation capacities (e.g. of Forest Department), limited abilities in project contract management, finance.	Low	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project implementation activities will include targeted capacity building and training to government institutions and partners, extension departments, communities, and other forest stakeholders.</li> <li>Implementation will involve targeted FAO Forest technical department and TRI services, which may be supported by performance-based incentives.</li> </ul>	The project has been in contact with the forest departments and through a number of orientation meetings explaining new concepts such as FLR and PES. On job training was provided to the forest department staff in nursery raisings and plantations. Necessary arrangements have been made for the forest department staff for ROAM, FLR, and PES. Similarly, the project will associate the Forest department in the preparation of Management Plan and Assisted Natural Regeneration investments. This will build their capacity and give them the confidence to undertake forest restoration on scientific lines.	

	Risk	Risk rating <sup>14</sup>	Mitigation Actions	Progress on mitigation actions <sup>15</sup>	Notes from the Project Task Force
3	Reluctance of beneficiaries of forest ecosystem services to pay for/protect forests.	Low	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mitigating forest destruction, protecting forest ecosystem flows, and building the resilience and sustainability of communities is central to the project.</li> <li>The project will create a comprehensive methodology for evaluating ecosystem services, analyzing potential 'buyers/ sellers' of services as well as assist in negotiating trade-offs.</li> </ul>	The ongoing discussion with the beneficiaries of forest ecosystem services has been positive. It has influenced the locals to realize the importance of management tools for generating financing and subsequent forest management sustainability. The support to the <i>FPCCs</i> is a key factor for the success and sustainability of the project. The planned training on PES will enhance the beneficiaries' understanding of this important concept.	

	Risk	Risk rating <sup>14</sup>	Mitigation Actions	Progress on mitigation actions <sup>15</sup>	Notes from the Project Task Force
4	Local households are risk-averse, resist shifts from timber to biodiversity conservation/sustainable use	Low	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The project targets the mobilization of community participation and emphasizes the participatory approach. Ongoing consultation with households and their representation will also help mitigate risk. Improved economic benefits of community-based forestry and productivity gains promoted by the project will provide additional incentives.</li> <li>Regarding the reforestation, the choice and placement of species will be determined with community inputs and sound-scientific advice to balance social, economic, and environment requirements (e.g. food security, income, watershed integrity, biodiversity connectivity).</li> </ul>	The project is building on the experience of one Billion Tree Afforestation Project, where the local community organizations and forest protection committees are actively involved in forest conservation and multiple uses of the forests. This is a good venue to get their support in biodiversity conservation and sustainable use. Similarly, the active involvement of the Forest Conservation and Protection Committees in the project will also contribute to the change. The increased net profit from the non-timber forest products will also encourage the locals for the multiple benefits of the forests and shift from timber focus.	

	Risk	Risk rating <sup>14</sup>	Mitigation Actions	Progress on mitigation actions <sup>15</sup>	Notes from the Project Task Force
5	Natural disasters, extreme weather fluctuations (drought, floods, landslides)	Medium	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In addition to project interventions targeting mitigation of upland ecosystem risks, protection of ecological flows, and building community resilience and sustainability, the project will create assessment, awareness, and capacity which could be used to leverage disaster preparedness planning.</li> </ul>	FAO Pakistan has good experience in building the resilience of the local communities against natural disasters. This experience is being used in the Chilgoza project. The 2016 floods in Kalash Valley had seriously damaged the agricultural land and other assets. Good forest cover in the upper catchment will reduce the risk of flash flooding.	
6	International consultants (e.g. MTE/TE) not receiving NOC from the government to undertake missions to pilot sites	Low	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The NOCs for the international consultants will be received in time if the request with required documents is sent much in advance.</li> <li>The NOC issuing authority is briefed periodically on the importance of the project and the need for the travel of international consultants.</li> </ul>	During the first year of the project, a number of local as well as international missions visited the project sites without any security risk or restrictions from the government.	This risk is no longer at Medium level, changed to Low
7	Risk of slowing of project implementation	Medium	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>FAO staff present in each target area and CFPPCs which will mitigate the risk of major delay.</li> </ul>	During the COVID-19 period the project was able to provide seedlings to the beneficiaries and able to conduct some surveys.	

**Project overall risk rating (Low, Moderate, Substantial or High):**

FY2020 rating	FY2021 rating	Comments/reason for the rating for FY2021 and any changes (positive or negative) in the rating since the previous reporting period



Low	Low	The project is being implemented smoothly.
-----	-----	--------------------------------------------

## 7. Adjustments to Project Strategy – Only for projects that had the Mid-term review (or supervision mission)

If the project had a MTR review or a supervision mission, please report on how the MTR recommendations were implemented as indicated in the Management Response or in the supervision mission report.

MTR or supervision mission recommendations	Measures implemented
<b>Recommendation 1:</b>	n/a
<b>Recommendation 2:</b>	n/a
<b>Recommendation 3:</b>	n/a
<b>Recommendation 4:</b>	n/a

### Adjustments to the project strategy.

Please note that changes to outputs, baselines, indicators or targets cannot be made without official approval from PSC and PTF members, including the FLO. These changes will follow the recommendations of the MTR or the supervision mission.

Change Made to	Yes/No	Describe the Change and Reason for Change
<b>Project Outputs</b>	No	n/a
<b>Project Indicators/Targets</b>	No	n/a

**Adjustments to Project Time Frame**

If the duration of the project, the project work schedule, or the timing of any key events such as project start up, mid-term review, final evaluation or closing date, have been adjusted since project approval, please explain the changes and the reasons for these changes. The Budget Holder may decide, in consultation with the PTF, to request the adjustment of the EOD-NTE in FPMIS to the actual start of operations providing a sound justification.

Change	Describe the Change and Reason for Change
<p><b>Project extension</b></p>	<p>Original NTE:                      Revised NTE: The no-cost extension of the project for one more year should be requested this year.</p> <p>Justification: The project took time to set up as it is active in 4 different districts, and now only two work plans have been implemented. It will also allow sufficient time to follow the MTR recommendations.</p>

## 8. Stakeholders Engagement

**Please report on progress, challenges, and outcomes on stakeholder engagement (based on the description of the Stakeholder engagement plan included at CEO Endorsement/Approval (when applicable))**

If your project had a stakeholder engagement plan, specify whether any new stakeholders have been identified/engaged:

If a stakeholder engagement plan was not requested for your project at CEO endorsement stage, please

- list all stakeholders engaged in the project
- please indicate if the project works with Civil Society Organizations and/or NGOs
- briefly describe stakeholders' engagement events, specifying time, date stakeholders engaged, purpose (information, consultation, participation in decision making, etc.) and outcomes.

Please also indicate if the private sector has been involved in your project and provide the nature of the private sector actors, their role in the project and the way they were involved

1. The list of all stakeholders engaged in this project is given in the table below.
2. The representatives from relevant provincial and federal Forest and Wildlife departments, Agriculture, Livestock, Environment, Administration, Health and Education as well as representatives from local organizations have participated in all the events organized by the project team both at the national and provincial levels. They also participated in toolkits distribution ceremonies, fruit and forest plant distribution ceremonies, and quarterly meetings of PIU. Also, departments are actively involved in the conservation and protection of natural forests.

List of stakeholders	
Stakeholder	Mandate and Role in the Project
Ministry of Climate Change, Office of the Inspector General	The Ministry of Climate Change oversees inter-provincial coordination of forestry-related matters. It is also responsible for UN REDD and, in consultation with the provincial forest departments, prepares policy, strategy and action plan for sustainable forest management. The fulfillment of international obligations on various treaties related to the environment is also one of the main responsibilities of this Ministry. The Project Steering Committee will be constituted under the Ministry of Climate Change, with membership from the participating provincial/regional forest departments. The Ministry will also support institutional coordination contributing to inter-sectoral planning and actions reducing pressures from competing for land uses in the wider landscape and lead institutional reforms for SFM planning, collaborative management and related measures advancing land tenure, Chilgoza ecosystem resource accountability, etc. Where possible, the Ministry will mainstream and operationalize project models and knowledge within national and provincial policy and planning.

Provincial/Regional Forest Departments	Provincial and Regional Forest departments guide day to day project management and will ensure inter-agency coordination for SFM at the provincial level. The development and implementation of forestry management plans (and other developmental planning) is their responsibility, and they will lead this work alongside other departments to promote integrated provincial policy, planning, and budget processes.
Village heads, leaders, district officials; protected area management	Are capacitated to promote SFM and motivate household participation. They are helping to ensure that project and government training extension are aligned in implementation, and more generally facilitate collaboration and planning at the local level for conservation, carbon storage, and SFM outputs.
Local smallholder communities living in or around the Chilgoza forests	Local subsistence farmers are the main stakeholders of the project. As key target beneficiaries, local farmers/herders, their communities, and interest groups will actively participate in Chilgoza conservation and restoration, as well as related livelihood, awareness, and community-based activities. At this level, Chilgoza Forests Protection and Conservation Committees will be organised representing the various segments of the community. These committees will have a major role at the field level implementation of the project besides enforcing local rules and regulations for the protection and proper management of the Chilgoza forest landscape.
Local NGOs and civil society	Local civil society organizations have been and will continue to inform project formulation and help to facilitate the involvement of communities in this project.
Private sector	Private sector partners will be mobilized in the project to implement SFM, establish and promote sustainable harvest regimens support NTFP processing and marketing with farmer cluster groups, etc. They will also be important partners in the establishment of PES schemes and other long-term sustainable financing schemes.
International NGOs, donors.	Will provide this project important baseline, finance, coordination, and technical support.

## 9. Gender Mainstreaming

<b>Information on Progress on gender-responsive measures as documented at CEO Endorsement/Approval in the gender action plan or equivalent (when applicable)</b>
<p>Was a gender analysis undertaken or an equivalent socio-economic assessment made at formulation or during execution stages? Please briefly indicate the gender differences here.</p> <p>The project area is conservative and the local norms and rules and regulations have to be followed when accessing women. However, in Chitral, women are more empowered. The family as a whole work and the income is spent on the various needs of the family. The general literacy and education ratios are very low among women and are confined to household domain, their exposure to the outside world is limited (women restricted mobility is the major issue).</p> <p>Does the M&amp;E system have gender-disaggregated data? How is the project tracking gender results and impacts?</p> <p>The monitoring and evaluation system has been developed to capture the gender-disaggregated data carefully throughout the collection, analysis, and reporting stages by the project team. Project</p>

staff is regularly uploading gender disaggregated activity data (distribution, trainings etc.) in KOBO software for further analysis.

Does the project staff have gender expertise?

The project staff has gender experience, however to ensure the direct access to women in most conservative areas, two female staff members were hired to work in Sherani and South Waziristan districts. Staff attended online sessions and training related to Gender mainstreaming and Gender equality hosted by FAO Pakistan at provincial and representative levels, and attended online training from e-learning FAO platform.

If possible, indicate in which results area(s) the project is expected to contribute to gender equality:

- closing gender gaps in access to and control over natural resources.
- improving women's participation and decision making; and or
- generating socio-economic benefits or services for women

The project is expected to contribute to gender equality in all three results areas identified above. As per project design, women are involved in activities related to women enterprise development, kitchen gardening, backyard poultry, and capacity development events, etc.. The women engagement strategy identifies the best ways in reaching out to women and engaging them in activities that will both be accepted by local communities as well as improve their economic status. The project will also involve women in processing, roasting, and value chain activities; capacity building, and provide relevant equipment to improve their socio-economic status. During the reporting period, the percentage of women beneficiaries increased, as compared to last years. Some of the deliverables (Chilgoza Toolkits and processing units) from the project, directly benefited women. Also the provision of fruit and forest plants was a great effort to push some village women towards increased role in society. They were encouraged by the female staff of project to plant the seeds and trees right in the boundaries of their homes.

The project is gradually supporting changes, although the target areas are male dominated. In most districts this work is still difficult as shifting mind-set is a long process that cannot be achieved by only one project. More social mobilization is require to ensure women participation in the future. It may be possible to bring about transformative change in attitudes and practices with regard to the empowerment of women and girls if there is an in-depth understanding of the existing challenges and opportunities, will to bring about change, and effective partnerships that can mobilize skills and resources to do so. The small livelihood projects are in pipeline for implementation and those projects will largely benefit women. These include homebased nurseries mainly be women, honey bee production, medicinal plants and fodder production.

## 10. Knowledge Management Activities

**Knowledge activities / products (when applicable), as outlined in knowledge management approved at CEO Endorsement / Approval**

- Does the project have a knowledge management strategy? If not, how does the project collect and document good practices? Please list relevant good practices that can be learned and shared from the project thus far.

Collection of good practices lies with the provincial coordinators following the implementation closely in the field.

The project includes a wide range of capacity building experience as stated in the result matrix. The implementation of the new knowledge in the field allow for the knowledge to be fully internalized. Together with the livelihood funds, some trainings, following the farmer field school approaches will be set up to support communities in the development of these new activities.

- Does the project have a communication strategy? Please provide a brief overview of the communications successes and challenges this year.

The preparation of the communication strategy is in progress. Among the successes of the communications during the reporting period are good photographs, well documented human success stories, and regular and successful media coverage for various activities.

- Please share a human-interest story from your project, focusing on how the project has helped to improve people's livelihoods while contributing to achieving the expected global environmental benefits. Include at least one beneficiary quote and perspective, and please also include related photos and photo credits.

Photos: <https://www.flickr.com/photos/151373913@N04/albums/72157713827670436>  
<http://www.fao.org/in-action/forest-landscape-restoration-mechanism/resources/detail/en/c/1258037/>

- Please provide links to publications, leaflets, video materials, related website, newsletters, or other communications assets published on the web.

<http://www.fao.org/in-action/forest-landscape-restoration-mechanism/resources/detail/en/c/1272916/>  
<http://newsletters.fao.org/q/16vqwx56ezp/wv>  
<https://www.dailyparliamenttimes.com/2020/09/15/chilgoza-harvest-season-begins-in-koh-e-sulaiman-fao-distributes-toolkits/#.YMrg8vkzaU>  
<https://www.dailyparliamenttimes.com/2020/09/30/promotion-of-agro-forestry-stressed-pine-nuts-processing-unit-inaugurated/#.YMrgovkzaU>  
<https://www.dawn.com/news/1583281/fao-sets-up-chilgoza-processing-units-in-diamer-zhob>  
[https://m.facebook.com/watch/?v=358874805456162&\\_rdr](https://m.facebook.com/watch/?v=358874805456162&_rdr)  
<https://www.thenews.com.pk/print/725404-fao-installs-chilgoza-processing-unit-at-diamer-zhob>  
<https://tribune.com.pk/epaper/news/Karachi/2020-09-30/ZjFlZWZhYzQ5M2M3OGNkZGNkZmI3NjQwMGE5MWM3OGluanBlZw%3D%3D>  
<https://world-news-monitor.com/climate/2020/10/05/fao-sets-up-chilgoza-processing-units-in-diamer-zhob>

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iGVn2iptX5U>  
<https://en.baaghity.com/fao-installs-chilgoza-processing-unit-at-chilas-diamer-in-gilgit-baltistan/>  
<https://profit.pakistantoday.com.pk/2020/09/29/fao-inaugurates-pine-nut-processing-unit-in-diamer/>  
<https://www.app.com.pk/national/fao-installs-chilgoza-processing-unit-at-chilas-diamer-in-gilgit-baltistan/>  
<https://www.urdupoint.com/en/agriculture/fao-installs-chilgoza-processing-unit-at-chil-1042591.html>  
<https://islamabadpost.com.pk/fao-installs-chilgoza-processing-unit-at-diamer-gilgit-baltistan-and-zhob-balochistan/>  
<https://dnanews.com.pk/fao-installs-chilgoza-processing-unit-diamer-gilgit-baltistan-zhob-balochistan/>  
<https://pk.news/2020/09/29/fao-installs-chilgoza-processing-unit-in-chile-diamer-in-gilgit-baltistan/>  
<https://www.dailyparliamenttimes.com/2020/09/30/promotion-of-agro-forestry-stressed-pine-nuts-processing-unit-inaugurated/#.X3ViNGgzY2x>  
<https://web.facebook.com/IndyUrdu/posts/899433344180261>  
[https://www.independenturdu.com/node/60471?utm\\_medium=Social&utm\\_source=Facebook#Echobox=1613877171](https://www.independenturdu.com/node/60471?utm_medium=Social&utm_source=Facebook#Echobox=1613877171)  
<https://www.dailyparliamenttimes.com/2021/03/05/fao-forest-deptt-improving-livelihood-through-the-pine-forest-restoration/#.YMrhSvkzaUk>  
<http://www.fao.org/pakistan/news/detail-events/en/c/1379240/>  
[https://www.dailyparliamenttimes.com/2021/04/17/120000-trees-planted-to-enhance-forest-cover-improve-value-chain/#.YMrf2\\_kzaUl](https://www.dailyparliamenttimes.com/2021/04/17/120000-trees-planted-to-enhance-forest-cover-improve-value-chain/#.YMrf2_kzaUl)  
<https://www.voadeewanews.com/a/baluchistan-pine-trees-restoration-project-/5628174.html>

- Does the project have a communication and/or knowledge management focal point? If yes, please provide their names and email addresses

Seema Ghazi, Communications Associate, FAO Pakistan, [seema.ghazi@fao.org](mailto:seema.ghazi@fao.org)

## 11. Indigenous Peoples Involvement

Are Indigenous Peoples involved in the project? How? Please briefly explain.



If applies, please describe the process and current status of on-going/completed, legitimate consultations to obtain Free, Prior and Informed Consent (FPIC) with the indigenous communities

Do indigenous peoples have an active participation in the project activities? How?

N/a

## 12. Innovative Approaches

**Please provide a brief description of an innovative<sup>16</sup> approach in the project / programme, describe the type (e.g. technological, financial, institutional, policy, business model) and explain why it stands out as an innovation.**

The Project during the reporting period has introduced/undertaken some innovative approaches the details are given below:

**1. Provision of fuel efficient stoves and gasifiers:** The people of the project target valleys are traditionally using fuel wood for their routine cooking, now under the project 1200 stoves and 200 gasifiers will be provided (already procured, distribution taking place at the time of PIR 2021 writing). Fuel efficient stoves have a function of minimal use of fuel wood as compared to traditional methods of cooking, and also have a positive impact on the health of women working in kitchen, because the stove has a system of smoke exhaust out of kitchen in a proper, safe way. Stove has also water heating system which can be used in winter. Therefore the fuel efficient stoves have a set of advantages which introduce different ways in going around household duties for the people of the target valleys.

**2. Distribution of toolkits:** Traditionally the local chilgoza cone collectors are using old, unsafe equipment and methods for harvesting chilgoza cones, which damage the tree and have negative effect on next years' harvest, which subsequently result in low production. With the introduction of safe and efficient chilgoza cone harvesting toolkits, minimum damages to the trees were reported by CFPCCs by using these toolkits.

---

<sup>16</sup> Innovation is defined as *doing something new or different in a specific context that adds value*

**3. Processing Unit and Cone Crushers:** Before the establishment of processing unit and cone crushers the local communities were using traditional methods for drying, packaging and crushing of cones with traditional methods, which cause loss of product and damage to the commodity quality, but now due to the establishment of the facility of processing unit, the commodity will be processed as per market demand. The commodity is being washed, roasted, dried and properly packed, which ultimately increased the demand and rates of such commodities.

**4. Chilgoza multi-functional Chilgoza Management Plan**

This is a unique tool which will assess the future cone production for 10 years period opening the venue for the private sector engagement in the value chain development.

**13. Possible impact of the Covid-19 pandemic on the project**

**Please indicate any implication of the Covid-19 pandemic on the activities and progress of the project. Highlight the adaptative measures taken to continue with the project implementation.**

- Are the outcomes/outputs still achievable within the project period.

FAO Pakistan offices continued with teleworking modality due to COVID-19 pandemic, slowing down implementation of project activities. At the time of the report writing FAO Pakistan office staff is still tele working, with only critical staff members working from the representation and provincial offices. The ongoing COVID–19 pandemic has delayed implementation, outcomes and outputs are still achievable within the project period (the no-cost extension requested as in "Adjustments to Project Time Frame" section).

- Will the timing of the project MTR or TE be affected/delayed?

The MTR is currently in progress (24 May - 30 September 2021), due to ongoing COVID-19 pandemic and travel restrictions the MTR team has adopted a hybrid approach – employing one international expert based in the UK and one national consultant to perform all the field visits.

- What is the impact of COVID-19 on project beneficiaries, personnel, etc.
- Are there good practices and lessons learned to be shared?

### 14. Co-Financing Table

Sources of Co-financing <sup>17</sup>	Name of Co-financer	Type of Co-financing	Amount Confirmed at CEO endorsement / approval	Actual Amount Materialized at 30 June 2021	Actual Amount Materialized at Midterm or closure (confirmed by the review/evaluation team)	Expected total disbursement by the end of the project
Recipient Government	Government of Balochistan, Forestry and Wildlife Department PD 10 BTTAP	In kind	5,692,060	50,000	118,840	4,743,383
Recipient Government	Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Forestry, Environment and Wildlife Department (Chitral and SW)	In kind	11,924,120	120,000	1,632,465	4,743,383
Recipient Government	Government of Gilgit Baltistan forestry and	In kind	5,962,060	43,333	50,333	948,677

<sup>17</sup> Sources of Co-financing may include: Bilateral Aid Agency(ies), Foundation, GEF Agency, Local Government, National Government, Civil Society Organization, Other Multi-lateral Agency(ies), Private Sector, Beneficiaries, Other.

	Wildlife Department GB					
		<b>TOTAL</b>	22,768,240	213,333	1,894,188	22,768,240

**Please explain any significant changes in project co-financing since Project Document signature, or differences between the anticipated and actual rates of disbursement**

## Annex 1. – GEF Performance Ratings Definitions

**Development/Global Environment Objectives Rating** – Assess how well the project is meeting its development objective/s or the global environment objective/s it set out to meet. DO Ratings definitions: **Highly Satisfactory (HS)** - Project is expected to achieve or exceed **all** its major global environmental objectives, and yield substantial global environmental benefits, without major shortcomings. The project can be presented as “good practice”); **Satisfactory (S)** - Project is expected to achieve **most** of its major global environmental objectives, and yield satisfactory global environmental benefits, with only minor shortcomings); **Moderately Satisfactory (MS)** - Project is expected to achieve **most** of its major relevant objectives but with either significant shortcomings or modest overall relevance. Project is expected not to achieve **some** of its major global environmental objectives or yield some of the expected global environment benefits); **Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU)** - Project is expected to achieve of its major global environmental objectives with major shortcomings or is expected to achieve only **some** of its major global environmental objectives); **Unsatisfactory (U)** - Project is expected **not** to achieve **most** of its major global environment objectives or to yield any satisfactory global environmental benefits); **Highly Unsatisfactory (HU)** - The project has failed to achieve, and is not expected to achieve, **any** of its major global environment objectives with no worthwhile benefits.)

**Implementation Progress Rating** – Assess the progress of project implementation. **IP Ratings definitions:** **Highly Satisfactory (HS):** Implementation of all components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised implementation plan for the project. The project can be resented as “good practice”. **Satisfactory (S):** Implementation of most components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan except for only a few that are subject to remedial action. **Moderately Satisfactory (MS):** Implementation of some components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with some components requiring remedial action. **Moderately Unsatisfactory (MU):** Implementation of some components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan with most components requiring remedial action. **Unsatisfactory (U):** Implementation of most components is not in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan. **Highly Unsatisfactory (HU):** Implementation of none of the components is in substantial compliance with the original/formally revised plan.